

# **Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security for Indigenous People in Chittagong Hill Tracts**

**Shahana Nasrin**

**Ph.D. Researcher (Session: 2011-2012)**

**Registration No. 143**

**and**

**Associate Professor**

**Institute of Social Welfare and Research**

**University of Dhaka**

**Dhaka-1205**

**A thesis submitted for the fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in Social Welfare**



**Institute of Social Welfare and Research  
University of Dhaka  
Dhaka-1205**

**May 2017**

## **Certificate from the Supervisor**

This is to certify that the thesis entitled **Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security for Indigenous People in Chittagong Hill Tracts** done by Ms. Shahana Nasrin is an original research work. The views expressed in the thesis are originated from field-based data and is entirely her contribution. The thesis has not been submitted anywhere else for any purposes, e.g., degree or publications. This may be submitted to the examiners to evaluate for conferring the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Social Welfare.

(Dr. Muhammad Samad)  
Professor  
Institute of Social Welfare and Research  
University of Dhaka  
Dhaka-1205

## **Declaration**

I hereby solemnly declare that this thesis represents my own work based on field-based data, except where due acknowledgment is made, and that it has not been previously included in a dissertation or report submitted to any university or other tertiary institution for a degree, diploma or other qualification.

(Shahana Nasrin)  
Ph.D. Researcher (Session: 2011-2012)  
and  
Associate Professor  
Institute of Social Welfare and Research  
University of Dhaka  
Dhaka-1205

## Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude and sincere thanks to a number of people and organizations for their cooperation and good advice to complete the study. Before that, first I express my heartiest gratitude to Almighty Allah for giving me the strength and opportunity to complete the present study successfully.

I am deeply grateful to my learned supervisor Professor Dr. Muhammad Samad who guided me through each step of the research work with his expertise, scholarly knowledge and succinct analysis. I am deeply indebted to him for his invaluable advice, constructive criticism, extreme patience, prudent guidance, intellectual contribution and insightful suggestions throughout the entire process of the Ph.D. research.

I must mention the important contribution of the respondents and participants of FGDs who have made the study possible. It would not have been possible to complete this study without their sincere cooperation. The most profound gratitude is to the indigenous people of the study area who helped me as respondents by giving their time, energy, supports. I am also extremely grateful to them for sharing their experiences and extended their sincere hospitality and generosity. These people confidently describe their gendered experience about human insecurities, development interventions, violence and communal conflicts and status of implementation of the CHT Accord and identity crisis etc.

I would like to convey my heartfelt thanks to the discussants of the seminars on research proposal, literature review and theoretical framework and findings of the study for their constructive comments and valuable suggestions which have enriched the quality of the study. I would also like to express my appreciation to my colleagues and faculty members of the Institute of Social Welfare and Research, University of Dhaka for their encouragement, moral support, continuous cooperation and support to reach the final stage of the research work.

I express my sense of gratitude to Mr. Shaktipada Tripura for his cooperation and generous help that he provided me out of a feeling of doing good for the people of indigenous communities. He provided me valuable inputs in the form of comments, sharing ideas and information regarding socio-cultural issues, threats, deprivation, impact

of development interventions in the CHT that have greatly benefitted my study. Needless to say, Mr. Trijinad Chakma, Mr. Moni Tripura, Ms. Swaraswati Tripura and Mr. Joten Tripura have rendered a most significant help that made the arduous task of fieldwork a pleasant experience. They have done most difficult task for me to communicate with the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities of different *paras* (villages), gather FGD participants, accompanied us to go to remote hill areas like *Chaklachhari* and *Killamura*. I am also thankful to them to make me understand various customs, culture and tradition of indigenous people. I am really indebted to them for their care and succor.

I owe a special debt to Headmen and Karbaies of different Mouzas for their sincere cooperation in sharing their information and experiences regarding different conflicting issues, historical and political context of the CHT and development interventions. I would like to record my deep appreciation and acknowledgement to NGO Officials from UNDP, BRAC, Tounga, and Green Hill for their valuable contribution, insights and help that I received from them during field study despite their intense work pressure.

Above all, I would have not been able to accomplish this work without the full support, encouragement and utmost cooperation of my beloved husband Dr. Md. Anwar Hossain, Professor, Department of Social Work, Jagannath University, Dhaka. His contribution is beyond the reach of my thanks. I am also grateful to my daughter and son for their patience and understanding work load during data collection and thesis writing as they work as living force and source of my energy. My sincere gratitude is to my father Mr. Md. Shahidul Hossain Biswas for his constant support and encouragement. His constant phone calls indeed were a stream of inspiration. I am indeed grateful to my mother and mother in-law for their kind support and encouragement.

Shahana Nasrin

Dhaka

## Abstract

Human insecurities in Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh in terms of land dispossession, forced migration, environmental degradation, and loss of ownership of natural resources, socioeconomic backwardness and ethnic conflict are still major concern of the policy makers, human rights workers, donor agencies and other stakeholders. As a result, various development measures have been undertaken for the well-being and improvement of socioeconomic conditions of the indigenous people. In such a situation, the present study has been carried out aimed at identifying the nature of human security and insecurity of the indigenous people, exploring the gender dimension of development interventions and analyzing the impacts development interventions on lives and livelihoods of the indigenous people living in CHT.

The study is qualitative in nature and purposive sampling procedure was followed to select the study area and sample as well. The site of empirical investigation of the present study was *Rangamati hill* district of the Chittagong Hill Tracts. At first, four villages from the four *upazilas* (sub-districts) of *Rangamati hill* district and two *paras* from Municipal area of *Rangamati* were purposively selected as the study area. Secondly, 36 adult indigenous people, 18 from the *Marma* (nine male and nine female) and 18 from the Tripura (nine male and nine female) community, were selected as respondents for the study using purposive sampling procedure. It helped the researcher to select the appropriate samples who were able to provide relevant information.

However, the study is based on primary data gathered by the researcher herself mainly through semi-structured interview and focus group discussions. Eight case studies were also conducted to get deeper insights into the research issues. Non-participant observation helped the researcher to capture the socio-cultural diversities, gender dimension, and nature of insecurities and impact of development interventions on indigenous people. In addition, data were collected from the key informants who were reservoir of knowledge about CHT. Data were collected from secondary sources that include legal documents, official reports, earlier studies, books, journals etc. The study employed the analytical framework of human security and intersectionality as theoretical underpinnings to analyze the findings.

The study findings revealed the gender dimensions of insecurities and threats that indigenous people experienced in their daily lives. The impacts of development interventions on them were explored in the selected two communities. The analysis of gender roles and responsibilities of the *Tripura* and the *Marma* community showed that respectful attitude towards women, equal treatment to boys and girls, freedom of movement, taking consent in marriage etc. had given indigenous women some privileges within their communities. On the other hand, women were discriminated too in their daily lives in respect of property inheritance, decision-making power, physical integrity, differential pay gap, selection of household head etc. Nonetheless, the study also tried to understand the local perception of human security and it was found that indigenous people conceptualized it as protection from and prevention of threats to humanity. Despite expressing common view in defining human security, the nature of insecurities was perceived differently by the indigenous men and women of the two communities. Indigenous women from both communities prioritized on the satisfaction of basic material needs like food, shelter, health, education, physical integrity etc. while indigenous men accentuated on meaningful participation in community life and decision-making process with dignity and self-esteem that affected their lives. They underscored on the protection from poverty, communal conflict and violence, eviction from ancestral land, environmental degradation and identity crisis as prerequisite of human security. Assurance of full implementation of the CHT Accord, utilizing natural resources and landownership were also mentioned by them as human security.

However, the government agencies (GAs), nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and International organizations (INGOs) have undertaken affirmative measures that included providing education, health, water and sanitation services, peace and confidence building program, creating employment opportunities, developing communication system, planting in fallow land in reducing insecurities in CHT and to improve the socioeconomic conditions of the indigenous people. Although people of urban areas and semi urban area were found to get the benefit of these services, it was very difficult for the people of remote areas to enjoy these opportunities. The geographical location often created obstacles to make development initiatives reachable and successful to the target groups. The respondents admitted that the development programs brought about few positive changes in their lives in terms of increased participation of boys and girls in education program, mobility of both men and women in public places, control of malaria, creation

of work opportunities etc. Still in many cases it could not do well. For instance, communal conflicts, land grabbing, violence against women, maternal and child mortality, expansion of reserved forest, food insecurity had not been minimized. On the other hand, ban on *jum* cultivation was not withdrawn and indigenous people could not achieve the control over market.

In addition, the indigenous people's view was not incorporated in implementing development projects. The indigenous people were not found to be habituated with new types of economic activities. Thus development initiatives benefitted more the Bengali settlers' than that of indigenous people. Human rights and freedom of the indigenous people in CHT were often constrained by the idiosyncratic mindset of Bengali settlers, government officials, bureaucrats and development thinkers due to lack of knowledge about indigenous cultures, languages, history, tradition, custom and ways of life. Besides, slow implementation process of the CHT Accord caused insecurities of indigenous people in CHT.

However, the study findings revealed that development programs induced human security problems for indigenous male and female in various ways. For instance, it turned them into day laborer, evicted from their ancestral land, made them vulnerable to economic and food securities due to lack of access to natural resources, made them victim of communal violence, compelled them to search non-farm activities for survival, created health hazards due to working in brick field or tobacco plant, lost the traditional values due to deforestation and making failed to establish their identity as indigenous. On the other hand, indigenous women were found to be discriminated and faced insecurities due to their gender identity, ethnicity, location and social status in both rural and urban areas. It is observed that the girls were found to be compelled to stop their education due to distance, financial constraints, and lack of safety. The study also found that women of the remote areas were found to be ignorant about their hygiene; and their maternal and neonatal health was not found to a considerable extent. Restriction on *jum* cultivation and expansion of reserved forests reduced their scope in subsistence economy, created food insecurity and made them vulnerable. Lack of access to information was responsible for not being aware of their rights. Even they were the victims of communal and social violence which again reduced their freedom of mobility. Their participation in decision-making process at community level was also found to be very poor. In the circumstances,



they tried to raise their voice and protest against injustice through some indigenous women organizations working for protecting women's rights in CHT.

Finally, the study argues that despite the development interventions, indigenous men and women face human insecurities which exacerbates through the intersecting variables of ethnicity, education, gender, socioeconomic status and geographical location to a considerable extent. However, the study proposes a good number of measures to ensure human securities of the indigenous people. Most important of them are: a) undertaking the legislative and administrative measures to recognize the customary land rights of indigenous people; b) strengthening the rehabilitation process of returnee refugees and internally displaced indigenous people; c) withdrawal of military camps; d) enhancing the participation of indigenous women in decision-making process and protection from violence; and e) augmenting the accessibility of indigenous people of remote areas to development programs.

## Table of Contents

Title of the Contents	Page No.
<i>Certificate from the Supervisor</i> .....	<i>i</i>
<i>Declaration</i> .....	<i>ii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	<i>iii</i>
<i>Abstract</i> .....	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i> .....	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of Tables</i> .....	<i>xiii</i>
<i>List of Acronyms</i> .....	<i>xvi</i>
<i>Glossary</i> .....	<i>xviii</i>
<b>CHAPTER ONE: Introduction</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 Background of the Study.....	1
1.2 Constitutional Commitment for Indigenous People in Bangladesh.....	2
1.3 Statement of the Problem.....	4
1.4 Conceptual Issues.....	5
1.4.1 Indigenous People.....	5
1.4.2 Chittagong Hill Tracts.....	6
1.4.3 Development Intervention.....	7
1.4.4 Human Security.....	7
1.4.5 Gender.....	8
1.4.6 Gender Dimension.....	9
1.4.7 Gender Analysis.....	9
1.5 Rationale of the Study.....	10
1.6 Objectives of the Study.....	11
1.7 Assumptions.....	11
1.8 Theoretical Underpinnings.....	12
1.8.1 Intersectionality.....	12
1.8.2 Human Security.....	14
1.8.3 Gender Analysis Matrix.....	16
1.9 Organization of the Thesis.....	17
<b>CHAPTER TWO: Review of Literature</b> .....	<b>20</b>
2.1 Introduction.....	20
2.2 Studies Related to Development Interventions.....	20
2.3 Studies Related to Human Security and Livelihood Issues.....	22
2.4. Studies Related to Human Security and Gender Issues.....	27
2.5 Research Gaps.....	30
<b>CHAPTER THREE: Methodology</b> .....	<b>32</b>
3.1 Introduction.....	32
3.2 Research Approach.....	32
3.3 Selection of the Study Area.....	33
3.4 Sampling Procedure and Sample Size.....	34
3.5 Methods of Data Collection.....	35



5.3.2 Child Preference.....	72
5.3.3 Division of Labor.....	72
5.3.4 Mobility and Using Public Places.....	74
5.3.5 Decision-making Process.....	75
5.3.6 Property Inheritance.....	76
5.3.7 Employment Opportunities.....	77
5.3.8 Labor and Wage Differentials.....	78
5.3.9 Gender Ideology and Gender-based Discrimination.....	80
5.3.10 Violence against Women.....	81
5.3.11 Access to information.....	81

## **CHAPTER SIX: Human Security of the Indigenous People by Gender Lens ... 83**

6.1 Introduction.....	83
6.2 Human Security .....	83
6.2.1 Views of the Interviewees on Human Security.....	85
6.2.2 Views of the Focus Groups on Human Security.....	87
6.2.3 Views of the Key Informants on Human Security.....	89
6.3 Nature of Human Insecurities .....	91
6.3.1 Land and Human Insecurities .....	92
6.3.2 Forests and Human Insecurities .....	96
6.3.3 Economic Insecurities .....	99
6.3.4 Food and Human Insecurities .....	101
6.3.5 Health and Human Insecurities .....	102
6.3.6 Housing and Human Insecurities .....	104
6.3.7 Violence and Human Insecurities .....	107
6.3.8 Identity and Human Insecurities .....	110
6.3.9 The CHT Accord and Human Insecurities .....	111
6.3.10 Demographic Imbalance and Human Insecurities .....	114
6.3.11 Militarization and Human Insecurities .....	116
6.3.12 Environmental Degradation and Human Insecurities .....	120
6.4 Impacts of Insecurities and Development Interventions .....	121

## **CHAPTER SEVEN: Development Interventions and Human Security ..... 129**

7.1 Introduction .....	129
7.2 A Brief Introduction to Development Activities Undertaken in CHT.....	129
7.2.1 Education .....	131
7.2.2 Health .....	134
7.2.3 Water and Sanitation .....	137
7.2.4 Peace and Confidence Building .....	140
7.2.5 Violence against Women and Conflict .....	142
7.2.6 Economic Development .....	146
7.2.7 Capacity Development .....	148
7.2.8 Gender and Development .....	152
7.2.9 Community Empowerment .....	153
7.2.10 Land and Forest Management .....	154
7.2.11 Infrastructural Development .....	156

<b>CHAPTER EIGHT: Case Studies .....</b>	<b>159</b>
8.1 Introduction .....	159
8.2 Case Studies .....	159
Case 1: Kheinsa Marma .....	159
Case 2: Mipai Marma .....	162
Case 3: Atian Tripura.....	164
Case 4: Kolpona Tripura .....	167
Case 5: Melapru Marma .....	170
Case 6: Shachin Tripura.....	173
Case 7: Shoshodhor Tripura .....	175
Case 8: Neinda Marma .....	177
<b>CHAPTER NINE: Summary, Suggestions and Conclusion .....</b>	<b>179</b>
9.1 Introduction .....	179
9.2 Summary of the Major Findings .....	179
9.2.1 Brief Description of the Socioeconomic Conditions of the Respondents... 179	
9.2.2 Human Security from Gender Perspective.....	184
9.2.3 Relationship between Development Interventions and Human Security....	192
9.3 Theoretical Implication .....	196
9.3.1 Human Security .....	196
9.3.2 Intersectionality .....	198
9.4 Analysis of Assumptions .....	200
9.5 Suggestions .....	204
9.5.1 Suggestions for Policy Formulation .....	204
9.5.2 Suggestions for Practice Level .....	205
9.6 Scope for Further Research .....	206
9.7 Conclusion .....	207
<b>References .....</b>	<b>209</b>
<b>Appendices .....</b>	<b>227</b>
Appendix A.....	227
Appendix B.....	232
Appendix C.....	234

#### List of Tables

Table 6.1 Food Situation (DAE, Rangamati-2011-2012/2012-2013).....	102
Table 6.2 Population Growth in the Chittagong Hill Tracts from 1901 to 2011.....	115
Table 6.3 Bengali Resettlement Project.....	116

## Acronyms

AC	Assistant Commissioner
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ANC	Antenatal Care
AUSAID	Australian Agency for International Development
BRAC	Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
BIWN	Bangladesh Indigenous Women's Network
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CHTs	Chittagong Hill Tracts
CHTDB	Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board
CHTDF	Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facilities
CHTRC	Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council
CHSW	Community Health Service Worker
CSBA	Community Skilled Birth Attendant
CSW	Commission of the Status of Women
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DC	Deputy Commissioner
EOC	Emergency Obstetric Care
FIDC	Forest Industries Development Corporation
GA	Government Agency
GAs	Government Agencies
GAM	Gender Analysis Matrix
GoB	Government of Bangladesh
HDC	Hill District Council
ICDP	International Child Development Program
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDP	Internally Displaced People
ILO	International Labor Organization
IWGIA	International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs
IP	Indigenous People
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MoCHTA	Ministry of Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs

NCTB	National Curriculum and Textbook Board
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NHRC	National Human Rights Commission
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCJSS	<i>Parbattyo Chattagram Jana Sanghati Samity</i>
PCP	<i>Pahari Chhattro Parishad</i>
PESDP	Primary Education Sector Development Program
PNC	Postnatal Care
PNDGs	<i>Para Nari</i> Development Groups
PSU	Primary Sampling Unit
SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SGBV	Sexual and Gender Based Violence
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioners for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNPFII	United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues
UNO	<i>Upazila Nirbahi Officer</i>
UNPO	Unrepresented Nations and People’s Organization
UPDF	United People’s Democratic Forum
USAID	United States Agencies for International Development
USF	Unclassed State Forests
VAW	Violence Against Women
VCF	Village Common Forests
WFP	World Food Program
WATSAN	Water and Sanitation
WHO	World Health Organization
YPSA	Young Power in Social Action

## Glossary

<i>Adivasi</i>	Indigenous People. <i>Adivasis</i> are also known as ‘ethnic communities’ and ‘tribal’ in Bangladesh.
<i>Ashar</i>	Third month of Bengali calendar year.
<i>Barga Shikhhak</i>	Hired teacher who perform the duties of a teacher in place of a teacher appointed by the government in CHT area.
<i>Bhikkhu Moth</i>	Buddhists cloister where Buddhism is taught and residential facilities are provided to learners.
<i>Chhorra</i>	Stream or canal is called ‘ <i>chhora</i> ’ in Chittagong Hill Tracts.
<i>Dai</i>	Midwife who attends during delivery in rural area of Bangladesh. Some of them have training on safe delivery but most of them do not have such training.
<i>Headman</i>	Head of a <i>mouza</i> in CHT. Headman is charged with collection of revenue, land and tribal justice administration at <i>mouza</i> level. He supervises the work of <i>karbaries</i> and responsible to the chief of the circle and deputy commissioner.
<i>Jum</i>	A traditional agricultural system practiced in Chittagong Hill Tracts by indigenous people that involves the clearing of jungle and the burning of dried debris, followed by a year or two of cultivation in a <i>jum</i> filed and then a fallow period of several years. In the fallow period vegetation is allowed to remerge. <i>Jum</i> cultivation is the only method of growing crops on the mountain slopes without causing too much harm to the soil.
<i>Jumma</i>	<i>Jum</i> cultivator. Indigenous people who depend on <i>jum</i> cultivation for their subsistence livelihood are regarded as <i>jumma</i> .
<i>Kancha</i>	Made of mud or earth, e.g., <i>kancha rasta</i> (earthen road).



<i>Karbari</i>	Hereditary head of a <i>para</i> (village) in CHT. He is traditionally nominated by the villagers, formally appointed by the circle chief and acknowledged by the administration. Although a <i>karbari</i> has no official power and authorities he is responsible to deliver the field taxes to headman and administer informal justice ( <i>salish</i> ) at <i>para</i> level. He receives no remuneration for services rendered.
<i>Khasland</i>	Government land
<i>Kua</i>	It means Well
<i>Machang</i>	Platform made of bamboo and wood. The indigenous people in CHT build their houses on <i>machang</i> . Sometimes they keep goods on <i>machang</i> and keep animals under <i>machang</i> .
<i>Nari</i>	Woman
<i>Pucca</i>	Concrete, e.g., <i>pucca rasta</i> (concrete road)
<i>Para</i>	A village under the control of a <i>karbari</i> .
<i>Sanatan Dharma</i>	<i>Sanatan (Sanatana) Dharma</i> is the original name of popularly known as Hinduism or Hindu <i>Dharma</i> . The terms Hinduism or Hindu <i>Dharma</i> are said to be a more recent development while the more accurate term is <i>Sanatan Dharma</i> .
<i>Shalish</i>	Informal justice system practiced in rural Bangladesh including CHT.
<i>Shanti Bahini</i>	An armed wing of <i>Parbattyo Chattagram Jana Sanghati Samiti</i> (PCJSS) was formed with the name of <i>Shanti Bahini</i> (Peace Force) by the then leader of CHT and Member of the Parliament (MP) <i>Manabendra Narayan Larma</i> . They struggled for autonomy of CHT.
<i>Sraban</i>	Fourth month of Bengali calendar year.

# CHAPTER ONE

## Introduction

### 1.1 Background of the Study

The notion of human security, gender and indigenous people is increasingly occupying the spaces of the knowledge system and the development discourse. It had long been remained patriarchal. At the same time, the orthodoxy of security has been masculinized and, therefore, disregarded the causal factors of insecurity which are differentiated by gender and that lived experiences of men and women are interconnected over various levels as well. Thus, women are largely invisible in security studies and the roles of women in development have been less recognized in one hand and the differential impacts of development based on gender have largely been ignored on the other. But, social justice and equity will be achieved only through equal opportunity and treatment which are inalienable for and prerequisite of the sound and sustainable development (Mohsin *et al.* 2009:5; O'manique and Macline, 2010:458).

Indigenous people carry a fragile but indispensable part of our common history, culture and heritage. They represent an irreplaceable diversity which is not exception in case of Bangladesh (UNPFII, 2004:1). Bangladesh is a country of natural beauty and cultural diversity with relatively having a small population of the indigenous community, often referred to as '*Adivashi*' in the national language, Bengali. They have their distinct languages, customs, traditions and culture. They can be categorized as marginalized ethnic group. The number of indigenous community is 27 according to the government estimate. But, ethnic communities themselves estimate the number as more than 45 (Gain, 2011:1). Among them, 11 communities live in Chittagong Hill Tracts (Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Forum – CHTDF, 2012:10). The indigenous people of this region are socially marginalized and deprived. Therefore, the government agencies (GAs) and non-government organizations (NGOs) have undertaken many development activities for the indigenous people of Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) to improve their socio-economic conditions, build their capacity, empower them, promote human security, and uplift their rights and potentials. But, to what extent indigenous men and women participate in these

development activities; how far they are benefitted from the development activities; whether the development activities are favorable to remove threats, or further create insecurities for the indigenous people, if they are still threatened; how do male and female deal with these threats? These questions should be investigated to have a greater understanding about the real situation of the indigenous people from gender perspective, to find out the way for their social inclusion, to make existing development initiatives gender redistributive and to create indigenous women friendly environment in particular. Therefore, the present study has been conducted as a humble endeavor towards that end.

## **1.2 Constitutional Commitment for Indigenous People in Bangladesh**

A large body of international and global machineries have been framed, particularly within the aegis of the United Nations (UN) that directly and indirectly impinge upon indigenous people's rights. These include the United Nations Charter of 1945 (Articles 1&55), the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948 (Article 2) and the International Covenants on Civil and Political Rights and on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of 1966 (Article 1), the Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) which have documented and acknowledged the indigenous people to focus greater attention to their issues and to make their voice heard throughout the world. In addition, a resolution on indigenous women was adopted at the 49<sup>th</sup> Session of the Commission of the Status of the Women (CSW) in March 2005 which is the first ever on indigenous women. Despite these, the UN has also declared 1993 as International Indigenous Year and 1995–2004 and 2005-2014 as 1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> International Decade of Worlds Indigenous People. Most recently, the General Assembly of the UN in 2007 adopted the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People. Such initiatives are the indication of recognizing the rights of the indigenous people and institutions as well as strengthening the cooperation for the solution of their problems.

Along with the international obligations, Bangladesh is bound by the Constitutional assurance of fundamental rights such as right to life, food, property and security for the indigenous people. Despite the fact that there is no mention of indigenous people directly or explicitly in the Constitution of Bangladesh, there are a number of provisions (Article 11, 15, 19, 20(1), 27, 28(1), 41, and 42) in it that are relevant to their rights. The government of Bangladesh has also ratified the ILO Convention on Indigenous and Tribal

Population (Convention No. 107 of 1957) in 1974 which recognizes the land rights of indigenous people. In addition, the government has recognized their vulnerable situation in terms of fear, insecurities, exclusion, social oppression and loss of cultural identity in chapter 5.3 of Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP).

The government has also enacted some laws that directly refer to the indigenous people's customs regarding the ownership and use of lands and other natural resources of the CHT. The most significant one is the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regulation, 1900. In addition, the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council Act, 1998, the Chittagong Hill Tracts Land Dispute Resolution Commission Act, 2001, the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regulation (Amendment) Act, 2003, the National Human Rights Commission Act, 2009, and Small Ethnic Groups Cultural Institution Act, 2010 were passed after the signing of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Accord, 1997 which ended armed conflict of more than twenty years and provided a framework for the recognition and strengthening self government system of CHT. These laws have both direct and indirect impacts on the lives of the indigenous people of CHT.

Regardless of such national and international pledges for ensuring their securities and rights, it is claimed that the indigenous people of Bangladesh face endless discrimination, harassment and have limited access to social services (Drong, 2006:56-58). The government has yet no specific policy for the development of indigenous people. Most significantly, it is notable that, there is no mention of the term indigenous people in the Constitution of Bangladesh. Some official documents refer them as tribal (*upojati*) or *adivashi*. Rather the Constitution includes them by referring the 'backward section of people' which makes their existence vulnerable. A recent law entitled *Kshudra Nrigosthi Sangskritik Protisthan Ain*, 2010 (Small Ethnic Minority Cultural Institute Act, 2010) has introduced a new identity for the indigenous people as ethnic minority group which leaves them in obscure regarding their identity question.

Since the state is the duty bearer for protecting and safeguarding the rights and ensuring security of indigenous people, it has some obligations to fulfill human needs, and to protect human rights to ensure equality. But the question is that how far these obligations are met. On the other hand, meaningful participation of both indigenous men and women in development planning, decision making bodies and overall development agenda is important for meaningful and sustainable development of Bangladesh. If they do not own

the development activities they will not act as change agents and thus will not be benefited and empowered. Their potentials should be explored and utilized for the improvement of their own and for the country.

### **1.3 Statement of the Problem**

Looking at the gender dimension of development interventions is immensely necessary for promoting a fair and just development that could create such an environment where insecurities, threats and discrimination will not be remained, and does not exacerbate the existing inequalities, rather enable both men and women to meet their human security needs and aspirations as well as ensure the human rights and social justice. According to the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (UPFII, 2004:1), there is often a reluctance to address this gender dimensions of indigenous people's issues. But gender-blind approaches to development will be failure to address the issues and problems of the indigenous women too. Indeed, the indigenous women have the equal participation and role in the struggle of indigenous people. Hence, any assessment of the benefits of development would be insufficient and potentially harmful if it does not differentiate the outcomes for female and male individually. Even ineffective and inefficient strategies could be formulated if we do not take into account the gender-based differences. A critical consideration, therefore, is needed and research should be conducted on integrating gender perspectives in implementing development intervention. It is also needed to call for attention to be paid to increase both men's and women's contribution and measures should be taken to fulfill their security needs and rights as well as to address the barriers to development intervention so that indigenous men and women could enjoy the full protection and guarantees against all forms of violence, discriminations and threats.

However, peace and security must be considered in the truest sense of the word: access to education, health, personal security and general freedom to live a life as the individual sees fit (Chakrabarty, 2004:56). Therefore, a lot of activities such as formal education, non-formal education for child and adult, primary health services through community and mobile clinics, micro-credit program for income generation, training for skill development, awareness building on legal issue, legal protection and legal aid; environmental conservation, strengthening the capacity of local community to defend land rights, remunerative employment, food security, ensuring water and sanitation and

infrastructure development programs have been undertaken for the development and interest of the indigenous people (Blie, 2006). But what are the effects of these services on the indigenous people and who have been benefited that have to be explored. It is the right time to investigate the above-mentioned issues and to rethink whether we need a new development strategies and interventions which will be pro-indigenous people, as well as to address gender aspects of human security and ensure the human rights and well-being of them. Hence, the study looks at the new means to reconstruct the development mechanisms for the protection and empowerment of indigenous people from gender perspective. This study also attempts to include the gender dimension by showing how the GAs, NGOs and international partner organizations have targeted male and female as target group of development initiatives and finds how these activities safeguard or create further threats to the indigenous communities. Hence, an endeavor has also been made through this research to expose whether any social safety network is existed within indigenous community that led their men and women to have the benefit of greater freedom.

#### **1.4 Conceptual Issues**

##### **1.4.1 Indigenous People**

The prevailing view on indigenous people is that no universal definition is necessary for the recognition and protection of their rights (UN Guidelines on Indigenous Peoples Issues, 2008:8). Considering the diversity of indigenous people, an official definition of indigenous people has not been adopted yet by any UN system body. Instead the system has developed a modern understanding of this term based on the following issues (UN Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues, 2008.):

1. Self-determination as indigenous people at the individual level and accepted by the community as their member;
2. Historical continuity with pre-colonial and or pre-settler societies;
3. Strong link to the territories and surrounding natural resources;
4. Distinct political, social and economic systems;
5. Distinct language and cultural beliefs;
6. Form non-dominant groups of society,
7. To maintain and reproduce their ancestral environment and systems as distinctive peoples and communities.

The International Labor Organization (ILO, 2009:187) defined indigenous people according to its convention No. 169 that the people who are regarded as indigenous on account of their descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to which the country belongs, at the time of conquest or colonization or the establishment of present state boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of the own social, economic, cultural and political institutions.

In the present study, indigenous people refers to that segment who are racially different, non-dominant and self-identified from the mainstream Bengalis and who have their own but distinct culture, language, heritage, religion, tradition, custom, modes of production, institution and ethnic origin. Here it should be mentioned that in Bangladesh, the indigenous people are generally regarded as ‘tribal’ or ‘small ethnic minority’ in official documents. However, this study has used the term ‘Indigenous’ as some laws such as Budget Act 12, 1995 and Rules 6, 34, 45, & 50 of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Regulation, 1900, section 97 of the East Bengal State Acquisition and Tenancy Act, 1950 refer them as indigenous. Moreover, this term is acceptable to the people concerned and also recognized in UN and other international process.

#### **1.4.2 Chittagong Hill Tracts**

The Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) is situated in the South-eastern parts of Bangladesh occupies a physical area of 5093 sq. miles covering 10 percent of the total land area of Bangladesh. This is the only mountainous area in the country. The region covers three districts: *Rangamati* (the study area), *Khagrachhari* and *Bandarban*. The region is surrounded by the Indian state of Tripura on the North and Mizoram on the East, Myanmar on the South and the East, and Chittagong district on the West. According to the Population Census 2011, the total indigenous population in country is 1,586,141 which represent 1.1 percent of total population of country and there are 8,45,541 indigenous people in CHT (Barman and Neo, 2014). The CHT is the homes to eleven indigenous ethnic groups. They are *Bawm*, *Chak*, *Chakma*, *Khumi*, *Kheyang*, *Lushai*, *Marma*, *Murang*, *Punkho*, *Tanchangya* and *Tripura*. They are collectively identified as the *jumma* people. The *jumma* people are different and distinct from the majority Bengali people of Bangladesh.

### **1.4.3 Development Intervention**

Development intervention is the means to understand the development process. According to Long (1989:234) development interventions are:

“.....always part of a chain or flow of events located within the broader framework of the activities of the state, international bodies and the action of the different interest groups operative in civil society. They are also linked to previous interventions, have consequences for future ones, and more often than not are a focus for intra- and inter-institutional struggle over perceived goals, administrative competencies, resource allocation and institutional boundaries.”

In principle, development interventions take place in a defined time-space setting relating two parties: the intervener and the target. Vrikkumen (2004 cited in Cerf & Magne, 2007:1) stated that the perspectives from which development intervention in work activities have been studied differ in two respects: 1) analyze the intentions of the interventionists and how they contribute to implement the policy and 2) Communities reaction towards such intervention.

The present study has employed the concept of development interventions as the actions intended to increase the country's ability to face the constraints of human security and sustain them in future. Hence, it has included those activities related to education, health, income generating program, environment protection, people's participation in decision-making process, violence prevention etc. as development interventions undertaken by the government and non-governmental organizations for securing human security and rights of the indigenous people of the CHT.

### **1.4.4 Human Security**

Human security is an emerging paradigm for understanding global vulnerabilities. The proponents of human security challenge the traditional notion of national security (UNDP, 1994; UN Millennium Report, 2000; Alkire, 2003). They argue that the security should be people centric rather than the state centered. Providing human centric security may involve protection from a range of threats including disease, hunger, unemployment, crime, social conflict, political repression and environmental hazards (UNDP, 1994:22). The UNDP (1994) first draw global attention to the concept of human security, in Human Development Report 1994, as freedom from want (it indicates to freedom from poverty) and freedom from fear (it intends to indicate freedom from violence) for all person is the



best path to deal with the global insecurity. The UN Millennium Report (2000) describes human security as freedom from fear, freedom from want and freedom of future generations to inherit a healthy natural environment which is the building blocks of human security. Alkire (2003:2) defined human security is to safeguard the vital core of all human lives from critical pervasive threats, in a way that is consistent with long term human needs fulfillment. She suggests that the vital core covers a minimum basic set of functions related to survival, livelihood, dignity; and all institutions should necessarily protect the vital core from any interventions.

The components of human security provided by the Human Development Report of UNDP (1994) has been used to identify the threats and insecurities faced by the indigenous men and women and to examine the way they are dealing with thereof. The components are economic security (basic income), food security (physical and economic access to food), health security (relative freedom from diseases and infections), environmental security (access to safe water, clean air and non-degraded land system), personal security (security from physical violence and threats), community security (security of cultural identity) and political security (enjoyment of basic human rights and freedom). Indeed, the concept of human security is relatively comprehensive due to its pro-people emphasis. Given the diversity in the emphasis and agendas in discussion on human security, the researcher has used this term in the present study in a holistic sense. The study mainly deals with political and personal security that are related with physical security and protection of human rights such as right to education, health, nutrition, employment, environmental protection, renunciation of violence and choices to fulfill his or her potentials.

#### **1.4.5 Gender**

The concept of gender generally refers to the social differences and relations between men and women which are learned and transformed as well as constructed and perpetuated by the patriarchal system in a given society. March *et al.* (2000:18) refer gender to describe all the socially given attributes, roles, activities and responsibilities connected to being male or female in a given society. Connell (2005:13) refers gender as “the structure of social relations that centers on the reproductive arena, and the set of practices that bring reproductive distinction between bodies and social processes.” Gender, therefore, has been used in the present study as a concept of socially distinct

category of male and female and the relationship between them who have socially expected and appropriate different roles and responsibilities that vary within and between cultures and affecting their abilities to make decisions, to share power and to assign tasks.

#### **1.4.6 Gender Dimension**

Gender dimension is a dynamic concept. It means to consider the gender based differences which shapes the immediate and long term needs and interests of men and women. With a view to eliminate the inequalities as well as promote gender equality in policies, programs and procedures Bekely (1997:15) notes that gender dimensions of development interventions:

“... Encompasses a whole range of areas, starting with the way we, as development agents and perceived the needs of those we seek to assist. Knowing the practical and strategic gender needs of women, their differences and the importance of the participation in identifying and meeting these needs by those concerned are paramount to the success of development interventions.”

Gender dimensions in development interventions have been defined in present study as the vast range of different effects of development initiatives both positive and negative on men and women, including how it affects the power relations between them, their rights, differential access to and benefits from the services in relation to security aspects. The present study has also grasped the gender dimension of human security as the experience of safeguarding from direct threats and structural discrimination for both men and women. But special attention has been given to the violence against women to understand the indigenous women’s experiences and perceptions of insecurities encounter in their everyday lives.

#### **1.4.7 Gender Analysis**

Gender analysis is a systematic way of looking at the different impacts of development policies, programs and legislations on women and men that entail collecting sex disaggregated data and gender sensitive information regarding the population concerned. It breaks down the dichotomy between the private and public sphere. It looks at how power relations within the household interrelate with those at the international, state, market and community level (March *et al.* 2000:18). The researcher has used the gender analysis framework (Gender Analysis Matrix) to realize the gender impacts of development interventions for human security of indigenous people in CHT. It has helped

the researcher to identify and address gender differentiated needs of indigenous people and understand the impacts of the development intervention on men and women.

### **1.5 Rationale of the Study**

The indigenous people live in CHT bearing special characteristics in Bangladesh like other countries in all over the world. They are socially marginalized and deprived of various services. The GAs, NGOs and other partner development organizations have undertaken various types programs to protect human rights and to improve socioeconomic conditions of the indigenous people of CHT. However, there have been many studies on diverse issues of indigenous people and indigenous women in particular, but so far the researcher's knowledge goes, very few studies on gender dimensions of human security and development interventions carried out in Chittagong Hill Tracts (Biswas, 2008; Chakraborty, 2004; Das, 2011; Halim, 2002 and 2003; Islam, 2010; and Rahman, 2009). But most the studies are limited within one issue such as violence against indigenous women (Halim, 2002 and 2003), security and social safety of indigenous people (Chakraborty, 2004) rights of the indigenous people (Biswas, 2008), land displacement (Das, 2011), health issue (Islam, 2010) and the role of development initiatives (Rahman, 2009) for the welfare of indigenous people.

There has been very little attention to the triangular interactions among human security, development interventions and gender dimensions. In addition, there is still lack of research on indigenous men's and women's own perceptions regarding defining the security needs that means how they conceptualize insecurities and threats in the context of indigenous community. There is also lack of information regarding the use of intersectionality approach (that gender, class and ethnicity are intersecting each other) in development interventions through which marginalization and social exclusion of indigenous people, particularly women, could be explained more authentically.

However, the present study, includes the different components of human security (see the conceptual issues) in a holistic sense to explain the development interventions for indigenous men's and women's security. It opens the discussion on the intersection of multiple forms of discriminations against indigenous people that limit and negate their potentials to exercise their rights and freedoms in all spheres of life. It investigates the threats faced by the indigenous people and how they deal with these insecurities within their community and struggles for their rights. In addition, the present study employs the

analytical frameworks of human security and intersectionality as theoretical underpinnings to analyze the findings which were not used by any of the above-mentioned studies. Moreover, gender analysis framework generates the data regarding expectations of indigenous people with regard to development interventions. In this respect, the present study bears new and different attributes from the previous studies.

It is expected that the findings of the study may produce new knowledge regarding security aspects of indigenous people and provide data for future works in this respect. Thus, perhaps other researchers in the future may develop further and consolidate through their works. The findings of the study may contribute to formulate policies and plans for pursuing development and empowerment of indigenous people through providing them with indigenous people friendly programs in Chittagong Hill Tracts in the context of Bangladesh.

### **1.6 Objectives of the Study**

The general objective of the present study is to understand gender dimensions of development interventions and human security of indigenous community living in Chittagong Hill Tracts in Bangladesh. To attain the general objective, the study has been guided by the following specific objectives:

1. To assess the gender roles, rights and responsibilities of both men and women in their daily lives of the study area;
2. To understand the local perception about human security in general and by the indigenous women, in particular;
3. To explore the gender dimensions of insecurities and threats that indigenous people encounter in their everyday lives; and
4. To identify the gendered impacts of development interventions run by the GAs and NGOs to protect and uphold the rights and securities of the indigenous people.

### **1.7 Assumptions**

The content of the present study pertains to studying the gender dimensions of development interventions and issues related to human security of the indigenous people living in Chittagong Hill Tracts. The study particularly highlights the existing gendered norms, gender division of labor, impact of development interventions on both men and women, and gender-based security issues. The study also investigates whether the development interventions increase security of the indigenous people or create further

insecurity. The study, therefore, draws a few assumptions to make critical analysis of the findings that helped in validating and clarifying the research issues. The assumptions are as follows:

1. Development interventions lack the conception of gender mainstreaming approach;
2. Development interventions are exacerbating insecurities instead of providing protection of the indigenous men and women;
3. The indigenous women are more vulnerable to violence and discrimination than that of indigenous men.

## **1.8 Theoretical Underpinnings**

The prior conceptual structure composed of theory and method provides the starting point for all observations (Schwandt, 1993). In fact, theory in qualitative research provides an explanation for behavior and attitudes of people. Theory also explains how and why the variables are related and acts as a bridge between or among the variables. This present study employs theory as up-front explanation (Creswell, 2003:131). The theoretical orientation has assisted the researcher to search the literature for concerns of diverse groups of indigenous people and issues of insecurities and threats, oppression and discrimination, to elucidate the power relation of indigenous community, to analyze the differential impacts of development interventions on indigenous men and women of diverse groups such as the *Tripura* and *Marma*. Theoretical perspectives and the way that two theories such as Intersectionality and Human Security have been operationalized has also been discussed below:

### **1.8.1 Intersectionality**

The theoretical foundation of intersectionality grew from the study of the production and reproduction of inequalities, dominance and oppression. The evolution of intersectionality as a theoretical framework traced back to Black feminists' responses to the limitations of the accumulated disadvantaged model (Mullings, 1997; Nakano, 1999) and the recognition that the intersection of gender with other dimensions of social identity are the starting point of theory (Crenshaw, 2005 cited in Shields, 2008:303). Intersectionality is a feminist theory, a methodology for research and a springboard for a social justice action agenda. It starts from the premise that people live multiple layered identities derived from social relations and the operation of structures of power.

Intersectionality is an analytical tool for studying, understanding and responding to the ways in which gender intersects with other identities and how these intersections contribute to unique experiences of oppression and privilege. It aims to reveal multiple identities, exposing the different types of discriminations and disadvantages that occur as a consequence of the combination of identities. It actually aims to address the manner in which patriarchy, class, oppression and other system of discrimination create inequalities that construct the relative position of marginal people and women in particular. The main aim of this tool is to reveal meaningful distinctions and similarities in order to overcome discriminations as well as insecurities and put the conditions in place for all people to fully enjoy their human rights (Association of Women's Rights in Development, 2004: 1-2).

Intersectionality can be used as a tool to include the structural and dynamic dimensions of the interplay of different policies and institutions. Single category of descriptions does not reflect the reality since we all have multiple identities and therefore may face intersectional discrimination (AWID, 2004). Weldon (2006: 239) argues that this term insists that we will not be able to understand the ways people are disadvantaged unless we examine the ways these structures interact. Certain aspect of inequality, problems and injustices will not be visible as long as we focus on gender, race and class separately. According to Weldon (2006) intersectionality refers to the intersection of social structures of disadvantage and not to the intersection of identities. In fact, it is impossible to talk about gender without considering dimensions of social structure and social identity created by multiplying features that play a formative role in gender's operation and meaning and foster inequality (McLean, 2005:25; Shields, 2008:303). Hence, the individual's social location as reflected in intersecting identities must be at the forefront in any investigation of gender to understand power relation, opportunities and distribution of resources. Gender must be understood in the context of power relations embedded in social identities (Collins, 1990:2000).

Hence, the researcher uses this framework to understand the complex and interwoven issues such as gender, ethnicity and geographical locations of indigenous people. This framework has helped understand the economic, social and cultural situation of indigenous people as well as whether development interventions and programs could achieve their full potentials. Since this analytical methodology is not categorical and top-

down, it assists to discover the full range of vulnerabilities, insecurities and experiences of indigenous people and women in particular. It has also helped the researcher to avoid the universalization of social locations. Encouraging by the work of Brewer (1993) regarding multiplicative nature of relationship between gender and ethnicity and Crenshaw (2005) regarding structural intersectionality, the researcher has employed intersectionality framework in this research for few reasons:

- a) It is helpful to understand how different sets of identities impact on access to rights and opportunities;
- b) It is a strategy for linking the grounds of threats to the social, economic, political and legal environment that contributes to discrimination and structures experiences of oppression, insecurities and privilege;
- c) Since the structures of oppressions such as ethnicity, gender and religion do not have only separate and additive effects and causes, rather influence one another in a multiplying way, this tool assists the researcher to avoid biasness and keep away from producing partial truth and inaccuracy in findings through emphasizing the intersections of other forms of disadvantages. Though, indigenous men and women are facing insecurities and threats, but the perception, impact and nature of dealing and participation in development interventions and with insecurities could be different due to their social location. Hence, the understanding of their situations, unequal power relations and explanations of challenges that they face have been revealed through using this analytical framework.
- d) Thinking about development from the perspective of intersectionality draws attention on specific contexts, distinct experiences and the qualitative aspects of equality, discrimination and insecurities, permits us simultaneously to work on behalf of ourselves and others.

### **1.8.2 Human Security**

The concept of security has long been traditionally interpreted as security of territory from an external aggression, protection of national interests in foreign policy, and the threat of a nuclear devastation from the global perspective (UNDP, 1994:22). With the shift from such traditional to non-traditional security paradigm in the last two decades, the approach has undergone a radical change. The state centric approach to security which since long remained a dominant paradigm of security, however, failed to address vital insecurity issues faced by the people (Afroze, 2010:16).

The United Nations and its agencies have successfully popularized the idea of human security as a compass of human development (Hussain *et al.* 2010:4). Since the idea of security is inalienable from the idea of insecurity, the United Nations Development Program (UNDP, 1994: 22) emphatically observed, “For most people a feeling of insecurity arises more from the worries about daily life than from the dread of a cataclysmic world event.” In fact, the phrase ‘human security’ is most often associated with the Human Development Report 1994 of the United Nations Development Program (UNDP, 1994) even though the term itself was in circulation earlier. Besides reports of several independent commissions like the Brandt Commission (1980), the Brundtland Commission (1987) and the Commission on Global Governance (1992) etc. paved the way for new thinking on the question of security. This was followed by a growing recognition of non-military threats to global security debates (Bajpai, 2000:7). The UNDP (1994) approach to human development represented a synthesis of earlier formulations on human security.

The UNDP (1994) report defined human security explicitly as: safety from chronic threat like hunger, disease and protection from sudden and harmful disruptions in the patterns of daily life. This report categorizes these whole ranges of human security into seven areas: economic, environmental, food, health, personal, community and political security. The report encompasses human security as both freedom from want and freedom from fear.

According to the report (2001) of the International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty (cited in Alkire, 2003:17), “The security of people – their physical safety, their economic and social well-being, respect for their dignity and worth as human beings and the protection of their human rights and fundamental freedom.”

The World Development Report 2000/1 of World Bank indicates human security as to ensure the human rights that mean every person is entitled to freedom of oppression, violence, hunger, poverty and disease and to live in a clean and healthy environment.

Commission on Human Security (2003:4) defines human security as, “to protect the vital core of all human lives in ways that enhance human freedoms and human fulfillment.”



Annan (2000:43-44) describes human security in its broadest sense. It encompasses human rights, good governance, access to education and health care and ensuring that each individual has opportunities and choices to fulfill his or her own potential. Freedom from want, freedom from fear and freedom of future generations to inherit a healthy natural environment are the interrelated building blocks of human security – and, therefore, national security.

Above mentioned definitions show that there is no internationally agreed definition of human security. The concept of human security is actually too broad to capture. The concept in its broadest sense means the conditions of daily lives of the people in which human dignity, absence of threats to human rights, freedom of choice and participation will remain and be ensured, rather than focusing on only military strength of a country. Therefore, this study adopts a flexible definition of human security as a concern with human life and dignity. Human security is achieved when indigenous men and women shall have the freedom from insecurities and threats of daily lives to enjoy and protect their human rights (such as right to education, healthcare, personal security etc.). Security symbolizes here as the protection from different threats like hunger, disease, unemployment, poverty, violence, conflict, environmental hazards etc. Needless to say all these securities are interrelated and interdependent on one another. Since human security is easily identified through its absence than its presence, this study identifies the modes of insecurities and threats faced by the indigenous women and men, locates whether development interventions reduces these insecurities and threats of indigenous men and women in CHT or gear it up, whether indigenous people can make and exercise their choices and opportunities safely and freely as well as become able to sustain such capabilities, whether these insecurities marginalize them due to intersecting factors like ethnicity, gender and social location.

### **1.8.3 Gender Analysis Matrix**

The Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) has been developed by Rani Parker (1998) in collaboration with development practitioners working for a Middle Eastern NGO. They express a need for a framework appropriate to their grassroots work. As a result, the GAM is very much influenced by the reality and ideology of participatory planning. It aims to help to determine the different impacts of development interventions on women and men by providing a community-based technique for identifying and analyzing gender

differences. It is a transformatory tool that intends to initiate a process of analysis by community members themselves. It encourages the community to identify and constructively challenge their assumption about gender roles.

The GAM is filled in by a group within the community which preferably should include men and women in equal numbers. The GAM can assess both the potential and the actual impact of an intervention on the community's gender relation. The GAM features two main concepts on a matrix which focuses on the impact of a development intervention (March *et al.* 1999:68).

The present study employs this matrix as it is a useful tool for impact assessment. Basically, it is designed to evaluate development interventions at a community level. Therefore, it is an effective way of bringing out local impact indicators building on the community people's own analysis. The analysis is done by the beneficiary groups of development interventions. The researcher has used GAM to analyze the roles and responsibility of the indigenous men and women at household and community level and gendered impacts of development interventions on them.

### **1.9 Organization of the Thesis**

The present study consists of nine chapters followed by a reference section. At the end, appendices have been incorporated for further information on some issues. **It is important to note that chapters five, six, seven and eight deal with the major finding of the present study.** A brief outline of the chapters has been presented below:

**Chapter I** deals with the research problem and rationale of the study leading to objectives and assumptions. It has also presented theoretical framework by describing the main theme of the theories and their implications in the present study.

**Chapter II** presents a detailed review of literature related to development interventions, human security and gender issues. The background information helped us to understand the contemporary situation related to studying relationship between development interventions, human security and gender issues as well as role of various stakeholders in the development of the CHT. It has also identified research gaps that have been addressed in present study.

**Chapter III** contains the methodological approaches used in this study. Research approach, sampling procedure and sample size, methods and techniques of data collection etc. have been discussed here with logic behind using a particular approach and technique. This chapter also sheds light on data analysis approaches and reasons for using qualitative approach. In addition, a brief description of validity and reliability, ethical issues and limitations of the study have also been presented here.

**Chapter IV** provides general information of the study area. Geographical location of the study villages/*para*, and communication system, employment opportunities, civic services etc. have been discussed here. It also provides detailed introduction of the two ethnic communities – the *Marma* and the *Tripura*.

**Chapter V** presents the socioeconomic characteristics of the respondents and gender issues. More specifically, it discusses age, education and occupation of the respondents; nature of household head, customs regarding child preference, inheritance, and gender roles and responsibilities. It also analyzes gender issues related to work opportunities, division of labor, mobility, decision-making rights and freedom of mobility.

**Chapter VI** attempts to provide a working definition of human (in)security and tries to outline the main factors related to security and insecurity among indigenous people. Hence, this chapter deals with the perception of the respondents regarding human insecurities and threats they face in their daily lives as well as their own efforts to combat such insecurities from gender perspective.

**Chapter VII** presents the development initiatives undertaken by the government agencies (GAs) and non-government organizations (NGOs) for the development in the study area. It also analyzes the impact of these initiatives on human security from gender perspective. More specifically, it discusses whether the development interventions enhance security of the indigenous people of the study area or further create insecurity for them.

**In chapter VIII**, in-depth issues related to human security and gender issues have been identified through case studies to supplement the interview data. Focusing on the lives and livelihood procedures of particular men and women of both communities, the case studies aim at demonstrating something of the harsh reality related to human security.

**Chapter IX** summarizes the major empirical findings of the study, presents theoretical implication, analysis of assumption and recommendations for policy formulation in the purpose of reducing insecurity of the indigenous people undertaking engendered development interventions through taking into account the socioeconomic and political realities of the CHT.

## CHAPTER TWO

# Review of Literature

### 2.1 Introduction

This chapter deals with the review of literature related to development interventions taken for the progress of the CHT and human security issues to identify the research gaps to be filled by the study. It is evident that a lot of studies have been conducted on various aspects of indigenous people in CHT. But studies on “Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security of Indigenous People in CHT” are very few. Although a considerable number of studies carried out in relation to indigenous people of CHT, but the researcher reviewed only those that are relevant to the present study. These studies have been divided into three groups such as (a) studies related to development interventions (b) studies related to human security and livelihood issues and (c) studies related to human security and gender issues.

### 2.2 Studies Related to Development Interventions

Chakma (2013) carried out an evaluation study on **Promotion of development and confidence building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts**. The study aims to analyze what have been done and achieved so far by the UNDP-CHTDF’s project towards promotion of development of indigenous people and peace-building in CHT. To carry out the study, data were collected both from primary and secondary sources. Union Councils’ chairmen and members, traditional leaders and VDC (village development committee) officials, local NGO workers, relevant Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Forum (CHTDF) officials and councilors of Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council (CHTRC) were interviewed as grass-root stakeholders to collect primary data. In addition, project documents, other evaluation reports and annual reports of UNDP-CHTDF, journal articles and daily newspaper reports were consulted for secondary data.

The findings showed that the major causes of the CHT conflict resulted from the continuous denial of identity of indigenous people, self-rule and development aggression by successive regimes. These issues led to guerilla warfare against the government of Bangladesh. In response to the guerilla warfare, the government tried to bring the CHT

into development through establishing the Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board (CHTDB). The CHTDB implemented various development projects on social, economic and infrastructural development. These economic development projects could not end the guerilla warfare rather served the purpose of counter-insurgency operations by facilitating military mobility across the whole CHT. The armed conflict between the GoB forces and *Parbattya Chattagram Jana Sanghati Samiti* (PCJSS) continued until 2 December 1997 when the CHT Peace Accord was signed. After that United Nations Development Program (UNDP) and Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facility (CHTDF) came up with the development intervention package of “promotion of development and confidence building” in CHT financed by the European Union and other donors. This project had five key strategic areas: capacity building of CHT institution; service delivery (on education, health and economic development); community empowerment; confidence building and enhancing the UNDP-CHTDFs operational and infrastructural capacity.

The findings showed that the components on basic services (health and education) and economic development were quite visible and the achievements seemed to be fairly on track as per the project plan. Through these components, CHTDF provided development services to some 3257 remote village communities across the whole CHT. This coverage should be treated as grand success in any respect. But the sustainability of these components after the CHTDF’s withdrawal remains a big concern. The study suggested that for peace building or implementation of the ‘critical issues’ of CHT Accord, it needed structural changes to the state policies and political support from different stakeholders like political parties, members of parliament, civil society, academics, and civil and military bureaucrats. The study highlighted that the measures should be taken for the development of the CHT and proposed some steps for better implementation of development programs. But it did not analyzed human security issues as well as did not focus on impact of development interventions on livelihood process from gender perspective.

UNICEF (2012) carried out an evaluation study on **Integrated Community Development Project in the CHT**. The study was conducted with a view to assess the project’s performance focusing on projects relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability. This study was based on primary data and review of documents (secondary data). Primary data collection was done through household survey of 2210 respondents,

*para* (village) worker survey of 340 sample, 9 focus group discussions and 15 case studies.

The findings showed that the project was well accepted and appreciated by the people of Hill Tracts. The project was able to provide pre-school child education, promote health and hygiene and to create awareness about nutrition amongst the target population. The findings also revealed the difference between intervention and non-intervention areas in terms of development of nutritional conditions, education, water and sanitation, availability of micro credit facilities for improving socio-economic condition of disadvantaged mother and child in the CHT. The findings showed that people of the study area were become more aware about their health, hygiene, benefit of nutrition, and sending their children to school. The study documented the outcome of community development project taken for the socioeconomic development of CHT people. But it did not analyze whether men and women are equally benefitted and did not investigate whether development interventions create further insecurity for the CHT people.

### **2.3 Studies Related to Human Security and Livelihood Issues**

Adnan and Dastidar (2011) conducted an exploratory study on **Alienation of Lands of the Indigenous People in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh**. The study provided description of the mechanisms of land grabbing as well as some provisional explanations of the causal factors driving this process and result of conflicts among various ethnic groups and social classes. The study employed qualitative approach in order to identify and analyze particular mechanisms and processes of land alienation as well as instances of resistance to these. Sixteen case studies of varying length were conducted to provide concrete instances of the land grabbing processes. Researchers firstly used unstructured interview and focus group discussion with the residents of CHT to collect relevant data. It also followed the content analysis approach and analyzed hundreds of secondary sources including legal documents, official reports, and correspondence, press reports etc. The study utilized the information related to the activities of the CHT Commission collected through discussions with individuals and agencies concerned, as well as documents submitted by the agencies to the commission. The research attempted to provide an interpretive analysis of the relations of expropriation and resistance between the groups and institutions concerned.

The findings of the study showed that the bewildering mechanisms used to apply to grab *Pahari* (hilly) lands in the CHT, along with violence and intimidation. For indigenous people, their lands including forest areas constitute resources indispensable for their physical survival as well as provisioning their distinctive social, cultural and religious needs. But lands were being forcibly acquired by the government agencies as well as by Bengali power-holders with connections to major political parties and agencies of the state for private commercial interests. Situation was become more complicated due to new pattern of land grabbing among Bengali interest groups as well as within *Pahari* ethnic groups. The consecutive failures of various governments in power since the signing of the CHT Peace Accord in 1997 to take effective measures against continuing in-migration and eviction of *Paharis* from their lands threatened to undermine the social and political stability of the CHT and raised the possibilities of renewed ethnic and political conflict. The study also concluded that CHT was in a post-conflict situation. Civil administration and security forces continued to operate counter-insurgency mindset. Correspondingly, almost all political parties continued to give priority to Bengali settler over the needs of indigenous people.

The study focused on ethnic conflicts on land grabbing through hegemonic nationalism and ethnic discrimination as well as highlighted the policy measures to prevent land alienation and restoring their occupied lands. The study also recommended some measures to overcome the barriers to implementing the policies for securing their land rights. But how such land grabbing process or threat of land alienation impacted on indigenous men and women's everyday lives were not discussed.

UNDP (2009) accomplished a study entitled **Socio-Economic Baseline Survey of Chittagong Hill Tracts**. The study aimed at generating bench mark information for understanding the periodic progress attained through interventions made into the region by UNDP-CHTDF. The study was designed to assess the baseline status of CHT population in terms of socio-economic indicators as well as status of peace promotion and confidence building. The survey produced extensive knowledge base on multifarious aspects of livelihood of all the twelve ethnicities living in the region.

The study used both qualitative and quantitative data. For understanding contextual issues and preparing methodology of the study, workshop, field visit and discussions were accomplished. A two stage random sampling strategy was adopted. At the first stage,



primary sampling units (PSUs – the *paras*) were chosen. A representative sample size of PSUs was determined as 199 *paras*. At second stage, the required number of households per selected PSUs was randomly chosen. The representative sample size was 3238. In addition, focus group discussion, stakeholder analysis, and consultation meeting were conducted to get deeper insights into the relevant issues. Nine different data collection instruments were used for collecting data. However, 199 *paras* in 29 unions of thirteen *upazilas* of 3 CHT districts have been covered in the study.

The study found that out migration was occurred in the study area due to security concern, and communal and political conflicts. An average indigenous household had to change the permanent address for almost 2 times. And 20% were displaced more than one. Most CHT population irrespective of indigenous and *Bengali* enjoyed some kind of land ownership. The composition of household assets among the indigenous people was dominated by the nature of plantation, poultry, livestock followed by type of home. All households possessed their own houses. Among them, 90% were fulltime employed and two-third of them was self-employed. Among indigenous income earner, 53% were male and 47% were female. Food poverty was widespread in CHT. Poverty situation of women needed grave concern as 94% were living below the absolute poverty line. About 82% children were enrolled in school but dropout was evident due to financial crisis, distance, insecurity, medium of instruction etc. Indigenous people had very low awareness and limited knowledge regarding health problems and available facilities.

There was widespread gender discrimination in collection of water. In dry season, all people of the study area experienced inadequate supply of water. Respondent also confirmed their inadequate hygiene situation. Possession of sanitary latrine among the CHT residents was not associated with sound practice. Indigenous people were found better positioned than the *Bengalis* in assessment of women and development issue. The overall practice of independent decision-making of women in CHT irrespective of indigenous and *Bengali* was somewhat insignificant. The prevalence of verbal abuse followed by battering was highly pronounced in CHT. In community level, the sexual abuse and intimidation at workplace were reported to be frequent by both the indigenous and *Bengalis*.

Majority of population of CHT possessed inadequate knowledge regarding the CHT Peace Accord due to absence of intensive discussion on the issue, absence of consensus among various communities, lack of education, low level of education, and memory recall problem. Existence armed conflict was found in the study area as per opinion of 20% households. A few of them also reported about abduction (6%) and extortion (17%). Majority of indigenous people informed that relationship between Bengali and them was hostile and not friendly. The study investigated the socioeconomic conditions of the indigenous people but did not focus on development interventions and their impacts on the livelihood process of the indigenous people. However, the study did not mention whether it used any theory to analyze the findings.

Hiscock (2008) carried out a survey on **Human Security in Bangladesh** for *Saferworld*. This study put emphasis into human security, community safety and armed violence. It tried to emphasize the linkage between different forms of human insecurity and human security, poverty, and development. The research identified eight categories of human security in Bangladesh. Four from these were largely concerned with freedom from want and the others were with freedom from fear. Five methods were used to gather information such as household survey, focus group discussion, key informant interviews, media survey and desk research.

The findings showed that the majority of Bangladeshis perceived freedom from want (poverty, unemployment, vulnerability to disaster, economic exploitation, and price-hike issues) as having the largest impact on their daily security. Poor health was found as a threat to human security as it undermined social and economic development. Respondents also listed insufficient food as food insecurity. Natural disaster, riverbank erosion, pressure on resources and climate change were identified as environmental threat in this study. On the other hand, personal property crimes, dowry related crimes, sexual violence and harassment, land grabbing and landlessness and slum eviction were reported as insecurity from the perspective of freedom from fear. Tenure insecurity and violence were found as community insecurity in CHT. The study results showed that gender was the most important dimension of human security. Women reported a higher degree of concern than men regarding insecurities. Women were concerned about gender-based violence while male reported incidents of public domain.

The study also analyzed the preventive and reactive role of the state in maintaining human security. Respondents mentioned NGOs, police station, union *parishad*/municipality, and health care centers as security providing institutions in relation to freedom from fear. Most respondents expressed that access to justice is limited by corruption, political interference, restrictions on legal aid and a huge backlog of cases. Non-formal security mechanisms (*gram pahara*, self-policing, neighborhood watch program etc.) for crime prevention and access to justice were also adopted by the respondents. Majority of the respondents preferred *shalish* as local and traditional form of justice. The findings showed the links between different forms of insecurity. For example, poverty was seen as cause of crime and political instability. Natural disaster was perceived as causes of tenure insecurity. On the other hand, political instability and violence were seen as barriers to economic development and hindrance to expanding education. This study highlighted the security and gender issues but did not focus on relationship between development interventions and insecurity.

Roy *et al.* (2007) conducted a case study on **Access to Justice for Indigenous Peoples in Bangladesh** to identify the main problems faced by indigenous people in looking for access to formal and traditional justice system. It also focused on their right to access to land and forests, their right to life and liberty and personal security, their right to gender justice and finally their right to participation in decision-making process and representation to local and national body. The study followed an inclusive and participatory approach. The study used interview, focus group discussion, case study and document analysis as the methods of data collection. The study involved representative voices of *Adivasis* (indigenous people) of different communities in both plain land and CHT. The *Santal* community of plain land from *Rajshahi* and *Dinajpur* districts, and the *Chakma*, *Marma* and *Tripura* from CHT were selected as sample of this study.

The study discussed the relevant political and historical context, economic and cultural background and the struggle to establish indigenous peoples' right. It outlined the legal framework including both formal and non-formal justice system as applicable to indigenous people. It set out the institutional framework and then analyzes the key obstacles indigenous people face in obtaining access to both the formal and non-formal justice systems against the background of the overall situation regarding access to justice for the majority populations of Bangladesh. The study also set out existing interventions

by the state and non-state actors to ensure access to justice for indigenous peoples. Although the study focused on key obstacles faced by the indigenous people in obtaining access to justice it did not analyze security issue of them. In addition, it did not discuss whether any development initiative was taken to remove the existing barriers to get access to justice.

#### **2.4. Studies Related to Human Security and Gender Issues**

ILO (2012) published a working paper on **Indigenous Women Workers with Case Studies from Bangladesh, Nepal and the America**. The aim of this paper was to examine indigenous women's position in the workforce participation. ILO commissioned three studies to provide a clear understanding of existing gender and ethnic-based discrimination of indigenous women workers. Two of the studies were undertaken in the Southern Asia (Bangladesh and Nepal) and third one was completed in the America. The empirical data used for Bangladesh was based on visits to communities in the CHT and Northern plain region. Through surveying the work situation of indigenous women and mapping the factors that determined their employment opportunities, one of the aims of the paper was to provide recommendations for a practical and integrated approach to addressing indigenous people's collective rights and combating discrimination against women workers. Wide ranges of secondary data were also used to compare the workplace status of indigenous women with that of indigenous men, and non-indigenous women.

The paper showed that the work carried out by the indigenous women as self-employed, unpaid family workers, or wage earners, was usually manual work in the agricultural and service sectors in the informal economy. This work was often unremunerated and undervalued badly paid precarious, lack social and legal protection and sometimes put their health at risk. Comparing with non-indigenous women, indigenous women were disadvantaged. They had little access to secure jobs, did more taxing tasks, and often paid less. Moreover, they suffered from discriminations, less mobile in comparison with indigenous men. Such discriminations had number of negative consequences on pay, benefits, social security entitlements, access to land, property, credit etc. Increased polarization in gender relations and division of labor affected their access to education, employment, capacity and social relation. Insufficient resources, lack of political power, qualified staff and sex disaggregated data created the gap between national and international legal framework and their implementation. The study analyzed the gender-

based discrimination of indigenous women at workplace. But it did not elaborately discuss how these types of discriminations created insecurity for women. It also did not analyzed whether any intervention taken to remove these discriminations as well as impacts of development interventions on indigenous community.

Roy (n.d.) submitted a report to South Asian Network to Address Masculinities (SANAM) entitled **Ethnic Conflict and Masculinities: A Study on the Impact of Conflict on Indigenous Men in Chittagong Hill Tracts**. The prime focus of the study was discourse on indigenous men's gender role, their role in conflict situation in response to nationalist project. The study was based on primary data collected through interview. Primary data were supplemented by secondary sources of information on CHT. The respondents of the study were from the *Chakma* (one of the ethnic groups of CHT) community, who were also member of *Shanti Bahini* (militant for maintaining peace) as these men were in the front line of the struggle in Chittagong Hill Tracts. The study scrutinized historical role of the *Chakma* men in family, society and economy from gender perspective to relate whether there were any changes of gender role among the *Chakma* men. The author employed social learning and masculine crisis theory to analyze the data.

The findings showed that the practice of hegemonic masculinity was replicated in the study area. There was a deep relation between nationalism and manhood. It was apparent that indigenous men adhered to and enacted nationalist movement for specific reasons. Persistent hegemonic state policies, deprivation, and discrimination led these men to produce nationalistic sense in them. Each of those men experienced incidents of violence and repression that prompted them to protest against hegemonic state ideology. There was a profound link between conflict and notion of masculinities. Post-conflict situation had a prevalent effect on the lives of men. Remaining in jungle and conducting rough and tough guerrilla life for long time, definitely changed men's attitudes and perceptions. In the perspective of CHT conflict, changes in masculine characteristics were remarkable among these *Chakma* men. Masculine characteristics were transformed when men had to response to nationalist project. During the insurgency period, maintaining guerrilla style those men became 'arrogant', 'hegemonic', 'bold', 'outrageous' for the autonomy of CHT and to achieve rights of the ethnic people. They decided to join in *Shanti Bahini* as it was their 'rational choice' instead of not having father's consent. At the same time those

men used to obey their father's advice of not hurting anyone unjustifiably which implies the rule of dominant patriarchal ideology over their lives somehow. After returning to normal life, those men conformed to some masculine characteristics which they used to maintain in guerrilla life. They still had 'strong feelings' for the peoples' rights in CHT signified that a very resilient nationalist ideology was persisted on their mind. At the same time they felt 'proud' for sacrificing their major part of life for the hill people's rights. It is obvious that the study profoundly discussed the impact of insurgency and guerilla life on the *Chakma* men from masculine point of view. But the study did not highlight the issues of insecurity and impact of development intervention on both men and women from gender perspective.

Islam (2010) carried out his study titled **Maternal Morbidity and Mortality among Indigenous People in Bangladesh: A Study of the Mru Community**. The study was conducted among the *Mru* indigenous people to comprehend their maternal health status and the factors associated with it. The study was carried out in three *upazilas* of *Bandarban* district. The study followed the mixed method approach combining both qualitative and quantitative approaches. The number of respondents was 374 currently married women having at least one child aged less than five years or women having at least one delivery experience selected purposively from three *upazilas*. Besides, 26 respondents were selected for in-depth interview. The collected data were analyzed through uni-variate, bi-variate and multivariate table analyses.

The findings showed that the maternal health condition was poor among *Mru* women and only less than one third of them had access to health care services which was one of the reasons for their poor health. Their access to maternal health care services was beyond geographical, linguistic, cultural and economic reach. The nature of complicity they faced during pregnancy, delivery and after delivery was high blood pressure, eclampsia, premature rupture of membrane, post-partum hemorrhage etc. The study also revealed that one out of the nine *Mru* women took prenatal care whereas one out of sixteen women visited for postnatal care. More than half of the respondents mentioned long distance and lack of transportation facilities, low level of education, nature of occupation, and lack of resource as important reasons for not receiving any antenatal and postnatal care. The delivery care and use of contraception were also low among the respondents as compared to Bengali mothers.

The study demonstrated that maternal mortality seemed to be higher as all deliveries were home-based assisted by traditional midwives and traditional beliefs and practices after delivery were also responsible for their higher death. This high maternal morbidity and mortality rate in the *Mru* society was interwoven with socio-economic and cultural factors, spatial factors and clinical factors. Hence, the study concluded with urgent requests for implementation of special health care strategies such as development of obstetric care and maternal health programs, replacement of existing traditional midwives by well-trained midwives, community-based collaborative strategy and to train the *Mru* girls as midwives, *Mru* language-based maternal health education and family planning programs with special emphasis on awareness through mass media. The study presented poor health condition with high mortality of the *Mru* women. But how did poor health condition create insecurity was not examined.

## **2.5 Research Gaps**

In general, there are a few empirical studies analyzing how indigenous men and women perceive security threats and how development impacts them in securing their rights separately. Previous studies that discretely focused on violence, displacement, endangered forests, health status and limitations of access to justice were limited to indigenous people's reports either related to impact of development interventions or different aspects of their livelihood issues. Therefore, the present study is an attempt to collect information from both indigenous women and men who are the beneficiaries of development interventions as well as from the service provider, and analyze human security from gender perspective and context of the study area. In addition, the literature review explored two levels of research gaps in the area such as contextual and theoretical.

Literature review suggests that many development interventions were undertaken for indigenous community to protect their rights and promote well-being. At the same time, some studies also reflect the disruption and destruction of indigenous life and nature in the name of development. But what roles indigenous men and women play in their everyday lives, how do they indicate their insecurities, what strategies they utilize to face them, how do they perceive development and describe its impact, have been emphasized only by a few studies. There is no doubt many studies focused on different aspects of insecurities once at a time like economic exploitation, food insecurity, poor health status, environmental degradation, tenure insecurity, unstable political system, terrorism, gender

violence etc. But there is very little empirical evidence to incorporate the notion of human security. Even the previous studies hardly addressed the gender dimension of both security needs and development interventions. Moreover, previous studies on indigenous people in CHT hardly incorporated African/western theoretical underpinnings, for instance, intersectionality. Therefore, the present study uses the notions of intersectionality (Crenshaw, 2005) to analyze how gender, religion and ethnicity interweave each other, and human security (UNDP, 1994:22-24) to analyze either development interventions reduce insecurities or further accelerate it as well as whether their social locations and identities create insecurities as theoretical underpinnings. Furthermore, Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) has also been used to assess the development impact on women and men from gender perspective.

So far the researcher's knowledge goes there are a few empirical studies that considered what actually human security is meant by the indigenous people. The previous studies did not address the gendered local perception about the concept of human security. Hence, the present study is an attempt to conceptualize the human security from the view of indigenous men and women and analyze how they symbolize security and insecurity. The study analyzes the factors related to insecurity, how the factors affect the indigenous people individually and collectively, and how they combat insecurities and threats of their daily lives. It also identifies the issues that should be considered in policy adoption and implementing plans and programs to combat insecurities.



# CHAPTER THREE

## Methodology

### 3.1 Introduction

This chapter deals with methodological approaches employed in this study with strength as well as logic of using some methods in accordance with the research problem. Methodological approach of this study is inspired by Silverman's (2005:99) observation: "methodology refers to the choices we make about cases to study, methods of data gathering, forms of data analysis etc. in planning and executing a research study." But, it should be noted that it is very difficult to simply choose a method and adhere to it in research study because of some limitations of a particular method. Therefore, this chapter discusses the methods followed in this study, the relationship among the various parts of the research project, the implication of the choices made and the limitations of the methods chosen.

### 3.2 Research Approach

Qualitative approach was followed to conduct the research tasks. Qualitative approach is one which gives the researcher a deeper understanding of social phenomena. It is an interpreted approach concerned with understanding the meanings that people attach to different phenomena such as beliefs, decisions, values and actions etc. within their social milieu (Bryman, 1988:8; Denzin & Lincoln, 2000:3; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003:3). As a result, it has been useful to the researcher to realize social circumstances, experiences, understanding of the respondents regarding the various aspects of threat, insecurity and discrimination against indigenous men and women as well as the barriers faced by the indigenous men and women as beneficiaries of development interventions. The approach also helps to understand whether they are benefited in terms of attaining security and promotion of human rights by the development activities. This approach provided the researcher with opportunity to observe the behavior of indigenous men and women in everyday situations in natural settings and made a sense of and to interpret phenomena in terms of the meaning they brought to the researcher. Moreover, this enables the researcher to sketching the details of indigenous people, their roles, responsibilities, and their experiences regarding the development interventions through emic perspective i.e.

penetrating to their frames of meanings. Another reason for using this approach was that it is emergent in nature not prefigured. As a result, the researcher could change or redefine the learning about the phenomenon of interest. Considering the above-mentioned merits qualitative approach was used in this study.

### **3.3 Selection of the Study Area**

The study looks at the gender dimension of human security and development interventions undertaken for the development of the indigenous community. Hence, Chittagong Hill Tracts was purposively been selected as the study area. This area was remained the most conflicting area for the ethnic and religious minorities since the mid-1970s. An incessant insurgency by the CHT indigenous people against the Bangladesh state, security forces and the state-sponsored Bengali settlers occurred to protect themselves from the perceived exploitation and misery that they have been subjected to over the past decades (Punday and Jamil, 2009:1055). The military intervention, demographic engineering, socioeconomic assistance as counter insurgency strategies by the state added fuel to the fire of continuing struggle of indigenous people (Barakat *et. al.* 2010:2). This long-standing armed conflict and bloodshed in CHT came to an end following the signing of an agreement popularly known as CHT Peace Accord between the government of Bangladesh and the PCJSS. Even if, The CHT Accord ended a two and half-decade insurgency war, it failed to reduce the military presence and influence in civil matters, distrust and hostility between Bengali and indigenous people, forcible occupation of the land of indigenous people, in-migration of Bengali settlers, ethnic conflict, structural violence (Gain, 2011:3-4; Islam and Chakma, 2013:40-41). Thus, the post-Accord situation became more complex than ever past and created insecurities for the indigenous people of the region. Therefore, six *paras/villages*: *Asam Basti and Garjontali* from *Rangamati* municipal area, *Killamura* from *Rangamati Sadar upazila*, *Kukimara* from *Kaptai upazila*, *Chaklachhari* from *Rajasthali upazila* and *Kochukhali* from *Kawkhali upazila* of Rangamati districts of CHT were selected as the study area. Among the six areas indigenous people of the *Tripura* community from *Garjontali*, *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* and the Marma from *Asam Basti*, *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* were selected as respondents. Some factors such as accessibility, possibility of establishing rapport with the respondents, possibility of getting information related to the research objectives, expectation of support from both indigenous people and local administration

were taken into consideration in the selection process of these para/villages as the study area.

### **3.4 Sampling Procedure and Sample Size**

Qualitative approach applies non-probability sampling in which units are deliberately selected to reflect particular features of sampled population. The samples are not to be statistically representative rather the characteristics of the population are used as the basis of selection. Therefore, purposive sampling was employed for the present study as it gives the opportunity to select unique cases that are informative, have particular features which enable detailed exploration (Richie & Lewis, 2003:78) and to identify the particular types of cases for gaining deeper understanding of the types. Such sampling is also concerned with constructing a sample framework which is meaningful and sensible theoretically (Mason, 1996:252). This type of sampling procedure gives the researcher ample opportunities to change the size of sample during the study and to choose cases in terms of the theories.

Considering the merits of purposive sampling procedure first *Rangamati* district of CHT was selected as the study area considering the availability of respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities. After that *Rangamati* municipal area and four *upazilas* (*Rangamati Sadar, Kaptai, Kowkhali* and *Rajasthali*) of *Rangamati district* and then six *paras* (*Asam Basti, Garjontali Killamura, Kukimara, Kochukhali* and *Chaklachhari*) were selected through using stratified sampling. However, the samples of the study were indigenous men and women who were the participants and beneficiaries of development program from two indigenous communities i.e. the *Tripura* and the *Marma*. Development program officials who were directly dealing with these target people and the community heads of indigenous people were selected as key informants.

However, qualitative samples for a single study involving individual interviews only often lay under 50. Otherwise it becomes difficult to manage in terms of quality of data collection and analysis (Richie & Lewis, 2003:84-85). Therefore, 18 respondents from the each community were selected as sample for the study. Moreover, four case studies from the *Tripura* and four case studies from the *Marma* community were selected for in-depth understanding. Officials of development organizations such as UNDP, BRAC, were chosen as key informants. One gender specialist and two executive officers from local NGO were also selected as Key informants. Two Headmen and two *karbaris* from the

both *Tripura* and *Marma* and two members of Union *Parishad* have also been selected as key informants who have the knowledge of their own culture, gender dimension and the impact of development intervention and human security as well.

### **3.5 Methods of Data Collection**

As the present study is qualitative in nature, it used both narratives as well as text information to attain the study objectives. Therefore, both open and close ended and semi structured interviews, focus group discussions, and partial participant observation methods were used to collect primary data. In addition, case study method and document analysis were used to supplement the data collected through interviews.

However, it is obvious that all methods have some limitations; but biases inherent in any single method could be minimized by using more than one method (Creswell, 2003:15). Therefore, triangulation was applied in this study to develop a comprehensive understanding of phenomena and to provide different insights into different levels of analysis. Triangulation is a characteristic of qualitative design as it allows for multiple views of framing the problem, selecting research strategies and extending discourse across several fields of study. However, 'Methodological triangulation', a term coined by Denzin and Lincoln (1989), implies that the researcher may use several methods in different combinations in order to gain the most detailed picture of participants' experiences. It also increases confidence in research data, creates innovative ways of understanding phenomena, reveals unique findings (Thurmond, 2001:254). Keeping this view, data were collected for the present study by using the following multiple methods of data sources:

#### **3.5.1 Interview**

Semi-structured interview consists of several key questions that help to define the area to be explored. It also assists the researcher to diverge in order to pursue ideas and responses in more detail. The flexibility of this approach also allows for the exploration and elaboration of information that is important to participants but not has previously been thought of as pertinent. Reason in choosing this method was also its interactive and generative nature where researcher and the respondents generate the necessary information and new knowledge regarding the purpose of the study. The in-depth analysis allows researcher to explore all the factors that underpin participants' answers regarding reasons, feelings, opinions and beliefs (Richie and Lewis, 2003:141-143).

However, open ended, neutral, sensitive and understandable questions were set in interview schedule for building rapport with and confidence among the respondents and to make them comfortable. Besides, the respondents were asked clarificatory, exploratory, explanatory and amplificatory questions to obtain a full description of perception of human security, gender roles and responsibilities; understanding what underpins the respondents' attitudes and behavior towards development interventions as indigenous men or women. Moreover, following the suggestion of Kvale (1996), Marshall and Rossman (1999); Rubin and Rubin (1995), and Thompson (2000) some techniques were used by the researcher such as listening, logical thinking, displays tranquility, demonstrating respect and interest for achieving the respondents' perspective, meanings and experiences. Explanatory responses in relation to non-implementation of peace accord, government's decision for changing their identity as ethnic minority group from indigenous people, role of land commission regarding land grabbing, economic insecurities were furnished by the respondents in this study.

Face to face interview technique was used in the study as primary method of collecting primary data for its openness and flexibility. It provides the deeper understanding of social phenomena and detailed insights of participants. However, the researcher used semi-structured interview as it guides interview session in a proper way to achieve the targets of interview.

### **3.5.2 Observation**

Observation entails the systematic noting and recording of events, behavior and artifacts in the social settings chosen for study. It allows events, actions and experiences to be seen through the eyes of researcher without any construction on the part of those involved (Richie & Lewis, 2003:35). It is a fundamental and highly important method in all qualitative inquiry. It is used to bring out the complex interactions in natural settings. It is useful when researcher wants to observe certain sampled situations as well as people rather than trying to become immersed in the entire context.

The researcher used the partial participant observation as it provided the researcher with the opportunity to observe the contour of talk as well as the body languages of the respondents when they described their deprivation and insecurities they face in their daily lives. Sometimes the respondents were reluctant to express their insecurity directly but

their facial expression and body language showed their vulnerabilities that are captured by observation.

### **3.5.3 Case Study**

The case study is utilized in order to gain an in-depth examination of social interaction within a single social setting; this may be within an organization and focused on the playing-out of a specific social process (Yin, 1994). Case studies aim to offer richness and depth of information by capturing as many variables as possible to identify how a complex set of circumstances come together to produce a particular manifestation. Eight case studies were taken from both of the *Tripura* and *Marma* communities for understanding individual's attitudes and beliefs regarding gender dimensions of everyday lives, meaning of insecurities, whether ethnicity made any difference in creating discrimination and so on.

### **3.5.4 Focus Group Discussion**

Focus group discussion method creates the opportunity for asking focused question from a number of respondents at the same time to stimulate discussion and thereby understand the meanings and norms which those group answers (Bloor *et al.* 200:43 cited in Marvasti, 2004). Even such discussions encourage the respondents that they elaborate on each other's answer which produce richer data and insights (Fontana and Frey, 2000:652; Morgan, 1997 cited in Marvasti, 2004:171). It reduces chances of distorting answer as the respondents have to give answer in presence of other. Less structured approaches in focus group discussion was used in the study to realize the participants' understanding about the theme. One of the important reasons for applying this method was of its spontaneity that arises from the participant's social context which offers the opportunity to see how ideas and language are emerged and shaped through conversation with others. However, four focus group discussions (FGDs) were organized at *Killamura*, *Kukimara*, *Asam Basti* and *Chaklachhari* to capture the respondents' view and understanding about gender dimension of human security and impacts of development interventions in natural settings. Participants explored the topic regarding impacts of development project, land grabbing process, presence of army in CHT, relationship between Bengali settlers and them and non-implementation of peace accord.

The researcher facilitated the groups as moderator to obtain required data from natural settings. Before probing into the main questions and discussion, introduction of research

objectives and procedures were explained briefly to the participants. Following the suggestion of Dunbar *et al.* (2002), the social context of the respondents' answer and their experiential standpoints were taken into consideration, and respondents were encouraged to break the silence, motivated to speak out as well as techniques of self-disclosure were applied by the researcher to put respondents at ease to participate as well as gaining their trust about the purpose of the study.

### **3.5.5 Document Analysis**

Document analysis is the study of existing documents, either to understand their substantive content and to illuminate deeper meanings which may be revealed by their style and coverage. Researching documents is particularly useful where the history of events or experiences have relevance and where private as well as public accounts are needed. Public documents like media reports, government papers or publicity materials, procedural documents (e.g. minutes from meeting, formal letters or financial accounts) etc. were used in the present study. It was helpful to set up objectives, questionnaire, comparing documents and cross referencing. Even these documents helped the researcher to understand the context of respondents, their culture and the history of deprivation, background of insurgency and ratification of peace accord, and land and forest system of CHT.

### **3.6 Data Processing and Analysis**

Qualitative data analysis method was used in the study to process and analyze the collected data. Collected raw data were processed through transcription and translation as transcribing and translating text became increasingly salient feature in the qualitative research. Inspired by Huberman and Miles (1994 cited in Marvasti, 2004), the researcher followed some steps to bring coherence and manageability to the analysis of data. First, the researcher reduced relevant data in an anticipatory way from the universe of data. While interviews, field notes and other data were available to researcher, summarization, coding, finding themes clustering and writing stories were started. The researcher took measures for narrowing the topic to human insecurities that faced by indigenous people, their evaluation regarding development intervention, their aspiration towards the GAs and NGOs etc. Textual representations for data display were used to illustrate the concepts of this study through data transcription and research memos. To strengthen the qualitative

analysis, verbatim quotations of the respondents and thematic analysis were also been applied in the study.

However, methods of agreement and methods of differences form the basis of analytic comparison of the findings which was employed in the present study for making comparison of the findings. Method of agreement helped the researcher to draw the attention on what is common across cases though other features of cases might differ. Accordingly the researcher argued that despite the enduring cultural and religious differences between the *Tripura* and the *Marma*, the critical similarities such as insecurities of employment, education, violence, land grabbing, and dissatisfaction regarding non-implementation of some clauses of the CHT Accord and changing their name (identity) from indigenous or tribal to small ethnic groups are existed. On the other hand, methods of difference helped the researcher to look for cases that had many of the causal features of positive cases but lack a few key features and had a different outcome. For instances, regardless of majority of respondents have expressed their grief regarding the change of their name or identity, few educated and job holders opined that identical name did not matter. Rather assurance of getting the rights which they wanted to enjoy was matter. Furthermore, opinions of the indigenous people who used to live in urban area regarding insecurities differed from the people who used to live in remote area.

The researcher also used the methods of contrast between contexts for data analysis to understand distinctive features of the *Tripura* and the *Marma* along with their cultural meaning of insecurities and gender roles which they faced in their everyday lives. This method assisted the researcher to find out unique features that shape the general process and to apprehend the ideal type to show the specific circumstances, cultural meanings and the perspectives of specific individual for understanding the social settings or process. For example, *Trijinad*, one of the key informants, described how military administration has grabbed the hilly areas for making tourist spot and made the indigenous people landless, unemployed, homeless and insecure for their livelihood. This description reflected the pattern of insecurities and attitudes towards existence of military in CHT.

Conversation analysis was also applied to analyze the data from interactional sequence of the study as it captures how the respondents in the course of their everyday activities achieve and maintain social reality and order. Gender roles and responsibilities of indigenous men and women, their granted norms, their perception of human security, and



way to resolve the insecurities were brought to analysis through verbal exchanges and natural interaction with others.

The researcher used thematic analysis for the qualitative data of the study. Inspired by Braun and Clarke (2006), the researcher followed some steps to analyze the data. The researcher read and re-read the verbal data through transcribing it before coding for searching the meaning and pattern. Then researcher generated the initial coding manually of data corpus for potential themes. After that the researcher sorted different codes into potential themes and subthemes and discarded other irrelevant codes. For refining the themes, the researcher ensured the coherent pattern of themes through refinement of the themes that means if the data were not fit into the theme researcher rearranged it. At that moment, researcher named the themes concisely and created the individual narratives. The researcher tried to put sufficient evidence of each theme from the data later (see in Findings part).

### **3.7 Dependability and Credibility**

Reliability and validity are the salient features of credible research but perfect reliability and validity are virtually impossible to achieve (Neuman and Krueger 2003:177). The present study denotes maintaining the reliability (means consistency or dependability) and validity (means truthfulness and credibility) of qualitative data (Corbin & Strauss 1990; Crabtree & Miller 1992, Lincon and Guba, 2002). According to Guba (cited in Shenton, 2004), four criteria could be maintained in pursuit of trustworthy study such as credibility, confirmability, transferability and dependability. The researcher employed reliability and validity in above sense.

#### **3.7.1 Reliability**

As the present study is qualitative one, the researcher considered a wide range of data sources and employed multiple measurement methods to get distinctive results and the diversity that exists in social world. It included various checks on how evidence was gathered for ensuring the integrity of research. According to Seale (cited in Silverman, 2001:226), the strategy of low inference descriptors is associated with high reliability of qualitative research. Hence, systematized field notes, detailed description, distinguish between *etic* analysis and *emic* analysis was used for ensuring reliability of qualitative data.

### **3.7.2 Validity**

The validity of research findings refers to the extent to which the findings are an accurate representation of the phenomena they are intended to represent. For maintaining validity the researcher followed several techniques such as adopting more applicable operational meaning of the concepts, data collection methods and tools, and analysis procedures. Besides, the researcher consulted different documents in relation to CHT Peace Accord, development interventions undertaken by the GAs and NGOs, gender dimension of indigenous people, human security of indigenous people etc. before first data collection dialogue took place for an early familiarity with the indigenous people's culture of CHT. The researcher also emphasized on triangulation which involves different data collection methods such as in-depth interview, observation and focus group discussion. Moreover, the researcher analyzed the ideas and experiences of service provider of development interventions for instances BRAC personnel, UNDP personnel that gave the researcher ample opportunity to check the user's attitude and behavior as well as enhanced the contextual data related to field and sites through site triangulation.

Furthermore, the researcher applied respondent validation (to validate research findings by taking back to the respondents with research findings to see whether they conform to their own experiences) for ensuring that the researcher presents data in consistent with the informant. Indigenous people provided feedback on the researchers' interpretations of their responses, comparing the firsthand knowledge with what other evidences or past studies showed that enabled researcher to treat the data as a whole rather than fragmenting it. The researcher tried to ensure credibility of research finding by following the above-mentioned procedure.

### **3.8 Research Ethics**

The researcher has a moral and professional obligation to be ethical, even when research subjects are unaware of, and unconcerned about ethics. Indeed, many subjects are less concerned about protecting their (respondents') privacy and other rights than researchers (Sieber, 1993). In this connection, Gillespie (1999:884) opined that researchers must try to minimize risk to participants, colleagues and society while attempting to maximize the quality of information they produce. This type of ethical position helps a researcher to avoid scientific misconduct, research fraud and plagiarism, charges of insensitivity and abuse of power and trust that could occur in conducting the research. Hence, the

researcher prohibited herself from causing unnecessary and irreversible harm to subjects and humiliating subjects, releasing the harmful information about specific individual that was collected for research purposes. Even the researcher avoided any kinds of deception, specially forbidden the deliberate misinterpretation and restrained from any kind of fabrication of fraudulent materials for maintaining the accuracy of data. Therefore, the main ethics in the study were informed consent, anonymity and confidentiality and benefit to the research participants.

### **3.8.1 Informed Consent**

The respondents have the right to be informed regarding the nature, objectives and consequences of research in which they are involved and participated in. Since proper respect for human freedom generally includes two conditions such as voluntary participation without physical and psychological coercion and agreement must be based on full and open information (Christians, 2000:138-139). It also assists the subject or respondent to be fully aware of the implication of their involvement in the study (Marvasti, 2004: 134). Therefore, the researcher provided a brief description of the background, objectives and procedures of the study along with its benefits such as addressing their concerns before taking any interview as well as focus group discussion. However, it should be mentioned that there was a tension between mainstream people and indigenous people and being a member of mainstream, indigenous people were confused and a little bit worried at the time of data collection and they had many questions which they asked the researcher. So, the researcher had to provide the assurance of no harms or risks would come to them by this research. When the respondents were agreed to take part voluntarily and enthusiastically, then the data collection procedures was started by the researcher. The verbal consent was taken from the indigenous male and female as they were reluctant to give written consent.

### **3.8.2 Privacy and Confidentiality**

The researcher should transgress the privacy of subjects in order to study the social behavior. Hence, the researcher in the present study applied two forms of privacy through maintaining anonymity and confidentiality. By following the ethics of anonymity, the researcher tried to protect the identity of the respondents from being known and used pseudonyms name so that they would not be disclosed to anyone. The researcher created

a set of pseudonyms for all research participants and used them in transcription instead of their real names.

It is significant that confidentiality must be assured as the primary safeguard against unwanted exposure. All personal data of the respondents ought to be secured and concealed and made public only behind a shield of anonymity (Newman and Kruger: 139). Since the disclosure of private knowledge is considered damaging, the researcher was aware not to make any harm or embarrassment to the respondents. The researcher maintained confidentiality of given information by the respondents.

### **3.8.3 Benefiting Research Participants**

The research participants provided the raw data for analysis by sharing their times and social experiences but usually they are not compensated financially for their contribution (Marvasti, 2004:138). So, the ethical concern is to ensure researcher-respondents relationship is mutually beneficial. In this study, the researcher tried to maintain this ethics by increasing awareness of the respondents regarding their perception of human security, available development interventions by the government and NGOs in CHT make respondents more aware of their choices such as implication of Peace Accord in CHT, role of Land Commission and Forest Department etc. The researcher also tried to provide new perspectives of human security on old problem of human rights.

### **3.9 Limitations of the Study**

In spite of whole hearted effort of the researcher there are several limitations in the present study. For in-depth understanding, the study was conducted in a limited geographical area and on only two ethnic communities – the *Marma* and the *Tripura*. It did not investigate human security of the other ethnic groups as well as the *Marma* and the *Tripura* as a whole live in other parts of CHT. However, the study only reveals the personal and political security of two indigenous communities but many securities like environmental security, community security are still yet to be exposed. With regard to methodology, qualitative approach was mainly followed in this study. Therefore, it has not examined cause-effect relationship between development interventions and human security by applying statistical tools. Therefore, more studies may be undertaken on the identified areas that were not covered in the present study.

This chapter provided a thorough description of methodological approaches that were applied in the present study to achieve the research objective. Although there were some limitations such as the study was carried out in a limited area with a small number of respondents but it will provide a logical ground to reach a conclusion considering the positive aspects of qualitative approach.

## CHAPTER FOUR

# The Study Area and Community Profile

### 4.1 Introduction

This chapter deals with the profile of the study area as well as of the two communities i.e. the *Marma* the *Tripura* in order to give an idea about the general features of them. The topographies of Chittagong Hill Tracts have been highlighted elaborately first in this chapter to understand the politico-socio-economic structure, geographical distribution, historical struggle, deprivation, marginalization, cultural diversity, ethnicity, human rights situation, securities and insecurities of life, and regional problems before probing into the features of four *upazilas* i.e. sub-district under *Rangamati* district which were purposively selected as the study area. Then orientations about two indigenous communities – the *Marma* and the *Tripura* as sample have been presented. This chapter is basically based on secondary information except a few primary data.

### 4.2 Chittagong Hill Tracts

The Chittagong Hill Tracts lies in the South-eastern part of Bangladesh adjoining international boundaries with Myanmar in the Southeast, the Indian state of Tripura on the North, and Mizoram on the East. Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT), formally a single unified district, comprises a total area of 5,093 sq. miles (13,189 sq. kms.) encompassing three separate districts namely *Khagrachhari*, *Rangamati* and *Bandarban* which was divided during the administrative reorganization in 1983 (Mohsin, 2002; Rahman, 2011:34; Hassan, 2011:9). The CHT is located between 21°-40' degrees and 23°-47' degrees North latitude and 91°-40' degrees and 92°-42' degrees East longitude. It roughly runs from North to South for 280 kms. The CHT has a low population density, 96 people per sq. km., compared to the high national average of 1077 (Roy *et. al.* 2000:3; Barakat *et. al.*, 2009:2). According to Census 2011, the population of CHT currently estimated at 1.4 million (1,586,141), making up 1.1% of the country's total population (IWGIA, 2012: 48; Barman and Neo, 2013:25). It is completely different in physical features, agricultural practices and soil conditions from the rest of the country due to its mountainous landscape. It is a unique territory with mountains and beautiful landscapes as well as socio-economically and culturally completely different from other parts of Bangladesh.

The Chittagong Hill Tracts is one of the most diverse regions in the country in terms of topography, ethnicity, culture and traditions of the people. From time immemorial the CHT has been the home to indigenous ethnic people. But there is no accurate and recent government data as to how many ethnic groups reside in CHT. Reports vary from 11 to 13 about the number of ethnic groups. Few researchers lists the number of ethnic groups is 12 (Gain, 2000; Khan and Khisa, 2000; Nasreen and Togawa, 2002; Rasul, 2007) and few researchers mention it as 13 (Punday and Jamil, 2007; Zahed, 2013). Generally, the CHT is the traditional homeland of 11 groups of ethnic people (Mohsin, 2003; Adnan, 2004; IWGIA, 2012; ICIP-CHT, 2013; Wilkinson, 2015). The ethnic groups such as the *Chakma, Marma, Tripura, Tanchangya, Lushai, Pankhua, Bawm, Mro, Kheyang, Khumi, Riang* and *Chak* live in the land of immense beauty in harmony with nature (Brauns and Loffler, 1990:36). There are also Bengalis, the mainstream population of Bangladesh, live in CHT. The indigenous people are distinct from each other in terms of material culture and social organization (Adnan, 2004:10-11). They are markedly different from the majority Bengali people of Bangladesh in respect of race, language, culture, heritage, religion, and economy.

### **4.3 Historical Background of Chittagong Hill Tracts**

#### **4.3.1 Political Context**

The conflict of CHT rooted in British colonial era followed by a process of political, social and economic alienation not only by the British and Pakistan regimes but also during different political regimes in Bangladesh (Islam, 2013:2). The indigenous people were independent before the British colonial period. There had been no external interference by any outside power in the affairs of the CHT until 1787. The British annexed the CHT area in 1860 and created an autonomous administrative district known as ‘The Chittagong Hill Tracts’ within the undivided British Bengal (Hassan, 2011: 23). For the good governance of CHT, in 1900 the British government enacted the CHT Regulation 1 of 1900 which was intended to protect the indigenous people from economic exploitation by non-indigenous Bengali people and to preserve their traditional, socio-cultural and political institutions based on customary laws, community ownership of land and so on. In 1920, the CHT was declared as ‘Backward Tract’ which was administered as an ‘Excluded area’ (Mohsin, 1997: 34; Roy, 2000: 22; Adnan, 2008: 29; Barakat *et. al.* 2009:2).

In August 1947, the British handed over the administration of the CHT to the government of Pakistan. The Pakistani government also recognized the CHT as an excluded area in the first Constitution of Pakistan, which was adopted in 1956 (Shelley, 1992:30; Mohsin, 1997; Hassan, 2011:24). From the very outset, the Pakistani government looked upon the indigenous people with an eye of suspicion for being anti-Pakistani as well as anti-Islamic. Indigenous people were discriminated in jobs, business and education. During the Pakistani rule, the government amended the CHT Regulation of 1900 several times against the wishes of the indigenous people in order to find a legal excuse for migration of Bengali Muslims into the CHT. The government enacted the CHT (Land Acquisition) Regulation in 1958 in order to grab indigenous people's ancestral lands. The predicament of the indigenous people began with the building of a hydroelectric dam in the early sixties which flooded 1,036 square kilometers of land, submerged 40% of the best arable land and displaced 100,000 indigenous people from their ancestral homes (Roy, 2000: 25; Adnan, 2004:23-24; Hassan, 2011: 25).

However, Bangladesh emerged as an independent state on 16 December 1971 after nine months War of Independence against the Pakistani force. The indigenous people hoped that the new government of Bangladesh would realize their hopes and aspirations. So, they demanded to the then government for regional autonomy in a democratic way. Unfortunately, the government of Bangladesh did not take into consideration the fundamental demand of the indigenous people and disregarded the multi-ethnic-make-up of the country (Mohsin, 1997:58; Mohsin, 2003:23).

The rejection by the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) in 1974 of demands for explicit constitutional recognition and protection of the rights of the indigenous peoples of the CHT led to a struggle for autonomy. A political party named *Parbattyo Chattagram Jana Sanghati Samiti* (PCJSS) was formed by the then leader of CHT and Member of the Parliament (MP) *Manabendra Narayan Larma* (Mohsin, 1997:57-58; Mohsin, 2000:79). An armed wing of the PCJSS known as Shanti Bahini was formed in order to resist the Bangladeshi state and its security forces. Then the CHT area underwent armed violence in the early of 1975 with massive militarization and armed activities by the state military forces and non-state rebel (Shelley, 1992:111; Adnan, 2008:32). Levene (1999) stated, over the years the CHT region experienced a genocidal process with the development interest of the state, which he called as the political economy of 'creeping genocide'.



However, the Government of Bangladesh (GoB) undertaken a drastic sponsored population transfer program in 1979-1984 to settle the Bengali population from other districts of Bangladesh to the CHT providing with land grants, cash and rations, so that they would outnumber the indigenous people and use them as human shields for the protection of the army personnel. They forcefully occupied the land of indigenous people (Adnan, 2004). During 1979 to 1985, at least four lacs of Bengali Muslims were transferred into the CHT and settled on indigenous people's lands. By 1981 the Muslim settlers made up nearly one third of the total population of the CHT (Barakat and Huda, 1988; Mohsin 1997). The success of such demographic engineering as a means of counter insurgency was evident in the accelerated growth of Bengalis from 19 percent of the total population of the CHT in 1974 to 49 percent in 1991 while the indigenous people fell drastically from 81 percent to 51 percent over the same 17 year period (Adnan, 2008:34).

After attempts to resolve the conflict in 1985 and 1989, the *Parbattyo Chattagram Jana Sanghati Samiti* (PCJSS), the largest party of the Hill people and the GoB signed the CHT 'Peace' Accord in 1997. Though criticized by many, on both the left and right, the Accord recognized the special status of the CHT as a 'tribal inhabited area'; provided for demilitarization of the area; rehabilitated JSS fighters; allowed returnee refugees and displaced people to their home; established a Land Disputes Resolution Commission; devolved further powers to the Hill District Councils (including on land administration and law and order); and formed a CHT Regional Council (RC) and a Ministry of CHT Affairs (MoCHTA). However, the substantial non-implementation of the Accord to this day remains a major bone of contention between the PCJSS and the GoB. The treaty did not address the fundamental problems of illegal Muslim settlers and militarization of the CHT; rather it legalizes the settlers in the CHT (Adnan, 2008; CHT Commission, 2015).

#### **4.3.2 Economic Condition**

Most of the indigenous people are agriculturists in CHT, while others are employed in public or private sectors, but the continuing acquisition of land and forests in the area by the government agencies and government-sponsored Bengali settlers has led to fall in productivity. Five types of subsistence activities also consists economic production of indigenous people such as rice, animal husbandry, fruit tree cultivation, timber and bamboo extraction and horticulture. Wet-rice cultivation is common in the narrow valleys of the CHT, whereas *jum* cultivation is limited to ridge-tops and sloping lands, where

wet-rice or other forms of irrigated agriculture is practically impossible and market-oriented agriculture is restricted to a few species of spices that may be dried and marketed on account of their durability and weight. The traditional subsistence economy of most indigenous communities has gradually been integrated into the market economy, even among *jum* communities, given the creeping intrusion of the 'state'. Poor economic infrastructure predominates in the CHT, and government services such as health, sanitation and education are not properly provided among the indigenous people of the CHT (CHT Commission, 2015; Gain, 2010).

### **4.3.3 Land Dispossession**

Land holds a particular social and cultural significance to the indigenous people of the CHT. But they have been systematically dispossessed of their land either through the operation of law, policy, and state's non-recognition of their customary rights over land or by force. The law governing land rights of the indigenous people in CHT is contained in, among others, the CHT Regulation, 1900 as well as a number of laws passed before signing the CHT Accord (Hassan, 2011:17; Adnan and Dastidar, 2011; Chakma and Matriot, 2016: 8).

The most acute land-related problems in CHT include the land scarcity following the construction of the *Kaptai* Dam in 1960s and the displacement of some 100,000 inhabitants; land dispossession at the hands of government-sponsored Bengali settlers; acquisition of land for new 'reserved forests'; allotment of customarily-owned lands to non-resident entrepreneurs for rubber and other commercial plantations; and 'privatization' of former commonly-held areas which perpetuated the practice of forcible and violent dispossession of indigenous people's land (Mohsin, 2000:68-69; Roy, 2004:152). In the post-Accord period, continuing dispossession and displacement of indigenous people has been occurred through compulsory acquisition of lands by the state (Adnan and Dastidar, 2011).

### **4.3.4 Forests**

Forests constitute an integral part of the lives, livelihood and belief system of indigenous peoples. In CHT, the state declared the areas of *jum* and other commons, used by indigenous people, as 'protected forests' and 'unclassed state forests' (in addition to reserved forests which prohibits access or use of the forest or forest products, without the government's express consent) resulting in indigenous people's rights being treated as

mere usufructs rather than as rights of ownership (Gain, 2000; Gain, 2013; Chakma and Matriot, 2016). Thus, many forest-dwellers and forest-adjacent communities face trumped-up criminal cases and harassment (for example, for ‘theft’ of forest products) merely for continuing their traditional existence and livelihood patterns, including *swidden* cultivation and gathering of forest products. Indigenous people are blamed for deforestation through Jum cultivation. But, production hydroelectricity, militarization, Bengali settlement, logging, industrial plantations are also responsible for deforestation. Women bear a disproportionate burden as prohibitions imposed by the Forestry Department on access to forests to collect dead branches or leaves that forces them to travel long distances to gather fuel wood. They are also blamed to be forest despoilers (Gain, 2000).

It is noteworthy that the 20-year Forestry Master Plan adopted by the GoB in 1994 sets out government policies and actions until 2013. Pursuant to this Plan, the Department of Forest has undertaken schemes to cover 20 percent of the country’s land surface with forests; this includes logging in the natural hill (reserved) forests in the Northern and Southern CHT. In addition, the government-owned Forest Industries Development Corporation (FIDC) and private companies are engaged in logging projects in reserved forest areas in the CHT and have established eco-parks under the auspices of the Department of Forest without any effective consultation with indigenous inhabitants as well as users. These programs have been disruptive and have violated the rights of local people and have had a negative impact on the local environment (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012: 61-69).

#### **4.3.5 Cultural Context**

Indigenous peoples are marginalized because of non-recognition of their cultural distinctiveness by the state. The mono-cultural, monolingual and mono-religious orientation of the present Constitution has prevented it from being inclusive with regard to indigenous people’s identities. Until the declaration of Islam as the state religion, the Constitution was secular. Although religious freedom was, and is still, recognized as a fundamental right the provision of a single state religion has made them further vulnerable in respect of religious freedom. However, the emphasis on fostering the national language and culture in the absence of any comparable provisions for the

languages, cultures and religious beliefs of the *Adivasis* has perpetuated their feelings of exclusion, insecurity and marginalization (Mohsin cited in Mohaimen, 2010:157-161).

#### **4.3.6 The Struggle for Rights of the Indigenous People**

Indigenous people in CHT have adopted their own modes of protests and resistance against marginalization and the state violations of their rights. These protests took place at various levels and acquired different forms ranging from forming indigenous organizations to resistance politics. Here it should be mentioned that the resistance in CHT took the form of an armed struggle in the 1970s and continued until 1997 and it was abandoned through signing of the CHT Accord on 02 December 1997. The movement led to the formation of the PCJSS, the largest political party of the hill people that reached to the agreement to sign the CHT Accord with the Government of Bangladesh. But the PCJSS is disappointed because of non-implementation of some clauses of the Peace Accord. On the other hand, the United People's Democratic Forum (UPDF), a new CHT party and *Jana Sanghati Samiti* (the rebellious part of PCJSS) opposed to the Accord (Rahman, 2011: 103; Wilkinson, 2015: 185). Both of these parties are aligned to the Hill Women's Federation and *Pahari Chattro Porishod* (Hill Students Council). Moreover, there are some organizations active at national level for establishing rights of the indigenous people that include the Bangladesh *Adivasi* Forum (BAF) and the now dormant National *Adivasi* Coordination Committee (NACC).

Almost all indigenous people in CHT have their own autonomous organizations (e.g. *Bawm* Social Council, *Marma Sangskriti Songstha*, *Marma* Buddhist Association, *Marma* Welfare Association, *Marma Unnoyon Songshod*, *Tripura Kallyan* Foundation, *Tripura Unnoyon Sangshod*, Bangladesh *Tanchangya Kallyan Sangstha*, *Mro* Social Council, *Khyang* Welfare Association, and organizations of the *Chak*, *Khumi*, *Lushai* and *Pangkhu*). In addition, there are some civil society organizations composed of UP chairpersons and members, headmen, *Adivasi* traders, *mauza* forest-dwellers, etc. The most influential NGOs and land rights activist forums include the Hill Tracts NGO Forum (many of whom have now rallied under the banner of the Hill Tracts NGO Network) and the Movement for the Protection of Forest and Land Rights in CHT. Organized *Adivasi* groups in CHT and plains have voiced their concerns and liaised and networked with progressive mainstream civil society groups to uphold and negotiate their rights with the government – both individually and collectively – through some forums such as

Bangladesh Indigenous Peoples Forum. Their demands are centered on major issues of land and forest rights. The violation of fundamental human rights, such as the rights to life and property in the case of the CHT has involved the demand for implementation of the CHT Accord (CHT Commission, 2015 Retrieved from [www.chtcomission.org/page.php?idn=4](http://www.chtcomission.org/page.php?idn=4) on December 2015).

#### **4.4 Description of the Study Area**

The present study has been carried out in *Rangamati* hill district. *Rangamati* is one of the districts of Chittagong Hill Tracts (in Chittagong division) with an area of 6116.13 sq kms, is bounded by the Tripura State of India on the North, *Bandarban* district on the South, Mizoram State of India and Chin State of Myanmar on the East, and *Khagrachhari* and Chittagong districts on the West. *Rangamati* district consists of 10 *upazilas* (sub-districts) namely *Rangamati Sadar, Kaptai, Kawkhali, Nannerchar, Bagaichhari, Juraichhari, Rajasthali, Belaichhari, Barkal, and Langadu* upazila, 2 Municipalities (*Pourashava*), 48 Union *Parishads* and 1344 Villages (Barakat *et al.* 2009:6). However, the population of Rangamati was 620214 and the population of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* community was 51235 and 27052 respectively as per The Population Census Report 2011. Among the total population, males was 325,823 and female was 295,391 in *Rangamati* (cited in Barman and Neo, 2012:26-27).

*Rangamati* is adorned as the ‘*Chakma* circle’ in the system of customary vat scheme and the ‘Chief of *Chakma* circle’ who is orderly the ‘*Chakma* King’ (currently *Raja* Barrister Devashis Roy, the titular *Chakma* king since 1971) is the main controller of this system. He is also the chief-in-charge of this district in accordance with the Bangladesh Government. The ‘*Chakma* circle’ is the home not only for the *Chakmas* but also other 11 ethnicities. The other ethnic groups are – *Marma, Tanchangya, Tripura, Pankhua, Lushai, Kheyang, Murang, Rakhain, Chak, Bawm and Khumi* including the *Bengalis*. Among the ethnic groups the *Marma* and the *Tripura* were selected for the present study. These two groups live in different parts of *Rangamati* district but the *Marma* from *Asam Basti, Kukimara and Kochukhali*, and the *Tripura* from *Garjontali, Killamura and Chaklachhari* were selected as respondents for the present study. Accordingly *Asam Basti, Kukimara, Kochukhali, Garjontali, Killamura and Chaklachhari* were considered as study area in the present study.

#### **4.4.1 Asam Basti**

*Asam Basti* is situated under *Rangamati* municipal area under Ward No 5. It is connected with *Rangamati* district headquarters by *pucca* road. But movement for children and women is difficult as it is hill area. There is no primary school in this ward. The children have to go to *Ashar Alo* School run by an NGO. It should be noted that there are some educational institutions in *Rangamati* municipal area. *Rangamati* Government College, *Rangamati* Government *Mohila* College, *Rangamati* Government High School, *Narangiri* Government High School, *Rani Dayamayi* High School, *Sapchhari* High School, *Manghar* Residential High School, *Lakers* Public School, *Rangamati* Senior *Madrassa* are among the notable educational institutions. There are also some cultural organizations such as 2 libraries, 1 *shilpakala* academy, 16 women organizations, 1 literary society, 3 cultural groups, 7 playgrounds etc. that play important role to the proper development of the children and to fulfill the recreational needs of the people. On the other hand, women organizations are playing significant role to protect women rights.

With regard to economic condition it is found that the main source of income of the inhabitants of *Asam Basti* is non-agricultural activities such as government and non-government service, business, daily labor, rickshaw pulling etc. A few of them are engaged in agricultural activities, catching fishes and earth cutting. In addition, goldsmith, blacksmith, potteries, weaving, bamboo work, wood work are also prevalent in this area as source of income. The people of the *Asam Basti* have access to electricity, water supply and sanitation facilities. The people have also access to health services. A satellite clinic is existed in *Asam Basti*. Besides this, the people receive the health services from 2 hospitals, 3 clinics, 3 family planning centers situated in *Rangamati* district headquarters. However, some NGOs such as *Adivashi Unnayan* Centre, *ASA* and *BRAC* are working along with the government agencies for the socioeconomic development and welfare of the people in this area.

#### **4.4.2 Kukimara**

*Kukimara* is situated in *Wagga* union under *Kaptai upazila* of *Rangamati* district. It is 27 kms South of *Rangamati* district headquarters. People of different religions, such as *Buddha*, *Hindu* and *Islam* live in this *upazila*. Indigenous communities such as the *Chakma*, *Marma*, *Tanchanga* and *Tripura* belong to this *upazila*. But in *Kukimara* most

of them are the *Marma*. Average literacy rate of this *upazila* is 60.3%; among them male is 67.2% and female is 51.5%. There are some educational and religious institutions in this *upazila*. But there is no primary school in *Kukimara* village (*para*). The children of this village have to go to *Muralipara* Primary School of neighboring village by crossing a road. They have to walk one km hilly road for going to school that sometimes discourage the minor boys and girls to attend the school regularly. But there is a pre-primary school runs by Unicef that plays important role in expanding education among the children of this village. With regard to health services, the people of this village have limited access as there is no community clinic in this village. The people have to go *Sapchhari* community clinic 3 kms far from this village or *Kaptai Upazila* Health Complex 10 kms far from this village. However, agriculture is the main source of income of the people of this *para* (village). Besides, people are also engaged in non-agricultural activities such as small business, NGO worker, rickshaw pulling, and transport and communication.

#### **4.4.3 Kochukhali**

*Kochukhali* is situated in *Kalompoti* union under *Kawkhali upazila* of *Rangamati* district. It is 28 kms far from *Rangamati* district headquarters but very near to *Kawkhali upazila* headquarters. Many of the urban facilities such as education, health service, water supply, sanitation facilities, improved communication system etc. are existed in this *moholla* (*para*). The children can easily go to school for primary, secondary and higher secondary education. The people get health services at *Upazila* Health Complex as it is located near *upazila* headquarters. Besides satellite clinic provides the people with health services in this *moholla*. There are colleges, secondary schools, technical educational institution, kindergarten, library, hospital, health complex, family planning centre near the *moholla Kochukhali*. Along with the government agencies, some non-government organizations (NGOs) such as ASA, CDS, CHCP, IDF, SAS, Hill Vision, etc. are working for the improvement of socio-economic condition the people of this *upazila* including *Kochukhali* village.

The sources of income of the inhabitants of this area are both agricultural and non-agricultural activities. The people of this *moholla* produce various types of crops that include paddy, ginger, turmeric, sesame, cotton and various types of vegetables. Among the households 50.85% are the landowner of agricultural land and 49.15% are landless ([http://en.banglapedia.org/index.php?title=Kawkhali\\_Upazila\\_Rangamati\\_District](http://en.banglapedia.org/index.php?title=Kawkhali_Upazila_Rangamati_District) retrieve

d on 23 December 2015). The people of this *upazila* are also engaged in different types of non-agricultural sectors such as commerce, transport and communication, service and construction sectors. Moreover, people work in cottage industries, and in goldsmith, blacksmith and weaving sectors. They are also involved to make household utensils by bamboo, jute and cane.

#### **4.4.4 Garjontali**

*Garjontali* is situated in *Rangamati* municipal area under Ward No. 7. It is located in main town of *Rangamati*. But movement for children and women is difficult as it is hill area but they are habituated with it. It should be noted that there are some educational institutions in *Rangamati* municipal area that have been mentioned earlier (in *Asam Basti* section).

The main source of income of the inhabitants of *Garjontali* is non-agricultural activities such as government and non-governmental services, business, daily labor, rickshaw pulling etc. Goldsmith, blacksmith, potteries, weaving, bamboo work, wood work, rickshaw pulling, auto-rickshaw pulling are also prevalent in this area. The people of the *Garjontali* have access to electricity, water supply and sanitation facilities. Health services are also available in municipal area. The people receive the health services from 2 hospitals, 3 clinics, and 3 family planning centers. Some NGOs such as *Adivashi Unnayan* Centre, ASA and BRAC are working along with the government agencies in this area.

#### **4.4.5 Killamura**

*Killamura* is one of the villages/*moholla* of *Balukhali* union of *Sadar upazila* of *Rangamati* district. It is 15 kms far from *Rangamati* district headquarters. It is scattered from *Rangamati* district headquarters by *Kaptai* Lake. Communication system is very poor. The people usually go to here and there by boat during rainy season. But in dry season they have to go to district headquarters and other places on foot. The people of this village are deprived of all of the civic services. However, there is only a government primary school but no high school in this village. Hence, the people of this village have established a junior high school (up to grade 8). But due to fund crisis they could not upgrade it up to grade 10. There is no permanent health center in this village. The people have to go to *Rangamati Sadar* Hospital for treatment though sometimes they get primary health care at nearest army camp. The people of this village also suffer from pure



drinking water and power supply. Although the well-off families use solar plants for electricity and submersible pump for water collection the poor people suffer from these facilities. However, the main source of income of the inhabitants of this village is catching fish. They are also involved in agricultural and non-agricultural activities. Non-agricultural activities are day laborer, involvement in commerce, services and construction works.

#### **4.4.6 Chaklachhari**

*Chaklachhari* is one of the study villages of the present study. It is situated in *Gilachhari* union under *Rajasthali upazila* of *Rangamati* district. It is 72 km far away from *Rangamati* district headquarters and seven km from *Rajasthali upazila* headquarters. It is a remote hill area. It is quite difficult to move from here to there in this area. The people of this village (area) have to go to on foot to *upazila* headquarters and other places as it is hill. However, there is no primary school in this *para*. But Unicef runs a pre-primary education program in this village. The children go to *Gilachhari* primary school for primary education that is half km far from *Chaklachhari* village. But the problem is that the teachers do not go to school regularly as mentioned by the respondents and key informants. Actually they live in *Rajasthali upazila* headquarters and have appointed another person to perform their duties as teachers in place of them. The local people called it '*borga shikskhak*' i. e. hired teacher. The assigned teachers give the hired teachers some money from their salary. The hired teachers are happy by getting some money as they are unemployed persons. Likewise the primary school, there is no health center at this village. The people can take health service from a community clinic situated in next village. But it is the matter of regret that staffs of the community clinic are not present in most of the time. Therefore, the people have to suffer from getting health services.

Although various ethnic groups live in *Rajasthali upazila*, most of the inhabitants of *Chaklachhari para* are from the *Tripura community*. The people of this *para* have no access to rural electrification. It is found that well-off families use solar-plants for electricity but most of the people use traditional lighting system. With regard to water and sanitation, it is found that they usually use water of deep tube-well for daily household work. But during dry season, March to May, they suffer from water crisis. Then they use water of *chhara* (canal). It creates various types of water-borne diseases. But health

services are not available in this *para*. However, the main income source of the people of this area is agricultural activities. People are also involved in non-agricultural activities, for example daily labor, commerce, and service sectors. Many people work in mills and factories as there are 5 cotton mills, 1 pulse mill and 2 rice mills in *Rajasthali upazila*. Besides, working in cottage industries, potteries as well as doing wood work, bamboo and cane work are also common in this *upazila*.

The area has both *haats* and bazaars where the people sell and buy their daily necessities. Women also participate in trade and business. With regard to sanitation facilities, it is found that most of the dwelling houses do not have sanitary latrines except few. They use pit/hanging latrine and open space for natural call (defecation). It has been mentioned earlier that the government agencies are providing services for socioeconomic development of the people of this area. Some of the NGOs such as Green Hill, BRAC are also working for the development of inhabitants of this area as opined by the respondents and key informants.

#### **4.5 Description of Tribal Communities under the Present Study**

##### **4.5.1 The *Marma***

###### ***Origin and Identity***

The *Marmas* sometimes referred as Mogh and live mostly in CHT. They call themselves “*Marma Lumya*” (Nue, 2007). According to *Marma* writer *Kya Shai Pro* the word ‘*Marma*’ is derived from ‘*Mryma*’ carrying the concept of *Myanmar's* nationalism (Chakma, 2009:69). They are the second largest ethnic group in CHT. Most of the *Marmas* live in the three hill districts of Chittagong namely *Rangamati*, *Bandarban* and *Khagrachhari*. Some *Marmas*, however, live in the coastal districts of *Cox'sbazar* and *Patuakhali*. The *Marmas* are divided into 30 clans. Each clan is named after the occupation and place from where it migrated.

The *Marma* community holds the positions of two ‘Circle Chief’ or ‘King’ (Raja) in CHT called the “*Bohmong Chief*” and the “*Mong Chief*”. The *Bohmong Chief* resides at *Bandarban* of the South and the *Mong Chief* resides at *Ramgarh* in *Khagrachari* district of the North (Mohsin, 2002:14). The *Marmas* of the CHT were migrated from the ancient *Pegu* city of Myanmar. The people of *Pegu* were known as “*Talaing* or *Tai Luang*” meaning “*Greater Tai*”. *Pegu* was invaded in 1599 by Arakan kingdom

(<http://www.ebanglapedia.com/en/article.php?id=3423&title=Marma.The#Vn1c6hbjMt>).

In 16<sup>th</sup> century, the *Arakan* king attacked Chittagong and established his capital here. The *Arakan* king sent two troops to Chittagong bestowing the title of *Bohmong* and *Mong* to the troop leaders to fight against the Mughals. These troops did not go back and eventually settled in the Chittagong and hill tract areas (Chakma, 2009:73). The *Bohmong* leader settled at *Bandarban* and the *Mong* leader entered *Khagrachari* and *Ramgarh* with his groups respectively. In the eighteenth century, many *Marma* people also migrated from *Arakan* because of political turmoil and they gradually settled in different areas of the CHT, Chittagong and *Patuakhali* (Mohsin, 2002:15).

However, it is known from other historical sources that the main *Marma* settlements in Bangladesh grew up with the fall of the independent Kingdom of Arakan to Myanmar (Burma) in 1784. After the annexation of Burma, the refugees from *Arakan* got a permanent foothold in the southern areas of Chittagong district. The second wave of *Marma* migration started from *Arakan* through the *Matamuhuri* valley and in course of time, they spread over *Bandarban*. The third group entered *Khagrachari* from *Sitakunda* region and built up their permanent residence at *Ramgarh* (Chakma, 2009:73; Gain, 2011:97). The fourth group crossing the Bay of Bengal and settled down in southern part of greater *Patuakhali* (now divided into two districts, *Patuakhali* and *Barguna*).

### ***Housing***

Structure of the *Marma* traditional house is simple and it is inimitable. It is just made of bamboo, sun grass, straw and timber. The houses are built on stilts made by bamboo or wooden platforms (*machang*). The space underneath the *machang* is used for various purposes such as keeping livestock and storing fuel wood (Bulbul, 2006:19). Some of their houses, however, are made of mud and built without a *machang*. Their houses are very natural and eco-friendly as well as fit with their ways of life as they live with the nature in the hills. However, they build their houses joining with veranda above the ground where the whole house is supported by pillars below. Some houses are founded on the ground and veranda is above the ground in parallel. As the houses are above the ground so they use ladders to climb up the houses and ladders are usually made of timber or bamboos and sometimes stairs are made of big logs. The reasons for this kind of structure are to avoid water and drying crops on the veranda to avoid from hens and other animals. For the cover of the roof, they use bamboos and over bamboos tied with forest

long grasses after cutting and drying under the sun. The four walls are attached with weaving bamboos. The type of walls is just like weaving of cloth where the bamboos are trashed and flattened for weaving. The floors are made of timber woods and sometimes with sewed bamboos.

### ***Language***

According to the philologists, the *Marma* language belongs to the Burmese group of *Tibeto-Burman* language family (Nue, 2007). It is not an exaggeration to say that the *Marma* tongue is a dialect descended from the Burmese language. Therefore, the word 'Marma' is derived from the Burman word 'Mraima'. The *Khyoung* and the *Mugh* (*Marma*) speaks provincial dialect of the Arakanese language, which tongue was also parent stock of the modern Burmese language. The language has the strong affinities with the Himalayan and Tibetan dialects (Lewin, 1869 cited in Mohsin 1997; Maggard, 2007; Keisuke, 2008).

### ***Education***

The *Phongyee* (Buddhist monk in *Marma* language) play an important role for the maintenance of traditional education system in the *Marma* community. The *Phongyee* gives them both spiritual and formal education in the temple. From the childhood, the *Marma* children receive both religious and linguistic education from their religious teacher in the temple. Such monastic order has been integral to education among *Marma* (Khan, 1999: 73-74). *Phongyee* and Buddhist temples are existed in almost every village and locality. As a result, the literacy rate among the *Marmas* is high compared to other tribal groups, (<http://sites.google.com/site/voiceofjummaland/marma>). The respondents from *Kukimara* (one of the study villages) send their children first to temple and then in school. But the respondents from *Asam Basti* (urban area) first send their children in kindergarten. Every member of the *Marma* society can read and speak the Burmese fluently.

### ***Religious Beliefs***

The Mongoloid *Marma* celebrates Buddhist religious festivals and also performs various forms of ritual worship to placate different gods. A common section still practices Animism that means nature worshiper by tradition (Tripura, 2012:62). Dreams have a very strong influence on decision-making in their everyday life. Their religious book is called '*Khaduttiang*'. *Buddha Purnima* (*Kachanglaprye*), *Ashari Purnima* (*Wachhoo*), and

*Probarana Purnima* (*Owa-gai-Anka*) are mentioned by the respondent as their famous religious festivals.

### ***Family Structure, Marriage and Ritual***

The nuclear family is predominant in the *Marma* community. They believe in patriarchal social system. Although husband is the head of the household, wife has also a significant role in the family. Kinship ties are quite strong in the *Marma* society. Brothers carry the identity of paternal line while sister carry the maternal. The property inheritance, in general, follows the old Burmese line of inheritance called *Thamohada*. Most land, house and other major property is passed from father to male sons while some properties considered women's is passed from mother to daughter (Dodson, 2011: 99). The study finds that if father or brother give willingly then daughter/sister get land or other properties. The '*auroth*' (most favorite) child gets the ownership of the house and has to take care of the parents (Bulbul, 2006:19).

The *Marma* society strictly maintains several customs and imposes restrictions to keep up their century old traditions, norms and administration. The *Marmas* are an amusement loving race. They are socialized in three occasions – Birth, Death and Marriage (Chakma, 2009:77). After seven days of the birth of a baby they invite their relatives to a feast to name the new born baby; this ritual is called '*Modetongpoeya*' (Nue, 2007). On the other hand, a dance party called '*Saing*' carries the coffin (*falah*) to the crematorium at the death of man in this society. They arrange a feast called '*Lakaprecgkuai*' after seven days of death (Tripura, 2012:75).

Marriage is a very important part of the social life of the *Marma*. Cross-cousin marriage and monogamy are predominant features of this society. Polygamy is also allowed. Child marriage is practically forbidden. Premarital love is common in the *Marma* community. Living conjugal life without marriage is a social crime in this society (Hutchinson, 1909). There are five types of marriage system in the *Marma* community – Settled Marriage, Irregular Marriage, Forbidden Marriage, Widow or Widows' Marriage, and Polygamy. Both men and women have equal rights to divorce although the final settlement is to be made in the court of *Karbari* (village leader) or of the Headman (mouza or area leader).

### ***Festivals***

The *Marma* community celebrates several types of festivals. '*Sungrai*' is the main social festival of the *Marma* community to celebrate the New Year for three days. On the other

hand, umbrella dance (*Kodur-Anka*) is a custom to welcome the respectable guests. Dance of fairy tales of *Manari* (*Wa-Thuk*), ancient *Ruba-Anka* Dance (*Duhpalang*) which reflect the whole process of *jum* cultivation from sowing to harvest are also their cultural festivals (SEHD, 2008:26-28; Chakma, 2009:85).

### ***Economic Condition***

Agriculture is the main occupation of the *Marma*. *Jum* cultivation is their primary agricultural pursuit (Rasul, 2005). Small-scale homestead gardening is also common among them. Other important economic activities of the *Marma* include basketry, brewing and wage labor. Weaving is a very common activity of the *Marma* women. The *Marmas* were not market oriented in the past. Their economic activities and production system were geared to their subsistence. Recently they have become involved in trade and commerce due to socio-economic and political reasons (Gain, 2000:27). Products of the *Marma* are sold mostly through middlemen. Some of the *Marma* families now operate small retail stores for their livelihoods (Maggard, 2007; Dodson, 2011).

### ***Customary organization***

The traditional political administrative system in the *Marma* community is a three-tier one. Village level administration is headed by a *Karbari* and *mouza* level administration headed by a Headman, while the circle level is headed by the Circle Chief (Raja). The main responsibility of these leaders is the collection of *jum* tax. In addition, each is entrusted with various socio-cultural responsibilities including arbitration of disputes, pronouncing judgment as well as maintaining law and order at their respective levels of administration (Mohsin, 2002:14, Dodson, 2011: 99).

## **4.5.2 The Tripura**

### ***Origin and History***

The *Tripura* is another large ethnic group in Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) region. At present they live in all over the CHT area, especially in *Ramgarh* and *Khagrachhari*. It is also believed that the *Tripuras* are currently living in Bangladesh originally came from the Indian state of Tripura. The number of the *Tripura* in CHT areas was close to 133933 in 2011 (cited in Barman and Neo, 2012:25), and it has, no doubt, increased considerably by this time. The word '*Tripura*' originate from the word 'Tui' (the *Sanskrit* meaning is river) and 'Pra' (which means the confluence). The word gradually changed into Tipre and later Tripura. So the total meaning of the word '*Tripura*' stands the people who live in the

confluence of rivers. They are medium statured and belong to the Mongoloid group (Barua, 2001:43; Tripura and Tripura, 2010:303).

The people of the *Tripura* community are considered as part of the *Tibeto-Burmese* ethnic group. Originally, they migrated from near the upper courses of the *Yangtze Kiang* and the *Hwang Ho* river of Western China. They had left China long before the *Sui* dynasty came to power. At the time of migration they were animists. So, it may be reasonably assumed that they migrated before 65 AD, the year Buddhism was introduced in China. The common reference to these people as '*Kiratas*' and '*Cinas*' in the early '*Sanskrit*' texts of India unmistakably indicates that they came down to the Assam Valley long before the dawn of Christian era.

*The Tripuras* entered their present country through its North-eastern corner, settled there and gradually expanded their settlement and suzerainty over the whole of Tripura. They were able to expand their influence in *Chittagong*, *Comilla*, *Noakhali*, and *Sylhet* region of present Bangladesh (Tripura and Tripura, 2010: 312). But their forefathers could hardly imagine that their descendants were destined to build a strong monarchy and resisted the advance of the Mughals. The ruling dynasty passed through several vicissitudes of history and ruled Tripura for several centuries till up to 14 October 1949, the day Tripura was annexed by India.

*The Tripuras* call their society *Dafar*. Among the *Tripura* community, all the groups and subgroups have their own dialects, dresses and ornaments. This tribal group does not have a uniform lineage system. In some groups, sons draw their lineage from the father's side while daughters draw their lineage from the mother's side.

### ***Language***

*Kokborok* is the language of Tripura people. *Kok* means 'language' and *borok* means 'man' that refers to *Tripura* people. So, *Kokborok* means 'the language of *Tripura* people'. According to the anthropologists, the *Tripuras* are Indo-Mongoloid in racial origin and they have Mongolian characteristic among themselves with some distinctiveness. But it is not sure that their language would be Mongoloid though they are Indo-Mongoloid by birth. It is seen in the research that *Kokborok* is a *Tibeto-Burmese* oriented language (Barua, 2001:46; Tripura, 2012:87). *Kokborok* was widely used in writing letters, performing magic and preparing lists of indigenous medicines. But due to lack of use, their script is on the verge of extinction (Tripura, 2012:90).

### ***Religion***

The *Tripuras* are mainly the followers of Hinduism but their beliefs and religious practices are different from the caste Hindus in many ways. Differences have been found in performing their worship (puja) and many other socio-religious festivals than pure Hinduism. Some of them believe in Animism and *Sanaton Dharma* (the eternal religion). Some of them have been converted to Christianity. They worship the god *Shiva* and the goddess *Kali* along with other 14 gods and goddesses (Chakma, 2009:96). There are many other traditional *pujas* of *Tripura* like *Goria*, *Kharchi*, *Jumlai*, *Sakchorai*, etc. (Tripura, 2011: 124). They also believe in a number of evil spirits, incorporeal beings and demons, who have their domicile in jungles and who do harm to people by inflicting diseases. They sacrifice animals and birds in the name of their gods and goddesses (Tripura, 2012:94).

'*Baishuk*' or spring mega-festival is one of the biggest social events of the *Tripura* people and its celebration takes complete shape through performing '*Goria Puja*' that depicts *Tripura* life and culture (Tripura, 2011:124). Like Hindus, the *Tripuras* believe in life hereafter and consider that those who have done good work will live in ease and comfort in the next life but that wrong doers will face ceaseless toil and constant harassment after life.

### ***Attire***

The *Tripuras* wear simple clothes which they weave by themselves. They have a rich tradition of knitting and dress designing. The men wear a turban called '*Khaban*' and '*Dhuti*'. The women have '*Pinons*' like the *Chakma*. A dress called '*Ring-nai*' and '*Khadi*' for wearing around the chest. '*Rinai*' and '*Risa*' are the national clothes of the *Tripura* women. '*Rimtai*' and '*Kubai*' are the national dress of the *Tripura* men. '*Rimati*' is put on for the *Tripura* cultured of clothes that is a sign of their nationality.

The traditional dress of the *Tripura* man includes *dhuti* (a narrow piece of cloth round the waist between the legs with a fringed end hanging down from the rear) and a *Khaban* (turban). During the winter they wear a ruggedly sewn jacket. The *Tripura* culture is equally rich when it comes to ornaments. Both men and women wear crescent-shaped silver ear rings. The *Tripura* women wear distinctive ornaments. The women wear necklaces made of beads and shells, nose skewers and ornaments on the hair, neck, wrist and ankle (Chakma, 2009:97; Tripura, 2011:123).



### ***Social Structure, Marriage and Rituals***

The social structure of the *Tripura* is patriarchal. Father is the head of the household and power and authority are vested to him. According to norms, the eldest son of a family can inherit all of his father's property. However, the right of the eldest son to inherit any property is forfeited if he separates himself from the parent's family when the father is still alive (Bulbul, 2006:21). In a few clans, daughters introduced themselves by her matrilineal line and become the owner of her mother's property (Tripura, 2011:123).

This ethnic community follows a custom of arranged marriage which is traditionally not allowed within one's group. The father of the bridegroom has to pay the expenses for the bride's dress and ornaments (Tripura, 2012:85). There is no bar in marrying outside the tribe. Generally there are three types of marriage among the *Tripuras* (Tripura 2011:125) that are as follows:

1. *Hamjak-lai Lama* or arranged marriage
2. *Khokoiy Lama* or elopement
3. *Chamiri Lama* or househusband.

The *Tripuras* burn their dead bodies and when the fire is extinguished the ashes and unburned bones are collected and thrown into a river or pond. The *Sraddha* is observed on 13 days after the death (Tripura, 2012:83).

### ***Housing***

The *Tripuras* build their houses on hilltops. Their houses lie somewhat scattered throughout their villages. They use wood or bamboo for making platform and posts; leaves of bamboo and a tall grass reed for roofing and thatching; and cane and rattan is used for binding. Platforms are generally made 5 to 15 feet height from the ground. They also build stairs to climb into their houses. This type of '*tong ghor*' (high houses) are suitable for coping with environment as it protect from hot, cold and rain. It also protects from attacks of wild life too. One house is divided into two parts – balcony and inner portion which has several parts according to the utility. But the *Tripura* people living in urban areas have house like Bengali people.

### *Festivals*

The most important social festival of the *Tripuras* is the *Baisuk* that lasts for three days. It commences from the penultimate day of the Bengali calendar. On the first day of the festival is called *Hari Baisuk*. The children decorate their homes with flowers; wear clean clothes and visit neighbors in this day (Chakma, 2009:98). As the *Tripuras* are rich both historically and culturally and being a ruling community they have multidimensional festivals and rituals. Their national festival is *Bwisu*. Some other festivals of them are *Haribwisu*, *Goria*, *Ker*, *Kharchi*, *Jumlai*, *Katharok* etc. (Tripura, 2011:124)

This chapter has provided a general description as well as discussed the livelihood pattern of the people of the study area. It has been found that it is very difficult to lead daily life smoothly in this area as it is hill. The people of this area suffer from many problems and deprive of many opportunities as they are different from the mainstream people of Bangladesh. The next chapter will discuss the socioeconomic and demographic conditions of the respondents as well as analyze the social context in the light of gender perspective and will try to make relationship of human security with the context of the study area.

It is evident that the issues of survival and well-being of the indigenous people have been taken into consideration by the GAs and NGOs in the study area for enhancing their security but expected outcome is still far reaching. Hence, the study emphasizes on ensuring and protecting human security of indigenous people against the threats to life, health, housing, livelihood, personal safety and human dignity. Above all, the present study underlines the role of the government to minimize the human rights deprivation of indigenous people through indigenous people friendly development interventions. The study also emphasizes on combating violence against indigenous women, in particular, and men, in general, as tolerance of violence is not acceptable in human security paradigm for social stability, peace, confidence building and development. Towards above ends, the present study underlines enhancing participation of the indigenous people at all levels of decision-making process, policy formulation, implementation and evaluation of programs and projects.

## CHAPTER FIVE

# Socioeconomic and Demographic Background of the Respondents and Gender Issues

### 5.1 Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to provide a qualitative analysis of the findings on the matters pertaining to age, education, occupation and household head; and customs regarding child preference, inheritance, gender roles and responsibilities. It also analyzes gender issues related to work opportunities, division of labor, decision-making and freedom of mobility. According to the study design, it focuses on selected two indigenous communities – the *Marma* and the *Tripura* to analyze the above-mentioned issues. The respondents from these two communities were selected from rural (*Kukimara, Killamura* and *Chaklachhari*) and urban (*Asam Basti, Garjontali* and *Kochukhali*) areas. Discussion of this chapter is based on primary data collected through face to face semi-structured interview with open ended interview schedule, focus group discussions (FGDs) and partial non-participant observation.

### 5.2 Socioeconomic and Demographic Conditions of the Respondents

#### 5.2.1 Age Structure

The age distribution of the respondents reveals that both of the male and female respondents were from different age groups. The age of the *Marma* male respondents ranged from 30 to 50 years while the *Marma* females were within the age limit of 27 to 45 years. On the other hand, the age of the *Tripura* male ranged from 25 to 60 years and for female was 23 to 58 years. Data also show that most of the *Marma* male respondents were from age group of 39 to 48 years and female from 29 to 35 years. In contrast, most of the *Tripura* male respondents were found to be within the age group of 35 to 39 years and female within the age group of 30 to 34 years. However, a significant number of the male respondents from the both communities were found to be middle aged (40-45 years) and females were from young category (27-30 years) which indicate that the female respondents were comparatively young than male.

### 5.2.2 Educational Status

Educational status is considered as one of the prime components of human capital. Education enhances knowledge, efficiency and human qualities. But the condition of the respondents of the *Tripura* community in terms of educational qualification reflects the lower status. Data show that most of the female respondents from the *Tripura* did not have any formal education in rural areas while male respondents had background of primary level of education. In urban areas, the scenario was slightly better compared to rural areas as the respondents had primary (grade 5) to secondary level (grade 10) of education. Only one of the *Tripura* male respondents was found to pass Higher Secondary Certificate (HSC) examination (grade 12). A few of them only could sign their name. On the contrary, all the *Marma* respondents were educated. Educational status of the *Marma* male respondents was ranged from primary to tertiary level. On the other hand, educational attainment of the *Marma* female was ranged from primary to above secondary level for both rural and urban areas. Most of the *Marma* female respondents were found to be educated up to grade 10 in urban areas and grade 5 in rural areas. Whereas, most of the *Marma* male had Secondary School Certificate in urban areas and completed grade 8 in rural areas. It is notable that no respondent was found illiterate from the *Marma* community.

### 5.2.3 Occupational Profile

Agricultural activities either in the form of plough or *jum* cultivation were the core occupation of the male respondents in rural area. Women were also found to participate in agricultural activities and salaried job along with doing regular household chores. Besides, small business, fishing, grocery, livestock rearing, day labor, rickshaw pulling were also common in rural area. On the other hand, non-farm activities such as service, teaching, business, transport laborer and so on were common occupation in urban area. In addition, a few of the respondents were also found to be involved in agricultural activities. Women were mostly involved in household chores along with doing other works (job and human rights works). Both primary and secondary occupations were found in case of few respondents. However, occupational differentiation was found between the *Marma* and the *Tripura*. The *Marma* male respondents in urban area were found to be involved in small trade and teaching as their primary occupation but they reported farming as their secondary occupation. Cultivation, on the other hand, was found as the primary occupation of the respondents living in rural areas. They were also found

to work as day laborers only when faced economic hardship due to non-farming for few months of the year. Nonetheless, most of the *Tripura* male respondents reported fishing, grocery and wage labor in non-agricultural sector as their secondary occupation along with farming as their primary occupation. Almost all the female respondents from the *Tripura* were found to be involved in agricultural activities along with performing domestic chores as housewives. Only two women were health workers of the CHTDF-UNDP. Likewise the *Tripura*, most of the female respondents from the *Marma* were also found to be engaged with farming and rearing livestock. Only four of them reported that they worked as school teacher in Unicef and BRAC. Only a few respondents of both of communities reported salaried job as their primary occupation and had no secondary occupation.

#### **5.2.4 Source and Level of Income**

Most of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* respondents informed that income came from farming (agricultural activities) and agricultural labor. A few of the respondents both from rural and urban areas confirmed that their income also derived from livestock rearing that include cows, goats, pigs, ducks etc. and homestead vegetable gardening. Respondents from the *Tripura* community added that fishing was also a source of income for their family. A small number of the respondents, both male and female, from the two communities assured that salaried job was also a source of their limited income. The income level of most of the *Marma* male respondents ranged from BDT 3000 to BDT 10000 per month. Only two of the *Marma* respondents from urban area were found to earn near about BDT 20,000 per month. On the contrary, monthly household income level of the *Marma* female respondents ranged from BDT 3500 to BDT 25000. But their individual income level ranged from BDT 3000 to BDT 4000. Only one *Marma* female respondent from the urban area was found to earn BDT 12000 per month.

The male respondents of the *Tripura* community informed that their monthly household income level ranged from BDT 4000 to BDT 8000. Only one respondent living in rural area reported that his monthly household income was BDT 25000. On the other hand, the *Tripura* female respondents reported that their monthly household income ranged from BDT 3000 to BDT 6000. But their individual income level ranged from BDT 1000 to BDT 3000. The findings show that income level of the *Tripura* community was lower than that of the *Marma* community in comparison with individual as well as household

level. On the other hand, most of the interviewees and focus groups reported that their income was not sufficient to lead a decent livelihood.

### **5.2.5 Household Size**

In order to obtain an idea about the household size of the study area information about the number of household member was collected. The findings revealed that household size of the *Marma* community in urban area consisted of 3 to 5 members while rural household consisted of 4 to 6 members. Most of the *Marma* respondents of both urban and rural areas opined that the number of their household member was 4 and 5 respectively. On the other hand, larger household size was found in the *Tripura* community. The study revealed that household size of the *Tripura* community ranged from 5 to 8 in rural areas while in urban areas the number ranged from 4 to 6. Most of the respondents reported that the number of their household member was 8 in rural areas and 5 in urban areas. However, a few households were found as small in size with 3 members.

### **5.2.6 Land Possession**

Land is the means of livelihood of the indigenous people and the source of their cultural and social identity. Most indigenous communities have land based economies, and are mainly hunter-gatherers, small-scale agriculturalists and swidden farmers whose way of life both in terms of livelihood is linked to the land they traditionally occupy (Roy, 2000:12). Whenever the respondents of study area were asked about their ownership of land it was found that they had customary practice of land distribution. Usually, the Headmen dispense the land to *Karbari* and then *Karbari* distribute it to the indigenous people to cultivate their land as well as to build their homestead. As a result, most of the respondents had their landownership but they had no legal documents in stamp papers. Only a few of them informed that they had deeds of their landownership. But most of the *Tripura* and the *Marma* respondents from both rural and urban areas reported that they possessed only the land where the house were constructed and did not have any type of land for farming or any other income generating activities. But only few of the respondents from rural areas informed that they had cultivable lands apart from homestead.

Land dispossession among the indigenous people is a major issue for a long time. It has been considered as principal reason for their marginalization and being internally displaced person. Most of the respondents from both of the *Tripura* and *Marma*

communities expressed their grief on this matter. They reported that indigenous people were the victims of land dispossession in *Rangamati* along with *Bandarban* and *Khagrachari*. A few victims from *Kochukhali* of *Kawkhali upazila* opined that their ancestors were compelled to leave this area in 1980 when genocide occurred and after that many Bengali settlers and army personnel bought their land in cheap price and sometimes occupied their land forcefully. But they admitted that although such type of situation was not existed during field study they were living as landless in their own land.

### **5.2.7 Housing Condition and Access to Civic Amenities**

Any household is incomplete without access to civic amenities that include water, sanitation and electricity as we consider complete housing in conjunction with these facilities (Hussain *et al.* 2010:57). Materials used in making houses are also important to understand the quality of a house. Qualities of houses mainly depend on the socioeconomic conditions of the owner. It was found through direct observation that houses in rural areas such as *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* were made of grass, thatch, bamboo and wood but houses of the *Karbaris* and *Headmen* were made of brick and corrugated iron sheet. On the other hand, houses of the respondents of urban areas e.g. *Kochukhali*, *Garjontali* and *Asam Basti* were found much better than that of rural areas.

With regard to sanitation facilities, it was found that only a few of the sample households in rural areas had access to sanitary latrines. Most of them were denied the right to access to any kind of latrine facilities. In urban areas, some of them were found to have access to sanitary latrines and some of them had access to modern latrine facilities. Nonetheless access to safe drinking water is another basic need of human being. Accessibility to safe drinking water is fundamental for lowering the risk of water-borne-diseases (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:53). But the opportunity of access to safe drinking water was diverged from place to place in the study area. For example, the respondents of *Asam Basti* and *Garjontali* were found to have the opportunity of water supply of WASA. The respondents of these *mohollas* could easily collect water for household use. But the people of other areas did not have such facilities. The people of *Kukimara*, *Killamura*, *Kochukhali* and *Chaklachhari* were found to collect water from tube-well and ring-well. But collecting water during summer and dry season very often becomes very much difficult as the water level goes to downward. Many tube-wells and ring-wells become out of order during summer. Then the people of rural area are compelled to fetch water

from *chhora* (spring) or lake for their household use. The same situation was found in *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari*. The respondents reported that they were compelled to fetch water from *chhora* (spring) or lake for their household use during summer. In respect of access to supply of electricity, respondents of urban areas were found to have such facilities. But in rural areas, the people were found to have no access to electric supply. But the well-off families in rural areas were found to use solar plant; the poor people could not enjoy such facility rather they had to depend on traditional system (kerosene lamp).

### **5.3 Overview of Social Context from Gender Perspective**

#### **5.3.1 Household Head**

Male in both of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities was found as household head in their community. Generally, father plays the role of household head, but in absence of him son could play the role. Most of the respondents identified and emphasized on autonomous decision-making capabilities and ability of male to earn more for family and traditional system to be male as household head. Few of the respondents indicated competencies of male to do various kinds of jobs, dexterity to communicate with unknowns in emergency and possess more knowledge to be head of the household.

It should be noted that there was a dissimilarity of opinion between male and female respondents regarding factors associated with considering household head. Female respondents accentuated on decision-making ability, earning capacities, physical condition (strength), communication capacity with others and crisis management skill of male and traditional social system for considering male as household head. On the other hand, male respondents prioritized on earning ability, capacity of making-decision independently, maintaining heredity, social tradition, mobility, access to information and widespread exposure as the a head of household. FGDs and case studies with the *Marma* community regarding reasons for considering male as household head were found to comply with the opinion of interviewees that indicated the following issues to be male as household head: a) male earn more and can take right decisions in emergency, b) they maintain heredity, c) they are stronger and knowledgeable than female and d) traditionally they are accepted as household head. The *Tripura* community, on the other hand focused on a) social tradition, b) earning and decision-making capacity, c) heredity



and d) participation in arbitration and legal process through their knowledge and communication skill for considering male as household head.

The above-mentioned discussion shows that both the communities underscored more or less on the same issues to be male as household head but the priorities were different. Data reflects that possession of money, power, ability to make choices and work independently, knowledge and communication skills of male made them superior to women in the both communities and both male and female respondents admitted such social position and status of male in family and community.

### **5.3.2 Child Preference**

Most of the respondents irrespective of their sex from the *Marma* community confirmed that the indigenous community had no gender differences like mainstream Bengali community in child preference. The respondents from the *Marma* community further said that male and female child was equal in their society. They did not make any difference between these two sexes in terms of distribution of foods, dresses, providing education and health facilities, and taking consent in marriage. One of the male respondents from the *Marma* community, such as Ueepu Marma, informed that:

“We are patriarchal; our hereditary identity is quite different. Sons carry the paternal identity and daughters carry the maternal identity. Generally, sons inherit the parental property but these do not impact on expectation of giving birth of son or daughter.”

The perception regarding child preference from the *Tripura* community was found mixed. Most of the respondents replicated that there were some gender biasness in relation to distribution of foods, dresses, providing education and health facilities but such discrimination had been decreasing overtime. A very few of the respondents highlighted that there were no gender differences in preferring giving birth of male and female child. But some of the respondents were found to prefer male child to female child as male carry on family lineage and inheritance to parental property. However, child preference was also found highly linked with patrilineality as per FGDs with the *Tripura* community.

### **5.3.3 Division of Labor**

Gender-based division of labor was found in both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities. Some of the works were found done exclusively by women and some were by men at household and community level as those works were designed as feminine or masculine tasks respectively in indigenous society. The respondents were asked to give

their opinion regarding their daily activities in four categories such as household work, productive work, amusement work and public welfare. According to both male and the female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities, cooking, cleaning, washing, serving foods for family members, child bearing and rearing, taking care of the family members during illness, fetching water, collecting and gathering vegetables and fire-wood, sewing, making mats, handicrafts, doing kitchen garden, raising poultry, looking after domestic animal and drying seasonal crops were mostly done by women. But women from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities were also found to be involved in field level agricultural works as day laborer. They were found to sell vegetables and handicrafts at *haat* or *bazar* along with their male counterparts. In addition, working in NGOs and teaching in school were very common income earning activities of women. Attending religious and occasional festival, meeting religious leaders, watching TV and gossiping were found as the recreational functions attended by the female respondents. Alongside doing income earning and household works, some women respondents were also found to play their role as Ward Member of Union *Parishad* (the lowest tier of rural local government) which reflects their community role as well as participation in politics.

However, men from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* were found to help women in domestic works by taking children to school, taking care of cattle, selling products in market and making handicrafts. But the male respondents emphasized on their productive role. They were mostly found to work in agricultural field; few of them work in non-agricultural sector as day laborer, carpenter, small shopkeeper and teacher. The work responsibilities such as cultivating, ploughing, earth cutting, irrigating, spraying pesticides, carrying heavy materials, climbing trees, marketing of their products and vegetables were exclusively of men. In addition, attending at *shalish* and social meeting, visiting different government offices and NGOs, children's educational institutions and religious places were the prioritized community roles played by the male respondents.

Above-mentioned discussion reveals that though indigenous people believe that there is no gender difference among male and female in their communities; but existence of such division of labor in indigenous communities is harsh reality. They also allocate some works as feminine to be performed by women and some work as masculine to be performed by men. The reasons for assigning gender specific works are related to some

issues that include male are usually physically stronger than female and thus can do heavy tasks and they have outward network and intelligence to utilize resources properly. Traditionally, men are assigned for tasks of public space. The situation of the study area was no different in this respect. Hence, men were found to exercise power and enjoy higher social status over women. Indeed, embedded gender asymmetry in these two indigenous communities was being reified through the practice of division of labor.

It is mention worthy that most of the male respondents emphasized on females involvement in household works except few because of their efficiency in domestic chores and taking care of the children. In spite of difference in the nature of work between two sexes, most of the respondents recognized women's role in both public and private sphere. As a result, question of workload may be raised. The findings indicate that women were overburdened than men by their work responsibilities since they were playing triple role at a time and did not get respite from household duties. For this reason, indigenous women did not have their leisure hour.

#### **5.3.4 Mobility and Using Public Places**

Freedom of mobility and using public places are the important indicators of enjoying human rights of the people. The respondents were found to move mainly for livelihood, education, and healthcare and social and religious purposes. Both the male and female respondents opined that women usually worked within their domestic sphere as well as nearby localities. But during *jum* cultivation, they were found to go far away on the hills with their male counterparts. Occupational interest also pushed them to go to outside of their hamlets. But they were reluctant to go to unknown places for their physical security. While male did not have such problems; therefore they went distant places on the hills from home for searching and doing work. One of the female respondents from the *Marma* said:

“We go to the forest for collecting firewood or vegetables, go to stream for collecting water, go to top of the hill for *jum* cultivation and other agricultural work, go to bazar for buying or selling goods, we also go to children's school, hospital and visit relatives' house. We feel that we have our freedom of movement like men.”(Kheikhei Marma)

One of the female respondents from the *Tripura* reported:

“Women enjoy equal right in movement. We, who are job holders, go to our office, go to upazilla office for different allowances, VGF and relief; we go to

NGO office for getting credit and reimbursement of installment and attending group meetings. Even who do better jobs and travel different parts of Bangladesh. In addition, we are also allowed to go to religious places such as temple and place of worship, permitted to go outside for cultural and recreational purposes. Nonetheless, male are more accustomed and inured with public places than female.”(Keshomoti Tripura)

But a few female respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities mentioned that they could move around according to their necessity with taking permission of their husbands as they are earning member and social tradition expect that women follow the instruction of their husband. But they were uncomfortable with unknown places. Likewise the female respondents a small number of male respondents from the both communities expressed the same opinion. But they prioritized on security concern, economic constraints and traditional practice for such restriction on female’s mobility.

It is explicit from the above discussion that female enjoy their freedom of mobility in a limited sphere than man due to less familiarity with public places, less involvement in public works, traditional view of society towards women, lack of tendency of going unknown places, physical insecurity, distance of destination and financial crises.

### **5.3.5 Decision-making Process**

People’s empowerment and development are mostly related to capacity of making decision independently. But women’s participation in decision-making process was found comparatively less in the study area. One of the key informants from the *Marma* community stated:

“In rural areas, decisions regarding family issues are taken by male household head but in urban areas, it is taken jointly or consultation with wife. Decisions in community level still are taken by male. Although there are few female karbaris and Headmen in the Chakma Circle at present there is no such example in other circles which reflects less participation of women in decision-making at community and formal structure of the society.”

Another key informant reported:

“There are few female UP members elected from indigenous community but their opinions are not taken into consideration in decision-making process. Sometimes they are not able to stand their ideas and views due to their sex, less education and knowledge as well as lack of information regarding their surroundings.”

However, most of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* respondents agreed with the opinion of the key informants. It was found that husbands usually discussed the matters with their wives before taking decision but final decision they took alone. Men were found to play crucial role in major decisions while women took less important decisions at household level that complied with the following comment:

“Though husband and wife take the decision through discussion, roles in decision-making are mostly played by male due to their experience, knowledge, skill, customary practice, earning capability, power and women’s less capacity to give their views properly on particular issues. Male takes the major decisions in relation to land possession, buying or selling of land, marriage of the children, bank loan, conflict resolution, court procedures etc. while female take the minor decisions regarding cooking, choosing dresses, taking micro credit, children’s education, health care etc.” (Sukhendu Tripura, one of the male respondents).

It was striking that most of the respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities reported that they took the decision mutually and collectively but they also acknowledged that the central role in decision-making process was played by men. The findings indicate the dependency of women on their male counterparts and unequal power relation between men and women. It indirectly influences female opinion as well as consent in the decisions. However, major decisions of livelihood such as purchasing land, choosing occupation, cultivating and producing agricultural product, children’s marriage etc. were principally taken by men. But there was a changing trend to take decisions through discussion with female counterparts. It is observed that the increase in mutual respect was significant reason for such shifting in attitude and outlooks. It was practiced more in urban areas than rural areas. It was explicit that women participation in public decision was very sporadic and spasmodic.

### **5.3.6 Property Inheritance**

Indigenous communities have their own customary law by which their legal rights are determined. Shanti Kumar Tripura echoed most of the *Tripura* respondents by saying:

“There is no specific written law rather oral practice is existed regarding inheritance to female. It depends on parents’ or brother’s will whether their daughter as well as sister will get any property. If female gets any share that is also less than that of their brother’s portion. For example, women get one fourth of their brothers.”

Suri Marma, one of the female respondents, said:

“We do not have any right on our parents’ property. But parents give inheritance to their daughter less than their son if they want. It completely depends on their will. But if the property is of her mother then daughter gets more than brother. But there is no definite religious law regarding distribution of parental property.”

With regard to discrimination of parental property, the Headmen and *Karbaris*, as key informants, also agreed with these views. But in a form of gift and deeds of rights daughter could get a portion of property. FGD and case studies also explored the same findings in this regard.

The findings indicate that customary inheritance laws determine son(s) as the only legal successor of ancestral properties in indigenous communities. Therefore, womenfolk had no legal as well as religious rights to inherit property in the study area. They could only own when they bought property and gifted through deed of rights by their parents or brother. It showed that women’s access to and control over resources was very poor in respect of owning inheritance. As a result, certain advantages, for instance, power, position and domination were practiced and enjoyed by men. Hence, patriarchy perpetuates in the indigenous society. All the male and female respondents from both the rural and urban communities gave emphasis to tradition, maintaining heredity by son, and parental funerals done by sons as significant factors of having inheritance rights by son.

### **5.3.7 Employment Opportunities**

Unemployment is a common social problem of Bangladesh like other developing country. Indigenous men and women also face this crisis. There is a competition between indigenous men and women as well as between Bengalis and indigenous people to avail work opportunity in CHT. However, most of the indigenous men and women were somehow found to be involved in agricultural activities. As a result, many of them were found to work in under payment and many people became unemployed in off season. Especially during rainy season it was hard for them to do work. Such situation forced them to look for new work. Often they were not accustomed with the nature of those works such as guard, peon and working as day laborer in automobile shop and carpenter shop. One of the respondents from *Tripura* community said:

“We basically depend on agricultural work but in rainy season it is difficult to cultivate in hilly areas. Even it is inconvenient to carry agricultural products to

market for selling. As a result, income level becomes low. During this time many of us try to find alternative work to maintain subsistence.”

Bulichang Marma, one of the respondents from the *Marma* community, stated:

“Our agricultural works have become squeezed as a result we have to looking for non-agricultural job which we did not do earlier like Bengalis that include day labor, carpenter, work in automobile shop etc.”

On the one hand, their lower level of education made the situation difficult to get proper jobs, and competing with Bengalis. The Bengalis were in better position to get jobs due to their socioeconomic advantages and networks. Indigenous people repeatedly claimed that incursion of the Bengalis into CHT area made the situation worse. Sometimes the indigenous men were compelled to migrate from their locality in searching job. On the other hand, indigenous women either worked in agricultural sector at a lower pay in their vicinity or did domestic chores but not went far from own area. But literate indigenous women were found to go out of their locality in searching job.

### **5.3.8 Labor and Wage Differentials**

Economy of the indigenous people is mainly agriculture-based and most of the respondents were found be involved in farming to maintain their livelihood. But many of the respondents informed the researcher that due to losing lands for cultivation, economic pressure, price hike and lack of alternative job opportunities, they were doing work as hired daily labor. Even they were doing such work which they did not do before such as carpentry, driving, rickshaw pulling, work at brick field and hotel and running small business. Reflecting such situation Suepru Marma mentioned:

“We basically depend on agriculture and meet our subsistence through cultivation. But at present due to increasing economic hardship and land grabbing by different authorities for various purposes, we are compelled to shift our mode of income sources and exposed to exploitation too.”

Saderu Tripura stated,

“Indigenous women work as housewife but work more than indigenous man as they do both household chores as well as work in field. They also work as agricultural laborer. But the intensity and degree of involvement differ from family to family and community to community depending on their economic crisis or extent of work.”

In respect of wage level, both the male and female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities affirmed that there was a wage differential between two sexes.

Wage of men was higher than that of women for the same work. The reasons for wage differential, that is, higher wage of men, were related to gendered ideology embedded in indigenous community. It was believed that men were physically stronger than women, did more work and had higher productivity than that of women. As a result men used to get more than women. Moreover, traditional gender gap in payment and giving more emphasis on male status by the society were also responsible for wage differential. Women were found to get approximately 30% to 50% less than that of men in informal sectors. It is significant to note that regardless of doing the labor intensive work from dawn to dusk, women themselves believed and society also imposed that their work was lower skilled and lower valued.

Both of the male and female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* admitted that there was a wage gap between male and female. Suri Marma reflecting on this issue stated that:

“There is a wage differential between indigenous men and women. Men are paid more due to their physical strength. They do hard labor and more work than women. We do not protest as it has been practiced for a long time in our society. Social perception regarding men’s role in family is also matter. But in urban area and in good jobs do not have such discrimination.”

Keshomoti Tripura, one of the female respondents opined:

“There is a wage differential between men and women in paid work. Women get BDT 150 to 200 in a day, whereas men get BDT 300 for the same work. We do not protest as women are less strong than that of men. But women laborer finish their work as early as possible as they have to do household work after the work of public domain. Despite taking break, gossiping and wasting time in lame excuses, male workers get more than female.”

But no indigenous men or women mentioned about irregular payment or geographical variation. The *Marma* and the *Tripura Karbaries* and *Tripura UP* member as key informant agreed that being patriarchal communities there were some discrimination against women in terms of decision-making, division of labor, wage differential, determining household head and inheritance. They mentioned that traditional social system, patriarchal attitude and dependency on male earnings, maintaining heredity, physical strength, knowledge and involvement with outward network of men were the significant factors related to such discrimination.



### 5.3.9 Gender Ideology and Gender-based Discrimination

The interviewees, participants of focus group discussion and key informants admitted that women were overburdened with different types of responsibilities than male as they worked at both private and public spaces, but their control over income was less than their male counterparts. Data show that many decisions at household level were taken jointly by husband and wife but men were found to dominate the decisions as senior and main income earner of the family. Women participation in decision-making process at community level was found very minimal than male participation. Consequently, women leadership was not flourished in an expected level. Urmila Tripura, one of the key informants, reflected the situation by saying:

“Working period of women is longer than men as they perform both domestic and outside works. They have no choice but to accept poorly paid, differential payment and undervalued work due to inadequate skill, less education and knowledge as well as limited mobility and network. Man plays the key role to take any decision at household level and consult with wife if necessary. Though few women are playing important role in community level their participation is still dissatisfactory and under-represented.”

But women could enjoy the respect and freedom of mobility in limited sphere in the study area. Incident of domestic violence was rare in the both indigenous communities. Focusing on this issue Chinsau Marma as Karbari said:

“Indigenous women enjoy much more freedom of movement. They are not frequent victims of domestic violence like Bengali women. Sometimes, indigenous women do not want to go far beyond their locality which is unknown to them considering their physical integrity. In rural areas, indigenous women generally take permission for going anywhere from their male guardians as it is traditional practice and they respect their male counterparts. On the contrary, in urban areas women’s mobility to go to any endpoint is less restricted.”

However, inequality between male and female child in providing food, dress, and education and health facilities was not found in the study area. The respondents claimed that they treated their boys and girls equally. Headmen from both communities assured that the *Tripura* and *Marma* did not make any difference between boys and girls in providing opportunities such as education, health care, clothes and food distribution. But economic constrains often made differences in such cases. Furthermore, most of the key informants prioritized that gender differences had spatial dimension as women faced more disparities in rural areas than that of urban areas. For instance, Marma Headman stated:

“Decision in rural areas is taken by male household head and in urban areas decision is taken jointly. Preferential treatment towards boy than girl is less evident in urban areas but giving birth of boy child is often emphasized because of maintaining heredity. Though jum cultivation and few works in private domain are done by both male and female still domestic chores are done mostly by female in rural and urban areas.”

### **5.3.10 Violence Against Women**

Prevalence of domestic violence against women was found less in the study area. The respondents from both the communities of rural and urban areas, participants of FGDs and key informants did not mention any severe violence against women at domestic sphere. *Shanti Tripura*, one of the respondents from the *Tripura* community, said in this connection:

“Generally, prevalence of violence against women is rare in our community. We respect our women and embrace humble attitude toward them. Though it very rare men beat or abuse their wives when they drink alcohol. But family members normally control the situation. If situation goes beyond their control the Karbari and Headman make a solution through shalish.”

On the other hand, *Uepru Marma* mentioned:

“Eve teasing, abuse and violence against women in our indigenous community are rare as there is a respectful attitude toward them. But few cases of social violence such as abduction, sexual abuse, rape, murder after rape have been happened by the Bengali settlers and member of law enforcement agencies or army personnel.”

The above-mentioned discussion and statements reflect that women of the study area were vulnerable to be victim of social violence rather than domestic violence.

### **5.3.11 Access to Information**

Access to information is the one of the key to success of democracy. Access to information about services and rights of the people as well as participation of the people makes the democratic government a success. There are a lot of channel of access to information in modern society. The study area was no different in this regard. Listening to radio, watching television, social gathering and gossiping were mentioned by the respondents as the main sources of information. But it was differed from place to place. The respondents from rural areas mentioned social gathering as an important and primary source of sharing information. But respondents from urban areas opined that radio and television as the basis of getting information. A few male respondents mentioned that cell phone with internet facilities was a significant source of their information. However, information regarding human rights, legal rights, political rights, legal facilities, CHT

accord etc. was not found quite clear to them. Most of the female respondent from both rural and urban areas could say little regarding their rights and problems. A few respondents, working with NGOs directly as change agents, became able to provide relevant information properly such as insecurities, nature and facilities of programs of the GAs and NGOs and impact of peace accord. But male respondents from both communities of rural and urban background could able to analyze their condition, deprivation, insecurities, aspiration as indigenous people, identity crisis and reviewing the CHT Accord.

This chapter exclusively concentrated on analyzing the socioeconomic condition, demographic data, gender roles, responsibilities and rights of the indigenous men and women of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities. It is evident from the findings that though the two communities are permeated with patriarchal values, women still have access to opportunities and benefits from family to societal level such as education, health, and freedom of mobility, positive and reverential attitude towards women. But in reality gender discrimination is existed in few aspects such as considering household head, decision-making process, child birth, wage gap and division of labor; therefore, indigenous women yet to enjoy equality in status and access to resources with their male counterparts. It is noteworthy that norms of female subjugation, subservience and subordination in social, economic and political realm are not so manifested like the mainstream womenfolk. From such background of gender disparities, how indigenous women analyze human insecurities of their daily lives has been presented in the next chapter in particular and indigenous men in general.

## **CHAPTER SIX**

# **Human Security of the Indigenous People by Gender Lens**

### **6.1 Introduction**

Human security is a broad concept and does not have internationally accepted definition. Therefore, it is significant to identify how an individual or a community comprehends their own security. Based on local interpretation of human security and insecurity, this chapter provides a working definition of human security and insecurity and tries to outline the main factors related to security and insecurity of the indigenous people in the study area. In other words, this chapter deals with the perception of the respondents regarding human insecurities or threats they face in their daily lives as well as their own efforts to combat such insecurities. The purpose of doing so is to ascertain the gender dimension of human insecurities from both indigenous men and women's perspectives, understand the drivers of insecurities and relationship among the factors related to insecurities. It also intends to understand relationship of human security and insecurity with development interventions and reveal the ways to uproot the causes and impacts of insecurities. Before moving on to look at how indigenous people of CHT define insecurities and threats it is worthwhile to look briefly at internationally defined term 'human security'.

### **6.2 Human Security**

The discourse on human security came to the forefront following the end of the Cold War owing to certain factors such as newer types of threats that affect ordinary people and non-combatants a lot more than they do the state. As a result, necessities for addressing people's needs and concerns became highlighted; secondly, in post-Cold war era, need for articulating state responsibilities became prioritized as the state itself is being seen as violator of safety and welfare of its citizen along with its incapability to confront few threats of its own people; thirdly, enunciating security both in positive and negative concept (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:19). From this background, rethinking and reimagining the entire array of security were started and all-inclusive alternative paradigm, which percolating down to the humanity, replaced the traditional exclusive discourse on security

(Hussain *et al.* 2010:1). Thus, human security emerged as an imperative and response to neutralize the threats to ensure security of the people through protection their rights and prevention from threats. It is notable that human security puts people at the center of its agenda along with the security of the state.

Human security is a new but universal concept. It is still in the process of change, development and maturation. Therefore, there is lack of consensus among the scholars regarding definition of the concept. For example, Chen (1995:137-146) observed that: human security means the ultimate ends of all security concerns and Bajpai (2001) perceived it as just to mean to end. On the other hand, Kabir and Ahmed (2012:21) mentioned it as a separate, distinct and parallel concept. Thus notion of security remains points of contention. In the absence of universal definition, academics, various institutions, and agencies of the United Nations defined this concept differently.

The former UN Secretary General Kofi Annan (2000) defined,

“Human security in its broadest sense, embraces for more than the absence of violent conflict. It encompasses human rights, good governance, access to education and health care, and ensuring that each individual has opportunities and choices to fulfill his or her potential. Every step in this direction is also a step towards reducing poverty, achieving economic growth and preventing conflict. Freedom from want, freedom from fear and the freedom of future generations to inherit a healthy natural environment – these are the interrelated building blocks of human, and therefore, national security.”

According to UNDP (1994:22), human security is a “legitimate concern of the ordinary people in their daily lives, for whom security symbolizes protection from threat of disease, hunger, unemployment, crime, social conflict, political repression and environmental hazards.”

Sabina Alkire (2003:2) defined human security is, “.....to safeguard the vital core of all human lives from critical pervasive threats in a way that is consistent with long term human fulfillment.”

Indeed, the concept of human security is relatively a comprehensive concept due to its pro-people emphasis. It comprehends security to make people safe from socio-political and economic discriminations, from different threats such as illness, starvation, illiteracy, tyranny and domination, creates access to economic opportunities and people’s needs,

enable people to exercise choices freely and safely. However, the present study observed the local perception of the respondents regarding human security as follows:

### **6.2.1 Views of the Interviewees on Human Security**

Concern for security affects each and every individual as well as human being collectivity. The idea of security is inseparable from the idea of insecurity. Hence, one needs another as fundamental analytical referent (Hussain et. al. 2010:4). Therefore, this section highlights how securities or insecurity embodies and exemplifies of what for the indigenous men and women in their daily lives. In-depth interview with the respondents revealed that there were many qualms, uncertainties and fear in indigenous people's life which were considered as human insecurities according to them. It is noteworthy that there were significant differences to the perceptions regarding insecurities depending on gender, ethnicity and location; but religion did not make any differences on their opinion.

Both of the indigenous groups (the *Marma* and the *Tripura*) emphasized less access to economic opportunities as their insecurities. Both interviewees and participants of focus groups from rural areas opined that poverty was a common insecurity of their lives. Lack of job facilities, squeeze of agricultural production, unemployment were the key reasons for poverty. These insecurities acted as source of other insecurities such as food insecurities, illiteracy, ignorance and ill-health.

On the contrary, the respondents from urban area mentioned about their identity crisis, land grabbing and problems in ownership of land as their insecurity. Both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* from urban area said that security comes through the recognition and establishment of rights of identity. But they (indigenous people) always experienced denial of this right that keep them marginalized. The terms used by the state, academicians, anthropologists, politicians for their identity are generally indigenous, tribe, small ethnic group, *adivashi*, *pahari*, *jumma* people etc. in different times which they felt destructive to their self-respect and dignity as well as developed a sense of exclusion. The respondents interpreted the term in various ways. Miaipu, one of the Marma respondents, opined:

“Land is the main natural resource of the indigenous people on which we depend for our subsistence. But the process of land grabbing or land dispossession by the state agencies, various interest groups and organizations in the name of developmental activities or maintaining securities creates the insecurities and menace to the indigenous people of CHT.”

Moni, one of the *Tripura* respondents, stated:

“Incessant loss of land and dwindling houses as well as limited access to the forest areas produce thwarting condition for our survival and vulnerable to provisioning our distinctive socioeconomic needs. It also acts as major driving force for ethnic conflict in CHT.”

The female respondents from both of the *Tripura* and *Marma* mentioned food security, freedom of mobility and protection from violence and economic opportunities as security issue. Mongoti, one of the female respondents from the *Tripura* community opined:

“Security seems to us as assurance of feeding family members properly and having food throughout the year. We have freedom of mobility in our indigenous community but due to the existence of Bengali settlers or staffs of security forces, we are scared of our bodily integrity.”

One of the female respondents from the *Tripura* from rural area mentioned:

“Security means to be satisfied with basic needs such as food, shelter, education and healthcare as well as freedom of movement. Our movement is still restricted in public places or outside the locality due to security concern as well as lack of inclination to go beyond familiar surroundings and discomfort to unknown and unfamiliar places. On the other hand, we do not face family violence like mainstream Bengali community but we face violence like rape, sexual harassment, bullying etc. perpetuated by the Bengali settlers or army personnel.”

One of the *Marma* female respondents, Mesinghai from urban area said:

“Land grabbing and landlessness are the major peril to our security. It impacts our livelihood adversely and intensifies our identity crisis and process of acculturation. If our existence and distinctiveness are questionable, how do we expect enjoying human rights properly? Hence, we mean security is the recognition of our identity and resolving conflict over land in CHT as well as to take into consideration the pahari practices on unwritten agreements regarding the allocation and management of land.”

Good health is one of the significant components contributing towards productivity and economic growth of a country (Hussain et. al, 2010:15). Hence, health is considered as significant component of human security. Respondents from both of the *Tripura* and *Marma* highlighted the guarantee of health facilities in terms of nutrition, water and sanitation, treatment of diseases, availability of essential drugs and doctors in time as human security. It is striking that the female respondents from both rural and urban areas put emphasis on this issue. One of the female *Tripura* respondents from rural area, Sonapoti, defined human security in the following way:

“I understand security as the assurance of health care in our life. Good health ensures the well-being and productivity. Therefore, all people should have the access to healthcare services which has been provided by the state. But, we, the rural people often far from these facilities due to distance from urban area as availability of such facilities are urban-centered.”

The respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* expressed their anguish and agitation regarding the deployment of military in CHT. They explained the presence of military in CHT is violation of human rights in the name of maintaining peace and security that is reflected by the comments of *Marma Karbari*. He said:

“The CHT remains under heavy military occupation despite incorporating a clause in the CHT Accord that the Army will be withdrawn. But the reality is different from expectation. Still they (army) control the CHT through prowling the forests, running profitable business like real state, and investment in land. They are also involved in production of cement, flour, lights etc. So, I think security means withdraw of military from CHT and full implementation of the CHT Accord. Insecurity, from my view, denotes outnumbering indigenous people from our own land and prioritized settlers against indigenous people and proving the importance of military presence for minimizing created communal tensions.”

### **6.2.2 Views of the Focus Groups on Human Security**

Both the male and the female respondents participated together in focus group discussions (FGDs) and gave their opinions regarding how they perceived human security. The female participants focused on freedom of mobility, food security, health care, and access to education and shelter while the male participants prioritized on opportunity of job, protection from social violence, religious freedom and opportunity of using natural resources as the sources of security. One of the *Tripura* female participants, Neela Tripura, from rural area of Killamura para opined:

“Security is understood by the indigenous people as access to food, housing with all utilities such as sanitation, electricity and water supply, education and healthcare along with the autonomy of movement and protection from violence. In absence of these conditions create human insecurity.”

One of the male participants from the *Tripura*, Purno Kumar Tripura, explained this issue in different way:

“We feel insecure when we do not have employment opportunity. Our work is different from mainstream Bengali people. We depend on forests, natural resources and jum cultivation for our subsistence; but now our occupation pattern has been changed due to limited access to these resources as well as evicted from land. So, security delineates right to land ownership, relishing natural resources, and access to employment opportunities.”



In contrast, the *Marma* respondents from *Kukimara para* underscored the issue of identity and implementation of the CHT Accord for ensuring security of the indigenous people.

Numongpru Marma, one of participants of FGD stated:

“Our identity is under threat as government frequently changes our ethnic name and termed us as different names. Even we do not have right to determine our own identity. At the same time, though government is kind to implement the CHT Accord but the reality compelled us to think differently. You see, military presence makes us vulnerable rather than feeling secure. They control all things in such a way that we feel as outsider in our own land. Even the Bengali settlers are more benefitted than us with the help of administration. From this perspective, we think security outlines enjoying own identity as the indigenous people, freedom of expression and emancipation from all kinds of deprivation and discriminations.”

It should be mentioned that Bangladesh termed indigenous people in different words such as tribal, small national minorities, ethnic communities, upajati (sub-nation) etc. but never give recognition as *adivashi* (indigenous). The government of Bangladesh has used the Bengali term *upajati* (tribal) in its different documents and prohibited the term *adivashi* (indigenous). But, it is noteworthy that the term ‘indigenous’ has been used in different government documents such as National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction (NSAPR-II 2009-11), the National Education Policy 2010 and the Sixth Five Year Plan 2011-16 (Jahan, 2015:7). Very recently, the new term ‘small ethnic minorities’ (*kshudro Nritattik Jonogosthi*) have been used for identifying indigenous people instead of *Adivashi*. Basically, the government has been opposing the demand of recognition as indigenous or *adivashi* and imposing the state hegemony and monotonic approach that considers as ‘One nation and one state’ (Jahan, 2015:8-9).

The female participants of focus group discussion from the *Marma* community prioritized the fulfillment of basic needs in defining human security. They asserted that security, in their sense, would be established if they have the access to food all the year round; if they could live in their own house, if their children get the opportunity to be educated in native language along with *Bangla*, get the employment facilities and do not face any kind of fear and discrimination.

But a few respondents from the *Marma* community of rural area made connection between limited access to land and their survival to the concept of insecurities by saying that lack of access to land was leading them to have very little opportunity to harvest

traditional crops and medicinal plants, which in turn making them poorer in terms of lack of access to food, medicine and other basic needs.

### **6.2.3 Views of the Key Informants on Human Security**

The key informants expressed in-depth views on human security issues. They focused on access to various types of rights as well as on fulfillment of basic needs as human security. For example, one of the key informants from the *Tripura* community (human rights and political worker) underscored that:

“Security means to have the ownership of land and natural resources, to enjoy common land of the community and own identity status, prevention of displacement, protection from violence and opportunity to participate in decision-making process. It should be noted that due to the establishment of Kaptai Dam during 1960s most of the agricultural land went under water and the affected people were not replaced with land rather given some money as compensation and thus the affected people became internal refugees. This situation became worst at the end of 1979 and through 1980 when the first settlements were taking place in hill tracts through cluster village under the guidance of Army and the process of internal displacement of indigenous people was being started. On the other hand, a huge number of lands have been leased for plantation, small industries, and cantonments in the name of development and the indigenous people became displaced further. The land which is our life and boon of our survival became the source of ethnic bitterness, conflict, reappearance of violence and insecurity as well as complicates relationship between settlers and indigenous people because of the state policies. Although the post-Accord era has created a hope of ending the struggle over land between indigenous people and settlers through its clauses regarding land commission and its role; but, till now it is far beyond our expectation since illegal appropriation of land by force, fraud and manipulation is continuing relentlessly in CHT.”

On the other hand, *Karbari* from the *Marma* community highlighted the issue of destroying forests as another source of insecurity to indigenous people. He said:

“Deforestation through rubber plantation and fragmentation in CHT has heightened the security problem. Social forestry has taken place to promote commercial and industrial plantations like rubber and tobacco. It is destroying our ecology, wild life, native varieties of crops, and above all indigenous people are gradually losing their land. Besides, because of damage of natural forest we are losing our means of livelihood. On the other hand, it is difficult to continue jum cultivation because of destroying land, forest and government restriction, but it is major source of our livelihood and important component of our culture and identity. Moreover, we collect fruits, vegetables, herbs, and plants for medicine from forests to fulfill our basic needs. But losing land and destroying forest are sources of threat to human security.”

On the other hand, Headman from the *Marma* community focused on the importance of village common forests for enhancing security and highlighted the reduction of forests, establishment of *Kaptai* Dam and transmigration of 1970 as source of insecurity. He asserted:

“We had many forests that were being used by village communities on a collective basis and regarded as our collective property. Since 1860 these forests were started to go under government management as reserved forests. Forests were being started to use for maximizing production of commercially valuable timber by ignoring local people’s economic and cultural needs. This situation became worst in 1960s in the wake of *Kaptai* Dam as well as population transfer in 1970. Nowadays, these forests are under peril due to population growth, in-migration, and spread of horticulture, tree plantation and sedentary agriculture. But these forests are the source of wood and bamboo which is helpful for the construction of house, temple and school; indigenous plants are source of medicine, and forests are the source of food. All these are in adverse threat as a consequence of declining village common forests (VCFs). Disappearance of traditional occupations like basket weaving and hunting is also evident for the loss of right to forests. Therefore, in my judgment security means to uplift the right of access to our common resources like forests and land that is inherently related to our life and culture, on the other hand, insecurity means evil impact of loss of this right”

Female UP member from *Tripura* community said:

“We need development in healthcare, education, economic facilities; protection from social violence, providing legal aid, making awareness, and capacity building to lead our livelihood. But it is true in the name of development we are losing our land, right to forest as common natural resource and compelled to change our pattern of livelihood as well as occupation. Basically, development interventions and associated deforestation adversely affect lives and livelihoods of the indigenous people. In that sense security indicates freedom of enjoying life with food, education, healthcare, economic activities, maintaining own tradition and culture. In absence of these facilities may symbolize insecurity.”

An NGO worker analyzed the issue of insecurity in the following way:

“Many young indigenous women do not feel safe to wear their traditional dress for fear of eve teasing and sexual harassment including rape. Before CHT Accord such violence was used as weapon of counter-insurgency. But after signing the CHT Accord the situation has not been changed rather women are always in fear of violence from settlers or security forces. It is often happened when they go for collecting water from stream, food and firewood in forest, or even pass nearby the Bengali village or army camp. Moreover, conflict between indigenous and settlers is a common scenario of CHT depending on different issues from trivial to significant. In this sense, security must be understood as the protection from violence and insecurity indicates threat to bodily integrity.”

The above-mentioned discussion indicates that how the indigenous men and women conceptualized human security and perceived insecurities from their own points of views. Their perception was influenced by the historical, socioeconomic, cultural and political context of CHT. Moreover, their gender, geographical location and education were also matter to influence their opinions and views. The respondents conceived the notion of human security as assurance of food, education, health, employment, housing, and access to natural resources like forests and land, physical safety, participation in socio-politico-economic decision-making process, recognition of identity in their daily lives and defined insecurities as threats created in absence of these opportunities. In a word, they explained human security as safety from threats such as hunger, unemployment and loss of right to forests, protection from sudden disruption like eviction from own land, violence like rape, which were identical as UNDP's (1994:23) definition of human security. Their expression also replicated the definition of human security of Kabir and Ahmed (2012:9).

However, human security, according to the respondents and key informants, embraced access to food, education, healthcare; respect for dignity and worth, opportunity to consume and make use of natural resources, preventing conflict and promotion of post-conflict reconstruction through implementation of the CHT Accord; as well as protection from violence, ill health, economic deprivation and homelessness. This understanding of individual and community regarding human security, in fact, encompassed freedom from fear and freedom from want (UNDP, 1994). On the basis of respondents' view the following section provides the outline of nature and sources of insecurities or threats faced by indigenous men and women in CHT.

### **6.3 Nature of Human Insecurities**

This section deals with insecurities that emerged from ethnicity and development intervention and the resultant conflict and threats thereof in CHT. The bases of human security problems in CHT are varied and stem from various roots encompassing the CHT's land factor and its demographic, political, economic, social and cultural factors and so on (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:47). To understand the situation of insecurities faced by the indigenous people in CHT, we need to explore the various sources of insecurities and their interaction. The present study, therefore, presents ethnicity and development induced human security problems i.e. the nature and areas of insecurities existing in CHT based on opinion and interpretation of the respondents. It is noteworthy that though the

presentation is categorized, but this grouping is not fixed and precised rather they are interrelated across these categories.

### **6.3.1 Land and Human Insecurities**

Land is the most important source of subsistence and livelihoods of the indigenous people in CHT. It is also significant for their survival and provisioning their distinctive social, cultural and religious needs. Lands are also intimately linked to their identity and way of life. On the basis of land use, lands under use and control of *paras* in CHT are divided into seven broad categories such as plough land, hills used for *jum* and garden, village common forest, homestead, infrastructure, water bodies and others (Barakat *et al.* 2010:72). But the process of frequent land grabbing created ethnic conflicts, coercions, intimidation among indigenous people of different ethnic groups, indicated that the land issue forms the crux of the human security problems in CHT. It is notable that the structure of land administration is distinctive under the hierarchy of the traditional indigenous officeholders (Chief-Headman-*Karbari*) and the colonial bureaucracy headed by the Deputy Commissioner (Adnan and Dastidar, 2011:35). Different types of grabbing mechanisms have been using from colonial period to till date. Denial of the rights to land of indigenous peoples of Bangladesh has a long historical background (Barakat *et al.* 2009:280). Hence, to understand the respondents' worries and distress about land alienation a brief history of grabbing mechanisms are indicated here.

The rights of access to traditional resources of the indigenous people of CHT are largely based upon customs, practices and usages that include rights over communal lands used for *swidden* (locally known as *jum*) cultivation, rights over forests, rights over grazing lands, grasslands, wild game and water bodies, amongst others (Roy, 2004:126-127). In pre-colonial period, indigenous people cultivated *swidden* in common lands based on customary laws and practices through oral tradition instead of developing permanent and inherited property rights in land. From the British period to second half of the nineteenth century, almost all lands of the CHT were taken under the state ownership, that were historically used by indigenous people for homesteads, *swidden* farming, hunting, gathering, livestock grazing, village common forests and forest based extraction activities and other common uses (Roy, 1996:2). As a result, although indigenous people are using and inhabiting in these lands the government might take back at will or settle or lease these lands to anyone else. Thus, they become trespassers on their own ancestral land and

vulnerable to dispossession through the state resumption (Adnan and Dastidar, 2011: 37-38).

After partition of the British India in 1947, the large scale migration of Bengali settlers was allowed into CHT under one amendment in Pakistan Constitution. These settlers abused the lands and resources of indigenous people. As a result, the indigenous people's identity, culture, religion and economic well-being were being in threat (Punday and Jamil, 2009). This situation was intensified by building the Hydro-electric Dam in 1962 on *Karnafuli* river in *Rangamati* when 40 percent arable land of CHT was sub-merged and about 100000 people were displaced, 55 percent of whom were plough cultivators. Among the displaced those with permanent land title were resettled in reserve forests. Nevertheless, the compensation and rehabilitation programs were insufficient and scanty (Roy, 2002). Between 1964 and 1971, the Pakistan government amended Regulation 1 of the Act of 1900 (CHT Regulation) several times. This allowed migration of non-indigenous into the hill tracts and led to transfer of ownership of land and other resources of CHT to non-tribal people migrated from the plains. Consequently, indigenous people (IP) lost a large number of lands to outsiders.

In post 1975 period, people from plain land (more than 200000) settled in CHT through resettlement program implemented by the government (Roy, 2002). They resettled in *khas* land (government owned fallow land) which actually possessed by indigenous people for generations as community land (Barua, 2001). As a result, indigenous people were evicted from their land for second time. This led to deepening insecurity of indigenous people of CHT (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:60). Another move was taken in 1992 when 50000 ha. of land was declared to be aside as forest and 4000 ha. was given for lease for rubber plantation (Mohsin, 1997). These moves further disappointed the indigenous people and disrupt the way of life of the indigenous people of CHT. In parallel, the civil administration and security forces followed a policy of disregarding the private property rights of the indigenous people on lands that had been formally titled and registered. Thus, legal, military and demographic interventions led to radical changes in the ethnic composition and land distribution of the region (Adnan and Dastidar, 2010:43.)

Despite repeated promise of government regarding fulfillment of the terms of the CHT Accord, immigration, land grabbing, policy of relocation, by Bengalis in post Accord period is continuing. As a result, problem created between the indigenous people and

Bengali community and the indigenous people viewed it as an encroachment on their rights to lands (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:45). Lack of access to land is the root of the problem, but the Accord has little addressed land tenure issues (Islam, 2013:3). The Land Commission could play a crucial role in solving the protracted land disputes, but years of official neglect and exclusion of indigenous people from its decision-making means it has become little more than an empty shell. However, after 18 years of the agreement, the result only marks the beginning of the process to resolve disputes over land access. Moreover, as land issues are still unsettled, it has remained a fundamental source for conflict, insecurity and violence in CHT. Challenges to access and control over land are still rolling over the conflict process. Barman and Neo (2014) reported that 3992 acres of land was grabbed by the forest department, elites and even the security forces in 2013. 111 cases of houses were burnt due to land related conflict in 2011 and another 36 cases were occurred in 2013. 26 families were evicted in 2013 from their ancestral land.

It is noteworthy that land area under use and control of *paras* in *Rangamati* has been reduced by 43% through acquisition by the Department of Forest. Moreover, in an estimate of last thirty years it is found that hills for *jum* cultivation and village community forest (VCF) has been declined drastically. On the contrary, the proportion of plough land, hills for garden, water-bodies, homestead and infrastructure has been increased in Rangamati (Barrakat *et al.* 2010:152). This background is helpful to understand the views and grievances regarding land grabbing process in CHT and threat to loss of land ownership in *Rangamati* in particular. The respondents and key informants of the study area expressed their opinion regarding the causes, nature, mechanisms and impacts of land grabbing as well as loss of landownership.

Pointing out the rights on land of the indigenous people and the consequences of loss of land in livelihood pattern the Headman from the *Marma* community said:

“Land is core and root cause of all kinds of problem existed in CHT. Eviction from land in the name of development, establishment of educational institutions, military camp and ECO Park is continuing picture of CHT. For instances, the decision to set up university and colleges, which will in real sense ultimately promote the interest of non-indigenous people but showing that those initiatives are for the development of indigenous people. It doesn't matter where such incidents are happening; in Rangamati or Bandarban or Khagrachari; matter is that we, the indigenous people, are being displaced, homeless and jobless; face food and health uncertainty; our traditional land rights and customary practice

are being hindered; our culture related to land and forest is being endangered and disappearing. Hence, successful resolution of different problems existed in CHT will not possible unless this issue has not been taken into consideration properly.”

The *Marma Karbari* from *Asam Basti* expressed the worries regarding losing of landownership and the ambiguous role of administration regarding fraudulent transaction of land. He said:

“We were accustomed with oral tradition of land ownership and never gone through the title registration process. But the entire CHT has experienced dispossession dynamics before, during and after the violent conflict. Settlers are eager to register their land to legalize and institutionalize their settlement document on their name to gain control over land. There are many instances of accessing land deceitfully and fraudulently and using land without recording in their name. In contrast, many indigenous people have valid document but their land is given Bondobosto (Settlement) to new settlers. I am the victim of such case; still my case is in the court for deciding whose land it is. We are in threat of losing ownership through such grabbing process.”

Few respondents both from the *Tripura* and *Marma* communities drawn attention to the land transaction process as there were anomaly and legal pluralism in land tenure. Thus, the male respondents from the *Tripura* of *Chaklachhari* (from *Rajasthali upazila*) represented the views and indicated the multiple practices of landownership as one kind of insecurity for the indigenous people. One of the male respondents, Dilip Kumar Tripura stated:

“It should be noted that three kinds of landownership like customary right of indigenous people on common property, non-recorded traditional customary land owned by individual, family or clan, registered ownership significantly by settlers with deeds certified by the administration are still remained in the CHT. Such practices as well as co-existence of four parallel laws in CHT caused multiple titling, fraudulent transactions, and biased land distributions by consecutive government are existing challenge to human security in CHT.”

Similar result was found in a UNDP study (2009) that showed that about 79% of tribal people had no registered private ownership of land that is why they had hardly security of rights to access and control over land. Adnan and Dastidar (2010) and Adnan (2011) also mentioned that diverse process was used as land transaction. For instance, the state converted the private and common lands owned by indigenous according to customary right through acquisition; Bengali interests groups and agencies converted the private land property of IP into their ownership through intimidating and forcible occupation; the



formal registration and titling of land rights to non-indigenous people and commercial farms; the powerful indigenous people become landowner through privatization of common lands. In all cases except last one loss of land rights by indigenous people to outside agencies or interest groups are involved.

One of the key informants from the Tripura, focusing on the actors of land grabbing, ownership and process of acquisition stated:

“At present, democracy means muscle, money and media in CHT. Loss of landownership in Rangamati and land grabbing in other region of CHT by different power holders reflects a complex trend. The loss of land rights of the indigenous people is related to the power relations and political contentions. Expulsion from land is happening in the CHT by the security forces, civil administration (UNO, DC) and law enforcement agencies, settlers backed by the government, forest department, business corporations, commercial NGOs, plantation leaseholders, and land dealers. Thus, the indigenous people are facing simultaneous threats from multiple fronts with losing their lands forcibly occupying by different groups and agencies using a whole range of distinct mechanism.”

Most of the respondents of the study area confirmed that dispossession and loss of landownership dynamics were influenced by several factors such as settlers were more powerful than indigenous people, local administration and law enforcement agencies were not helpful to indigenous people; the state followed unequal land disputable policies and applied coercion. Such situation accelerated their marginality and insecurities. Barakat *et. al.* (2010) also found in their study that the key aspects of the marginalization were gradual dispossession and obliteration of indigenous people's lands, expelling them from their land rights and thus shrinking them from their land use patterns which impacted negatively not only on their livelihood concern but also heavily accentuated their identity crisis. Moreover, they found that lack of legal safeguard, ignorance of the indigenous people and their customary practices regarding landownership in relevant government policies, lack of effective application of government rules and laws were major factors for such marginalized and uncertain situation.

### **6.3.2 Forests and Human Insecurities**

Like lands, the forests and natural resources are important sources of subsistence of the indigenous people. The forests in CHT include reserve forest, protected forest, un-classed state forest (USF) and privately owned forests. The first two categories are managed under the forest department and USF falls under the management of Hill District Council

(HDC). In many places, the village common forest (VCF) – one of the traditional practices of managing forest by the communities in CHT is existed. However, the people of the CHT (specially the ethnic groups) depend on the land and its natural resources, including the forests, for leading their livelihood. Traditionally, the right to use and extract forest produce is existed in CHT except those prescribed under customary law. However, during 1875-1882 the British administration initiated a policy of curtailing the rights of the indigenous people to the forests (Roy 2000:71). Following the colonial policy, the government of Bangladesh also applied the management of forest and established the state ownership by a gradual expansion of land and shifting cultivation land into reserved and un-classed state forest. This trend impacted on the livelihoods of the local ethnic people by limiting their accessibility to forests and traditional ownership of land (GoB and FAO, 2013). Deforestation and fragmentation occurring in the region indicated the extent of the CHT people's human security problems and revealed some of the threats posed to human security (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012). But the indigenous peoples had their own explanation in this regard. A Headman from the *Tripura* community said in this regard:

“We depend on forest for our livelihoods. Our tradition, culture and history are related to forest. Forest depletion has severely affected our livelihoods. Present forest depletion can be considered as outcome of development intervention and modernization. I differ with the non-indigenous peoples' explanation regarding the reasons for forest diminution like population explosion, shifting cultivation, fuel-wood collection etc. But, what about the establishment of Kaptai Dam and population settlement program? These are also responsible for creating a pressure on resource use like forest. Jum cultivation is forbidden and has been shrinking due to deforestation. Even the Forest Amendment Act of 2000, which amended certain provisions of the Forest Act of 1927, serves the interest of international financial institutions for promoting commercial and industrial plantation. However, instead of jum, the state policy and such law for horticulture, monoculture or industrial plantation like rubber and tobacco mainly displaced the indigenous people ignoring the customary rights of them and caused ecological damage too. It offers jobs for local indigenous people as day laborer or tappers. It actually brings cash money for government and private entrepreneurs but destroys the grazing land which impact adversely on livestock also. Forest meets our subsistence needs, medicinal needs through herb, which have now been restricted. On the other hand, monoculture wipes out the native spices that ultimately makes imbalance of environment.”

Mentioning the importance of forest in the lives of the indigenous people one of the female respondents from the *Marma*, Numeching Marma, mentioned:

“We depend on forest for our subsistence by collecting vegetables, fruits, different kinds of herbs, household fuel, housing materials, bamboo, wood, different types of grasses, raw materials for handicrafts etc. But the provision of reserved forest has restricted those options which impact us adversely in terms of creating food crisis as well as economic and livelihood insecurities. Furthermore, gradual conversion of agricultural land into mono-plantation and timber plots does not benefit poor people like us for our subsistence by enhancing food production.”

Gain (2013) also claimed that the state sponsored and aid dependent development initiatives caused devastation of CHT land and forests. He also commented that the government declared the forestland reserved which disposed the local community in one hand and ill-conceived development plans led further destruction of the CHT forests and its ecology through horticulture, monoculture and commercial plantation on the other. Moreover, such monoculture and agro-forestry could not be alternative to *jum* as these were not adequate means to survival for the indigenous people. Kabir and Ahmed (2012: 65) also commented that expansion of reserved forest was the major concern of the CHT people. The indigenous people grumbled government’s initiative for reserving the *jum* land, orchards, croplands and homestead.

Ahammad and Stacy (2016) also showed that traditionally forest had the life supporting functions for ethnic communities in CHT. It was regarded as the source of informal employment for small scale forest based artisans. But lack of formal valuation of such contribution of forest was often disregarded by the people’s dependency and their potential benefits.

Another respondent from the *Marma* community, Memongsing Marma, focused on landownership pattern and how forest policy made people landless. He said:

“We have both customarily owned land and community owned land. Few households have registered land in addition to customary and community land while few have both customary and common land except registered-land. All people including women own at least the community land. Thus, the implementation of the forest policy, after expanding reserve forest in 1994 onwards, has dismissed all kinds of traditional-customary and community ownership which made most of the people in the village totally landless who did not have any registered land. Even it has limited women’s access to these community resources and heightened the impoverishment of women.”

The findings show that indigenous people mostly depend on forest for their livelihood. But the government policy has reduced their access to forest that severely hampered their

livelihood that complies with the findings of Ahammad and Stacey (2016.). They showed that indigenous people had access to forest areas for different purposes like product collection or shifting cultivation following customary rules which was curtailed due to government policy regarding management of forest. Moreover, overlapping jurisdiction areas between customary land and reserves created complexities in management of common property like forests and shifting (*jum*) cultivation land.

### **6.3.3 Economic Insecurities**

Economic security refers to a situation having a stable source of financial income that allows maintenance of one's standard of living currently and in the near future. On the other hand, economic insecurity arises from the exposure of individuals, communities and countries to adverse events and from their inability to cope with and recover from them (UNDESA, 2008). In line with this Osberg postulates that a definition of economic insecurity reflects the common meaning of the term insecurity might be the anxiety produce by the lack of economic safety (Osberg, 1998:23). The present study investigated the economic condition of the respondents and to what extent they could cope with the adverse events. The findings show that the respondents were vulnerable to economic shock. Occupation of most of the respondents' in the study area was agriculture including horticulture, fishing and livestock rearing. Few of them were involved in non-agricultural activities that include, service, business, day labor, self-employment etc. Some of them had additional (secondary) sources of income such as small business, catching fish, rickshaw and auto-rickshaw pulling, community health worker etc. but their income level was very poor except a few which had been mentioned in previous chapter. Many of them could not fulfill their basic needs like food, education, healthcare, housing etc. due to limited income and poor economic condition.

Both the male and female respondents from the *Tripura* and the *Marma* communities explained their economic insecurity in various ways. Uhlashoi, one of the *Marma* respondents, explicated economic insecurity of her family in the following way:

“Jum cultivation is officially regarded as undesirable and condemned for forest destruction. As a result, we are bound to give up this cultivation. For maintaining subsistence, many of us have become day laborers. And income is very poor. Moreover, many of us are now working in tobacco companies despite its negative health consequences as jum cultivation has been abandoned.”

One of the *Tripura* respondents, Upendra Tripura, analyzed their economic hardship, focused on livestock rearing as means of livelihood and problems of livestock rearing in the following way:

“Cow, pig, buffalos and goat rearing is one of the means to maintain our livelihoods as other means of livelihood have been reduced. But grazing land and fodder crops are becoming limited due to different types of restriction on land from forest department. As a result, detrimental economic conditions are evident in our para.”

Likewise the interviewee one of the key informants (BRAC official) focused on some aspects of insecurity of indigenous people in his statement. He stated:

“Poor indigenous people produce different types of crops, fruits, vegetables or horticulture depending on the condition of their locality. But their production, harvesting and marketing are hindered by different types of factors such as capital, lack of post-harvest knowledge and irrigation system, low price, poor communication and marketing system. Furthermore, some products like fruits and vegetables are perishable in nature. These should be marketed as early as possible after harvesting. But availability of huge products in market during peak time, growers have to sell products in low price. Sometimes a large number of the products are wasted due to microbial infection as well as lack of transportation, storage, processing and marketing facilities. Thus, production for survival and investing for profit both goes in vain and people fell into poverty cycle.”

The above-mentioned statement conforms to findings of Talukder *et al.* (2013) who showed that there were various types of marketing limitations such as lack of farmers or growers association, limited volume of produce due to small farm size, seasonal production, immediate need of cost return, inadequate and under developed transport system, high charges in the form of local tax and tolls, lack of physical facilities like road or water communication, poor market channel, lack of market information, absence of storage and processing facilities, and government interventions in CHT. Moreover, the roles of middlemen dominated the marketing system seriously. For these reasons, the growers did not get the real price of their products that created economic insecurity among the indigenous people of poor and middle class. Rasul (2009) also noted that geographical issues were compounded by a lack of business knowledge hindered the economic activities. Chakma and Matriot (2016:15) showed that the limited access to market created obstacles to the capacity of earning. Even remoteness and the lack of transportation facilities led to an undervaluation of products and forced the extreme poor to sell products at low prices to Bengali middlemen..

### 6.3.4 Food and Human Insecurities

Food security is an important concern for the well being of human life throughout the world. Understanding of food availability is important for the analysis of food security. Food security exists when all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food that meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life (Jamaluddin, Hassan and Miah, 2010:3). Bangladesh faces many challenges in addressing food security in certain pockets of the country that are lag behind. The CHT is one of such regions. Decades of conflicts, isolated terrain, linguistic diversity and inadequate development have created such situation where food security, nutrition and livelihood indicators are far worse than national as well as rural averages of the country (NFPCSP, 2010).

The respondents from both the rural and urban areas alleged that reduce of cultivatable land and restriction on *jum* cultivation created food crisis. They also mentioned the rainy season as horrible time for them in respect of food insecurity, and torrential and incessant rain as the main cause for their food insecurity. Shanti Kumar Tripura from *Killamura* said in this respect that:

“Our economic system is agro-based and it has been deteriorating day by day. We are cut off from plough land and jum field. Horticulture is not enough for our subsistence. Consequently, we have shortage of home consumption. Moreover, in rainy season, we are suffering from food scarcity due to unwanted heavy rainfall. We could not go for growing crops in hill. Sometimes we try for fishing but it is beyond our need. Sometimes we take only twice a day due to food crisis.”

Studies conducted by Barakat *et al.* (2009), YPSA (2013) and Kabir and Ahmed (2012) also found that the indigenous people suffered from food security especially in rainy season. However, the respondents highlighted how they cope with food insecurity. One of the *Marma* respondents from *Kochukhali* (of *Kawkhali upazila*) stated the strategies to face such situation:

“We often migrate seasonally to meet the needs of family, work as day labor, take meal once or twice a day, sell home-made baskets, handicrafts, livestock, or take loans from NGO though such micro credit is not acceptable and seen negatively for us.”

It was noteworthy that female were very much concern about food insecurity and anxious to provide food for all members of the family. Nila Tripura, one of the respondents from the *Tripura* community said:

“For family members I try to collect vegetables and fruits from surroundings so that we can have some meal. After having meal by my husband and children then I take my meal so that I can ensure their food first. We often try to adjust with food scarcities through taking meal twice a day, eat less amount of food and change the menu from rice to other food items during worst month of Ashar and Sraban (July-August) when food availability is interrupted and harvest is damaged by rough weather.”

Overall scenario of scarcity of food in *Rangamati* district also mirrored the above situation. The area for cereal crop cultivation is not adequate. The annual food requirement and production status of the district is given below:

**Table 6.1: Food Situation (DAE, Rangamati-2011-2012/2012-2013)**

Year	Population	Demand (m.ton)	Depreciation (m.ton)	Total Demand (m.ton)	Production (m.ton)	Surplus (+)/Deficit (-) (m.ton)
2009-2010	569027	101149	11713	112862	69722	(-)43140
2010-2011	596000	105942	12268	118210	73773	(-)44437
2011-2012	603986	107362	12433	119795	99804	(-)49991

Source: Talukder *et al.* (2013:10).

The Table 6.1 shows that *Rangamati* hill district face food deficit in every year. (Jamaluddin, Hassan and Miah, (2010) also shows that *Rangamati* is found to be more food deficit among three districts due to declining productivity of *jum* cultivation and limited land for cultivation. The indigenous people adopt a range of coping strategies to cope with dearth of food. They cut the expenditure of education, clothing and medicines towards food purchase. Family members engage in day labour for wages in towns and neighbouring *jum* fields. Even they change their eating patterns, take less meals regularly and moving from nutritious foods such as fish, meat, milk etc. to less nutritious forest foods, some of which are unfit for consumption. However, selling of livestock and borrowing from various sources, sometimes exploitive sources, support households during poor harvest years. It then takes longer for them to recover from such loan.

### 6.3.5 Health and Human Insecurities

Security of health is one of the most fundamental concerns of human security along with food, housing, water, education and livelihood. Hence, it should not be seen separately from other interrelated securities (Hussain *et al.* 2010:212). Healthcare is basic issue to

the well-being and productivity of the society. It cannot be constrained by affordability. This is the sense in which primary healthcare qualifies as public good for the provision of which the state has to bear a special responsibility (Guhan, 2001:87). Therefore, health issue has remained a major concern of the government for the people of CHT. The people of CHT living both in rural and urban areas lack adequate health security which is characterized by poverty and inability to access to necessary healthcare (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:72). The situation of the study area is no difference in this regard. The respondents, participants of focus group discussion and key informants mentioned several issues related to health insecurity. In most cases female respondents were more concern about this issue. One of the key informants (female Ward Member of Gilachhari Union Parishad) from Rajasthali said in this regard:

“Immunization of infant and pregnant mother is very important for a sound generation. But it is reality that rural indigenous people get this facility less than urban areas and even in remote hill area this scenario is gloomier because of difficult communication system. It is very difficult for the children, pregnant mother and older people to go to health center as it is hill. On the other hand, health workers are reluctant to go to and stay in remote hill area.”

Kabir and Ahmed (2012:72) also showed that the CHT is a very low performing region in this regard and had significant ethnic differences. The rate for the Bengalis who settled there from the plains was the highest and the range in coverage for indigenous people varied from 9% for the *Mro* and 18% for the *Tripura*. However, people of urban area and near to urban area were in better position in terms of enjoying health services compared to people living in remote areas. Sometimes people of remote area depended on indigenous medication. One of the female respondents, Numeching Marma, from *Kukimara* (near to *upazila* headquarters) explained the situation in the following way:

“It is easier for us to take health facilities from hospitals or health centers as we live near the urban area. It is true that the infrastructure and medical instruments are scarce and quality of health services is not good but we are more beneficial than the people living in remote areas. At present, people are habituated to take medicine rather than depending on medicinal plants and going to quacks. It is (indigenous method) only practiced in remote area where medical team is not available and it takes one or two days to come to the town for taking medical assistance.”

The above-mentioned statement complies with the findings of Kabir and Ahmed (2012:72). They also found that local wisdom in treatment of ailment was dwindling in the CHT gradually. But traditional doctors and traditional treatment of prevalent diseases



were prevailed in the remote areas. Communication and transport system were generally reported as being difficult in remote areas where recruiting doctors and getting modern health services were really tough and challenging. Thus, CHT including the study area suffers from acute lack of health facilities that indicate the health insecurity of the indigenous people.

The respondents from the study villages reported that malaria was the epidemic in their areas. There were also other diseases but malaria was widespread. One of female respondents from the *Tripura* community of *Killamura* made clear this issue in her statement. She stated:

“Among other diseases (fever, diarrhea, malnutrition, dysentery) malaria is the major one from which we suffer a lot. Many indigenous people have been died from this disease in previous years. As a result, we are scaring about this disease. It is also regretful that women and girls suffer more than men and boys due to negligence and lack of awareness. Though it is under control now because of necessary measures adopted by the government agencies and NGOs, the people of remote areas are still in its threat,” (Sonapati Tripura).

It is observed that malaria is a silent killer in the CHT region since long. The number of malaria victims was much higher in 2006 than the previous years. Hundreds of malaria-affected people of all ages were keep crowded the health care institutions and mobile clinics run by NGOs at that time (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:80). Still it remains as a serious health hazard and affecting the health security of the people living in the study area.

### **6.3.6 Housing and Human Insecurities**

The importance of food, housing and clothing to human life has exposed civilizations to struggle throughout the history. The housing absorbs both the physical and psychological aspect of security. It also reflects the socio-economic and cultural aspects of the people of a society in which they live. It also provides the people with safety and security. The right to housing includes adequate living space, well structures, and safe surroundings. In the present study, security of housing has been seen as housing with all civic amenities like water supply, electricity, sanitation in accordance with the environment of the CHT.

Both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities have their own housing style (discussed in previous chapter). The study area was no different in regard. A typical *machang* house comprises of several rectangular block allocated for household functions was found in the study area. The *Marma* house was consisted of three structural parts like a terrace, a main

house and a kitchen. The underneath was used to store various things like storing fire woods, rearing animals etc. Timber, bamboo and wild grass were used as materials of housing. But the condition of housing was very poor in rural areas than that of urban ones. Respondents of *Kukimara*, *Chaklachhari*, and *Killamura* had *kancha* and *machang* house. Some of them had house with tin-shed roof and some of the affluent family of *Kukimara* were found to have semi *pucca* house. On the other hand, most of the respondents of *Asam Basti* and *Kochukhali* were found to have semi *pucca* and *pucca* house and a few of them, whose income level were poor, had *kancha* house. But all the respondents of *Garjontali* had *pucca* house as it was located in main part of *Rangamati* Municipal area.

Lack of adequate sanitation facilities was the dominant feature of the study area especially of the rural and remote hill area. Some of them had no latrine at all. They used to defecate in open space and bushes. Few of them had pit latrine that was completely unhygienic. Only a few of them had sanitary latrine with ring and slab. But in urban area, the people were found to have some sanitation facilities. For example, the respondents of *Garjontali*, *Asam Basti* and *Kochukhali* had sanitation facilities with some limitations but the respondents of *Chaklachhari*, *Killamura* and *Kukimara* did not have sanitation facilities. The poor respondents of urban area were found to have sanitary latrine with ring and slab. On the other hand, middle class and rich households were found to enjoy improved sanitation facilities (semi-*pucca* and *pucca* latrine with water supply). It should be noted that the affluent households of rural areas were also found to have such facilities especially sanitary latrine. *Karbari* from *Chaklachhari* described the overall sanitation situation of his area in the following way:

“Indigenous people of our locality do not have proper sanitation system due to traditional practices, water scarcity and poverty as well. Many of us still defecate in open space and bushes. A few of them have pit/hanging latrine or ring-slab latrines. Even we have lack of knowledge regarding sanitation and hygiene too. Especially mother do not have ideas regarding cleaning the children’s feces or washing hands properly. Despite the support services of NGOs in water and sanitation sectors and behavioral modification in hygiene practice, the situation is not improved up to the expected level in CHT.”

Generally, the ethnic communities drink water from natural sources as they consider them the blessings of Goddess and if they pollute those sources misfortune will call upon them (NGO Forum, 2008). But cumulative impact of gradual escalation of population and man-

induced fracas to nature, the sources of water are becoming drier and contaminated which create paucity of water in this region. ADB (2010) found approximately one third of the total population in the CHT relied on water of wells and 17% used to collect water from springs, river or ponds for drinking. Only affluent families had deep-tube-well in individual basis in their land and used water for cooking and drinking. Another study (Easher, 2013:235) found the same source of water. It found that people living in urban areas used water supplied by municipalities and rural people got portable water from various sources like shallow tube-wells, concrete water reservoir, ring-wells, hand-pumps, deep set pumps, gravity flow piped water system, and infiltration of galleries.

The situation of the study area was no different in this regard. Although urban areas were facilitated with water supply, rural areas did not have such facility. Sufia, one of the *Tripura* respondents, representing most of the male and female respondents' views from both communities, said:

“It is the women who are traditionally assigned to fetch water from the streams and other sources. We have to spend two to more hours for this purpose. Even we take bath and wash clothes from natural streams. We collect this water for cooking and drinking too. But for different reasons quality of these sources are now deteriorating and places are not safe for us. Many of us also use water of lake due to distance of other sources, unable to use highly expensive options like ring wells, infiltration galleries etc. and unaware of the water pollution. As a result, poor families are suffering from access to safe drinking water and consequently affected by different types of water-borne diseases like diarrhea and dysentery. But few NGOs are working for providing water to poor communities.”

Nonetheless, quality and importance of housing depends significantly on its access to electricity. As *Rangamati* has the hydro-electric supply system, houses of most of the respondents were found to have the supply of electricity except *Chaklachhari* and *Killamura* as those were situated in remote hill area. The well-off families of those villages (*para*) used the solar plant for electricity. It is mentionable that respondents were much more concern about insecurity stem from homelessness rather than facilities.

Hamongu, one of the *Marma* respondents from *Kukimara* stated in this regard:

“We expect that we have access to water, electricity and sanitation facilities but uncertainty of being homelessness is serious matter to us. As we have got this land for staying from headman according to customary practices, but cases of false document is common in the CHT that up-root the indigenous people from their home. So we are always in threat of eviction.”

### 6.3.7 Violence and Human Insecurities

The concept of human security comprehends the meaning of security as freedom from fear that means the protection from threats to the personal and communal safety. Violation of the basic human needs of individuals and communities leads to human suffering on an individual level and conflict and violence on communal, regional and international levels. Therefore, individuals and communities feel secure and protected from the threats that emanate from direct and structural violence through the guarantee of basic human security [<http://www.sipri.org/yearbook/2008/02/02C>]. The respondents of the study area mentioned domestic as well as social, ethnic and state violence as the threats of their lives but emphasized on later one.

Violence against women has long been a threat to women and girls in Bangladesh. But the respondents of the present study area expressed that they did not find insecurity in respect of domestic and family violence like mainstream people in Bangladesh. Both the male and female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities reported that there were very few cases of beating wives at family level only when husbands took alcohol and became drunk. They minimized it through familial intervention or mediation by the *Karbaries* and *Headmen as well*. Indeed, violence in the CHT was diversified in post-Accord era.

The *Tripura* and the *Marma* female respondents, key informants and participants of focus groups discussion irrespective of locations mentioned that the state and community violence was created by military and non-indigenous people that were a threat to their security. Reflecting on this issue Keshomoti, one of the respondents from *Tripura* community said:

“We are not threatened physically or mentally by any indigenous men rather different incidents of rape, killing or sexual harassment committed by security personnel and settlers make us terrified and scared. Sometimes our mobility becomes restricted because of their anti social and unlawful activities.”

Social and community violence has long consequence. Halim (2010) in her study focused on socio-psychological impact of various crimes committed against women. She claimed that it was difficult to calculate the long term consequences of such trauma. Rahman (2011) also mentioned about the severe consequences of ethical conflict on mental and physical health. Naher and Tripura (2009) claimed that rape by security personnel in CHT had almost never been acknowledged and investigated officially.

But contrasting opinion about perpetrators was also found from the *Marma* respondents, especially from women. Khei Kheinu Marma explained the incidents of violence and perpetrators in the following way:

“Actually, different forms of violence exist in the CHT and we the women are the major victims of violence among the indigenous and the non-indigenous people. It is true, we are frightened from non-indigenous people and focus on those incidents but the indigenous people of other communities are also perpetrators. We solve those cases through local arbitration by the Headmen.”

Naher and Tripura (2009) also found such intra-community violence against indigenous women. Mohsin (2002:3) reported that according to the CHT commission, over 40 percent girls of less than 18 years old were raped by security personnel in between 1991 and 1993. Chakma (2010) found that violence was executed by politically motivated settlers, security forces, a section of political and economic leaders, and government employees based in CHT.

The male respondents of the study area expressed dissatisfaction regarding violence associated with the presence of military. They mentioned the name of different violent groups. The *Marma* respondents and participants of focus groups mentioned that sexual violence, accusation of imprisonment without charge, detainment and torture were very common violence in their area for which military were responsible that conforms to the findings of IWGIA (2012). A meta-analysis by the IWGIA in 2012 found that between 2004 and 2012 a total of 1487 human rights violations were committed by the army in CHT. Of those violence, there were fourteen deaths, two reported instances of rape, sixteen attempted to rapes, eighty-five instances of harassment and 374 instances of torture as well as a large number of looting, beating, desecration and eviction (IWGIA 2012: 15).

Wilkinson (2007:185) indicated that armed groups such as the United Peoples Democratic Front (UPDF) and *Jana Sanghati Samiti* (JSS) were emerged as a response to the hegemonic and exclusive nature of the Peace Accord and its political manifestation in CHT. The opposite position of these two groups was conflicting in their ideologies and activities and such situation was often used by third party. Mohsin (2003:67) claimed that unidentified armed groups were emerged that time which complicated the CHT's

security. This situation was reflected by the quotation of a Marma respondent of *Kukimara*. He said:

“The UPDF refused the CHT Accord on the ground that the provisions were not consistent with their demand of autonomy, did not recognize their identity and rights over land and were not constitutionally protected. They feel that the Bengali settlers, instead of the indigenous people, will be benefited from the Accord. The ideological conflict between PCJSS and UPDF turned into armed fighting that resulted in the downslide of the law and order situation in the CHT. The conflict has created instability in the CHT and divided the people there, which in turn, made the implementation of the accord uncertain. The vested groups are benefiting from this internal conflict.” (Uchoumong Marma).

Wilkinson (2015) also claimed that the existence of UPDF as new violent group was acting for resurgence of violence in CHT. UPDF was known for violent skirmishes with police, the army and PCJSS and was suspected of targeting PCJSS member for kidnapping and assassination. They viewed the Accord as a ‘sell out’ of the autonomy movement, and were vocally critical of the dominance of the PCJSS in negotiations and in the post-Accord politics of the three Hill Districts (CHT Commission, 2000). Even various unidentified criminal groups like JSS reformist group and National Army were active in *Rangamati* and *Bandarban* (Mohsin, 2003). Moreover, a proliferation of violent Bengali groups named *Somo Adikhar Andolon* (Movement for Equal Rights) was formed in 2001 representing Bengali interest groups, described as ‘a conglomerate of extreme communal forces’ (Chowdhury 2010: 68) as well as communal vigilantes (Mohaiemen, 2010, cited in Wilkinson). Those groups were exclusively criminal profiteers with little involvement in the autonomy movement (Wilkinson, 2015).

The above situation was reflected by the statement of an NGO official. He opined:

“These groups are creating serious human insecurities in the CHT like extortion, threatened life, and restricted mobility of the people due to toll collection. Moreover, they are related with drug and arms trafficking.”

Wilkinson (2015:186) referred to this situation as an outcome of the decentralization of violence in the post-Accord era in CHT. The oligopoly of violence held by the *Shanti Bahini* (force for keeping peace) and Bangladesh army was replaced by a number of competing violent criminal groups in CHT.

### 6.3.8 Identity and Human Insecurities

The term 'indigenous' is becoming a paradoxical identity within Bangladesh after systematically constructing the noun phrase 'small ethnic group' instead of tribal/indigenous (Khumi, 2010). The government of Bangladesh has decided to use the term 'small ethnic group' instead of 'indigenous' through adopting 15<sup>th</sup> amendment of the Constitution in 2011. The indigenous community feels that their lives fell down in identity crisis through the decision of the government. From the government part in different diplomats' discussions has been dissenting the demand that the tribal people are not first residents in CHT such as in the discussion related to CHT Accord with foreign diplomats and UN agencies Former Foreign Minister of Bangladesh Dipu Moni commented that as per historical documents tribal people of CHT did not exist before 16th century, that is why the tribal living in CHT are 'ethnic minorities' not 'indigenous' (Jahan, 2015:11). Moreover, in the closing session of two-days national conference on "Land, Forest and Culture of Indigenous Peoples", held on 2011 the then Honorable Law Minister Barrister Shafiuqe Ahmed as chief guest denied the demand and analyzed them as 'tribal' people, not 'indigenous' in the light of the International Labor Organization (ILO) Convention No. 169 (The Daily Star, 27 July, 2011 cited in Jahan, 2015). On the contrary, indigenous people explained that government has taken this decision because recognition as '*adivashi*' will give them the right to enjoy all rights guaranteed by the United Nations and might create pressure on the government of Bangladesh at an international level and will pave the way for establishing autonomy for indigenous people in the future which could impede the communal harmony as well (Chakma, 2010).

Hence, how the indigenous people relate it as their insecurity has been identified in the present study. The findings revealed the mixed reaction regarding their identity crisis. Few of the respondents, especially living in rural area were unable to make understand what was the conflict about this issue and why. On the other hand, the key informants and the educated respondents doing good job and living in urban area explained this issue clearly but the female respondents except few could not explain it intensely. Responses found regarding this issue were indeed contrasting.

One of the key informants from the Tripura, made his position vividly and strongly in this regard. He stated:

"The decision of the government of Bangladesh regarding our identity is really depressing. We would like to be acquainted with our own identity.

Whenever we will take our name our identity will be focused. Changing our name seems to me become a fashion to the authority. Sometime tribal, hill people, ethnic etc. have been given by the government. Thus it is not new. Recently in 2011, the government took decision to change our name from 'indigenous' to 'small ethnic group'. But many previous laws have given our identity as 'indigenous'. Therefore, it is our demand to be recognized as our ancient name by the Constitution of the country but not to be disintegrated. But the government enforced 'Bengali' identity on us." Again he posed the question, "Why do the civil, military, bureaucrats intend to impose an identity on us? Tell me, question of our identity will you decide? It is our human rights to assert our identity as indigenous people but not by the imposed one."

On the contrary, indigenous people who are doing a good job or holding a good position in working place did not emphasize on this issue. Sushama Chakma, one of the key informants, said:

"It does not matter in which name people called me, 'upajati', 'pahari' or 'adivashi'. The matter is that whether I could enjoy my rights."

The view of Nirmala Tripura reflects most of the female respondents' views. She opined:

"I do not know about the change of our name or identity and what is actually loss or gain from it. It is out of my understanding."

On the contrary, a few of the respondents, both male and female from rural and urban context confessed that they knew the decision of changing their identity but what was the advantage or disadvantage of that decision was not clear to them. Focusing on this issue Ununong Marma expressed his opinion in the following way:

"We came to know about this decision in meeting of our indigenous community who are fighting for our rights. But how this decision affects us is not explicit to me and even many of us. We only understand something has been happened wrong to us."

The findings indicate that though most of the respondents were not clear about the change of their identity but some of them thought that it would create identity crisis for them.

### **6.3.9 The CHT Accord and Human Insecurities**

The CHT Accord has ended an armed conflict that was going on between the PCJSS and security forces of the government. This Accord was hailed and welcome not only by the indigenous people as well as other democratic and progressive political parties of Bangladesh but also by the international community in general. Although more than one and half decade has already been passed since the signing of the Accord still it remains



unimplemented. This situation is generating human insecurity among the indigenous people (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:85-86). Therefore, the interviewees, participants of focus group discussion and the key informants expressed mixed reaction regarding the CHT Accord.

The CHT Accord includes some basic features that recognize ‘political, social, cultural, educational and economic rights’ of the CHT people, and paves the way for peace-building and socio-economic development in the region. The main features of the Peace Accord are (Roy *et al.* 2010):

- Recognition of the CHT as ‘tribal inhabited region’;
- Strengthening self-government system through establishing three Hill District Councils (HDCs), CHT Regional Council (CHTRC) and Ministry of CHT Affairs (MoCHTA) under indigenous leadership;
- Dismantling temporary military camps except six cantonments, cancellation of leases and land settlements given to non-permanent residents for rubber and other plantation; and giving priority to hill men for employment in all government, semi-government, councils and autonomous institutions;
- The definition of non-tribal permanent residents has been ascertained. The authority of issuing permanent resident certificates has been bestowed on circle chiefs instead of deputy commissioner;
- Resolution of land-related problems through: a) establishment of a Land Commission on resolution of land disputes, b) establishment of a Task Force for rehabilitation of the refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs); c) establishment of land administration authority in three HDCs; and d) recognition of customary laws of indigenous peoples;
- Socio-economic development by under guidance of HDCs and the CHT Development Board (CHTDB) under the supervisory authority of the CHT Regional Council.

It is noteworthy that the CHT Accord has ended the long-standing armed conflict between guerillas and government forces, but real peace-building is very much contingent upon implementation of the CHT Accord in letter and spirit in reality. But the present study found mixed reaction about the CHT Accord. The participants of focus group discussions

held at *Kukimara, Killamura, Chaklachhari* and *Asam Basti* admitted that the peace accord had both positive and negative impacts on their lives. It created security as well as insecurity in their lives. Opinion of Bulichang Marma reflects the views of most of the respondents. He expressed his opinion in a long statement in the following way:

“After signing the Peace Accord we are moving freely from one area to another which was interrupted and limited by military before signing the Accord. Now our mobility has been increased. Even freedom of expression has been increased than before. We can organize ourselves and raise our voice collectively through discussion, meeting, rally and submitting memorandum. People from outside are getting the opportunity to know about our culture, problems and expectations as well. We are not scaring like before as we were seen in suspicious way. Conflict and violence have been reduced and people feel more secure. Though military existence in Rangamati is evident their rule and dominance have been decreased than earlier. But it is also evident that the Accord could not fulfill our dream and aspiration. The main failure of this Accord is non-implementation of several commitments written in its different clauses. For instance, role of land commission is still ambiguous in resolving land conflicts, active application of HDCs and CHTRC in terms of formulating laws, recruiting hill peoples, implementing development projects, withdrawing temporary army camps, cancellation of leases, rehabilitation of returnee refugees and internally displaced persons is not taken place.”

The above-mentioned statement echoes that despite the differences on the question of implementation of the CHT Accord, undoubtedly, it was a constructive arrangement between the government and indigenous people of CHT. What they needed? It was spirit, mutual trust, esteem and respect from both sides to implement it. The findings of the present study in respect of the CHT Accord conform to the findings of a study carried out by YPSA (2013.) The study pointed out that failure of addressing the basic issues of CHT was the inherent weakness of the 1997 CHT Accord that led to the rise of the conflict among the vested interest groups and sustained it for so long and establishing durable peace was far reaching. This report also confirmed several core issues which created agitation among the indigenous people such as identity by which they would like to be ethnically and culturally different; and land rights which was inextricably linked with settler and demilitarization of CHT. Islam and Chakma (2013:40) mentioned that the Accord failed to reduce structural violence, gross human rights violation, land grabbing, sexual harassment, communal riots, inter group hostility, mistrust amidst the government and indigenous people.

### 6.3.10 Demographic Imbalance and Human Insecurities

Population changes affect security concern that has been established after nearly three decades of debates and analysis stemming from Myron Weiners path breaking study (1971 Cited in Goldstein). He explicated that population growth brought degradation of forests, water sources and arable lands, which triggered the misery of poor and prevalence of large scale violence. It also created conflicts among different groups, elites and government as well as increased the risk of violent internal political and ethnic conflicts (Goldstein, 2002). The above-mentioned characteristics were existed in the CHT which was replicated in different ways by the respondents of the study area.

Few participants of focus group discussion informed that massive in-migration and the state policy of relocation of mainstream people hindered the greater interest of the CHT people. The key informants also pointed out the appearance of growing percentage of non-indigenous people in CHT that created barrier to development of CHT. One of the key informants, headmaster of a high school from *Kawkhali* analyzed this issue in the following way:

“It is not exaggerating that the transmigration forms an immense demographic transformation in CHT including our area. There are many Bengali people settled in our area and many indigenous families compelled to evict from their lands forcefully, or bound to sell their lands in lower price and moved on remote hilly areas after the massacre of 1980. As a result, threats to the existence of the indigenous people in terms of the encroachment on right to our lands, limited utilization of forests, irresolvable economic uncertainties, conflict between settlers and indigenous people and violence remain in our area.”

The findings related to eviction of indigenous people comply with the findings of Young Power in Social Action (2013). It claimed that uprooting of indigenous people and the transmigration of Bengali settlers brought about a profound spatial displacement that led to change in social and demographic structure. The fear of disappearance and annihilation as well as ethnocide continued to haunt the indigenous people of the CHT.

One of the respondents from *Asam Basti* (lawyer in profession) of the *Marma* community highlighted the rapid change of ethnic composition of CHT population from second half of the twentieth century and concern of the indigenous people in the following way:

“If you analyze the information regarding growth rate of ethnic and non-ethnic population from the census report, you would see that the portion of all indigenous peoples of the CHT has declined drastically and the portion of Bengalis has risen dramatically from the decade of fifties to 2011. Such

demographic transition has occurred through both transmigration and in-migration and consequently trepidations regarding their existence looms among indigenous peoples.”

It is evident that the ethnic composition of the CHT was profoundly transformed during the second half of the twentieth century. A demographic transition in the CHT thus was occurred rapidly (Ullah *et. al*, 2014:210) that has been reflected in table 6.2 and 6.3:

**Table 6.2: Population Growth in the Chittagong Hill Tracts from 1901 to 2011**

Year	Population	Increase %
1901	124,762	-
1911	153,830	23.2
1921	173,243	12.6
1931	212,922	22.9
1941	247,053	16.0
1951	287,274	16.3
1961	385,079	34.0
1974	508,179	32.0
1981	746,026	46.8
1991	994,465	33.3
2001	1,333,000	34.4
2011	1,598,231	19.89

Sources: Ullah, M, Shamsuddoha, M, Shahjahan, M (2014:210)

Moreover, table-6.3 provides the population transition of more than 100-year of the indigenous people and Bengali communities in East Bengal, East Pakistan and Bangladesh as per the census results. The 1901 census, compiled when the British outlined the partition of India and Pakistan indicated that the *Jumma* population formed more than 90% of the total population of the Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT). After the independence of Bangladesh in 1971, the CHT scenario was dramatically changed due to different government strategies. The Bengali resettlement project was the most important factor in this demographic change. The percentage of Bengalis in the CHT rose from 9% in 1951 to 41% in 1981. In 1991, the total *Jumma* population of the CHT was increased in number, but decreasing trend was found in 2001 and 2011. On the contrary, the declining trend of the indigenous people, in terms of its ratio, was found due to Bengali resettlement.

**Table 6.3: Bengali Resettlement Project**

Year	IP	%	Bengali	%	Total
1872	61957	98	10972	2	63054
1901	116000	93	8762	7	124762
1951	261538	91	26150	9	287688
1961	339757	88	45322	12	385079
1981	441776	59	304873	41	746649
1991	501144	51	473301	49	974445
2001	736682	55	606058	45	1342740
2011	845541	53	752690	47	598231

Sources: Ullah, M, Shamsuddoha, M, Shahjahan, M (2014:210); Dhamai, 2014

YPSA (2013:23) also mentioned that although the number of indigenous people has been increased more than 13 times from the base figure in 1872 up to 2011 the number of Bengalis has been increased more than by 686 times from the corresponding starting time.

The above-mentioned explanation indicates that population transformation has been happened rapidly in CHT. The percentage of indigenous people has been decreased and the percentage of Bengali settlers has been increased sharply in CHT that was considered by the respondents as a threat to their culture and tradition. Therefore, some indigenous people were compelled to migrate to remote hill area that further created various types of insecurity for them. Among the insecurities food insecurity, health insecurity and housing insecurity were crucial threats to lead their livelihoods.

### **6.3.11 Militarization and Human Insecurities**

The significant interference in the natural resource-enriched hilly areas was started with the annexation of territory by the British colonial rulers in 1860 to safeguard their political and economic interests. The British named it Chittagong Hill Tracts and established indirect rules. The British provided the area with a special administrative status and restricted settlement of Bengali from plain land in hill area through Chittagong Hill Tracts Regulation-1900 which was abolished by the military regime of General Ayub Khan during Pakistan period. After independence of Bangladesh, indigenous people were threatened by different regimes to deluge the area with Bengalis and military troop if they

demand for regional autonomy. The consecutive authorities claimed that they did this for protecting the sovereignty of the country.

General Zia, in 1975 ordered full militarization of the CHT and settlement of large number of landless Bengalis from the plain land of the country in the CHT. The underlying motive of these transmigration programs was to outnumber the indigenous people and '*Bengalize*' the area to undermine the resistance movement of the indigenous people and their demand for an autonomous region. As a reaction to the militarization and *Bengalization*, *Shanti Bahini* started carrying out attacks on settlers, trying to drive them out and prevented more settlers from coming to the CHT (Arens, 2013:288). General Ershad also pursued the same counter-insurgency policy in CHT. Thus, CHT becomes an area under military occupation and the security forces in the name of counter-insurgency against the *Shanti Bahini* and perpetrated massive human rights violation. Reports of gross violations of human rights by the military were mass killing, torture, rape, disappearances, arson, forced relocation, destruction of temples, houses, and even whole villages from the early 1980s (Arens, 2013:292).

It is noteworthy to mention that there were some cases of ethnocide in CHT where the people of ethnic minority groups were exterminated in a calculated manner (Chakma, 2010). For instance, *Kawkhali* massacre of 1980 could be mentioned here where the military asked the local indigenous people to be gathered in a particular place for reconstructing a Buddhists temple. They were surrounded by the army and then opened fire on them brutally. In this incident, 200 to 300 people were killed and 600 houses were burned. Those who tried to escape from the encirclement were axed down by settlers (Mohsin, 1997:182). There was a parliamentary enquiry into the *Kawkhali-Kalampati* massacre but no one was charged or brought to justice. Similar incidents were happened in other places of CHT too. Thus, dynamism of conflicts between different parties, especially between Bengali settlers and indigenous peoples backed by military and government was being existed in CHT. Levene (1999) correlated such massacre with transmigration and concluded that protracted and deliberate government policies attempted to wipe out the indigenous peoples from their land.

However, after signing the CHT Accord there was a hope to withdraw military from CHT as it was mentioned in Accord. But the reality was that still the area was remained under heavy military occupation. According to IWGIA (2012), 35000-40000 armies are

deployed in CHT. Though there is no insurgency in CHT, there is now 1 soldier per civilians in CHT compared to 1 soldier per 1750 civilians in the rest of the country. They (militaries) were the de-facto rulers in CHT; Bengalis continue to settle in the CHT and human rights violation was taking place (that has been mentioned earlier in this chapter). It was also the process of making indigenous people minority in CHT. Shachin Tripura from *Garjontali* explained it distinctly in his statement. He stated:

“Militarization is a strategy to make us minority in our own land. They are involved in controlling and governing our everyday lives. With the support of them, many organizations or Bengali settlers attempted to grabbing land and initiated communal attacks. Not only that, everybody knows they are involved in lucrative logging with the assistance of forest department but they blame us for destroying forest for jum cultivation. Somo Odhikar Andolon of Bengali settlers that has become financially solvent through business and lease or illegal purchase of land is patronized by army too. They have created ferocity and blamed us for that to institutionalize their presence; even they have widened the gap between state and us; as long as CHT will be a militarized zone, it would be difficult to establish peace.”

The above-mentioned statement reflects the findings of IWGIA (2012). It reports that the intervention of military in civil and political matter has a negative influence over the CHT situation. Chakma and D’Costa (2013:143) also brought the allegation of land grabbing by army for their camps. They mentioned that the enduring pattern of land grabbing by transmigration continued from pre-Accord to post-Accord through the support of military and civil administration. Arens (2013:286) revealed that apart from power army personnel had great benefit from serving in CHT. They were running profitable business, looting forests, leasing out vast tract of land. The indigenous people of the CHT were disappointed with presence of army that reflects the following comment of a *Marma* respondent from *Kochukhali* (of *Kawkhali upazila*). He said:

“The government has deployed military in CHT to maintain law and order in CHT. But they are controlling us as if we are harmful to others. We are really disappointed with military presence in CHT. We do not feel freedom in our own land and always feel threatening. We have a great expectation on Accord through which there is a chance to withdraw them by the government but it is in vain. We are still claiming to remove them from our land.”

The above-mentioned quotation resembles to the findings of Chakma and D’Costa (2013). They stated that the CHT Accord stipulated the gradual dismantling and removal of all temporary military and para-military camps from the CHT and retention of six military cantonments. But army and para-military camps were existed in the CHT.

Therefore, indigenous people through regional political parties, civil societies and human rights groups were continuing their sustained campaigning and demanding for demilitarization of CHT after 18 years of Peace Accord in 1997 for maintaining peace. But the government had been continuing to delay the process of demilitarization. Rather in some cases the government was in the process of strengthening the military presence in all sphere including development interventions though the Prime Minister recently declared military will be withdrawn from CHT. However, strengthening military power and further imposition of military rule through development activities were considered as the action of creating insecurities in the CHT (Chakma and D'Costa, 2013:142). The people of the study area also expressed their contention about presence of army in CHT. One of the *Marma* female respondents from *Kochukhali* (of *Kawkhali upazila*) said:

“As our ancestors had bitter experience from military regarding massacre, we always feel uneasy whenever we see them and when we pass the way near their camps and cantonment. Moreover, incidents of rape, killing of indigenous women by the military also create one kind of fear and angst among us.” (Meiui Marma).

Nila Tripura, one of the female respondents from *Killamura* of the Tripura community said:

“We are used to move freely to forests to collect fuel, vegetables, or fruits; even we take our bath in natural stream. But few cases of sexual harassment and rape of indigenous women by security personnel make us scaring to move freely.”

The above-mentioned statements indicate the sexual violence committed by the security personnel that created physical insecurity of the indigenous women. The findings comply with the findings of Arens (2013), Islam and Chakma, (2013) and CHT Commission (2014). However, the CHT witnessed increasing militarization to counter the ethnic resistance movement. Indigenous activists said that they had been subjected to gross human rights abuses and indigenous people did not feel safe and secure. The tribal people conceded large swath of land for setting up of military camps across the CHT. However, the PCJSS leaders pointed out in January 2013 that nearly 400 temporary military and paramilitary camps remained in the region. The presence of more than 20,000 security personnel posed a threat to the indigenous people as they frequently (Bhattacharjee, 2015).



### 6.3.12 Environmental Degradation and Human Insecurities

The environmental issues are significantly related to insecurities of indigenous people. The respondents and the key informants related this issue to their daily lives in connection with demographic imbalance and development perspectives comparing with *jum* cultivation. One of the key informants (NGO official) made the relationship between development activities with environment degradation in the following way:

“There are huge environmental problems in CHT which are being faced by indigenous people that include deforestation, mono-plantation and industrial logging, cutting hill, siltation of rivers and lakes, the drying up of streams, springs and other aquifers. Such environmental degradation has been created due to overflow of population in CHT and development activities like construction of building, road, changing pattern of tree plantation and thus impacts on our livelihood means too, for instance, indigenous people have been turned into day laborer.”

On the other hand, one of the *Marma male* respondents expressed anguish and agony for banning *jum*. He said:

“*Jum* is our community agriculture. We engage in this cultivation with hard labor but enjoy *jum*-based songs, dances and other celebrations. It reflects our culture too. But the governments from the very beginning ban this cultivation with lame excuse of environmental dilapidation. Rather we feel bringing millions of settlers gradually made a pressure on the ecology of CHT as well as establishing many infrastructure, military camps, road construction, different plantation all are responsible for devastating environment of CHT.”

Focusing on such ecological disaster of CHT Gain (2013:17-63) claimed that the state sponsored and aid-dependent development projects of Pakistan government, started after the partisan of Indian sub-continent in 1947, began the devastation of the CHT land and massive environmental degradation through the *Karnaphuli* Paper Mill and the *Kaptai* Hydroelectric Project. Thus, industrial plantation, destruction of species and extensive deforestation started to restrict customary land rights of indigenous people and ruined much of *jum* lands in one hand and inundated the wildlife on the other. He denied the *jum* cultivation as a cause for deforestation and monoculture plantation as alternatives of *jum*. Even he claimed that monoculture destroy the biodiversity of CHT. He concluded that plantation actually eroded the lifestyle, culture, knowledge, history and traditional values of the forest dependent communities of CHT.

#### **6.4 Impacts of Insecurities and Development Interventions**

This section entails a brief account of different types of impacts of human insecurity on the everyday lives of the respondents. The impacts of human insecurities are presented as follows:

##### ***Fear***

Freedom from fear is one of the building blocks of human security concept. The respondents informed that though they are not victim of eviction from their land but previous experience, continuous land grabbing process in different places of CHT and present infrastructural development in *Rangamati* produced fear of dispossession of their own lands. This anxiety was reflected from the opinions of most of the respondents, the participants of focus group discussion and the key informants. One of the male respondents from the *Tripura* community, Moni Tripura, said in this regard:

“Now we are not scared about the process of alienation from our land but the whole situation in CHT makes us anxious as many indigenous people are still evicted from their own land and compelled to move in remote hilly area because of infrastructure development, setting up Eco park and tourist spot, establishment of military camp, commercial use of land for profit maximizing through rubber garden, horticulture plantation and so on. Thus, people are becoming homeless and losing farmlands, facing economic uncertainties, food insecurities and other difficulties. In some cases, compensation for land from government is too poor to settle another place and maintain livelihood. Therefore, we are always threatened with eviction.”

##### ***Generation of Mistrust***

The respondents admitted that enduring development programs had many projects those were apparently seem to be for the benefit of the local people, but to what extent those projects improved the socio-economic conditions of the intended beneficiaries was questionable. Most of the male respondents from the both communities from the urban and the rural areas expressed that the indigenous people were actually being marginalized instead of being privileged by the development interventions. One of the *Marma* male respondents, Kheisa Marma, said:

“Mistrust have been generated among some of the indigenous people as we could not come to a decision whether development interventions have been projected to provide sufficient space for us to grow up as well as to keep pace with this modern world or not. Even the involvement of military in civil matters also makes us hopeless.”

### ***Degradation of Values and Practices***

The respondents were asked about the impact of insecurity and development intervention on their social lives. In response to this question the respondents expressed both positive and negative impression. The responses were varied from age to age of the respondents. The male respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities of the age group of more than 50 years stated that development interventions were not conducive to their values. On the other hand, indigenous youths did not think that their traditional values and practice were conducive to lead modern livelihoods that comply with the following statements:

“To cope with the modernity young indigenous people think about their present well-being. In doing so, they are forgetting their own ancestral values and practices. Therefore, our traditional values and norms are degrading.” (Uepru Marma).

In contrast, the respondents from the young group explained development in a positive way. One of the young respondents, Jakob Tripura, said:

“We have to accept the development initiatives for surviving with uncertainty, keeping pace with modernity along with getting out of our ancestral web of believing fate. Development activities enlarged our outlook and uplifted our standard of life.”

### ***Multiculturalism***

Multiculturalism is policy tools which can be utilized to managed diversity and advantageously integrate minorities (Rahman, 2011:169). Seigel (1999:389) states, “Multiculturalism refers to that movement in contemporary social, political, educational thought and claims, theses and values which characterize it – [that] celebrates cultural difference; insists upon the just, respectful treatment of members of all cultures, especially those which have historically been the victims of dominations and oppression; and emphasizes the integrity of historically marginalized culture.” This definition echoes a positive meaning of multiculturalism. But the respondents and key informants share their experience about multiculturalism in negative way.

Some of the respondents claimed that multiculturalism caused by increased number of Bengali settlers and development interventions was another threat to their lives. Entrance of Bengali settlers and development workers influenced the culture and tradition of indigenous people. It created forced interaction between indigenous people and Bengali

settlers which in reality fostered the process of losing intrinsic nature, traditional culture, beliefs and the simplicity of indigenous people. The indigenous people, especially youths assimilated modern culture. This type of mixed culture was considered as threat to their lives by many respondents. One of the respondents from the *Tripura* community was found to say:

“Development interventions assist Bengali settlers to improve their life situations rather than the indigenous people. The number of settlers is increasing in CHT day by day and their different life styles are influencing over our cultural practice and fabricating an invisible pressure to our way of living, clothing, food habits, nature of work, enjoying festivals etc.” (Shanti Tripura).

The present study found the attack on indigenous culture through different mechanisms which reflected by the comment of one of the key informants from the *Marma* community. He said:

“Indigenous people are susceptible to crises of cultural and social identity. We are losing our own heritage, which threaten their sustainability. We are slowly and steadily losing our language, culture, customs and music. Indigenous people are rarely able to influence national decisions that affect them. Even the indigenous names of the places have been changed to Bengali names where the indigenous people have been living for longtime.”

Another key informant, Swaraswati Tripura, from the *Tripura* community gave the example of National Curriculum and Text Book Board (NCTBB) to raise the issue of discriminatory portrayal of indigenous culture in a derogatory manner. She said:

“The social science text book for 4th and 5th grade students published by the National Curriculum and Text Book Board (NCTBB) has mentioned that the indigenous peoples lead backward lifestyles, eat whatever they find here and there, live in forests, and the diet of the Santals, Garos and Marmas mostly consist of animal products.”

Headman of *Marma* community focused on how their traditional culture was is changing because of restriction on *jum* cultivation. He explained this issue in the following way:

“Jum cultivation is not only a mode of cultivation but also constitutes the core of the cultural values of the indigenous people in CHT which over a period of time became our way of life. But the government and development organizations have identified jum as major cause of massive deforestation. As a result, there is a serious challenge for the jum cultivators to maintain their livelihood in one hand and become a contested terrain not only between the state and indigenous people rather than among indigenous communities too. As a headman I feel jum cultivation could be replaced through introducing alternative towards indigenous people.”

The findings show that culture, custom and tradition of indigenous people were threatened in various ways that comply with the findings of Mai (2007). The respondents apprehended that the government was not eager to protect them from that threat.

### ***Broadening Gap between Indigenous People and Bengali Settlers***

Indigenous people of CHT were solely engaged in traditional way of living and depended on subsistence economy. *Jum* cultivation was the prime means of their livelihood. But due to the state sponsored project of settlement of Bengalis in CHT as well as different programs such as deforestation, militarization, commercial use of land, intensified telecommunication, road construction, electrification, infrastructural facilities put adverse effect on the livelihood pattern of indigenous people (Mohsin, 2000:66; Safa, 2014). Indigenous people are becoming marginal in their own lands on the one hand due to rise of number of Bengali settlers in CHT and controlling all kinds of jobs based on surplus economy by Bengali settlers on the other (Mai, 2007:13). The situation of the study area was no exception in this regard. Focusing on this issue one of the respondents, Ranjan Tripura said:

“Now it is the second-generation of transmigration in which the people who have already been settled play the key role. It has become everyday process. We are economically exploited as we cannot take part of or cannot enjoy the outcome of many development activities because of lack of skill on particular job and being live in remote areas as well as relied on agriculture. As a result, capital reliance Bengali settlers are becoming benefitted more than us within a short period of time and accumulating wealth. Even they are encouraged to bring their kin from their own region. Thus, we are living under poverty line and cannot improve our economic condition like them. This deprivation creates other kinds of threats like food insecurity, lack of opportunities of availing education, healthcare and so on. Consequently, gap between both parties are becoming widen.”

Uchoumong Marma, another respondent from the *Marma* community said:

“There are some organizations like Somo Odhikar Andolon that claim equal rights and discard the preferential position of the CHT Accord for us. They are antithetical to establishing our rights. They are acting for their own vested interest by using the poor settlers. They are being patronized by army or the government in one hand and make own strength by accumulating financial assets on the other. It is also significant to note that now the settlers are the second and third generation in CHT. Thus, a negative attitude belongs to both Bengalis and Indigenous people.”

Such mistrust between the indigenous and the settlers and negative attitude of the indigenous people toward the settlers indicated major factors of polarization in this region (Project Report of Japan on Peace Building, Human Security and Governance of Chittagong Hill Tract in Bangladesh, 2014:2).

### ***Discrimination in Employment***

Indigenous people were discriminated in the field of employment and occupation. They were deprived of the most challenging and attractive government and non-government jobs, mainly because of their racial distinction from the mainstream people. One of the respondents from *Tripura* community opined:

“The changing pattern of socio-economic and political situation of CHT forces us to change our occupation but the opportunity to be employed in good job is far reaching to most of us except a few. Some of the indigenous people are doing low grade jobs and others are suffering from livelihood insecurities in their remote lands due to lack of opportunities as well as lack of proper knowledge and skill. A few of the indigenous people are being compelled to migrate in other city areas of the country for searching job and better livelihood options. It can be considered as one kind of eviction from own traditional lands for encountering social injustice. Thus, internal migration is encouraged in one hand and they are facing various sorts of inequalities, for instance, wage discriminations, and physical and mental abuse on the other.” (Antiendra Tripura).

### ***Change of Occupation and Wage Discrimination***

It is evident that indigenous people were compelling to change their traditional cultivation and occupation. Tobacco farming was taking place of *jum* cultivation that was not fit for the indigenous people. But the indigenous people were compelling to change their cultivation because of the state restriction on *jum* and propaganda of development agencies as well as for economic development. One of the respondents from rural area explained the situation in the following way:

“It is said that *jum* is harmful for environment and there are so many rules and restriction on *jum* cultivation. Therefore, tobacco is better as it is short-term cultivation and financial return is also better than traditional crops like banana, paddy, cotton etc. So, I think if changing pattern of cultivation could give me the assurance of good economic lives, I will do that.” (Sichu Marma).

The above-mentioned statement indicated positive aspect of changing occupation. But it was not applicable for other cases. Female participants of focus group discussion from the *Tripura* community explained the causes of changing occupation negatively. They stated that lack of access to land; food insecurity and poverty were forcing rural women like

them to change their occupations. Many of them were then working as day laborers in agricultural farms where they faced wage discrimination. They (indigenous women) got lower wages than that of indigenous men and Bengali women. They did not raise their voice in this regard as male were stronger and productive than female and they had very little scope to be heard by the non-indigenous people.

A few rural female respondents from the *Marma* community added that although a few *Marma* women joined in non-agricultural job in different places of Bangladesh but all those were low paid jobs. Moreover, limited skills and fear of unknown places often restricted their movement even for their subsistence purpose.

However, like the findings of Mohsin (2001-2002: 43) all rural female *Marma* respondents of the study area agreed that they enjoyed more or less equal status like men in *jum* cultivation. But due to ban on *jum* by the state put women in a disadvantaged position. Following comment of one of the female respondents from the *Marma* reflects the situation:

“Male has the opportunity to work on alternatives such as fishing, horticulture instead of *jum* cultivation; but we the women have lost our working scope, shriveled our space in public sphere and become dependent. *Jum* was not only our mode of cultivation rather way of our life.” (Thasampu Marma).

### ***Losing Freedom of Movement***

Report of ICIP-CHT (2013) emphasized that militarization and transmigration programs illegally settled Bengalis in CHT that were started in full swing in 1976 and continued onwards. Those processes created extreme vulnerability and poverty for the indigenous peoples, and deeply affected the safety and security for indigenous women and girls in the CHT. The present study also found similar findings that were reflected by the comments of male and female respondents of both communities. Both of the *Tripura* and *Marma* key informants focused on lack of bodily integrity and limited freedom of movement of women. They further stated that the indigenous women were vulnerable to the violence of settlers, staffs of forests department and other security personnel. Many occurrences such as rape, attempt to rape, murder after rape etc. were happening against the indigenous women who especially belong to poor economic strata. It was unfortunate that in many cases victims of those incidents did not get proper justice and the perpetrators were exempted from the charge. As a result, daily activities of the indigenous women such as

work on others' farms, tending cattle, collecting food and firewood from the forest, fetching water were becoming restricted and ultimate outcome of such happenings were the evidence of losing freedom of movement of the indigenous women.

The findings of the present study conform to the findings of Barman and Neo (2013). They report that in 2013, 54 indigenous women and girls from CHT were subjected to violence and 89 percent of the perpetrators were found from the Bengali Settlers, while 7 percent were indigenous and 4 percent members were from security forces.

### ***Psychological Impact***

A few respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities highlighted the psychological impact of feeling insecurity. Since the CHT Accord was not implemented properly, military was not withdrawn and violence against indigenous people was being occurred frequently that made the indigenous people insecure. In addition, the change of identity of indigenous people as 'ethnic minority group' created psychological stress on them. The reflection of psychological impacts of insecurity was found in the statement of Jakob Tripura. He stated:

“Non-implementation of CHT Accord, militarization in CHT, land grabbing and in few cases, implementation of development activities at mass level are detrimental to us and gradually creating a sense of dependency, loss of self-esteem, and depression among indigenous population. The government initiative of changing the name of the indigenous people to small ethnic group has created our identity crisis; we feel insulted and disrespectful when we think someone else is deciding who we are and how we want people to call me.”

This chapter presents the findings regarding how indigenous people both men and women defined human security, nature of insecurity and present state of their security from different perspectives. It is explicit that they described human security both in terms of qualitative and quantitative aspects. They mentioned from satisfaction of basic needs such as food, education, health care to achievement of human dignity, autonomy, freedom of movement, expression and participation in every walks of life as human security. Both the rural *Tripura* and *Marma* female respondents prioritized on fulfillment of basic needs and protection from violence as their security concern. On the other hand, both the rural and urban male from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* were more aware about their cultural identity, land grabbing process, loss of right to forests as security concern. The key informants also highlighted non-implementation of the CHT Accord, militarization, land



grabbing, environmental degradation etc. as human security issues. Threats to human security were varied – political and military as well as social, economic and environmental. A wide array of factors contributes to making people feel insecure which were also replicated by the respondents of the study area. They also expressed the effects of insecurities in their lives. Their elucidations reflect the intersection of gender, level of education, ethnicity, geographical location and remoteness as their opinion was varied according to those variables. Now the next chapter will present how development interventions ensure the security of indigenous people or further accelerate the insecurity of them.

## CHAPTER SEVEN

### Development Interventions and Human Security

#### 7.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the development interventions undertaken by the government agencies (GAs) and non-government organizations (NGOs) for the development in the study area. It also analyzes the impact of these measures on the indigenous people from human security and gender perspectives. More specifically, it discusses whether the development interventions enhance security of the indigenous people of the study area or further create insecurity of them. This endeavor has also been characterized by the gender dimensions of the selected two communities – the *Marma* and the *Tripura*. However, the study has only looked at the basic features of development in CHT such as education, health, housing, food, landownership, forest use, and access to economic opportunities as well as women empowerment and protection from violence in relation to gender.

#### 7.2 A Brief Introduction to Development Activities Undertaken in CHT

The CHT Accord ended the decade-long armed conflict in the region by recognizing the special governance systems under the indigenous leadership of different local body such as CHT Regional Council, and three Hill Districts Councils alongside the traditional administrative systems. The CHT Accord lays down a framework for overall development in the CHT region. As the CHT Accord has created an enabling environment for peace and development, this period has also witnessed development interventions undertaken by the government agencies and many non-government organizations, ranging from regional and national organizations to international organizations (Chakma, 2013).

Historically, Chittagong Hill Tracts have been being exploited in the name of development projects since the British colonial period. During the Pakistani rule, the Pakistan government took on massive development projects without the consent of the indigenous peoples. This pattern of development was continued after the independence of Bangladesh. The government of Bangladesh introduced Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board (CHTDB) in 1976 to promote CHT development projects with the

collaboration of Asian Development Bank. But construction of roads and highways, large scale projects to build telecommunication, power station and other infrastructure development had got importance under this project rather than human development. As the CHT Accord has created an enabling environment for peace and development, many international development agencies have come forward to support development interventions in the post-Accord period. While the fact is that though the development organization worked before the treaty, it was small scale and most of the time it was an infrastructural issue but after the treaty, the situation has been changed dramatically. Both the GAs and national and international NGOs have discovered the new field of interventions after the peace treaty.

It is worth mentioning that Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facilities (CHTDF) is working under the Ministry of CHT Affairs. On the other hand, a large number of NGOs and donors have flocked to the Chittagong Hill Tracts with different projects. Most of the funding of this region had been provided by the Asian Development Bank (ADB), United Nations Development Program (UNDP), United Nations Children's Fund (Unicef), Australian Agency for International Development (AUSAID), Oxfam, World Health Organization (WHO), Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), Japan, UK Aid, World Bank, Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), and Save the Children (Jumma Net, 2009) along with the national NGOs like Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC), Green Hill, NGO Forum etc. The GAs and NGOs have contributed a lot to re-build of devastated rural socio-economic conditions of the CHT through facilitating education, enhancing community empowerment, women empowerment, arousal of consciousness on health and sanitation; advocacy for civil rights, human rights, women and child rights, preserving environment and opting for alternative and sustainable livelihood, enhancing management skill, exploring market and so on. In the study area, UNDP, UNICEF, CHTDF, Green Hill, BRAC, Dhaka Ahsania Mission and Taungya were found to work in different sectors during field study.

Indigenous people's lives are defined by struggle and survival. The region witnessed bloodshed, dislocation, disruption and destruction of life and nature in the name of development (Gain, 2000). Two decades of insurgency and armed struggle launched by the indigenous people came to an end through signing the historic Peace Accord during the Sheikh Hasina led government in 1997. Efforts were also undertaken by national and

international developmental agencies along with the government to address the developmental problems of the CHT region. But two conflicting views were found regarding development of the CHT. For instance, one group characterized development in CHT as ‘aggression of development’ (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:82) and another group accepted the development activities positively. They affirmed that whatever was done in CHT that was for the development and well-being of the CHT people.

However, the discrimination and human rights violation, land grabbing and settlers displacement in the indigenous-inhabited regions, militarization, extractive industries, development initiatives such as construction of dams, eco-parks and national parks, reservation of protected forest and even the establishment of military bases on their ancestral and community land were the main factors contributed to increase the risk of and threat to indigenous people’s lands, territories, resources and livelihood in CHT (Barman and Neo, 2013). Then the question was raised whether the development interventions enhanced security of the indigenous people or further created their insecurities. How did development interventions impact the lives of indigenous men and women? The following sections discuss the dynamics of development activities undertaken by the GAs and NGOs in various sectors through GAM to seek the answer to the above-mentioned questions.

### **7.2.1 Education**

Education is the boon of human resource development. It is the most important components of development initiatives that support to attain the government’s domestic and international commitment like MDGs. Hence, strategies of access to quality primary education, improving teaching method, developing learning materials, infrastructure development, and reduction of dropout rate were promoted in CHT. The Integrated Community Development Project (ICDP) of CHTDB was found to run *Shishu Bikash O Prak-Prathomik Shiksha Karmosuchi* (Child Development and Pre-Primary Education Program) at the *para* center for child development through primary intervention of developing multi-grade and multi-level curriculum and incorporating local ethnic culture, heritage, supplementary book and materials. Construction of new schools, renovation of existing school, establishment of Pre-primary Mother Tongue Multi-Lingual Education and providing training among the head teachers were done in by CHTDF in CHT for ensuring increased access to quality education (CHTDF 2014a).

It is found that educational status of both of the *Tripura* and *Marma* communities was lagged behind, especially in remote areas. The picture was gloomy in terms of accessibility, quality, consciousness and socio-cultural influences to education. Gender dimension of education revealed that institutional education of female was comparatively less than that of male due to limited access to educational facilities, distance of school, security, participation in domestic chores and lack of awareness. But number of enrolment in school was increasing day by day because of development interventions of various agencies. Participants of focus group discussion also indicated these issues. One of the *Tripura* male participants in FGD encapsulated that:

“The number of schools and colleges has been increased in CHT. Thus, enrollment of indigenous boys and girls has been augmented and literacy rate is increasing. But the fact is that though both boys and girls are equal in number at primary level, from secondary to tertiary levels the difference of enrolment between boys and girls is noticed like Bengali community. However, community perception regarding the importance of education has been geared up especially for girls as viewing education as a pointer of progress; education is now considered as significant precondition of getting jobs or good jobs as competition become obvious with settlers; it also helps us to understand what is going on our surroundings so that no one takes advantage of our simplicity. The attitudes to invest in girls along with boys are accelerating day by day as we feel literate mother is necessary for the children and family. It is also significant to mention that initiative has been taken to educate indigenous children in our mother language. But still if there is a question of affordability, security of mobility, involvement in domestic chores, distance and problem of transportation, marriage, priority is given on boys’ education, in such backdrop girls’ education becomes secondary one among the indigenous people.”

Barman and Neo (2013) mentioned that low enrolment rate and the drop-out rate of indigenous student at primary level was very high due to the absence of incorporating indigenous language at primary level in education system.

*The Marma* respondents from *Asam Basti* focused on the reasons for being lag behind of the indigenous people in education sector. They identified problems of mobility (communication), lack of sincerity of the school teacher and medium of instruction as the barriers to improvement of education. One of the *Marma* respondents, Umongshing Marma, opined that:

“It’s true that BRAC, Christian Missionaries School, Bhikkhu Moth are working for expanding education among indigenous people but the number of schools and colleges are limited. In remote areas the school is

located far from the house. Infrastructural condition of the school is very bad. Not only this, in remote hilly area where communication is difficult and staying is hard for the teacher, there is a provision of ‘barga shikskhak’ (hiring teacher). That means the teacher takes all the benefits including salary and allowances from government but does not go to school regularly. He/she stays in town, and an indigenous youth (comparably less educated) teaches instead of that teacher in those areas. The teacher gives the youth some money. Consequently, the quality of education is questionable. Another problem we face in medium of instruction. We have to learn in Bengali not in our native language. Therefore, it is also matter of concern for our children as the teacher very often are from Bengali group. Moreover, cynicism still exists due to not having the opportunity of employment after substantial level of education or quota given by the government.”

Chakraborty and Ali (2009) also found some causes behind not achieving objectives of educational program in CHT. Those causes especially affected female education. The causes were economic crisis, far reaching area, location (hill area), lack of structural facilities, inadequate road facilities, irrelevance of curriculum with the local culture and social context; language-based barriers between teachers and students as some teachers were appointed from outside of the indigenous community; and less school facility for indigenous groups in remote areas. Furthermore, deprivation of access to quality education was a major factor contributing to social marginalization, poverty and dispossession of indigenous women. It is noteworthy that the government of Bangladesh has already approved National Education Policy 2010 which includes recommendations of indigenous people to introduce mother-tongue-based education for indigenous children. It is expected that this would increase the number of both indigenous boys and girls attending primary school. By citing UNDP (2009) ICIP-CHT noted that literacy rate for females aged between 15-24 years in the CHT were 49 percent well below the national average 72 percent. Chowdhury and Chakma (2016:163) also mentioned that the government plan to introduce mother tongue-based multilingual education (MLE) for indigenous children has not seen any remarkable progress even in 2015 though government has taken the initiative three years back. It is mentionable that the textbooks in indigenous language did not reach to indigenous kids and introduction of MLE activities did not start even in 2016.

It should be mentioned that the indigenous people were also found to take commendable measures to expand education in their own communities where the children were being

deprived of educational opportunity that reflected the comment of Keshomoti Tripura, one of the *Tripura* female respondents from *Killamura*. She said:

“As there was no school and other educational facilities we have initiated to set up a school for our children by community effort. We give salary of the teachers by collecting money from local people. Headman has given the land for the school and few affluent Tripura families have given bamboo, fence and benches for the school. Actually, it takes one hour to go to Rangamati sadar by engine boat and then the children again have to walk or hire the vehicle if he/she wants to avail a good school. Even that process needs a big amount of money and time, that is not possible for many of us due to economic constraint along with the distance; consequently students or parents often loss the interest to continue education that is why we have established the school in spite of fund crisis.”

Despite the progress made in last few years with the interventions of the government and national and international partner organizations still there are some challenges remain in CHT to attain objective of education sector. District council has started to recruit the teachers from indigenous community so that they could teach in their native language. But teacher’s training is organized through a central process. Therefore, their efficiency is not enhancing at desired level (Plant and Chakma, 2011:20).

### **7.2.2 Health**

Health is an indispensable component of livelihood security. Despite the government responsibility to healthcare provision, it is not possible for the government alone to provide adequate healthcare. Therefore, NGOs in health sector have been emerged in Bangladesh to meet the additional healthcare needs. Collaborations between the GAs, NGOs and international organizations (IOs) regarding healthcare could bring the desired change in this sector. On few aspects related to health security, achievement over the decade is worth mentioning such as knowledge and awareness has been increased regarding primary healthcare, immunization, and in setting up medical and health infrastructure. But in many facets, the quality of service is far reaching in the CHT. Improvement in maternal health and reproductive health; reducing child mortality, prevalence of malaria, tuberculosis, diarrhea and other communicable diseases are major objectives of healthcare program in CHT. For this purpose, standard of prevailing health service and community empowerment as well as participation in management of health services have been developed.

The long term strategy of CHTDF-UNDP (2015a) aims at strengthening the government health system. Therefore, improving the physical infrastructure of the existing health, nutrition and population facilities in the CHT, delivery of appropriate health service packages and training for health service providers are major focus of CHTDF. Assisting indigenous people for early detection and prevention of communicable diseases in the community, providing immunization and other health services, establishment of referral linkage for Emergency Obstetric Care (EOC), implementation of Vitamin 'A' Supplementation program, motivate to establish kitchen garden that creates awareness on nutrition, iron tablet, vitamin and mineral powder are provided to prevent anemia, promote activities on water and sanitation by International Child Development Program (ICDP) with the support of Unicef and World Food Program (WFP) are major healthcare programs in CHT. On the other hand, UNFPA provides technical support to the Mother and Child Welfare Centers (MCWCs) in each district prioritizing Antenatal Care (ANC) and Postnatal Care (PNC), Safe Delivery and Emergency Obstetric Care (EOC), training of skilled birth attendants, health assistants, provide midwifery training, family planning services, and contraceptive counseling at the community level. But WHO does not work directly in the CHT although provides technical support to immunization and involved in active and passive surveillance to prevent communicable disease in CHT. BRAC also works on the issue of diagnosis and treatment of malaria and tuberculosis (TB), distribute mosquito nets among the residents of remote area, provides water, sanitation and hygiene facilities.

Most of the respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities in the study area informed that health related interventions made a change in their daily lives. They explain the public health condition, problems of health sector, availability of health services, and its impact on their lives, especially on the lives of women. One of the female respondents, Meiching Marma, from *Kukimara* said:

“As we have hospital facilities at upazila level, it is easier for us to take the benefit of health services. We generally suffer from malaria but BRAC has taken initiative to provide mosquito net as well as vaccine. Hence, the spread of malaria is under control in the CHT. Now people are more conscious regarding health related problems due to campaign about primary healthcare. Ante-natal and post-natal cares and immunization programs are running successfully which have made us secured from health hazard than before. Dependency on quacks has been reduced. But all these are available in urban areas. There are many indigenous people



living in remote areas where such infrastructure and medical facilities are unavailable and doctors are also discouraged to go to those areas since to reach those places is very difficult.”

The data indicate that because of interventions of the GAs, NGOs and IOs, health security has been enhanced in urban and sub-urban areas but the people of remote areas were found to be suffered from health related insecurity. Similar information was found from *Asam Basti* and *Kochukhali* too. But the respondents from *Chaklachhari* gave a kind of dismayed picture in this regard. One of the woman Ward Members of the Union *Parishad* of this area (*Gilachhari Union Parishad*) said:

“Health services are limited in this area as the area is far from Rangamati district and Rajasthali upazila headquarters and reaching out in many *paras* (hamlets) is really difficult. Child deliveries in our area are done by local *dai* (midwife). Sometimes they are not trained up in one hand and maternity clinic is absent on the other. Hence, complicated pregnancy might cause maternal and infant mortality. Immediate treatment, ante-natal, post-natal, and child care sometimes become harder due to economic hardship as well as non-availability of doctor and lack of transport facilities to transfer the patient to hospital. Thus, people are compelled to go to quack or take herbal medicine. Family planning services are not also satisfactory rather create complicacies. Malnutrition and anemia is very common among the indigenous people but womenfolk suffer most due to having less food. Even irregular visits of health workers make people unknown to different services, hygiene matter, sanitation, and vaccination of child and pregnant mother.”

Participants of all focus group discussions strongly suggested the following needful measures to improve the prevailing health situation in their *paras* that included to increase the number of hospital, health center, maternal health center in local areas for ensuring easy access and availability of quality services; to extend free health services; to increase the number of doctors, especially female doctors, trained midwives, health workers and relevant equipment; to increase ante-natal, post-natal and childcare services; to increase awareness building measures for general health, hygiene, and different services through providing general information.

However, indigenous people of the study area summarized the insecurities of health sector that were limited health facilities, small number of staff both doctors and nurses, absenteeism of the staff, lack of proper diagnostic equipments, and inability to maintain fully stocked medicine store. Women were found to have limited knowledge of available

health services like hospitals, health centers, and the place to go for ante-natal care and emergency obstetric care; and knowledge of primary healthcare issues like symptom of diarrhea, malaria, and danger signs of pregnancy; service providers and vaccination. The Bangladesh Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (2009 cited by Talukder, 2014) reported that only 17% of the deliveries in the CHT were assisted by trained personnel in 2006. Only a limited number of ambulances existed at district level and none at *upazila* level. Positions sanctioned for the CHT, in accordance with the government policy were not filled. On an average 50% of the positions were vacant.

UNDP (2008 cited in ICDP-CHT) reported that people in CHT had limited access to basic primary health services and the maternal mortality rate in the CHT was 2 or 3 times higher than that of the national average which was one of the highest in South Asia. Chakraborty and Ali (2009) showed the similar findings for the indigenous people of plain land. They showed that non-availability of health services, maternal care, childcare, lack of trained midwives and health workers, scarcity of doctors and free services, weakness of health and hygiene related awareness raising program and family planning program impacted negatively on female health status of plain land indigenous people that were not exception in the study area.

### **7.2.3 Water and Sanitation**

Knowledge, awareness and practice status related to water and sanitation was at the level that needs much attention in *Rangamati* of CHT due to not paying much attention to WATSAN (Ali, 2010). To address these issues the GAs as well as NGOs and IGOs are working together and individually on the socio-economic and cultural issues and on developing the safe water sources and sanitation situation in the study area. After failure of the government provided both hand-pump shallow tube-wells and ring-wells projects due to rocky and stony ground and lack of orientation and improper installation, the government has taken measures to develop and preserve the natural water sources and distributed slab latrines in different communities and trained the local workers on safe water use, proper sanitation installation and maintenance and healthy hygiene behavior through the 2<sup>nd</sup> phase of the Integrated Community Development Project for Chittagong Hill Tracts Area by Ministry of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Affairs. In addition, UNICEF, NGO Forum, Green Hill, DANIDA and Dhaka *Ahsania* Mission are also working for

intensive hygiene education and behavior, sanitation, water supply and awareness of water supply points, have appointed local workers as community hygiene promoter.

Unicef prioritized on assisting in installation of latrines and safe water sources for local schools and remote communities (Unicef, 2008). NGO Forum strengthened the capacity of the local community in order to provide with and maintain safe water supply and sanitation facilities and encouraged behavioral change in hygiene practices in underserved rural areas through community-managed and community-owned water and sanitation program (NGO Forum, 2010). It also assisted community people to develop their existing rainwater harvesting system (RWHS) and introduced household and community-based RWHS which contained 3200-3500 liters and 35000-50000 liters water at a time respectively (NGO Forum, 2007). Green Hill, a local organization, worked for Sustainable Rural Safe Water Supply and Sanitation Program with the support of WaterAid Bangladesh. It built the capacity of community people on WATSAN issues through Village Development Committee. It constructed reservoir for preserving spring water and piloted the concept of ecological sanitation where human waste from latrines were processed as natural fertilizer (WaterAid, 2010). This fertilizer was used in potato and bean farming by the indigenous people. Dhaka Ahsania Mission (n.d.) also provided *para* (village) based water support and sanitation facilities as well as gave hygiene orientation to school children and tutors.

Despite so many works done by GAs as well as NGOs and INGOs in WATSAN sector, the overall scenario in the study area was gloomy. Most of the respondents from 6 *paras* (areas) expressed that their sanitation system was *kancha* and water facilities was very poor. Only the respondents from well-off group mentioned that they enjoyed these facilities. Representing the views of indigenous people living in rural area (*Killamura, Kukimara and Chaklachhari*), *Marma* Karbari as key informant from *Kukimara*, opined:

“Few people are aware of sanitation system and use ring or plastic slab latrines in our areas. Though community hygiene promoters or local caretakers, or village development committees are working for giving training or to educate local people both men and women, poor people still use open places for defecation and women are not conscious about maintenance of hygiene. Even local women are recruited after providing training to educate neighbors regarding the health benefits of hygienic practices, sanitation, operation and maintenance of technology of safe water sources for sustaining the WATSAN program. Indeed, poor communication and transport system, cultural practices, social beliefs, irregular visits of local workers, non-functionality of water point, non-

affordability of cost and less administrative support are the main barriers to safe water and sanitation in our area. It is noteworthy that natural sources of water is also constrained by the destructive activities such as inappropriate road construction, unregulated timber harvesting, soil exhausting root crop cultivation have created our water crisis.”

Focusing on women’s participation in community work Green Hill official stated:

“Local young women are selected to take training and disseminate the information regarding water and sanitation. It has multifarious implication on women. Since women are assigned for domestic chores as well as rearing children, such training build their capacity and enlighten them with the knowledge of using safe water, sanitation and hygiene which make their family healthy and change the behavior in this regard. On the other hand, they have become knowledgeable and skilled regarding the technology of operation and maintenance of water sources and able to address the safe water crisis. Thus, women participation in decision-making at community level has been increased and made the WATSAN project sustainable. In addition, the water points are installed in such location where it is commonly accessible. As a result, outbreak of waterborne diseases like diarrhea, dysentery, scabies, jaundices etc. has been declined.”

But female respondents from the *Marma* community irrespective of their location expressed different views. They mentioned that intervention adopted by the nation-building institutions had positive impacts on the lives of indigenous people but very often they could not avail these opportunities because of various reasons. Demonstrating others’ opinion one of the female respondents from the Marma community, Chhuri Marma, opined:

“No doubt such programs have brought a change in our hygiene behavior and practices, created access to safe water, lessen the load of fetching water from distant places and save our time as well as given the opportunity to participate in community work and built our capacity but the benefit is not up to the expected level. Only a few women are involving with this work and participation in decision-making that is not worth mentioning. Lack of education, fear of organization, less orientation with public places, worries about the technology, discomfort with out-network are the barriers to be involved or playing this role properly.”

One of the *Tripura* female respondents, Mongoti Tripura, pointed out the benefit of domestic water supply and sanitation and said:

“Access to water and sanitation through such programs gives us the opportunities to be engaged in more productive work and enjoy leisure hour, escalate privacy, diminish risk of being harassed while collecting water. Since we the women are involved in storing, maintaining quality and know the location, it would be useful if we remain in water and sanitation management.”

The findings show that interventions adopted by the governments and partner organizations (NGOs and IOs) in water and sanitation sector have brought a positive change in attitude and behavior of the indigenous people, created access to safe water and sanitation facilities but people live in remote areas and still deprived of such facilities. Easher (2013) also mentioned that poor ethnic community who live in remote area had minimum ideas about safe water, sanitation, hygiene behavior and they faced problem to use the technology in this regard. Distance, poor transport and communication system, expensive technologies (like ring wells), infiltration galleries, poverty, less skill to operate and maintenance of these technologies were the obstacles to run the WATSAN program in CHT. Furthermore, ADB (2010) showed that pervasive degradation of forests, big changes in land use, unplanned physical intervention were the key reasons behind deteriorating the spring flows and also the quality of water. Thus, natural sources of water for indigenous people were reduced gradually and restricted the surface water use. Report showed that poverty was the hindrance of proper hygiene behavior and sanitation. Despite recognizing the facts of women's prodigious contribution in fetching water, washing, cleaning and cooking, project implementation plan remained inadequately women-focused. As well, gender sensitiveness was somewhat reduced through provisions of "women-only" courtyard meetings (UNICEF, 2007).

#### **7.2.4 Peace and Confidence Building**

Confidence of the people and peaceful environment are viewed as necessary prerequisites for any development process. Socioeconomic, cultural and political facets of human life depend on these issues. Thus, peaceful co-existence of various communities is an inalienable part of this phenomenon (Barakat *et al.* 2009:166). But in CHT, indigenous people of different ethnic groups are belonging without recognition of indigenous identity in one hand and a large number of settlers are remaining under patronage of the government on the other. Before the CHT Accord there was insurgency and counter-insurgency for 20 years that led the region into an area of conflict and violence. After successful negotiation process, the CHT Accord was signed in 1997 but its slow implementation and newly adopted development programs could not create a situation of trust, harmony and self-reliance among the indigenous groups and between indigenous and settlers too (discussed in earlier chapter). In the circumstances, the government and NGOs have undertaken various types of initiatives to build peace and confidence among the residents of CHT.

Confidence building is a fluid concept equated with peace-building in the post-conflict situation. The peace-building measures aimed at setting up mechanisms of peaceful conflict management, overcoming the structural causes of violent conflicts and thereby creating the general conditions in which peaceful and just development can take place (Gerhaz, 2001). As CHT was a conflict induced area confidence building programs adopted by the government and NGOs facilitated a mutual trust between indigenous and non-indigenous communities, with government and different institutions to create a stable environment for socio-economic development. It actually encouraged the harmonious coexistence of different groups in CHT through promoting constructive dialogue, visits of high officials in CHT to understand the situation, workshops and seminars to exchange the views of different conflicting parties, arranging festivals to share cultures, recognizing the indigenous strategies to solve conflicts, and supporting the implementation of the CHT Accord.

The achievement of such programs was acknowledged by the key informants. One of the key informants (an NGO worker) said in this regard:

“This program creates an understanding of indigenous culture and tradition, awareness on CHT issues, provides a space to discuss on the CHT Accord and to determine the strategies to improve our life in a limited sphere. The visits of government officials and foreigners are compatible to learn about land management, community reconciliation and to gain experience to encourage development initiatives in remote area.”

But in contrast, participants in focus group discussions highlighted the insecurities caused by different factors related to non-implementation of Peace Accord despite taking above-mentioned programs to create confidence among the people of CHT. The findings show that lack of resolution of land dispute, non-withdrawal of temporary army camps and de-facto military rule in the name of ‘Operation *Uttoron*’, non-cancellation of land leases given to non-residents, non-compliance to appoint permanent residents of CHT in various posts giving priority to indigenous peoples, non-rehabilitation of internally displaced indigenous people and returnee indigenous refugees, non-devolution of powers and functions to CHT institutions were remained as obstructions in securing security, development and empowerment of indigenous people in CHT. Thus, peace and confidence building program did not attain its objective. One of the key informants, analyzed the situation in the following way:

“The relationship between indigenous people and Bengali settlers is bitter. If any incident occurs, both the groups accuse each other. A third party is always active between these two parties to create and maintain the gap for vested interest. Consequently, distrust and suspicion always remain there. Sometimes this situation becomes worst and creates communal violence. The role of the state and its organs such as civil administration and law enforcement agencies is not creditable enough to reconciliation of this matter and thus questionable and create barriers to peace process.

However, to facilitate the progress on the peace process an initiative for dialogue on the accelerated implementation of CHT Accord was taken among the government, PCJSS and the Regional Council in 2014. The purpose was to reduce the disagreed points in the draft Amendment Bill of the Land Resolution Commission Act, 2001. The dialogue was also fruitful in terms of reconciliation of the CHT Accord Implementation Committee. Even six areas of responsibilities like secondary education, local tourism, and money leading business, preservation of birth, death and other statistics, provisions of license for local industries and the improvement of trust of administrative leaders were transferred to HDCs as per the CHT Accord (UNDP-CHTDF, 2015b:11). The findings indicate that in spite of taking various measures to create trust among the indigenous people mistrust was existed in the study area that led the people feel insecure. <https://info.undp.org/docs/pdc/Documents/BGD/Annual%20Progress%20Report-%20Conflict%20Prevention%20Project-final.rrmc.pdf>

### **7.2.5 Violence against Women and Conflict**

Indigenous women face discrimination based on gender and ethnicity. Gender-based violence in various forms including rape, domestic violence, abduction, eve teasing, physical, verbal, and psychological torture, killing, trafficking of women are recognized as major public health concern and serious violation of human rights. Violence is an important category of analysis of women’s position and gender relation in a particular society. The researcher sketched here the nature of those violence perpetrated against indigenous women of the *Tripura* and *Marma* Communities in CHT in spite of taking women empowerment strategies.

The most striking facet of sexual violence against indigenous women and girls was rape which was exceeded other forms of physical and sexual violence in 2015. A total number of 14 cases reported on rape and 12 cases on gang rape, 11 cases on physical assault, 6 on sexual harassment, 16 cases were attempted to rape out of the 69 cases in 2015. It is

notable that most of the cases rose out of the land issue and masculine hegemony towards minority indigenous women and the majority perpetrators were belong to non-indigenous background (Unrepresented Nations and People's Organization, 2016).

Whenever respondents of study area were asked about violence against women in their communities they deemphasized on domestic violence. They mentioned very few cases of domestic violence were happened in their society in comparison to Bengali society. Discussion in focus group summarized nature of domestic violence as beating, using abusive language, slapping, and scolding happened in domestic sphere but not so prevalent. When husbands took alcohol too much and lost their sense then that type of incidents occurred. Family members were found to intervene to solve the matter. But in few cases it took violent form for wife then the issue was presented to informal justice system headed by *Headman* and *Karbari* instead of going to court as that process was costly and unfriendly followed by lengthy process as opined by the respondents.

Summing up the comments of other female respondents from the *Tripura* and *Marma* communities, it is found that domestic violence was not mentionable incident in these two communities whether they live in urban or rural areas. Alcohol consumption, ill temperament of husband, severe economic hardship, and refusal to carry out men's order were being described as the causes of domestic violence. But both male and female respondents emphasized on non-domestic violence committed by the non-indigenous as the result of development.

Prioritizing on social violence like rape relating to development and representing most of the female respondents' voice Urmila Tripura stated:

“Because of development activities undertaken by the GAs and NGOs a huge number of people for various purposes have come in CHT from different cultural background. As a result, indigenous women friendly environment is lacking now. You will find many cases where the indigenous girls are being raped, killed after rape or sexually abused by the security forces, employer, businessman and staff of the forest department. Many indigenous women are scaring to go to forest and chhara (spring/canal) to collect subsistence and water or even to do job under non-Bengali employer. Insecurity of women is further intensified due to biased role of law enforcement agencies as well as less concern about us in government policies and programs. For example, it is regretful that we do not have any separate law to protect us from violence and there is a small portion on indigenous women in National Women Development Policy.”



The above-mentioned statement indicates that entrance of non-indigenous people because of adopting development activities had close link to insecurity of indigenous women. It was very alarming for the indigenous community. Focus group discussions with the indigenous people in the study area also considered violence against indigenous women as an alarming issue. They regarded militarization as one of the causes for much distress for both men and women in CHT in post-Accord era. Women were being subjected to risk of rape and sexually harassed by the security forces as they (army or security personnel) stayed in different areas. Moreover, Bengali settlers were the second largest source of their threat who came in this region through the state-sponsored in-migration. Verbal and sexual assault was being continued against indigenous women by them. Impunity of the perpetrators was another reason for heighten violence against indigenous women. Perpetrators did not face any consequence rather repeated victimization often occurred. Discrimination between Bengali and indigenous people, in relation to laws, plans etc. accelerated the situation of violence and tension. The key informants and the respondents from the study area expressed their distrust and claimed the non-cooperation of law enforcement agencies in this regard. Above all, they claimed that non-implementation of Peace Accord was the main obstacle to empowerment of indigenous women in CHT.

However, several positive initiatives have been taken by the successive governments for women development such as the second cycle UPR recommendations, 7th Five year plans (2015/16-2019/20) and provision of indigenous women's advancement in the CHT Accord. But Kapaeeng Foundation (2016) reported that the majority of the key policies and development interventions tended to overlook the concern of indigenous women in general. The report mentioned that the National Women Development Policy 2011 mentioned a little on indigenous women and other development plans and strategies ignored the special needs and concern of the indigenous women. Although there were a number of national level plans, strategies and laws to address violence against Bangladeshi women, the implementation and intervention process were not proactive towards ethnic minority and indigenous women. As a result, impunity pertained and justice was denied in most cases.

Chowdhury and Chakma (2016) pointed out that since 2007 a total of 434 women and girls became victims of multiple forms of violence. In 2015 at least 69 cases of violence against women were documented of which 38 were from CHT. None of the perpetrators were prosecuted through the formal justice system. Non-implementation of the CHT Accord, impunity, land grabbing and militarization were the major reasons for such violence. The report also identified the lack of systematic documentation of these cases and access to legal procedures. The biased and corrupt administration led to this situation at the courts.

But contrasting views was found in the statement of one of the key informants. She said in this regard:

“The case is not like that always the perpetrators are non-Bengalis rather indigenous women nowadays are also the victim of the lust of indigenous people too. We explain such situation as the influence of living with different cultures where violence against women is very common. Indeed, non-harassment of women publicly is the unique feature of indigenous community that has besmirched gradually swayed by Bengali culture.”

Chakraborty (2004:79-71) explicated this incident in her study by concluding that ethical values of the indigenous people were being contaminated over the years due to exposure to *Bengali* culture and association with them. Consequently women's insecurity and vulnerability were increasing within their own societies. Some waifs incidents of indigenous women's harassment in the hand of indigenous men were being heard in limited extend.

It is noteworthy that indigenous women were also now organized and they raised their voices in various forums regarding their rights. Women from diverse ethnic minorities in Bangladesh gathered on the occasion of the third National Indigenous Women Conference, where they discussed the importance to be united in the struggle for their rights. Chanchana Chakma, from the Bangladesh Indigenous Women Network (BIWN) (21 March, 2016, The Daily Star), read out the Dhaka Declaration, a charter comprising demands to be addressed by the government, the UN and other organizations. In this context, the indigenous people demanded the full implementation of the CHT Peace Accord and reservation of seats in the Parliament for women of their ethnic community – three from CHT and three from plain land, formation of land commission for plain land ethnic communities, making amendments to laws for an effective land commission for

CHT, creation of a cell by the UN to monitor the condition of minority women, and keeping an ethnic minority women's representative in UNHCR.

### **7.2.6 Economic Development**

Economic development aims to create an environment to investment, improve employment rates, stimulate small enterprise, strengthen producer association networks, improve product quality, extend business linkages and improve market access and infrastructure to benefit the communities. The situation of the CHT is no difference in this respect. With the objective of income generating activities such as mushroom cultivation, honey production, bio-briquette production, ginger processing and medicinal plant cultivation etc. have been initiated in CHT. Training has been provided for entrepreneurship and weavers' skill development with special priority on the female participants. The Field Farmers Schools have been started to train farmers on crop farming, fisheries and livestock through agriculture and food security component (Chakma, 2013).

Participants of the focus groups and a few of the respondents opined that cultivation of cash crops like ginger, aroid and turmeric, horticulture, agro-forestry practices and fruits (pine apple, jack fruit, lemon) farming had a positive impact in a small scale on their livelihoods. Selling seasonal fruits and bamboo increased their income and supported livelihoods for indigenous people. According to Raj Tripura, one of the respondents from the Tripura community:

“Gardening is very profitable and it has a positive impact on household income enhancement and food security.”

Regarding livestock schemes one of the *Tripura* respondents from *Killamura* said:

“Livestock scheme had increased our income and improved our economic condition than before.” (Shanti Tripura).

But contrasting view was also found in in-depth interview. A few of the respondents from the *Marma* community denied the contribution of horticulture and agro-forestry to their livelihoods. They said that such attempt was failed to provide the means to survive.

It is explicit that most of the respondents from both the communities indeed expressed the frustration and grievances about the development activities in CHT. They admitted that

various organizations along with the government ones were trying to improve their socio-economic conditions but those strategies were not culture friendly for them. They explicitly indicated how such development strategies impacted the lives and livelihood of the CHT people. Reflecting on this issue one of the *Marma* respondents, Uepru Marma, from *Asam Basti* expressed that:

“The government and international agencies regard swidden (jum) cultivation and fires resulting from it as the boon to destroy the environment and blame it for deforestation and hence discourage it. They have introduced horticulture, monoculture plantation, industrial plantation instead of jum for rehabilitate indigenous people like us. But such provision has left us with limited economic choices; made us day laborer and unemployed or partial employed, disrupted and threatened our survival pattern, compelled to search jobs out of our tradition, and generated food insecurity. Our forest dependent lifestyle, culture and traditional values have been gnarled. Our cropland, orchard, jum land, homestead all have been taken away by the government as reserve forest and opened them for commercial exploitation. We rather feel ecological damage and health risk have been caused by rubber and tobacco plantation.”

The above-mentioned quotation reflects the insecurities created by development activities rather than securing the lives of indigenous people. The female respondents also mentioned how they faced the detrimental effect of development interventions of the government and NGOs. Comment of Kalpona Tripura, one of the female respondents from *Chaklachhari*, is profoundly considerable here. She said:

“In remote area, women like us face lack of job opportunities. Hence, we face livelihood insecurity. We live on weaving as our traditional activities or working as day laborers in agricultural farm for maintaining livelihood. But militarization and forced eviction of indigenous people from ancestral land imposed indigenous women to take up non-traditional economic activities and occupations like sales girls, domestic worker etc. In both cases we face gender pay gap, delayed payments and sometimes denied payment as well as face lack of security and physical harassment.”

Both the government agencies and non-government organizations provided micro-credit among indigenous people to generate economic activities. But the respondents believed that providing micro-credit was not an effective strategy to improve economic condition of the indigenous people. Actually, indigenous people were not culturally habituated with this practice. On the other hand, they (who received credit) mentioned that it was very tough to pay installment timely that reflects the following comments of Sufia Tripura, one of the female respondents from Tripura community of *Killamura*:

“We have taken credit from NGO for poultry rearing. Our economic condition has improved than before. But this approach is not well granted in our community. We do not utter regarding the credits rather try to hide from others. On the other hand, it is challenging to continue for poor people like us because to pay the installment is hard-hitting.”

Khan (2010) commented that prevalence of cash economy through micro-credit by NGOs in many parts of CHT was rare due to uncertainty and non-sustainability of such economic activities. Many indigenous people might become trapped in indebtedness without requisite marketing and the ability to generate cash with certainty.

One of the key informants, working in BRAC, focused on the reasons for not hailing the micro-credit program by the indigenous people like plain land in the following way:

“Despite the success of micro-credit model in other parts of Bangladesh, indigenous people of CHT feel this approach is not appropriate to improve their condition rather escalate the poverty. Indigenous people think that after taking the credit for the particular project, paying installment and getting profit properly becomes far reaching due to inconvenient communication, marketing system, low price, influence of linking person, and ruin of product like fruit or vegetable. Moreover, the groups like UPDF and JSS discourage indigenous people to avail credit from NGOs and restrain NGOs to provide credit as well.”

However, UNDP operates rice bank to protect the people from rice insecurity. The people store rice in a place and use this rice in worse months when they do not have income and suffer from food crisis. Especially in rainy season they do not have work and when fishing is prohibited in lake for three months they suffer from economic crisis and rice bank plays an effective role to cope with the situation. The union *parishad* (UP) distribute rice and money to cope with the situation. The respondents from both *Kukimara* and *Killamura* acknowledged the contribution of rice bank to face food crisis.

### **7.2.7 Capacity Development**

The capacity development component provides support to strengthen capacity of the CHT institutions so that they could manage services efficiently, and inspire communities to make change of their own socio-economic conditions based on the principles of local participation and decentralized development. The capacity of CHT institutions has been strengthened through the provision of technical support in planning and implementation of multi-sectoral development projects. The institutional set-up of CHT is a decentralized system comprised of the CHT Regional Council, Three Hill District Councils, and three Circle Chief offices along with the local government institutions like other part of

Bangladesh. Before probing into the capacity development of these institutions, a brief description has been presented here regarding the specific governance system of CHT.

The Ministry of CHT Affairs (MoCHTA), which was created as a result of the CHT Accord and should be headed by a Minister/State Minister from indigenous community, is responsible for overseeing all activities in the CHT and recommending the staffing for the Regional Council and three Hill District Councils. As part of the implementation of Accord and stipulation of a special arrangement for the under-developed region like CHT and to accelerate the process of political, social, cultural and economic development, and to uphold the socio-political rights of all residents of CHT, the CHT Regional Council was established by an Act of Parliament passed in 1998. The purpose of the regional council is to supervise and co-ordinate the development activities of three hill districts, the municipalities, CHT Development Board along with tribal laws, practices, customs and social justice and disaster management (Roy, 2000).

As per the Hill District Council Act of 1989 (as amended after the 1997 CHT Accord), the government has already transferred a number of functions (15 out of the total 33), but the remainder has not been transferred yet which include important areas such as land and land management, forestry, and police forces (local). Moreover, there has been very limited transfer of financial resources to the HDCs. In the transferred subjects, the Ministries or Departments concerned are responsible to implement all development works undertaken by the government through the Hill District Councils (Chowdhury, 2008:63; PCJSS website).

The *Upazila Parishad* (UP) works for development of physical infrastructure, execution of irrigation scheme, and coordinate the development activities. The UP is the lowest tier of local government which consists of one chairman and 12 elected members including 3 women from reserved seat. It is assigned for 11 administrative and developmental tasks along with optional ones. They have a major role in community development with the support of *Upazila Parishad*.

The traditional institutions and leadership alongside the central and local government system are in practice in CHT. There are three administrative circles each with their Chief or Raja. They correspond to the decentralized local government administrative areas. The *Headman* is a traditional leader of a *Mouza* and *Karbari* is the leader of a *para* (village),

are appointed by Deputy Commissioner on recommendation of Circle chiefs (Barakat *et al.* 2009: 144).

However, such a parallel and multiple governance system often face a lack of clarity in roles and responsibilities among the administrative stakeholders that create obstacles to delivery of services. Hence, development of capacity becomes indispensable for providing services smoothly and building confidence among the residents of this region. For this purpose, efforts to strengthen the capacity of HDCs through website development, provide training for the staff of HDCs, and set up ICT equipment for Ministry's governance system to ensure transparency have been taken. Since traditional leaders are very much influential to indigenous people, they are also supported to implement village common forests plan. Furthermore, arrangements of tax collection festival promote the cultural diversity and give opportunity to share opinion of community members on effective local governance. Training program on customary law to understand the difference between customary and general law is also provided. Even conflict sensitive policing, community police and women friendly environment have been introduced under HDCs for greater public safety and heighten trust towards law enforcement agencies.

Although the government has adopted the above-mentioned initiatives for capacity development of the persons concerned, the respondents, especially the key informants from the study area expressed mixed reaction about their effectiveness. One of the key informants, human rights worker, reflecting the weakness of local government and central administration to deal with different issues of CHT claimed that:

“Settlers evict the indigenous people from their land but the administration becomes hushed. People do not get justice from administration or law enforcement agencies rather they patronize them (Bengali settlers). The silent role of deputy commissioner (DC) and upazila nirbahi officer (UNO) is questionable. Moreover, the central government still deals with the land issue which has not been transferred to Hill District Council. Even AC, DC, UNO who comes to CHT does not have enough idea about community and social ownership of land in CHT. They do not take into consideration the unwritten customary laws and land rights of indigenous people. As a result, when they work in CHT do not understand the feelings, sufferings and culture of the indigenous people related to land. Land commission must initiate the alternative mechanism of existing land dispute settlement and ensure landownership. Moreover, corruption of Zila Parishad is immense. There is no accountability. Training and other development is in slow pace which is remarkable in remote areas where communication and transportation is difficult. If delivery of need-based services, transparency, and rules of law are absent how do I say that the

people of this region own these activities and the administration persists there? Website development is really praiseworthy through which we disseminate our information to others, organize our opinion and create public support.”

Women member of Union *Parishad* (UP) from *Killamura* highlighted the issue of gender disparity in political decision-making structure. She said:

“We (women members) face many obstacles to establish our voices in UP meeting as we are from reserved seat. Both indigenous and Bengalis think that we do not have capacity to take decision as well as no idea about the community matters. It is very difficult to place my opinion in such environment. Sometimes local people also understand us in a wrong way if their expectation does not meet up. It is noteworthy that the number of indigenous women is still only one as reserved in HDCs and CHTRCs. Moreover, women Headman and Karbari are very few. Thus women participation in decision-making body is not mentionable.”

*Karbari* from *Kukimara* drew the attention to two significant issues regarding capacity development. He stated:

“We acknowledge that the opportunities of education, health, income generation activities and water and sanitation have been created as well as infrastructure development such as road, schools, hospital and clinics have been happened and indigenous people are taking the benefit of these programs. Many development workers have come to our para to raise awareness among male and female on different issues of daily lives. But the role of land commission is still disputed. Law enforcement agencies are biased and support settlers first if the crisis occur. People especially women are disinterested to seek justice due to harassment. I have heard about training of Headman and Karbari but yet to participate. So I do not know how much fruitful it for the benefit of indigenous people.”

It is found that that according to the CHT Accord, statutory acts, customary laws and regulations carry out responsibilities in the administrative system. But such separate layers of institutional mechanisms for delivering development services to the people added multiple complexities. On the other hand, there was an absence of clear operational rules and administrative frameworks for most of these institutions. Thus, the core triads of CHT institutions (MoCHTA, RC and the three HDCs) that have been devised to respond to the specific needs of the CHT people are still to realize their full potentials as development agents. In all three cases, there was a wide range of differences between what they were meant to perform and what they were actually doing. These differences tended to create frustrations on behalf of the office-bearers of the concerned institutions, and to limit their effectiveness in facilitating and supporting development.



### 7.2.8 Gender and Development

Indigenous women all over the world are among the most marginalized groups, suffering from discrimination not only on the basis of sex and race, but also on the basis of their culture and class. The complex interaction of factors such as colonialism, globalization, nationalism and top-down policies and paternalistic approaches to development has resulted in a social and economic environment that has been limiting for indigenous women (UNGLAW and UNPFII, n.d.). Hence, to empower and advance the indigenous women is a great concern of the development thinkers and policy makers and the grave responsibilities of the state so that they become the active agent and actor of the development instead of passive recipient. It is found that both the GAs and NGOs promoted local women as change agent along with men. They were provided with training on various issues like education, health, capacity development, water and sanitation, hygiene and gender sensitiveness and then they were employed as community worker. These workers were found to play important role to create awareness and build confidence among the indigenous people, organize indigenous community, make relationship between community and local governance, and inform the people about various facilities exist in the society. An UNDP official, focusing on the above-mentioned issues asserted that:

“We are working to build up the capacity of women along with men. We also build community-based organization, for example, Community Health Service Workers (CHSW), Community Skilled Birth Attendant (CSBA), Para Nari Development Groups (PNGDS), Local Trust-Builders’ Network, Local Mediators, Grassroots Women Leaders Network and Women Weaver Group for peoples empowerment. Most of the committees are consist of only women and few of the committees are consists of both male and female members who are given training first on respective fields and then they work with the community in pertinent fields. Thus, we are building and enhancing the capacity of indigenous women from different communities as well as reaching benefit to other people, especially women of the community. We also recruit, train and mentor the women professionals within the project as National United Nations Volunteers. Thus, we promote gender equality both in organizational level and program activities.”

Annual reports of CHTDF-UNDP 2014b showed that the number of women-led Para *Nari* Development Groups (PNDGs) was 250 who were assisted to have greater control over their own lives, income and community affairs. Even their potential empowerment and confidence were reflected by the participation in *Upazila* election. Local trust builders were playing significant role in mediating conflict (800 local level conflicts were

mediated) through peaceful dialogue. In response to gender-based violence, CHTDF with the partnership of Bangladesh Legal Aids and Services Trust provided legal aid, medical examination, treatment related costs, transportation, accommodation, support to witness to the victim for ensuring justice. Police department of *Rangamati* assisted for campaigning to use the Victim Support Center. Even male and female were provided martial art and football training for breaking the stereotype surroundings of girls' participation. Samio *Marma* from *Asam Basti*, a *para* health worker of BRAC, said:

“As frontline caregiver I provide information regarding primary health care among the local people so that they become aware. We pay attention to maternal and child health, immunization, safe drinking water, sanitation, and nutrition. We also provide mosquito net, family planning services, and malaria and diarrhea prevention services for maintaining good health. Such works make me knowledgeable and informative regarding different health issues as well as give opportunity to make neighbors health conscious. Many women come to me if they face any health related problems. I could suggest them the proper place where they will get the help.”

However, the Integrated Community Development Project under Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Board was also found to administer *para* centers by the community with the assistance of Unicef. Both male and female *para* workers were involved to run the centers through performing a wide range of activities such as conducting courtyard meeting, collection of information, home visit, submitting report, service delivery etc. under the supervision of Para Center Management Committee. Thus, women were playing their role in decision-making in public places and consequently developing their capacity in the study area.

Mesaenu *Marma*, a teacher of Unicef school in Kukimara, said:

“As a teacher, I not only teach the students but also visit home of the student, motivate the mothers to send their children to school regularly, make them understand about the significance of regular school attendance, student's cleanliness etc. which foster a sound school environment and strong community.”

The findings indicate that women of the study area were active partner of development programs and playing pivotal role in community development. Women were not simply service recipient rather they played their role as change agent.

### **7.2.9 Community Empowerment**

To pawn the challenges of rough topography, remoteness of villages, lack of socio-economic opportunities with a direct impact on livelihood of indigenous people of CHT,

the strategy of empowerment for indigenous communities is considered as necessary to heighten their social and economic option. The GAs and NGOs provided support in empowering indigenous people to take their own initiatives and increase the socioeconomic options through ancillary marginalized farmers, establishing farmers field school, setting up *para* development centers, women led *Nari* Development Para Group, facilitating the value chain enhancement of agro products and market driven agricultural approach, establish and manage rural sales and service centers, encouraging indigenous people to participate in natural resource managements (CHTDF, 2014b). One of the key informants, UNDP official, said about the impact of the community empowerment activities:

“Through para development center both men and women are becoming organized, building network with public places, mobilizing resources, growing capacity of decision-making, acquiring qualities of leadership through participating in resource planning with local government institutions. Thus, they are becoming empowered and working for empowering the people of their respective community too. Furthermore, for the agriculture dependent and subsistence oriented CHT people, Farmer Field School (FFS) has been initiated so that they can learn better farming method and earn more for their survival through increased production. It is noteworthy that the half of the FFS beneficiaries is women. People also get loan from Quick Impact Fund by which they could run small projects and build community resource. Moreover, facilitating the access to economic opportunity of local indigenous farmers through value chain enhancement, they can enter to the market driven economy and establish their position strongly and minimize the crop damage.”

Dilip Kumar Tripura from *Killamura* said:

“I could not maintain my family by fishing and faced food crisis. Then I took lessons from farmer field school for better farming techniques. Now I cultivate different types crops and vegetables which has increased my income.”

The data show that indigenous people of the study area became empowered by getting training and required information. They became able to take appropriate decision to lead their livelihoods and overcome some problems that enhanced their capacity and safety.

#### **7.2.10 Land and Forest Management**

Indigenous people have traditional and emotional attachment with their ancestral land and forests. But continuous shrinking of land and forests area affected their emotion and limited their rights to resources through applying diversified mechanisms by different actors like the government, security forces, forest department, Bengali settlers,

commercial interest groups etc. They were denied such rights by transmigration program, state acquisition and forcible seizure. The government acknowledged such trend of land loss of the ethnic communities as special measures through the Peace Accord of 1997 mentioning explicitly that without the prior approval of the council concerned, no lands of the district can be settled, leased, sold, and transferred in any other way, by any agency, including the government itself (Adnan and Dastidar, 2011). In practice, the land leases and settlements were accomplishing without prior legal approval. Moreover, land had been acquired for reserved forest by the state which was being used to as common property of indigenous people. In addition, the government seized the land due to degradation of land by shifting cultivation of indigenous people. But indigenous people claimed that it was the government policy and program from the British colonial period, and it is continued to till date, to acquire land with the Policy of nationalization of land and forest and large scale commercial logging (ibid) as well as promoted alternative land use practice by overlooking the needs and aspiration of indigenous people. The respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities in the study area were found to be victim of such trend of decreasing and in some cases losing landownership.

The *Marma* respondents from both *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* expressed their fear regarding losing landownership, economic hardship due to lack of *jum* cultivation and changing nature of occupation. Exemplifying the marginal position one the male *Marma* respondents, Uepru Marma, said:

“The process of leasing land for commercial rubber garden and horticulture has dispossessed us from our traditional *jum* cultivation which create economic crisis as well as compel us to search for alternatives. On the other hand, we are threatened by the use of fraud and forgery to manipulate land records. As they (military officials, political leaders, settlers, commercial interest groups) are powerful than us, we often compel to sale our land to them under pressure and move to more remote areas accepting vulnerable livelihood being as internally displaced person. Moreover, it is difficult for us to compete with the Bengali merchants who have been migrated in CHT. Furthermore, agricultural lands have been converted into timber plots where poor people like us do not have any access. Thus, we became marginal, powerless and minority in our own land as well as suffer from insecurity.”

The female respondents mainly focused on gradual loss of their collective ownership of land and violence. Kheikhei Marma, One of the female *Marma* respondents opined:

“Government policies and intervention related to land and forest have restricted our communal ownership of lands and natural resources. As a

result we not only lose our access to and control over subsistence resources which we enjoyed in past but also forfeited our traditional rights to natural resources. Many of our roles and mobility have been confined within domestic sphere. Even government policies like settling Bengalis through transmigration program and militarization have created vulnerabilities and affected our safety and security.”

Moniranjana Tripura, one of the respondents from the *Tripura* Community, also emphasized on different types of insecurity created by forest management. He expressed his opinion in the following way:

“Unemployment, food crisis, forced migration, occupation change and internal displacements are the creation of development policies related to forests and land. We, the poor indigenous people both male and female, are mainly the victim of such problems. The government grabs the forests for mono-plantation or fruits for economic benefits instead of shifting cultivation. We always urge for stopping the cultivation of tobacco and mono-plantation, and encourage fruit production which could contribute to household economy.”

The above-mentioned findings conform to the findings of Ahammad and Stacey (2015). They found that according to customary rules indigenous people have access to forest areas for their subsistence farming which have been reduced by the government control on management of forests and adjacent land-use systems has increased. Consequently, intricacies were arisen in the management of traditional common property between customary lands and government reserves. Even government policies of plantation program covered the reserve and private lands and economic value of such timber plantation again secured the ownership of large land holding families rather than poor people.

### **7.2.11 Infrastructural Development**

The government and autonomous body have taken measures to develop transportation and communication system of CHT including *Rangamati*. The study area was not exception in this regard. The government and CHTDB have constructed roads and highways, educational institutions, hospital and infrastructure in this area. The people of *Garjontali*, *Asam Basti*, *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* were found to enjoy improved transportation system as *pucca* roads were existed there. It expedited their communication from one area to another for various purposes. For instance, Mongsinhai Marma from *Kukimara* said that:

“Initiatives of road construction by CHTDB resulted into a good communication for us with different places. Now we can go to market,

hospital, school, colleges and different institutions easily than before which accelerate the access to different services too. It reduces our time consuming communication. But it is also true that such road construction damages our forest and many families lost their land. It adversely affects our livelihood. It is also fact that such good communication also allured the Bengali settlers to set up their habitat and expand their authority on our ancestral land and over indigenous people.”

Wasif (2010) mentioned that ADB built the *Kaptai-Rangamati* link road under Urban Governance and Infrastructure Improvement Project by cutting down forest and hills. Even after building the road Bengali settlers grabbed the land of both sides and started the rubber and teak plantation under their ownership. Even owner of the vehicles on the roads were Bengali settlers. Thus, Bengali monopoly was perpetuated over settlement and profit based economy and became the gainer of development.

On the other hand, respondents from *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* mentioned the under developed communication and transportation system as one of the major causes of their backwardness. Purno Kumar Tripura from *Killamura* said:

“Due to lack of transport and communication system, our education, health, and agriculture is badly affected. Many indigenous children especially girls are de-motivated to go to educational institution due to distance. Diseases like stroke, heart attack, maternal delivery are often hindered because of lack of transport and bad communication system. Farmers of our locality often face challenges of marketization of agricultural products.”

Kantilal Tripura from *Garjontali* focused on infrastructural development for education purpose. She said:

*“Many indigenous children in CHT are deprived of primary level of education and many are lack of quality education. In such circumstances, government’s decision of building university or medical college hospital will serve the needs of Bengali settlers than indigenous people.”*

The data show that infrastructural development had both positive and negative impacts on indigenous people. It enhanced the livelihood of the people in one hand, it also created threat to their lives on the other. Some people were crying for infrastructural development and some were skeptic to development.

This chapter was started with a brief description of historical background of development interventions adopted by the state when development priority was on infrastructure development, population transfer and settlement, and economic development. But such

development interventions were referred as destruction and disruption by the indigenous people as development policy and measures dislocated many indigenous people from their ancestral land and flung them into livelihood insecurity. Their condition was like fish out of water. But after signing the CHT Accord the situation has become apparently normal. On the other hand, the GAs, NGOs and IOs have taken some measures for the development of the CHT area. Therefore, this chapter recapitulates different activities of the GAs and NGOs and IOs and their impacts on indigenous people, both male and female, in the study area. The findings show that the respondents appreciated the initiatives of development but many hindrances were existed to enjoy the benefit of development. The findings also show that women were far behind of taking the advantages of these development activities due to existing gendered norms (e.g. their marginal status of society, home manager and personal security) except few cases. Moreover, factors like remoteness, lack of information and knowledge, traditional beliefs, deprivation, location, education and age all intersect each other to relish the development intervention. In addition, some initiatives such as constructing roads evicting from ancestral land, tobacco plantation, and rubber plantation were found to create further insecurity of the indigenous people.

# CHAPTER EIGHT

## Case Studies

### 8.1 Introduction

The previous chapter discussed the human security issues from gender perspective on the basis of data collected through interviews and focus group discussion. But more in-depth issues were identified through case studies to supplement the interview data. The distinctive need for case study arises out of the desire to understand complex social phenomena indepthly. It allows a researcher to retain a meaningful characteristic of real life. The researcher follows case study for collecting data as it is likely to be fluid in pursuing a consistent line of inquiry. Moreover, the respondents also provide with insight into certain matters and suggest sources of corroborating and contracts evidence (Rubin and Rubin, 1995; Yin, 2003). Focusing on the lives and livelihood procedure of particular men and women of both communities the case studies aim at demonstrating harsh realities related to human security of the indigenous people. Representative cases are presented in this chapter for this purpose

### 8.2 Case Studies

#### Case 1: Kheinsa Marma

Kheinsa Marma, 35 years old man. He would live in *Kukimara* of *Kaptai upazila* under *Rangamati* hill district. He passed Secondary School Certificate Examination. His main occupation was agricultural activities and monthly income was BDT 5000. He was Buddhist in religion. His family consisted of five members. He lived in his own land in a traditional *Marma* house made of bamboo, timber, wild grass etc. He had access to electricity supply but no sanitation facilities. He had also no own source of water at his house. His wife used to collect water from a ring-well which took 20 minutes to go.

He had two daughters and one son. Accordingly his household composed of five members. He was selected head of his household according to the tradition of his community, and considering his earning capacity and decision-making capability. He got a small portion of his father's property with his other brothers as sons were the legal successors of their ancestral properties. However, he acted as the principal decision-



maker, while his wife could take minor decisions at the household level. But nowadays, in many cases decisions such as children's education, future, family savings etc. are taken jointly by both of them through mutual understanding. He maintained equal treatment to boy and girl and showed respect to women. Kheinsa primarily did income-earning activities and was engaged with public functions. Kheinsa did household work occasionally and when needed he helped his wife such as in weaving baskets, rearing livestock and looking after children. His wife and daughter performed household chores like cooking, washing, rearing children, fetching water that were predominantly women's works defined by gender norms. His wife did not go to distance from their own vicinity, especially in the deep forest considering security reasons and fear of violence. She only used to go to fetch water from a ring well. But his daughter went to school which was 3 kilometers away from his house. It was very difficult for her as it was a hill area.

Kheinsa conceptualized human security as the efforts to cope with threats to human dignity and livelihoods like unemployment, wage differentials, violence, and overemphasized on military existence in hill area, eviction from land and expansion of reserved forests. However, the government agencies, NGOs and IOs took various measures for the development of their locality through providing education and healthcare services, increasing water and sanitation facilities, improving communication system, ensuring food security, increasing economic opportunities and so on. They also built awareness among the people so that they enjoy these opportunities and lead a healthy life. A rice bank was also established in their locality to ensure food security during food crisis.

Kheinsa could not pursue higher studies due to lack of affordability which restricted his good employment opportunities. He stopped his education at the higher secondary level and started to work in the agricultural field of banana and ginger. But he did not get the real price of his agricultural products and faced the challenges of marketing support. But did not have any work opportunity during rainy season. Accordingly his family faced food crisis for four months from mid *Baishakh* to mid *Bhadro* (from May to August). During food crisis his family members took meals twice a day; reduced the amount of food intake and took only rice and vegetables. They could not eat fish, meat, milk or other expensive items. Despite being poor he did not get a VGD/VGF card in last five years

due to the non-cooperation of the local level government officers as he was an indigenous people.

His agricultural land was grabbed by Bengali settlers. He protested the forcible takeover and informed Union *Parishad*, *Zila parishad*, and police officer; but all efforts were in vain. The administration did not take any action, but helped settlers to expropriate the land. Even they (settlers) made the forged land settlement documents to justify their fraudulent claim on his land. He did not further try to recapture his land in fear of losing the rest of the land and threat of violence. Thus, it has severely affected his economic earning and led him to a poorer condition on one hand and he did not get justice from administration on the other. Even he claimed that the non-implementation of the CHT Accord perpetuated such land grabbing process in CHT and thus land disputes became the source of conflicts between Bengali settlers and indigenous people. He also blamed the transmigration policy for increasing Bengalis in CHT and decreasing the forest areas; which was also responsible for creating economic crisis and food insecurity in his life. His wife and daughter used to collect fruit and vegetables from the forest but they could not do so at present because their mobility has been restricted due to the fear of the forest officials and security personnel.

**Analysis:**

Kheinsa's case shows that indigenous people do not differentiate between men and women but differences between gender roles and responsibilities in his family are evident with regard to decision-making capacity, inheritance, selection of household head and gender division of labor. In respect of insecurity, he experienced increasing economic pressure created by the loss of lands and the absence of alternative income opportunities. His subsistence economy was also in threat due to the limited access to forest areas as the government acquired the community forest as reserve forest. It was also responsible for creating food insecurity in CHT. However, his case illustrates the forced possession of lands and use of forgeries to manipulate land records by Bengali settlers. Non co-operation of civil administration and law enforcement agencies to regain his occupied land also reflects the mechanism of grabbing land as well as the settler's affiliation and connection to prevent authority from taking actions against their activities.

## **Case 2: Mipai Marma**

Mipai Marma, 50 years old woman. She would live in *Kochukhali* of *Kalampati* union under *Kawkhali upazila* of *Rangamati* hill district. She completed primary graduation (grade 5). Although she was a housewife but she had to work as day laborer for survival. The number of her family member was 6 and her monthly income was only BDT 4000. She was too poor to buy a piece of land to build her house. She could have got her father's land as she is only successor of her parents. But she did not get since the land of her father had been grabbed by Bengali settlers. As a result, she was compelled to live in *khasland* (government land) and had no agricultural land of her own. She would live in a *kancha* house made of bamboo and leaves. Unlike other households of her locality, she did not have access to basic facilities such as access to electricity, water and sanitation at her house. She used to collect water from her neighbors tube-well by walking for five minutes. Sometime she collected water from a pond during water crisis in summer. She used latrine of her sister and sometimes defecated in open paces as she did not have sanitation facilities in her house.

Her husband was the household head according to the social tradition along with consideration of heredity and wider exposure. Generally, decisions were taken jointly in her family, but in case of major decisions her husband played the key role. Her husband and she worked as day laborer in a brick field. But both of them were under paid and she got less than that of her husband and other male laborers. She expounded her experience of such wage differentials. She stated that as a woman she was physically weaker than man and could do less work than that of her husband. It was being practiced for a long time in the society. Despite doing work in the public sphere she had to do other regular household chores including housekeeping, cooking, child rearing, fetching water, collecting vegetables, making handicrafts etc. but major decisions, as already mentioned, were taken by her husband alone.

She elucidated the concept of human security as the assurance of fulfillment of basic needs like food, housing with civic amenities, education, health, employment opportunities, protection from violence and enjoying natural resources like land and forest. Regardless of the development initiatives like constructing road, school, hospital and *para kendro*; providing micro-credit, medicines, mosquito net, and raising awareness on social issues by Union *Parishad*, Zila *Parishad*, CHTDB, and different international

organizations and NGOs in their vicinity, the benefits of strategic gender needs such as getting job in formal sectors, decision-making power, control over resources were yet to reach to the poor like them.

Human insecurities in her locality were numerous and interrelated with each other. She expounded food insecurities as not to have meal all the year round properly. She suffered from food crisis and the situation turned in to worst during rainy season. Her family could have meals only twice a day and fish/meat was taken twice a week. The lack of work opportunities and lack of access to land and forest were the major reasons for such food insecurity. Her family took less amount of food during rainy season due to the scarcity of food. A few families of her locality got VGF cards for facing such challenges, but despite living in such poverty she did not get a VGF card like a few other poor families.

She claimed insecure land tenure and violence as reasons for her such poverty. She became an internally displaced person because of land grabbing. Her father had homestead as well as agricultural land in *Kalampati* union. In 1980, when the massacre took place in *Kalampati* union of *Kawkhali*, her father was killed along with many indigenous people and their houses were also burnt and destroyed by the settlers. She became the victim of sexual harassment. They were obliged to leave the area in fear of further attack by the both the military and the Bengali settlers and moved to a more remote area (jungle). After the CHT Accord, when they returned to their village, she found that their land had been grabbed by Bengali settlers and that they did not have any power, position and even any document to claim their land again. The restitution of forcibly occupied land was then beyond their ability. Even they left the hope of justice to be rehabilitated as they did not get any help from the government in this regard.

### **Analysis**

The case of Mipai demonstrates that intersecting factors of both social status and ethnicity have created insecurities in her life from her childhood. She experienced human rights violence. She was the victim of brutal attack of non-indigenous people. She lost her father, honor, houses and land in the massacre of 1980. She had to spend a long period in remote area and struggle with economic insecurities of daily lives. Till that time at her old age she had to work hard in domestic and public places to survive which sheds light on gender division of labor practiced in the *Marma* community. It is also explicit from this case that in urban or semi-urban areas, the *Marma* men and women work in non-

agricultural sectors due to the shrinking scope for agricultural works. Wage differentials between indigenous and non-indigenous people and between indigenous men and women were also prevailed in work place. Hence, both indigenous men and women were under paid; women even got less than men. Reasons for such wage discrimination were: men were physically stronger than women; men could do more works, and tradition al practice. No initiative was found to take so far from the communities concerned to address this issue. However, she was the case of internal displacement induced by Bengali settlers in 1980s that led to landlessness and loss of livelihoods. She had not been able to get back her father's land because she did not have a document of her land due to practice of collective landownership. She also did not have sufficient influence on administration to dislodge settlers occupying their land. As a result, she had been denied to take re-possession of her father's land which had been illegally occupied by the Bengali settlers. She neither get back the landownership of her hand that was grabbed by Bengali settlers nor get the benefit of rehabilitation as internally displaced as per terms and conditions of the CHT Accord. It reflects that the implementation of Accord is yet to take effect properly.

### **Case 3: Atian Tripura**

Atian Tripura, 43 years old, would live in *Chaklachhari* village of *Gilachhari* union under *Rajasthali upazila* of *Rangamati* hill district. He was a follower of *Sanatan* religion. Atian He was illiterate and a rickshaw puller in profession. He would pull rickshaw in *Rajasthali upazila* headquarters. The number of his family member was five and monthly household income was about BDT 4000. He would live in *kancha* house made of bamboo and straw where no civic amenities like electricity and sanitation were available. He did not have own source of drinking water. Water was collected for household use from a well situated in far distance. *Chhora* (stream) and rain water was other alternative sources of water. His family was found to use hanging latrine for defecation. He did not have any land of his ownership rather got the land for homestead from Headman according to customary practice.

He was the head of his household according to traditional patriarchal system. By and large he enjoyed the decision-making power but the decisions about household management, children's education, poultry rearing; marriage of children and so were taken mutually with his wife. It has already been mentioned that he was involved in

income-earning activities. On the other hand, domestic chores were generally done by his wife as these works are designated as feminine tasks. His wife supported him financially by rearing pigs. Though women of *Tripura* community enjoyed freedom of mobility, considering the insecurity of women at outside, Atian did not allow his wife to work outside, but preferred to do household works.

He delineated human security from the point of identifying threats to survival. Basically, unemployment, wage differential, lack of education, ill health and poor housing condition, corruption of public organization to avail services, communication and transport problem, lack of safe drinking water, restriction on *jum* cultivation and lack of food threatened the livelihood of his family members.

Various organizations such as the Union *Parishad*, UNDP, Unicef, BRAC, Green Hill and *Taungya* were working for the development of socioeconomic conditions of the indigenous people of *Chaklachhari* like other areas of CHT through the establishment of and running primary school, health center and *para kendro*. These agencies provided them with mosquito nets, medicines, books and micro credits; raised awareness among them about education, healthcare and hygiene; and distributed tube-wells for ensuring safe drinking water. Despite these activities he thought that there were many other problems in their locality which had not been addressed. On the other hand, existing programs had various limitations to implement properly. As his village was situated in a remote area, there was no direct road to *upazila* headquarters to this village. It was very troublesome for the people to go to market and *upazila* headquarters. As a result, he had to sell his vegetables and other agricultural products at local *bazar* (market) and did not get fair price. He was also remained scare about his vegetables to be rotten if he could not sell.

Illuminating the condition of development works he stated that he sent his son to a primary school but teachers were not available. The teachers did not go to school regularly. Rather very often '*barga*' (hired) teachers performed the duty in place of the actual teachers. However, there was no high school either in his village or his neighboring village. As a result, except primary education his children had to go to distant places like other children which were also very troublesome for them, especially in rainy season. There was also fear of security. On the other hand, he was not in a position to provide his

children with financial supports for higher education. Accordingly, he discouraged his daughter for education.

Health workers used to go to his village in every 15 days and provide knowledge regarding family planning, hygiene, nutrition and immunization. But, health services such as maternal and neonatal healthcare were inadequate compared to their necessity. For example, his wife got the vaccination services during her pregnancy. But she had to face severe complications during delivery as there was no efficient physician or gynecologist and improved diagnosis services in community clinic. First he had to go to the *Upazila* Health Complex and then to the District *Sadar* Hospital. He borrowed money to bear the cost of that treatment and became indebted but he could not save his child. The delivery of other two children took place at his residence with the help of local birth attendant (*dai*). However, all the members of family were suffering from ill health and his wife was suffering from both anemia and malnutrition. The situation became worst at least 4 months from mid *Baishakh* to mid *Bhadro* (June to August) when they ate less amount of food and took meal twice a day.

However, there was no settler, land related conflict and violence in his village. But he had a little conflict with his neighbor that was settled through *shalish* conducted by *Karbari*. He used to trust *Karbari* and like other people of his community and always avoid formal court procedure as it usually takes long time. On the other hand, rural *shalish* takes less time to resolve a dispute and ensure congenial and people friendly environment.

He underscored on unemployment, not getting the fair price of product and restriction on *jum* cultivation as the main economic threat to his life which made his family's livelihood vulnerable and difficult to meet their basic needs. He expected that the government, NGOs and IOs would give proper attention to address their real needs and aspiration.

### **Analysis**

It is explicit from Atian's case that he is a very poor man. He was struggling with the economic insecurities to survive. He had to face different forms of hindrances and threats in his life. It is evident that distant location, financial crisis, costly treatment, lack of transport, quality services, trained staffs, teachers, doctors, infrastructure are the obstacles to avail the better facilities education and health in remote area of CHT, which often make the people reluctant to take the services as well as to participate in development

activities. Moreover, both male and female *Tripura* face malnutrition due to poverty, but women suffer more as they get minimum amount of food after eating male member of the family. Furthermore, food deficit is another cause of their vulnerability especially from May to August. With regard to justice system, people prefer *shalish* to court procedure due to its expensive, lengthy prejudiced and delayed nature. *Jum* is much favored to the *Tripura* people but restrictions on burning cultivations pushes them to find alternatives of agricultural activities like wage labor or rubber cultivation. Even not getting the fair price of the agricultural products and lack of market facilities due to remoteness of the area are responsible to create economic threats to their lives. It indicate location, social status and ethnicity intersect with each other and create threats in people's life like Atian. Hence, Atian accentuates on the role of the government, NGOs and IOs in adopting development programs considering the location, nature of needs of the indigenous people and their perception to development.

#### **Case 4: Kolpona Tripura**

Kolpona Tripura, 45 years old, was a housewife living in *Killamura* under *Sadar upazila* of *Rangamati* hill district. She was educated up to grade 5 (primary graduation) and a follower of *Sanatan* religion. Her family was consisted of 4 members. Her husband was a fisherman and her monthly household income was BDT 6000. She would live in a *kancha* house which did not have any civic amenities like electricity, water supply, sanitation and so on. She harvested rain water in rainy season and usually fetched water from lake and then boiled it for household use.

Her husband enjoyed the status of household head according to their traditional practice. But they did not provide preferential treatment to their son and daughter; rather equal distribution of food, clothing, education, health services were practiced in her family. She generally enjoyed the freedom of mobility to go to market, children's school and college, relatives' houses and other places by informing her husband. Although they did not discriminate between son and girl in providing them with various opportunities, a preference to son in child birth was existed since sons were considered heir of family, continue names and tradition of ancestors and maintains the lineage. Even as a *Tripura* woman, she got only gifts but did not get any share of her father's property. She thought that her daughter should get the ancestral property but not the same proportion as her son.



However, she had to do the domestic chores like cooking, washing, rearing children, taking care of senior members, and looking after the livestock while her husband was mainly engaged with fishing and other income-earning activities. Not only this when she worked as an agricultural labor she had to do household works too. It should be noted that she was paid less than that of a male labor. For instance, a male worker got BDT 200 while she got BDT 140. Important decisions were taken by both husband and wife otherwise her husband took other decisions related to public place. She thought that decision making power should be practiced by her husband as he was much more knowledgeable than her regarding many matters.

In respect of human security, she indicated that human security would be ensured if the people would have housing facilities with civic services, proper education and health services, employment opportunity and property rights and could use natural resources in their daily lives. Accordingly the government agencies and NGOs were found to work in her locality to ensure human security through different development interventions. They established schools and community clinics, constructed roads, distributed books, medicine, mosquito net, sanitary latrine, seeds, and rice; provided health services like family planning, immunization; micro-credit, financial grants for fishing projects, and conducted awareness building program. But these development activities could not meet the needs and aspiration up to their desired level.

However, *Killamura* was a remote area where people would live on top of the hill. It was very troublesome to move from here to there. In some places they had to use the stairs made of mud and in some places they did not have any. It was difficult to go to *Rangamati* district headquarters as it was surrounded by water. Therefore, they used *Tomtom* (engine boat) for going to *Rangamati sadar*. It took one and half an hour by boat and then they had to take a rickshaw-van or auto-rickshaw to go to any destination. Such communication created obstacles to initiate development interventions in their locality and access to the benefits of education, healthcare, water and sanitation, information and so on.

She sent her son to high school which was situated in *Rangamati sadar* as there was no primary school or high school in their vicinity one year ago. There was only a pre-primary school run by Unicef. Therefore, people of her community established a junior high school (up to grade 8) and paid the salary of the teachers from their own sources.

However, teachers were also not willing to come to school regularly because of backward place, difficult communication and minimum salary. Hence, the government decision to set up a university in Rangamati appeared unbelievable to them in her judgment.

She had to go to *Rangamati sadar* for the treatment of her family members as there was no clinic or health complex in their locality. Kolpona was very happy as she could observe all religious festivals and rites and rituals peacefully. Furthermore, as there was no Bengali settler like other areas of *Rangamati*, they did not face any ethnic conflict. But she was worried regarding the military presence near their area. It should be noted that she faced domestic violence like slapping, scolding but not more than that. They solved these types of problems with the help of senior members of the family. Even they did not need to go for *shalish*.

The months of April to July were very critical for them because of food crisis. During this time fisherman were not allowed to catch fishes in *Kaptai* Lake. As a result, they faced food deficiency. They could take meal only twice a day on that time. Although the government had provision to give 20 kgs rice per month to a family for three months during food crisis but the problem was that her husband had to pay BDT 100 for getting that rice. Actually it was very difficult for them as he had no income that time. On the other hand, her family got that rice only for one month and the amount of rice was not enough for all family members. During that time they depend on natural resources like forest. But often that was also circumscribed and *jum* cultivation had been restricted from long before. All these factors pushed them into poverty. To overcome such situation she took micro credit from BRAC for goat rearing. But it was notable here that she was hesitated and scared to speak out about her changing socioeconomic condition through this credit because the concept of micro credit was not well accepted by the indigenous community.

She criticized the *Upazila Nirbahi* (Executive) Officer and Deputy Commissioner for not playing their role properly due to corruption. Therefore, facilities of any kind did not reach to the poor people. Moreover, she complained that women were much neglected in the decision-making mechanism at community level. She also claimed that decision regarding changing their identity as 'ethnic minor group' seemed disgraceful to her. She stated that they had an international recognition as indigenous people but despite being the citizen of Bangladesh, their identity was questionable. However, she underscored on

establishing factories to create alternative work opportunities and reserving some posts for the indigenous people as well as educational institutions (school, college and training institute) for building skills and capacities of the people. She also accentuated on full implementation of the CHT Accord which could ensure the real development of the indigenous people of CHT.

### **Analysis**

Kolpona is from a poor family who has to work hard along with her husband. Despite differences between men and women's work, wage and inheritance, indigenous women enjoy more freedom of mobility and equality in distribution of food, dress, education and consent in marriage. Preferences to sons still prevail in *Tripura* community which often resulted in practicing *patrilocality*. Even the male line of family lineage legitimizes the men's rights over paternal properties. Women get share of parental property only when parents are eager to give them as gift or in absence of male members in the families. Her statement shows that being the inhabitant of remote area and due to troublesome communication system and lack of transport facilities they face challenges of not getting doctor, nurse and health services; educational opportunities, electricity (few families have solar plant), safe drinking water, opportunities of work and income. They have to go *Rangamati Sadar* Hospital situated at district headquarters for better treatment which often causes death of the patient. Thus, distance, troublesome communication and economic constraints leave them into numerous interrelated insecurities in their daily lives. Moreover, corruption of the government agencies makes them exasperated not to get the services properly. Less visibility of women in decision-making bodies and fewer voices of women are also elucidated as the obstacles to women empowerment. The urge for full implementation of the CHT Accord is also echoed from her feelings for their actual improvement of their condition. Thus, the intersection of location, gender, class has been explained by her as an intertwined category for creating sufferings and vulnerabilities in their daily lives.

### **Case 5: Melapru Marma**

Melapru Marma, a 31 years old woman, was a resident of *Kukimara* village of *Wagga* Union under *Kaptai upazila* of *Rangamati* district. She had 4 members in her family. Her husband played the role of the household head according to their tradition. Her husband was a farmer and she was working as a teacher in a pre-primary school run by UNICEF.

Their monthly household income was BDT 7000 and her own income was BDT 3000. Melapru had to do all kinds of household chores as the primary caretaker of her family along with teaching. She also assisted her husband in agricultural works. Despite her involvement in both public and private spheres, both of them believed that women were physically weaker than men and thus there were some works which were exclusively considered as work of male. Women could not perform those works that gives superiority of men over women. She claimed that women's daily workload was much higher than that of men and men remained busy with income related works. She also confessed that the lack of opportunities made women unable to do certain tasks. Melapru and her husband took decisions through consultation and she enjoyed the freedom of movement. She could go out of her home vicinity for various purposes such as employment, children's education and healthcare.

Melapru perceived human security as an assurance of food security, freedom from economic discrimination, protection from violence, opportunities of access to education, healthcare and natural resources. She expressed that hunger, unemployment, sickness, land grabbing, and homeless were the threats to human security for indigenous people. They had little access to state protection and became marginalized. She specially stressed on physical and material differences as well as socioeconomic and political inequalities between indigenous men and women, resulting in specific types of impacts of insecurities, for instances, experiences of violence, wage differentials and less representation in political institutions.

She had been teaching in a pre-primary school run by Unicef for last 3 years. She played an important role in promoting education of indigenous children. She encouraged parents of her community to send their children to school regularly, discussed many issues with them related to school, attendance, quality education and future outcome of education. She also motivated other mothers about children's daily hygiene and cleanliness before going to school which would be helpful to create student's concentration on education. She was always careful about children friendly environment in school, regular presence of the teachers, teaching material as well as teaching style.

Melapru was very optimistic to make the future of her children. She regularly sent her son and daughter to school and expressed her dream about their good future. She believed that education could make their children knowledgeable, build their capacity and above all

make them human resource of this country. Hence, she emphasized on teaching in native language for increasing children's learning abilities. She also believed that through education indigenous people could uplift their living standard, maintain their indigenous culture, and organize for their own rights. Even she informed that women from her locality came to her for taking suggestions regarding income-earning activities, health, education and cultivation as they felt that she (Melapru) had the access to different information that could help them. Melapru also discussed their rights as indigenous women. She felt that indigenous women were far behind than indigenous men as well as Bengali people. Therefore, both individual and collective actions were necessary to overcome insecurities existing in CHT.

Melapru also praised the CHT Accord as it reduced the communal conflicts and created a variety of opportunities like education, healthcare, water and sanitation etc. But she also opined that few clauses regarding withdrawal of military, rehabilitation of refugees, role of land commissions were unimplemented which was responsible for dissatisfaction of the indigenous people of CHT. Even she criticized the government initiative to declare some areas as reserved forest which reduced their access to natural resources, income and ownership of community resources. She also indicated the change of their identity as 'ethnic minority group' in lieu of 'indigenous' as the sources of identity conflict.

### **Analysis**

Melapru is a representative of those indigenous women who struggle to change their life and enter into an enlightened world of information, knowledge and skill along with maintaining their own culture, tradition and identities. Her roles which range from domestic domain to public space are the indication of her empowerment. Her statement reflects that existing gender hierarchies and power structure are the sources of insecurities of the indigenous women and in some cases exacerbate their insecurities. Selection of Melapru as a teacher has contributed to better retention of teacher from indigenous community in one hand and building her capacity as empowered woman on the other. She works hard for developing child-centered teaching and learning methods, child friendly environment in education to provide space for child development as well as for making aware and encouraging the indigenous people about child education and importance of education in life. She accentuates on mother-tongue based multi-lingual education materials at pre-primary and primary levels for the development of ability of the children

as well as reducing their absenteeism. Having training on various issues and participating in many group meetings, she has got the opportunities to build her capacity to make choices of her own life, to deal with financial institutions and participate in community development activities in which previously she had limited access. Her perception regarding the Peace Accord, right to use natural resources, changing status of their name reflect that she is conscious about her rights too as indigenous women of CHT. It indicates that development interventions adopted the GAs and NGOs brought positive change in the lives of the indigenous people.

### **Case 6: Shachin Tripura**

Shachin Tripura was from *Garjontali*, from *Rangamati* municipal area. He was 38 years. His family was consisted of seven members. He and his family members were followers of *Sanatan* religion. After passing Higher Secondary Examination he started small business of grocery and found to continue during field study. His monthly household income was BDT 25000. However, he was the head of his household according to their tradition. He took decision by consulting with family members but his role was prominent to take decisions due to his earning capacities. But female members of his family enjoyed freedom of mobility like other women of *Tripura* community. They also got the same treatment in distribution of food. But they (female and girl) did not get similar treatment in case of educational opportunities, distribution of clothes and property inheritance. On other hand, he was involved in income-earning activities and female members of his family were involved in doing domestic chores that indicate division of labor at household and community level.

Shachin conceptualized human security as securing the opportunities of income, health, food, education, political freedom, land rights, identity and protection from social and communal violence. He stated that different development activities had been taken by the GAs, NGOs, IOs to ensure human securities but in many cases those programs could not benefit the indigenous people of remote areas rather favored Bengali settlers.

However, he expressed his experience of eviction from his own land in *Sazek* of *Rangamati*. His permanent residence was in *Sazek*. But the army compelled him along with many indigenous families to leave their ancestral land. Actually they ousted the indigenous people aiming at establishing a tourist spot. They got the assurance of compensating by setting up houses by the government but it was in vain; rather many

Bengali settlers got the facilities. Despite their protest, the local administration supported the settlers. As a result, the question of state's patronizing role to land settlers had been raised. However, he left his own land and started to live in *Garjontali*. He expressed his grief by saying that there was no one to pay heed to these incidents happening to the indigenous people in CHT. They were found to protest, arrange demonstration and submit memorandum against land grabbing and acquisition not against the state or security forces. But the way, through which they were evicted from their land, experienced displacement and faced resultant insecurities, was quite unexpected. Naturally they raised the question about the process of implementation of the CHT Accord. Even the role of the Land Commission in solving land disputes in the CHT was debatable and dubious.

He shared his experience about his past livelihood pattern. He was involved with *jum* cultivation when he was in *Sazek*. But because of eviction he came to *Rangamati* town and started business. Although he was evicted he praised the development initiatives regarding education, health, water and sanitation and construction of road as these initiatives had built capacity and increased the awareness, knowledge, skill and mobility of the indigenous people. But it was not unmixed blessing to the indigenous people. The job opportunities created by the GAs and NGOs were not familiar to them, thus Bengali settlers were getting more opportunities of work. On the other hand, many construction works clutched their land, Bengalis settled besides the road and indigenous people were compelled to reside in remote area. Again, the indigenous women hesitated to wear their traditional dresses and often experienced sexual harassment. It also depleted forest and created livelihood insecurity.

Shachin appreciated the CHT Accord but at the same time he believed that slow implementation of the Accord was responsible for land disputes. He was very conscious about his identity. Hence, he criticized the use of word 'small ethnic group' in place of 'indigenous people' as their identity. Such change and wording seemed to him demeaned and mortified their status. Shachin believed that collective action through organization could help them to uplift their rights.

### **Analysis**

The case of Shachin echoes the ensuing conflicts between the majority-minority populations which indicate the government's failure to address the rights of indigenous people and poorly planned development schemes which lead to further deprivation.

Tensions between Bengali settlers and the indigenous people were increasing and role of the government was in question. Despite including the provisions of rehabilitation of the internally displaced indigenous people in the CHT Accord the incidents of new cases of eviction and displacement were sources of tension and dissatisfaction among the indigenous people. Land acquisition with the support of security personnel and in many cases without compensation hampered the peace and confidence building process and increases communal violence, and distrust. Moreover, forced displacement affects the livelihood security and creates economic insecurity and the indigenous people are aware about their rights and raise their voice to establish their rights collectively and draw attention of government to resolve the above issues.

### **Case 7: Shoshodhar Tripura**

Shoshodhor Tripura, 38 years old, would live in *Garjontali* of *Rangamati* municipal area under ward No. 7. He attained Bachelor in Commerce degree. He had his own business of restaurant and his monthly income was BDT 18000/-. He was a follower of *Sanatan* religion He used to live in one storied building constructed on his own land and had all kinds of civic amenities. The number of his family member was four. He was considered as the head of his family because of his earning capacity and ability to communicate with the outside community and to manage crisis situations. He played the major role in decision-making process in his family such as financial matter but consulted with his wife regarding children's education and their future, problems of business, savings and so on. He considered his son and daughter as equal and did not give preferential treatment to any of them in providing various opportunities. But he emphasized on male heir as they carry on family lineage and inherit parental property. He also mentioned about different gender roles and responsibilities practiced in his family and in community. As per his opinion, traditionally women are efficient in household chores than outside work and men are familiar to income earning activities. Accordingly, his wife did all the domestic chores while he worked in public places.

Shoshodhar was asked to describe human security issue from his own perspective. He opined that freedom from economic discriminations, to have opportunities to enjoy natural resources such as land and forests, protection from social violence and enjoy the right to education could be considered as human security to him. The government agencies and non-governmental organizations adopted diversified programs for



improving the socio-economic condition and security of the inhabitants of Rangamati. But he strongly criticized the development interventions regarding education, health, communication and said that the indigenous people could not enjoy the benefit of development. Actually the development interventions were not meant for the indigenous people. For instance, decisions of establishing educational institutions for tertiary level would not benefit them. While the indigenous children were facing problems at primary level as method of teaching was *Bangla* and they did not understand *Bangla* properly then how they would attain higher education. On the other hand, quality education were hindered by the scarcity of trained up teachers, lack of educational institutes in primary level in remote areas, absenteeism of the teachers and so on. As a result, lack of skills and competencies constrained the indigenous people to get satisfying job. He also added that imposing restriction on *jum* cultivation adversely affected their subsistent economy, squeezed job opportunities and pushed indigenous people in economic insecurities and discriminations. In such situation he started to run restaurant business as he did not get any job in government or private sector. Initially he had to face economic hardship to run his business.

Shoshodhar mentioned about the gap between indigenous and non-indigenous people. He stated that if any incident happened to Bengali settlers, they blamed to indigenous people. He shared a bitter experience of his own life in this regard. Once a seriously wounded Bengali settler was found near his house and the Bengali community made responsible him for this incident. Without any evidence he was accused and convicted later. In addition, Shoshodhar expressed his grief regarding changing their status from indigenous to small ethnic. He identified this issue as an important example of human insecurity for indigenous people. He said that indigenous people were suffering from such identity crisis and had no choice to enjoy the freedom of being called by the name which they prefer. Shoshodhar also indicated the issues such as presence of military, slow rehabilitation procedure and the role of land commission that were mainly responsible to sustain their insecurities in CHT. Therefore, there were no alternative to rapid implementation of CHT Accord.

### **Analysis**

Shoshodhar Tripura reflects his attachment to the indigenous community through his description. His story highlights that though mutual approval in family matter has been

found, conventional patriarchal norms was prominent with regard to decision making process as well as consideration of becoming household head in their community. Even linkage of child preference with patrilineality and men's right to property inheritance show his preferential treatment toward male child. His description also sheds the light on existing gender division of works and responsibilities and wage differential as well in the indigenous community. However, the case of Shoshodhar Tripura can be explained from both human security and intersectionality perspectives. The concept of human security emphasizes that people should enjoy their rights without discriminations. Shoshodhar identified structural factors such as discriminatory policies of development interventions are mainly responsible for creating insecurities and vulnerabilities in his life and created barriers to enjoy human rights.

#### **Case 8: Neinda Marma**

Neinda Marma, 35 years old, lived in *Asam Basti* in *Rangamati* municipal area under Ward No. 5. He completed his Masters degree from the University of Dhaka. His family consisted of three members. He was working with a local NGO in Rangamati. He did not have his own land hence he lived in *pucca* rented house that had all kinds of citizen amenities. Both he and his wife were working in public place and their monthly family income was BDT 32000/-. Though he played the role of household head but decisions were taken by both of them with consultation each other. He had only daughter to whom they provided all opportunities. He felt that equal treatment towards boy and girl should be provided. But he admitted that gender division of work was prevailing in his family as domestic chores were mainly done by his wife. Thus, his wife's workload was heavier than him and she did not enjoy her leisure hour properly.

He explained human security from the point of insecurities. He conceptualized insecurities as labor market discriminations, dominant group attitudes, state policy of assimilation, slow implementation of CHT Accord, land grabbing, and expansion of reserved forest which created the threats such as unemployment, broadened gap between indigenous and non-indigenous people, communal conflicts, multiculturalism, displacement, and challenges in subsistent economy. But he denied the identity crisis as he felt changing the name of indigenous people did not matter to him; matter was to have the ability to enjoy the human rights.

Neinda Marma was working as activist in Rangamati for uplifting the rights of indigenous people. He urged that indigenous people should organize themselves for their rights in CHT. He affirmed that many development programs had been run in Rangamati by GAs, NGOs and IOs. Those programs resulted in improving the socioeconomic condition of the indigenous people. For instances: increasing awareness about and access to health, education, water and sanitation, creating new types of work opportunities, organizing indigenous people to improve their condition, building capacity, increase the confidence between indigenous and non-indigenous people and so on. He also added that people of remote areas still in backward position because of geographical location. In addition, he mentioned that rapid implementation of the CHT Accord could ensure the peace in CHT. He praised this initiative as it broadened the freedom of indigenous people. But he expressed his disappointment as the accord could not give any solution regarding the land, did not withdraw the military camp, rehabilitation of internally displaced people and stopped the settlement of non-indigenous people in CHT. He questioned the role of administration in this regard and said that without good political will this problem would not be solved. Therefore, indigenous people should continue the democratic movement for their rights such as sit for dialogue with government, to arrange rally and human chain, and to submit memorandum to the administration.

### **Analysis**

The case of Neinda Marma shows that he welcomed the government and non-governmental approaches to improve the condition of the indigenous people. Simultaneously he urged for organizing the indigenous people to enjoy their rights. He specially emphasized on the implementation of the CHT Accord which could ensure the human securities in indigenous people's lives. He believed that different threats which are now prevailing in CHT could be minimized through the democratic process of movement and good political will of the government.

## CHAPTER NINE

# Summary, Suggestions and Conclusion

### 9.1 Introduction

This chapter provides a summary of the major findings, their theoretical implications and an analysis of the assumptions. It also proposes a set of recommendations for formulating policies and adopting plans and programs considering the socioeconomic and political realities of CHT to reduce insecurities of the indigenous people. It also presents the conclusion at the end of the chapter following the scope of future research.

### 9.2 Summary of the Major Findings

#### 9.2.1 Brief Description of the Socioeconomic Conditions of the Respondents

The broad-spectrum objective of the study was to analyze the gendered impacts of development interventions and the gender dimensions of human security in CHT. The findings show that indigenous women had different gender roles and responsibilities at household level. Consequently they had their different needs, desires and interests. Although they were found to be respected and valued by their male counterparts they were being suffered from discrimination and marginalization on the ground of their sex, ethnicity and social status. As far as gender roles were concerned, indigenous women had to manage all the domestic chores along with productive work. Therefore, they were highly valued for their reproductive roles. But, often their male counterparts helped them in a private sphere.

With regards to socioeconomic conditions, the findings show that the *Marma* respondents were more educated than the *Tripura* and the female respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities were found to be less educated than their male counterparts. Most of the respondents from the *Marma* in urban area were found to be engaged with small business, teaching, day labor in other non-farm activities and the rural *Marma* male respondents had major involvement in agriculture and informal sectors related to non-farm activities. The male respondents from the *Tripura* of rural areas were betrothed to cultivation and fish business whereas urban male respondents were mainly affianced with small business like grocery shop and worked as day laborer in non-farm activities. On the

other hand, most of the female respondents from the *Tripura* were housewives and found to do agricultural works; only two of them were health workers of UNDP. A few of the rural *Tripura* women were also recipients of micro credit for poultry rearing. The female respondents from the *Marma* were found to be involved in agricultural work, weaving and livestock rearing. A few of them were school teachers of BRAC and Unicef and health workers of BRAC.

Monthly household income of the most of the households was not enough to lead a decent livelihood. The monthly household income of the *Marma* ranged from BDT 4000 to 25000 whereas monthly household income of the *Tripura* was from BDT 4000 to 15000. The socioeconomic condition of the *Marma* was better than that of the *Tripura* in term of monthly household income. The female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* who were found to work as health worker, school teacher and day laborer, earned BDT 2000 to 3500 per month. Such income level was too poor to lead the decent livelihood. It reflects the poor socioeconomic conditions and backwardness of the respondents.

The landownership pattern is complex in CHT. To probe into the insecurities related to land such as land grabbing, dispossession and dislocation, it is significant to understand the pattern of landownership in CHT. The land under habitations comprises of homestead, pond and water bodies, arable land under plough cultivation, arable land under *jum* cultivation, land under plantation (fruits and trees), fringe land and grazing land. The landownership is of three kinds: Firstly, there is the common property which is enjoyed by the indigenous people of one or more *Mouza* under the registered record of *Mouza's* Headman. Secondly, customary-traditional landownership within a *para* which is used by the households with the consent of the Headman and *Karbari* and may not recorded in register. Thus it could be both recorded and unrecorded. The last type of ownership is registered where documents are provided by the district administration (Barakat *et al.* 2009:47). Historically, common property systems have been the traditional way of accessing land and deciding on ownership of settlement and cultivation areas in the villages in CHT (Rasul, 2007). The study area was no different in respect of landownership. In *Asam Basti*, *Kochukhali*, *Garjontali* and *Killamura*, the respondents had both customary-traditional and registered and landownership. On the other hand, recorded and unrecorded, customary-traditional and common landownership were found

in *Kukimara* and *Chaklachhari*. But no female respondents were found as a registered owner of land from any community.

Housing is one of the basic needs and constitutional rights of the citizen of a country. The majority of the respondents of the study area were found to possess their own houses except a few cases. The houses were varied in quality of structures. In urban areas (*Asam Basti*, *Garjontali* and *Kochukhali*) the poor respondents had *kancha* houses made of CI sheet with timber, bamboo, wild grass, tree trunks etc and well off families had *pucca* house with RCC and semi *pucca* house made of CI sheet with *pucca* wall. In *Kukimara*, most of the *Marma* respondents had *kancha* house made of muddy wall with CI sheet, CI sheet with bamboo and timber followed by typical *machang* house and also non-*machang* houses. In both cases they used tree logs as beam covered with thatch or wild grass, tree logs as roof material and bamboo, mud or thatched bamboo for wall construction. The houses of the *Marma* in the study area were basically comprised of rectangular blocks prearranged for specific household functions with three parts of terrace, a main house and a kitchen. The main house was divided into several parts like bedroom and living room on the basis of the respondents' needs. Respondents who had *machang* houses used a tree trunk as stairs to climb up and entered the room. But the kitchen belonged to the house under separate roof and was used as dining and food storage. On the other hand, the *Tripura* community had their houses built with bamboo and wood for platform, wild grass and reed for roofing and thatching, and cane and rattan for binding. The study also reveals that the houses in rural areas did not have proper sanitation facilities. Some of them had no latrine at all who defecated in open places. Some of the indigenous people were found to use ring-slab and pit latrines indicating that indigenous people of the CHT in rural areas did not have proper sanitation. ADB (2010) also found that 80% of households used open spaces for defecation. On the other hand, respondents of urban areas had *pucca*, ring slab or pit latrines.

With regard to sources of water, the respondents used multiple sources of water for their household use such as tube well, river, lake, spring and concrete water reservoir. The people of rural areas, such as *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari*, collected water from spring and lake and harvested rain water. Only affluent families had tube wells. In urban areas, there were water supply as well as tube-wells and concrete reservoirs. The interviewees, participants of focus group discussion and key informants admitted that the geo-physical

condition, high implementation cost, complication in installing tube-wells due to hard bedrock and lack of knowledge on how to operate and maintain the technology were challenges to ensure safe water options. They did not have much knowledge regarding surface water pollution on one hand and had less option of safe water sources on the other. Indigenous women were primarily responsible to collect water from streams and they had to spend much time to collect water from far distance. The respondents of *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* had no access to electricity supply. They depended on traditional systems and few well-off families used solar plant, while respondents of *Asam Basti*, *Garjontali*, *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* had access to electricity supply.

In respect of sources of information, the respondents from rural areas relied on gossiping as a source of information while in urban areas they used radio and television in the same purpose. Mobile phones with internet connection were reported as another source of information, especially, by a few young respondents. Most women, but a few who were engaged with NGOs, were less informative than their male counterparts regarding political, legal and human rights, and non-implementation of the CHT Accord. The male respondents from both rural and urban contexts were critically analytic about their insecurities, identity crisis, and impact of development and so on.

In connection with household head, both male and female respondents from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities acknowledged that man played the role of a household head. Most of them, except a few, expressed almost the same view about the various causal factors for considering men as the household head. For example, decision-making capability, earning capacity, physical strength, traditional practice, networking and skill of crisis resolution of men were reported by the female respondents as important factors to be household head. In contrast, earning capacity, decision-making ability, maintaining heredity, mobility, and widespread exposure of men were reported by male respondents as important factors to be household head.

It is evident from the study that there was no gender discrimination regarding child preference in the *Marma* community. They did not make any differences between two sexes in distributing food, providing education, clothes and health care. But the *Tripura* respondents showed mixed responses regarding this issue. They stated that there were some gender discriminations in distributing above opportunities which were reducing day by day.

However, gender division of labor was evident in the study area. The respondents were found to be involved in doing daily work in four categories such as household, productive, amusement and public welfare. Indigenous women were assigned for domestic activities like cooking, washing, child rearing, taking care of family members, fetching water, collecting vegetables and looking after livestock. Indigenous women also found to do agricultural work, sell products in the market, and perform duties as health worker and school teacher as well. A few women were also found to work as public representatives. Consequently women were overburdened with their works through playing double or triple roles. It should be noted that gossiping and observing festivals were the major sources of their amusement. On the contrary, the male respondents played their roles in productive and income earning sectors such as doing agricultural and non-agricultural works and running petty trades. They also participated in *shalish*, attended social meeting, visited government and non-government organization. Although both male and female respondents claimed that there was no gender discrimination between the two sexes in indigenous society in reality men and women were assigned their responsibilities separately that were determined by gendered norms. The causal factors for such gender specific works were related to physical strength, intelligence and outward mobility of men and tradition. The findings indicate that public-private dichotomy and the exercise of power and status by men were persisted in the study area.

With regard to freedom of mobility, it was found that indigenous men and women enjoyed the freedom of mobility in the study area but women were often constrained by some factors such as less familiarity with public places, less immersion in public work, traditional views of the society towards women, lack of proclivity of going to unfamiliar places, physical insecurity, distance of destinations, economic restraints and so on. In respect of decision-making, major decisions like selling or buying land, choosing occupation and cultivating agricultural products were taken by men. On the other hand, women took less important decision like cooking, selecting dress, gardening that indicate unequal power relation between the two sexes. Despite admitting men's decision-making role in different issues, most of the respondents, both men and women, mentioned that decisions were taken by consulting with each other, which indicated an attitudinal change of the indigenous community.



In respect of inheritance rights, patriarchy was found to be perpetuated through customary inheritance laws which determined sons as the only legal inheritor of ancestral properties. Women did not have any legal and religious rights to inherit ancestral properties. They can only own when they buy a property and when they are gifted through the deed of rights by their parents or brothers. Thus power, position and domination of men over women were persisted in the indigenous community.

However, job opportunities were found to be squeezed gradually for both male and female respondents in the study area. They blamed the government policy of Bengali settlement for creating unemployment situation. They mentioned such programs as the reasons for the migration of the indigenous people from their own areas, pursuing them to search for new jobs which they were not accustomed with. In many cases, they were obliged to work in government sponsored plantation as day laborer. But, an access to good jobs was limited for both sexes due to their lack of education and skill. However, women of the study area used to enjoy an equal status in *jum* cultivation but ban on *jum* cultivation forced them to work in different sectors outside of their community where they faced wage differential (approximately a man got BDT 300 while a woman got BDT 150 to 200). But, they did not protest as it was tradition of the indigenous community and men were considered stronger and did more job than women.

With regard to domestic violence, the respondents from both of the communities confirmed that domestic violence was not common in their communities like the mainstream Bengali society. If there was any case of domestic violence, family members settled it, if it was not possible then *shalish* headed by *Karbari* and *Headman* gave the verdict. But the indigenous women became the victim of social violence perpetrated by security personnel, forest officials and non-indigenous settlers as reported by the respondents. Moreover, the indigenous men also faced violence that was related to land and forest issues.

### **9.2.2 Human Security from Gender Perspective**

To understand the meaning of human security from gender perspectives, both male and female respondents were asked about their individual and contextual elucidation of the meaning of security or insecurity in their daily lives. It is evident that their perception and conceptualization regarding security or insecurity were influenced by the historical, socioeconomic and political context of CHT as well as intersecting attributes like gender,

social status, ethnicity and geographical location. The rural *Tripura* male respondents defined insecurities as the presence of poverty, unemployment, lack of food, education and health facilities in their daily lives. On the contrary, the urban *Tripura* male respondents described insecurities as the existence of threats like identity crisis, land alienation, bewildering landownership, conflict and intimidation between the indigenous people and the settlers, and the non-implementation of the CHT Accord. On the other hand, the rural *Tripura* and the *Marma* female respondents viewed human insecurities as a manifestation of the non-fulfillment of their basic needs such as food, housing, education, healthcare, nutrition, water and sanitation. The female respondents living in urban area from the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities also prioritized on the presence of food security, protection from social violence, economic opportunities and freedom of mobility for their security concern along with their basic needs fulfillment. The educated *Marma* female respondents explicated human insecurity as a peril of tradition and livelihood because of cultural aggression and grabbing of land by applying different mechanisms. It was notable that militarization, the non-implementation of the CHT Accord, restricted access to natural resources and disputes over landownership were identified as menace to human security of the indigenous people of CHT by the respondents irrespective of their gender, social status and geographical location. The key informants conceived human security as the assurance of enjoying land right, identity status, protection from violence and prevention of displacement, access to natural resources especially forest, bodily integrity and above all the implementation of the CHT Accord. Thus, human security encompasses human rights, access to education, healthcare, food, housing, water and sanitation, absence of violence and conflict, reducing poverty and threat of militarization, recognition of identity, achieving economic opportunities, access to socioeconomic and political decision-making process.

It is noteworthy that the term security has its own contextual features. The human security problems in CHT were differed as they stemmed from various roots encircling the CHT's land factor and its demographic, political, economic, social and cultural factors (Kabir and Ahmed, 2012:47). To understand the insecurities faced by the indigenous people in CHT it is important to understand the various sources of insecurities, their interaction and interrelationship.

Data show that the landownership of the indigenous people was at a stake. Different mechanisms were being used by the different actors for alienation of the indigenous people from their ancestral land. It was found that people of the study area were at a risk of eviction due to engulfment by the security forces, civil administration (UNO, DC), law enforcement agencies, settlers backed by the government (except *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* where there were no settlers), forest department, business corporations, commercial NGOs, plantation leaseholders and land dealers. The respondents focused on different issues and mechanisms which were responsible for such insecurity problem with land. They mentioned legal pluralism which was in parallel operation in CHT. For instance, both customary law and formal law were existed in CHT. Thus, multiple titling and conflict over the same land was very common scenario in CHT including the study area. The state acquisition and forcible land occupation, which was evident in large scale in counter-insurgency, still persisted in CHT in new dimensions. They also expressed their agony and torment regarding the roles of HDCs and the Land Commission as these institutions failed to settle, lease, sell or transfer the land as per guidelines of the CHT Accord.

The respondents also expressed their frustration regarding the role of the security forces and civil administration as they often backed the settlers to take over the land of the indigenous people. However, the respondents felt a high risk of the settlement on the same plot of land which had been occupied by the settlers under different names disregarding the prior rights of the indigenous people. They also mentioned that sham and mock documents were used for illegal occupation of land and that they were under pressure to sell land. Furthermore, violence centering on land resulted in eviction and conflict was mentioned as one of the techniques of eviction of indigenous people from their lands. But leases of *khasland* for plantation by civil administration, political leaders, professionals, military officials were not mentioned by the respondents of the study area. Thus, above-mentioned trends were likely to give rise to inter and intra ethnic conflicts, political tyranny of the indigenous people which would impede the regional stability, economic growth and social development. Consequently, it generated the human insecurities in their lives.

The findings show that the indigenous people faced livelihood and environmental insecurities due to the expansion of reserved forest and un-classed state forest in one hand

and environmentally unfriendly policies regarding mono-plantations by the government and international organizations on the other. Such initiatives became a threat to the environment. The government efforts of making alternatives to *jum* for the indigenous people through the initiatives of mono-plantation became failure and left indigenous people with limited economic choices. Even the programs of CHTDB for rehabilitation of the indigenous people through horticulture and agro-forestry became futile in generating the means of survival. As a result, the indigenous people were compelled to change their occupation, became day laborer and served the interest of the non-indigenous people's commercial purposes. The female respondents alleged these initiatives for destroying their subsistence. They purported that *jum* was not only their cultivation system but also their tradition and culture where both indigenous men and women enjoyed equal status. They used to collect vegetables, fuel, and house building materials, fruits and medicinal plants from the forest especially from the village common forests. Such mobility of the indigenous women was constrained due to restriction on *jum* cultivation and development interventions. As a result, they were compelled to search non-farm jobs for survival and often had to leave their own area for searching jobs. The respondents of the study areas also denied that *jum* was not the only cause of deforestation. But they alleged that the government policies related to population transfer, extension of reserved forests, plantation program and construction of *Kaptai* Dam were responsible for deforestation.

Restriction on access to the forest and dispossession of landownership directly affected the economic condition of the indigenous people of the study area. The respondents informed that restriction on *jum* cultivation created poverty, food insecurity and unemployment. Many of them had to shift their occupation from agricultural activities to non-farm activities. Many of the respondents were found to be involved in rickshaw-pulling and other non-farm activities (day labor and carpenter). They also worked in horticulture and mono-plantation sector but such work did not change their economic condition rather intensified their poverty and brought adverse health consequences. In contrast, a few indigenous respondents regarded these plantations as the source of income earning. Another important observation is that grazing lands were significant for rearing livestock but it was reducing day by day and again limiting the source of income of the indigenous people. Moreover, the problems of marketing, transportation and communication from remote area made wastage of perishable products which pushed the rural

people into a poverty cycle. Furthermore, lack of capital and knowledge regarding irrigation and post-harvest preservation; low price and unfriendly marketing and linking person in market system were the different factors which created detrimental economic consequences for the indigenous people. As a result, they encountered exploitation and faced destruction of indigenous lifestyles. Sometimes they were forced to migrate for an alternative economic source.

With regard to food security, the indigenous people were found to be suffered from food insecurity. The respondents mentioned multifarious reasons for food insecurity. They underscored that encroachment of forests and lands not only displaced them but also created vulnerability in economic sustainability, and thus affected their food habit and food consumption. Even they explained that *jum* was a practice that was culture friendly and meticulously related to consumption. It traditionally ensured their access to sources of food in CHT. Moreover, shifting from subsistence to the market-based agriculture and plantation programs could not be proved as an attractive alternative livelihood option and convenient for indigenous people. The respondents further mentioned that the rainy season i.e. *Ashar* and *Sravan* months of the Bengali calendar year (mid June to mid August) were critical for food insecurity as they could not work that time due to torrential rain as well as rough and bad weather. As a result, food crisis was emerged during that time in the study area. Then they took meal twice a day in place of thrice. Food items were also curtailed into rice and vegetables. They could eat fish occasionally. But they could not have meat, milk and other expensive food items. Women were found to eat less because they prioritized the consumption of their family members first. Thus, female respondents appeared to live in a poor condition and suffered more from food insecurities compared to their male counterparts in terms of both amount and quality of food intake.

With regard to housing condition, the study reveals that the respondents from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities suffered from housing insecurity except a few affluent respondents living in urban area. They built their houses on stilts known as *machang* (platform) with walls of bamboo or mud and a thatched roof. The materials used for such housing generally were timber, bamboo, wild grass, corrugated iron (CI) sheet and so on. But those houses were not enough to protect them from storms, cold and rain which indicate their housing insecurity. They were also very underprivileged in terms of sanitation facilities at their household. Their knowledge on sanitation and hygiene was

very poor. Although people in the urban areas had access to supply water and tube-well facilities, in rural areas women had to collect water for daily household use, especially in dry season, from different sources like lakes, streams and small ponds. They were also found to harvest rain water household use. Therefore, they were the worst victims of diarrhea, dysentery, typhoid and other water-borne diseases that indicate the lack of civic amenities and health insecurity.

In respect of violence against indigenous women the findings show that social violence was more visible than domestic violence. They admitted that although there were a few cases of domestic violence, they were more worried about the violence committed by the non-indigenous people. In many cases, the perpetrators were member of the security force, law enforcement agency, employee of forest department and Bengali settlers. Rape, killing after rape, sexual abuse and tortures were common forms of violence against indigenous women in CHT which indicates women's vulnerability. However, significant data were explored regarding inter-ethnic and intra-ethnic conflicts in post-Accord era. It is found that the United Peoples Democratic Front (UPDF) who refused the Accord considering it as against the interest of the indigenous people made the situation of CHT unstable through creating violence.

The study exposes that the indigenous people faced insecurities from identity crisis which was a very critical issue in CHT. They cried out for their ethnic identity but they became frustrated after the decision of the government to identify them as small ethnic group. During interviews and focus group discussions they contested their name and identity being decided by others not by themselves. They asserted that they are Bangladeshi without any doubt but they are not *Bengali*. So they would like to be acquainted with their own identity as 'indigenous people'. However, contrasting views were found among the educated and good job holders who opined that getting all the rights which they deserved were more important than identity. It is notable that female respondents were not very concerned about their identity or even its meanings.

The momentous CHT Accord was signed in 1997 which brought an end to the decade long counter insurgency in CHT and widened the path of development initiatives. Although it was welcomed by the both indigenous people and Bengalis, many of its clauses were remained unimplemented and thus created insecurities for the indigenous

people of CHT. They expressed the uncertainties created due to non-implementation of the Accord: the non-removal of temporary camps of para-military and army forces, the disputable role of land commission, and slow proceedings of rehabilitation of the returnee refugees and internally displaced people, effective enforcement of HDCs and CHTRC. They also alleged that such slow and sluggish implementation of the CHT Accord often created conflict, unhappiness and violence in CHT and hindered the development process. It is remarkable that female respondents only could mention the presence of military camp and slow rehabilitation process as a weakness of the CHT Accord. This again indicates their lack of access to information. In contrast, they praised some initiatives undertaken as per conditions of the CHT Accord. The respondents referred to several initiatives such as the formation of the CHT Regional Council, power delegation to Hill District Council, the establishment of Land Commission and that of Ministry of CHT as the key achievement through this Accord.

The analysis of insecurities also discloses that many uncertainties related to the policies regarding settlement had undertaken by the government in pre-Accord period. But its consequences were being faced by the indigenous people of the study area. They alleged that transmigration was one of the reasons for land conflicts in CHT. They focused on the growth rate of ethnic and non-ethnic people in CHT since 1951 to 2011. During this period the growth of non-indigenous people was very high. They regarded the government policy as responsible for the displacement from their ancestral land. Many indigenous people obliged to move to hilly areas and faced housing and livelihood insecurities. They felt that the growing percentage of non-indigenous people was responsible for changing social and population structure, creating violence, and inducing pressure on the resources of CHT.

The respondents identified the presence of military as one of the significant insecurities of their life. They felt that the government was reluctant to withdrawal of military camps. The decade long military existence in CHT left the indigenous people welt and blemish in their minds that people of all generations were sternly traumatized by the carnages that they experienced and witnessed. The respondents irrespective of their age, status, ethnicity and gender purported that land purchase, lease, using forest resources, grabbing land by the settlers, eviction of indigenous people, *jum* destruction and communal attacks were controlled and backed by the military and civil administration in CHT. Thus

collective spirit, harmony, culture, environment, language and traditional values have resulted in erosion that complies with findings of Mohsin (2012). They even alleged that military legitimized their presence in CHT by creating savagery and patronizing armed conflicts and fed distrust between two conflicting groups like JSS and UPDF in this region. Allegations of violence against indigenous women expressed women as a specific target to extinguish ethnic community not only during counter insurgency but also in post Accord period. The female respondents said that they did not feel safe passing nearby the camp for collecting water, go to field, stream and market. It is noteworthy that on the basis of the repeated demand of removing military camps from CHT, the Present Prime Minister, Her Excellency, Sheikh Hasina announced on 08 May 2016 (News from TV) that all the temporary camps will be withdrawn as per the CHT Accord. It would expedite the implementation process of the CHT Accord and reduce the violation of human rights, conflicts and communal attacks.

However, data show that environmental deterioration and devastation triggered by transmigration of settlers, establishment of infrastructure, mono-plantation and road construction. Such deterioration impact adversely on natural resources like land, forest and water bodies and thus eroded the biodiversity and lifestyles of the indigenous people.

Data indicates different types of impact caused by above-mentioned insecurities. The respondents alleged that continuous grabbing and eviction in CHT region made them scared about their ownership. Therefore, wary thoughts regarding development activities were persisted among the respondents. They even felt that appearance of multiculturalism and new lifestyle and economic activities are degradation of their traditional values. They were also worried about the distance in attitudes between the settlers and the indigenous people which was the source of continuous conflicts in CHT. They were even compelled to change their long-standing traditional occupations and entered into a market oriented economy where economic exploitation, in the form of wage differentials and hard labor was prevalent. The lack of knowledge and skills of the indigenous people lead to more discrimination in employment in comparison with settlers or non-indigenous people. Racial distinctions were also expressed as a hindrance in securing livelihood option. However, freedom of women's mobility was restricted due to the fear of violence in one hand and impunity of perpetrator created threat on the other, as expressed by the female respondents. Justice was often denied due to the political interference, the influence of



law enforcement agencies in both cases of gender based violence and conflicts between indigenous and non-indigenous people. But psychological impact such as loss of self-esteem, depression, dependencies and so on was perpetuating among the indigenous people and regarded as detrimental for their self-worth and dignity.

### **9.2.3 Relationship between Development Interventions and Human Security**

The findings show that the government agencies such LGED, Department of Forest, Department of Roads and Highways; local bodies namely CHTDB, Union *Parishad*, Rangamati Hill District Council, international organizations such as UNDP, Asian Development Bank, Unicef; national NGOs such as BRAC, NGO Forum, Dhaka *Ahsania* Mission and local NGOs like Green Hill and *Taungya* were working in the study area for the socio-economic development of the indigenous people. The study examined whether these interventions had any impact on the lives of the indigenous people. The data show that development interventions of these organizations brought both positive and negative changes in the lives and livelihood strategies of the indigenous people. It is found that development interventions undertaken by the above-mentioned organizations were inclined to ensure human security of the people. But, some initiatives were responsible for creating further insecurity of the indigenous people in terms of fear, want, and violence.

Data reflect that educational status was improving in urban and semi-urban areas in comparison to the remote areas. Although pre-primary (*Prak-Prathomik*) education program of UNDP and affirmative action of the government enhanced educational status of the rural indigenous people, it was not like that of urban area. Lack of infrastructure, teaching staff, distance of school, cost of education and language barriers were reported as the common limitations of the indigenous people on achieving education. Gender specific challenges in education were economic crisis, distance, inadequate infrastructure and road facilities as well as insecurity among other mentionable ones. Absenteeism of the teachers placed in remote area was another barrier to ensure quality education in remote area. The teachers who were appointed in rural areas were not eager to attend the school regularly. Rather, they appointed other persons having SSC or HSC degree from indigenous community who performed the duties of the actual teachers. They were called '*barga*' (hired) teacher. The urge for quality education and use of mother language were

also described as the boon of empowerment of the indigenous people in general and indigenous women in particular.

With regards to healthcare, the respondents from urban area such as *Asam Basti*, *Garjontali*, *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* affirmed the availability of healthcare facilities (hospital and clinic) were near their locality. They were provided with general health services, immunization, emergency obstetric care, maternal and child health services by both the government and different social welfare agencies. Besides, mosquito nets, vitamin A capsule, tablets for destroying worm, water and sanitation services, hygiene education, antenatal and postnatal care, safe-delivery and training on midwifery, counseling for contraceptive use, diagnosis and medicine of TB were provided by the NGOs through the *para* health centers as reported by the respondents. But the respondents of remote hilly area (*Killamura*, and *Chaklachhari*) informed that health facilities were not available in their locality as hilly areas are detached from mainland. They had to go to *Rangamati sadar* (for *Killamura*) and *Rajasthali upazila* headquarters (for *Chaklachhari*) for treatment purposes. But they got the health services provided by the mobile health workers through satellite health clinic from different NGOs along with government health facilities although that was inadequate compared to their requirement. To avail health services often became difficult in remote area. For example, to reach the doctors, get ambulance, avail investigation facilities and delivery services were really difficult in remote area because of troublesome communication and transport system. As a result, mother and child health together with general healthcare was hindered pervasively which indicate the poor health condition and health insecurity of the people.

With regard to water and sanitation, most of the respondents of urban areas were found to enjoy water supply and modern sanitation facilities. But the respondents of rural areas were deprived of such facilities. Although the government and partner organizations provided the rural people with modern and essential technologies and instruments for ensuring availability of safe drinking water they were in crisis because of dysfunctional of the instruments. Moreover, often, they could not enjoy modern sanitation facilities because of economic constraints. Consequently, the use of open places for defecation and less use of sanitary latrine was prevalent in the study area. It should be noted that natural sources of water like streams were destructed due to road construction, nature of timber harvesting and crop cultivation which increased water insecurity in the study areas.

In respect of women's role in the water and sanitation sector, the respondents from both rural and urban area confessed that women played the major role in their household as primary users, providers and managers of water and sanitation for maintaining household hygiene. They had to spend a significant amount of time to fetch water from distant places which limited their productivity, escalated the risk of being harassed and reduced their time of enjoying leisure time. Simultaneously, women were also trained for WATSAN program to disseminate the information regarding safe water, sanitation and hygiene as well as to make people conscious in this regard. As a result, women were becoming knowledgeable about the operation and maintenance of water technology and capable of making decisions. At the same time they admitted that the number of such women were very few to create a massive change in the society and that scenario in remote areas was very gloomy due to their lack of education, fear, discomfort to work with out-network.

The status of peace and confidence in the study area was found to be low among the indigenous people, Bengalis and the government in respect to implementation of the CHT Accord. The respondents gave the reference of incongruous role of Land Commission to resolve the clashes over land, indecorous rehabilitation process of the internally displaced people, non-withdrawal of army camps were the main obstacles to implement the Accord. Thus, cynic and skeptic opinions were found on peace and confidence building. However, relationship between indigenous people and Bengalis was described by the most of the respondents as cold and incredulous. But, a few respondents opined that the relationship was warm and friendly but became distrustful by a group of people through incitement. Hence, peace and confidence building programs adopted by the government and NGOs created the environment of understanding and sharing the culture among the government, different actors, Bengalis and indigenous people, built trust and coherence; and reduced conflicts through dialogues. Such initiatives were considered as reconciliation process to accelerate the pace of implementing the CHT Accord in CHT. But a substantial number of the respondents identified gender-based violence as the prime barrier to building peace and confidence. It is found that cases of violence were increasing due to the presence of settlers and military, the silent role of law enforcement agency and so on. Even inter-ethnic and intra-ethnic violence backed by the different vested interest groups such as Bengali settlers and enforcement agencies was also evident in the study area. The

respondents also expressed that harmony would be established and enhanced through building reliance between communities and law enforcement agencies.

The findings show that the economic condition of the indigenous people was improving through gardening, livestock, fruit plantation and cultivation of cash crops. In contrast, a few respondents opined against economic programs such as horticulture and agro-forestry due to its failure to improve their socioeconomic condition. The respondents also felt that such efforts of the government made them day laborer, intensified the poor economic condition, created health hazards and provided less economic choice. However, female respondents mentioned that restricted *jum* cultivation and less economic opportunities compelled them to change their occupation and to move from native village to other places for a job. They also stated that it created insecurities, wage differentials and physical harassments. On the other hand, the male respondents opined that lack of marketing opportunities, distance, nature of product, influence of linking person, cost of product and low price were also the barriers to improve their economic condition through crop cultivation. It should be noted that likewise other areas of Bangladesh, the GAs and NGOs provided micro credit among the indigenous people to expand their income generating activities. Despite considering micro credit as non-popular initiative in the study area, a few of the respondents thought that microcredit could bring positive change in their livelihood pattern.

In relation to institutional capacity building, the respondents focused on the governance system, its strengths and loopholes which should be taken into consideration for planning and implementing development projects. They mentioned corruption, lack of transparency and accountability, absence of rule of law of *Zila Parishad* and *Union Parishad* as loopholes of confidence building program. The female respondents also expressed their grief regarding the marginal participation and status in politics and in political organization. They said that there were only 3 seats reserved for women in HDCs and CHTRC among which one was for only the indigenous women. Even in traditional governance system there were no women *Headman* or *Karbari* in the study area. Indigenous women members of *Union Parishad* also highlighted their weak voice raising capacity due to patriarchal domination that indicates the lower position of women in all spheres of life.

It is found that NGOs had their specific programs for gender-based development. Initiatives were taken to make indigenous men health workers, local trust builders, local mediators, and to make women *para nari* development workers, school teachers and skilled birth attendants. Thus, confidence of indigenous men and women were strengthening and breaking the stereotyping in women's participation in different sphere of life.

The respondents particularly mentioned the name of UNDP in relation to community empowerment. They mentioned that *para* development center assisted them to organize themselves, developed leadership, made public network and mobilized resources. Even the farmers' field school provided them with the opportunity of learning better method of farming that developed their condition and confidence. It is an indication of human security in respect of freedom of fear.

### **9.3 Theoretical Implication**

#### **9.3.1 Human Security**

The present study employs theory of human security and intersectionality to analyze the research problem. Since large disagreement exists and conceptual debate prevails regarding the meaning of human security, a detailed conceptual reflection may seem spurious, but undeniably needs an analysis for conceptual clarity and operationalizing it for research purpose. Therefore, the main thrust in this study was to conceptualize human security from the respondents' standpoint and the nature and impact of threats the indigenous people face in their daily lives. The study finds gendered perception of human security. Most of the male respondents, from the both *Tripura* and *Marma* communities, view human security as their socioeconomic well-being, respect of their dignity and worth, physical and psychological safety and freedom of violence and conflict, participation in decision making, enjoy rights to land, forest and identity, the CHT Accord with full implementation in the context of CHT. On the contrary, the female respondents interpret human security as the fulfillment of basic needs such as income, food, shelter, education healthcare for the family members including themselves, fortification of basic liberty like freedom of mobility, use of public places and protection from violence. It should be noted that that the male and the female respondents of two communities understand human security as the safeguard from different kinds of threats or risks. They

focus on their individual rights as well as community needs and rights in a non-discriminatory way for a long term fulfillment.

The focus of human security is on human lives. Although human security threats have direct and indirect effects on human lives, respondents of the study area mention the impacts of such threats in their lives rather dividing the effects. It is significant to note that whenever they point out the threats and its impacts they make the relation of uncertainties and suspicions with their ethnic standpoint beyond the location. Thus, in many cases they present themselves through their collective identities. The respondents identify the following issues as insecurities: land grabbing, eviction from land, losing of landownership, identity crisis, lack of job opportunity, forced change of occupation, non-implementation of the CHT Accord, dual role of land commission, restricted use of forests, food insecurity, insecurities related to education, healthcare and housing; violence and conflict committed by militarization, different ethnic group, violence against women and environmental degradation.

Most of the female respondents from both communities prioritize on economic uncertainties, non-fulfillment of basic needs like income, education, healthcare, food, water and sanitation, violence from non-indigenous people, i.e., Bengali settlers as intimidations in their day to day lives. A few female respondents could connect land and forest issues, the CHT Accord, identity crisis and environmental degradation explicitly with insecurities. But most of them could not do because of their low level of education, less access to information and network, geographical location, limited mobility are the reasons for the inability to relate above issues with the concept of security concept. The respondents identify several impacts of such insecurities as well as threats in their lives.

If human security comprises of economic development, social justice, environmental protection, democratization, disarmament and respect for human rights and the rule of law as suggested by Annan (2000), then the CHT context is partially characterized by the notion of security. It is found that respondents are facing economic hardship due to different mechanisms for grabbing land and generating muddle upon landownership, and introducing such economic opportunities which are not favorable to indigenous people. Environment is endangered for forest diminution in one hand and mono-plantation on the other. Democratic rights to participate in social, economic and political decision-making are limited and are hindered for indigenous women. In comparison to the ratio of

indigenous men and non-indigenous men with indigenous women in HDCs, CHTR and, Union *Parishad* replicate the decision-making condition. According to the CHT Accord, withdrawal of military camps by the government has not been yet implemented. Conflicts and violence in various forms rather persist in the study area and in CHT in general which make people feel more insecure. However, it is also true that provisions of education, healthcare, water and sanitation, capacity building of both indigenous men and women have been taken for their development. As a result, they are enjoying freedom of mobility, freedom of expression, freedom of assembly and freedom of association as well as they can raise their voice against violence and abuse of their rights with some limitations.

### **9.3.2 Intersectionality**

The intersectionality perspective reveals that an individual's social identities to a major extent influence his/her experience and beliefs about gender. It encompasses that individual's social location as reflected in multiple layered identities must be at forefront in any investigation of gender (Shields, 2008). Intersectionality aims at revealing multiple identities of the people and exposing the different types of discrimination and insecurities that occur as consequences of the combination of identities. This framework has been used in present study to understand the intermingled social locations such as gender, ethnicity and religion of the respondents. It is noteworthy that the findings confirm that gender, education, ethnicity, and geographical areas predominantly intersects each other and create discrimination inequality and insecurity in the life of indigenous people. With regard to religion, the indigenous people from the *Marma (Buddhists)* and the Tripura (followers of *Sanatan* religion) communities do not make mentionable differences and threats in this regard.

It is observed that ethnicity, gender and geographical location mainly intersect each other in the study area. Indigenous people, in general, face the challenges and threats of land dispossession, land alienation, limited use of forest, economic constraints, food insecurity, militarization, demographic imbalance, intra and inter-ethnic conflicts and violence in CHT that contribute to their experience of discrimination, oppression and detriment. But the *Marma* and the *Tripura* who belong to the poor class face the extreme form of above-mentioned problems. Even those who live in remote areas face more obstacles than those who live in urban area. Disadvantaged location, i.e., remoteness and

troublesome communication system limits the access of indigenous men and women to education, health, water, sanitation and market opportunities. It also constrains their ability to develop their livelihood strategies.

However, structural factors intensify the situation adversely. The complex interaction of factors like top-down policies and paternalistic approaches to development have resulted in a socioeconomic environment that is not conducive for both indigenous men and women. For instance, government policies like transmigration of Bengali settlers in CHT, infrastructure development, expanding reserve forest, military intervention, trade liberalization, privatization, commercial plantation, partial implementation of the CHT Accord have resulted in extreme socioeconomic and legal vulnerability and uncertainties, food insecurity, identity complex, disputes over land, poverty, and forced migration in search of work. Moreover, it has heightened conflicts and broadened the gap between indigenous and non-indigenous people; destroyed the subsistence economies, undermine their dignity and capacity, displaced from their land, dispeel their rights on natural resources; destroyed their indigenous lifestyles. Neither the customary system nor the formal judiciary system could establish justice by resolving the conflicts, violence and disputes between indigenous and non-indigenous people. Rather police and military intervention interrupt the justice procedure that often led injustice to indigenous people. Furthermore, indigenous people have very low participation in decision-making bodies, politics and employment in comparison with mainstream people. Through intersectional analyses the present study tries to illuminate the development policies and initiatives that intertwine to create such a situation that threaten indigenous people's rights and sustainable development rather than to eradicate discrimination and ensure enjoyment of their human rights.

It is noteworthy that despite valuable contribution of the indigenous women in both domestic and public sphere, they face distressful situation caused by multiple identities: as indigenous person, as women, as member of poor group and as living in rural areas in comparison with indigenous male counterpart as well as indigenous women living in urban areas. The present study shows that indigenous women are particularly vulnerable to violence both within community and in broader society by non-indigenous people. They are politically disenfranchised as decision-making is gradually becoming a man's domain both in their community and in the state functionaries. They face inequalities in



terms of inheritance and other economic resources, inaccessibility and lack of accessibility to education, employment opportunities, and information and capital markets. They suffer from poor health due to lack of safe drinking water and sanitation system, ante-natal and post-natal facilities, non-availability and high cost of modern healthcare services. Even they are forfeited from their traditional rights and natural resources due to gradual loss of collective and communal ownership of land and forest. It is mentionable that the rural indigenous women face such limitations more than the indigenous women of urban areas. In addition, the perception of indigenous men and women regarding human security is diverse. Development interventions also affect the indigenous men and women differently. It is important to mention that although development interventions have been taken for the wellbeing of the indigenous women along with the men these activities are basically meant for meeting the practical gender needs rather than strategic gender needs.

The above-mentioned discussion shows that how social and cultural categories like gender, ethnicity, socioeconomic status and geographical location are intertwined. As a result, discrimination, marginalization and insecurities experienced by the indigenous people and the development policies and practices shaping their lives would be difficult to address properly.

#### **9.4 Analysis of Assumptions**

##### **Assumption 1: Development interventions lack the notion of gender mainstreaming approach.**

The focal point of attention of mainstreaming gender is attaining the goal of gender equality and gender perspectives. These perspectives can sway the goals, directions and outcomes of development activities and ensure participation of both men and women and benefit them equitably. However, gender mainstreaming involves both the analysis of the different roles of men and women in a given place at a given time. In addition, it confirms actions to ensure that development policy; planning, monitoring and implementation are sensitive to the needs of women as well as men and promote greater equality of opportunity and benefit (KfW, 2006; UN Women, 2014).

However, it has been found that the government agencies, local government bodies, NGOs and IOs are working in the study area and they have policies and programs in relation to development interventions with gender perspectives and gender equality

imperatives. For achieving gender equality, gender perspectives have been identified in different sectors such as education, health, water and sanitation, economic development and violence against women by the development actors. It proves that policy making and planning are gender sensitive and targeted both the men and women through the analysis of their roles and relationships. An explicit commitment to achieve gender equality, women rights and women empowerment has also been expressed through these policies. But in most cases this is conventional and confined in black and white. Promoting gender equality at the implementation stage is less visible. Moreover, many sectors like governance, agriculture, market-based economy, land and forest, peace and confidence building are only women focused but lack gender equality agenda. It is also evident that women's access to services, participation in decision-making process and capacity building program is visible in urban and semi urban area like *Asam Basti*, *Garjontali*, *Kukimara* and *Kochukhali* in a limited extent but in remote area such as in *Killamura* and *Chaklachhari* women are still lag behind in this context.

With regard to fulfillment of gender needs, it is found that women could fulfill their practical gender needs to some extent but to enjoy strategic gender needs are still far reaching to them. For example, they do not have property rights if they are not given by parents. They face gender-gap in employment and wage payment, are more visible in lower paid job, often face restriction on their mobility, and are often not informed about the rights and the opportunities that might be available for them. They are also vulnerable to social and communal violence and conflict.

However, they do not have active (purposeful behavior according to their choice) and transformative (the ability to act on restrictive aspects of roles and responsibilities and challenge the social structures) to get rid of such oppressions. The scenario of decision-making ability is also exasperating. Till now women take the less important decisions in domestic life except a few. On the other hand, the indigenous men are more visible than women in governance system from local level to national level. The study finds no *Headman* and *Karbari* from the indigenous women in the study area. The number of indigenous women in Hill District Councils (HDCs) and Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council (CHTRC) is negligible. The representation of indigenous women in local government like Union *Parishad* or *Upazila Parishad* is lower in comparison with the indigenous or non-indigenous men. Thus, the findings partially support this assumption.

**Assumption 2: Development interventions are exacerbating insecurities instead of providing protection of the indigenous men and women.**

The history and culture of development interventions in CHT is rooted into colonial period to till now. The respondents from the study area characterize development policies, schemes and activities as disruption of their culture, tradition, livelihood and nature through the lens of deprivation and denial of various opportunities from colonial period to till date. It is observed from the respondents' views that they have grave grumbles regarding the development interventions of CHT which has been taken from the colonial period. They consider the change of subsistence economy to surplus and profit-based economy as an attack of British colonial ruler on their mode of production and economic life through denoting *jum* cultivation as waste of resources. As of today they are facing economic insecurity and food insecurity due to such interventions. They also blame the then Pakistan government to set up *Karnafuli* Paper Mills in *Chandroghona* in 1953 with the financial assistance of the World Bank and the hydroelectric dam in 1960 at *Kaptai* in *Rangamati* as a part of development plan. Although the *Karnafuli* Paper Mills created job opportunity most of the posts were occupied by Bengali and Pakistani. The indigenous people were not benefitted from it. Rather it destroyed forest, land and indigenous livelihood strategies. It was also harmful to nature, tradition and privacy of the indigenous people. The hydroelectric dam, locally known as *Kaptai* Dam, created artificial lake, submerged nearly 54,000 acre of plough land, left 1,00,000 people internally displaced. It destroyed agricultural system, created unemployment food crisis, ill health and malnutrition. On the other hand, soil erosion, land degradation and destroy of the forest have been happened due to fruit gardening, forestation, rubber and teak plantation instead of *jum*. Thus, insecurity regarding land and forest continue to persist in CHT which impact indigenous people's livelihood adversely.

However, after the CHT Accord, extensive development interventions have been undertaken for the development of CHT as a whole. But ongoing mechanisms of evicting indigenous people from their land and taking over ownership of those lands by different vested interest groups adversely affect the livelihood of the indigenous people. Economic, food and livelihood insecurities become intensified through these initiatives. Hence, the development activities seem meaningless to many of the indigenous people. On the other hand, many refugees, returned from India after signing the CHT Accord, yet get their land

back. They are still living in inhumane condition. In such situation complete implementation of the CHT Accord is the prerequisite for peace and development in the study area. Based on the above-mentioned findings it could be said that the development interventions are trying to protect the indigenous people from insecurity but few development policies regarding land, forest and resettlement as well as non-implementation of the CHT Accord left them vulnerable and marginal. Thus, the findings partially support the second assumption.

**Assumption 3: Indigenous women are more vulnerable to violence and discrimination than indigenous men.**

The findings of the study show that the majority of the indigenous women from both of the *Marma* and *Tripura* communities face multiple discriminations with regard enjoy human rights because of their gender, ethnicity and social status. They face multiple forms of violence in their lives and in many cases justice is far reaching for them. It is observed that the female respondents from both of the communities are triple burdened mainly due to assigned with household activities along with outside and community work. Likewise the domestic roles of women of mainstream Bengali community, their domestic roles are not recognized as productive work. With regard to property rights, they do not have inheritance rights rather it depends on the desire of their parents and brothers whether they will get any property which makes them economically vulnerable. On the other hand, they are victims of wage discrimination. Their job opportunities are limited due to less education, skill, mobility and social network. Moreover, restricted *jum* cultivation pushes them to non-farm activities where they often face discrimination and harassment. Their participation in decision making process in both private and public places is less visible. Important decisions are taken by men. Traditional institutions are patriarchal and male dominated where the posts of *Headman* and *Karbari* are occupied by men. Only in their absence, women can hold these positions. Over the past centuries only 10 out of the 384 *Headmen* were women in CHT (Kapaeng Foundation *et al.* 2013). On the other hand, no woman *Headman* or *Karbari* is found in the study area. Participation of indigenous women in local government system is very minimal in comparison with male ones. Women do not have any significant influence on decision-making either in the CHTRC or in the HDCs according to the respondents. Their opinion is often hindered with the patriarchal surroundings.

However, sexual violence is the protuberant and prevalent problem in CHT like other parts of Bangladesh. After signing the CHT Accord both of the indigenous men and women expected that the growing rate of violence will be abridged. But failure of the state to prevent the rising incidence of violence as well as to bring the perpetrator to the justice system due to powerful affiliations and protection of perpetrator by the security forces, political parties, law enforcement agencies, forests guards and settlers are often disappointing. Moreover, communal oppression, land grabbing, non-implementation of the CHT Accord, exemption of perpetrators, lengthy legal system are the principal causes of occurring such violence as per opinion of the respondents. Therefore, it could be said that the last assumption is supported by the findings of the present study.

## **9.5 Suggestions**

Taking into account the views of the respondents, key informants, participants of FGD and observation of the researcher, the following measures are suggested to improve the condition of the indigenous people of the studied communities.

### **9.5.1 Suggestions for Policy Formulation**

- i) Legislative and administrative measures should be taken to recognize the customary land rights of the indigenous people of the Chittagong Hill Tracts so that forced redistribution of land and use of fraudulent and forgery land records could be controlled. It will also be helpful to curb the manipulation of land settlement documents, restrict the boisterousness of commercial land grabbers, limit the pressure of litigation leading the distress of indigenous people and prohibit the land leasing procedure to non-indigenous people.
- ii) Repatriation process of the indigenous people with rehabilitation by the government should be implemented phase by phase so that ethnic tension and conflict would not be escalated into violence.
- iii) Policy of withdrawal of military camps and minimizing the involvement of the army and other security forces in nation building functionalities including CHT Development Board, education, land administration and forest matters should be announced and ensured by the government.
- iv) Advocacy measures should be taken for strengthening the capacity of the formal and informal institutions on customary laws and practices which will be helpful to resolve land disputes.

- v) Congenial atmosphere should be developed and generated through exchanging views and sharing knowledge among the indigenous people and other stakeholders which will be helpful to build peace and confidence.
- vi) Food security measures should be undertaken to reduce food insecurities and enhance the knowledge and awareness on agriculture and post-harvest preservation. However, agro-ecological mechanisms should be developed prioritizing the indigenous knowledge.
- vii) Distinctness plurality and opinion of the indigenous people should be taken into account before designing as well as implementing any kind of development interventions for ensuring their rights and well-being.
- viii) Policy should be adopted to redistribute the state owned common forests land to indigenous people under their own management so that sharing of resources would be equitable and justified.
- ix) Self-employment should be encouraged in informal sectors according to the needs of the indigenous people in their locality to increase job opportunity.
- x) The number of women representative from indigenous community in policy making bodies should be increased through establishing linkages with local level indigenous organizations, NGOs and other stakeholders. In addition, seats for indigenous women have to be reserved at local and national body including parliament.
- xi) The government should ensure personal security and safety for rural women particularly in areas affected by conflicts through judicial inquiry and exemplary punishment to the perpetrators to combat such violence.

### **9.5.2 Suggestions for Practice Level**

The present study recommends the followings measures to fulfill the practical and strategic needs of the indigenous women and ensure gender specific security:

- i) Community clinics should be expanded and health governance system of the local government institutions (*Union Parishad* as well as traditional leadership – *Headman* and *Karbari*) should be strengthened to provide qualitative and effective healthcare in remote areas as well as training on skill birth attendant should be given to traditional birth attendants.
- ii) Appropriate measures for training, allocation of resources and equipments should be taken for the actors (local government institutions, service providers of

education, health, water and sanitation.) to deliver the services to the indigenous men and women according to their needs, conditions and aspirations; geographical context and diversity.

- iii) To establish small and cottage industry to create job opportunity for women of remote areas, to improve marketing facilities and to limit the interference of middlemen to make indigenous women economically self-sufficient.
- iv) The role of NGOs and international organizations to fulfill the needs and ensure human security of the indigenous people is evident in urban and semi-urban areas but minimal presence of these organizations is noticed in remote areas. Hence, activities of these organizations should be extended in remote hill areas considering the topography and distinct culture of the particular area.

Above all, full and speedy implementation of the CHT Peace Accord and to declare the roadmap to implement it is necessary for ensuring confidence, expedite peace process and to reduce distrust and communal conflict.

### **9.6 Scope for Further Research**

The present study attempts to identify the gender roles and responsibilities of the indigenous people as well as analyze the gender dimensions of human security and development interventions through the lens of theoretical frameworks of intersectionality and human security by using qualitative approach. Data were collected from the two indigenous communities, the *Marma* and the *Tripura*, living in six small *paras* of *Rangamati* hill district. However, the current study did not address the insecurities faced by the indigenous people of other communities such as the *Chakma*, *Tanchangya*, *Chak*, *Mru*, *Khumi*, *Kheyang* and so on living in CHT and even people of the *Marma* and the *Tripura* communities living *Bandarban* and *Khagrachari* hill districts. The study only reveals the personal and political security of the two indigenous communities but many securities like environmental security, community security are still yet to be explored. Nevertheless there are ample scopes to conduct further research in this regard. For instance:

- i) Researchers may undertake the study on how gender mainstreaming policy could be operationalized through development interventions for providing the benefits of development activities to the indigenous people of CHT;

- ii) Gender dimensions of land grabbing process and role of women in natural resource management need to be explored;
- iii) Research on institutional capacity building is also an important area for further study;
- iv) Confidence building process through the development initiatives could supplement the findings of the present study;
- v) Nutritional status and food consumption pattern of the indigenous people of CHT could be explored;
- vi) A study on gender dimension of impact of the CHT Accord could be a significant additional branch of present study; and
- vii) A study on how each indigenous group is affected by development intervention could add new facets in this field.

### **9.7 Conclusion**

The study examines the gender dimensions of development interventions and human security of the indigenous people in CHT of Bangladesh. It explores the existing human security situation of the indigenous people from gender perspectives and examines the impact of development interventions undertaken by the GAs, NGOs and international organizations. It is found that the growing inter-cultural contacts, increasing trends of market economies, fast expansion of communications, spread of the state functionaries and development actions make gender as a significant factor. In some cases, these factors broaden the gap between indigenous male and female. For example, some development interventions such as establishing educational institutions, community clinic, water and sanitation projects, and upgrading overall infrastructure have been undertaken for the improvement of socioeconomic situation of the indigenous people. Attention has been given to indigenous women and girls in tune with Millennium Development Goal-3 (MDG-3) in the purpose of reducing gender discrimination, in particular. The development programs have brought about positive changes in their lives such as health condition has been improved, maternal mortality rate has been decreased, enrolment of girls in school has been increased and women can collect water easily from ring-well and tube-well (*Tara Pump*). But, there is still gender gap in terms of less participation in decision making process in both public and private domains, under-representation in local (Union *Parishad*, *Upazila Parishad*, Hill District Council), regional (Chittagong Hill Tracts Regional Council) and national (Parliament) bodies. In addition, gender



discrimination in payment, victims of violence committed by non-indigenous people, deprive of access to and control over natural resources have also found.

Furthermore, their ethnic identity, social status and geographical location intersect with gender and deteriorate the situation and undermine the status of both indigenous male and female. In addition, non-recognition of customary land rights, restriction imposed on using of forest resources and not fully implementation of the CHT Accord create major hindrances and difficulties for the indigenous people. However, the present study reveals that both of the multiple identities and structural barriers are being faced by the indigenous people to lead a decent livelihood. Indigenous women, in particular, victims of compound discrimination on the basis of their ethnicity, gender and economic status which engrained in conflict, militarization, dispossession, migration, and gender-based violence and repudiation of services. Hence, the study emphasizes combating violence against indigenous women, in particular, and men, in general; as tolerance of violence is not acceptable in human security paradigm for social stability, peace, confidence building and development. The study also urges that political commitment for various development programs with special attention to the distinctness, plurality and opinion of indigenous people is needed. It may uphold the dignity of the indigenous people, enhance peace, harmony and trust as well as lessen the sense of deprivation. Thus, the benefits of development will be more equitable and create friendly environment among the indigenous people. However, gender mainstreaming approach has to be followed in both policy formulation and program implementation levels to minimize the gender discrimination in every level.

It is evident that the issues of survival and well-being of the indigenous people have been taken into consideration by the GAs and NGOs in the study area for enhancing their security. But, expected outcome is still far reaching. Hence, the study emphasizes ensuring and protecting human security of the indigenous people through minimizing the threats to life and improving health, housing, personal safety and human dignity. Above all, the present study underlines the role of the government to minimize the human rights deprivation of the indigenous people through indigenous people friendly development interventions. Towards that ends, the present study underlines enhancing participation of the indigenous people at all levels of decision-making process, policy formulation, implementation and evaluation of programs for minimizing their insecurity.

## References

- ADB (2010). *Chittagong Hill Tracts Study on Potential for Integrated Water Resources Management: Promoting Effective Water Management Policies and Practices. Phase-5*. Dhaka: ADB.
- Adnan, S. (2004). *Migration, Land Alienation and Ethnic Conflict: Causes of Poverty in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Research and Advisory Services.
- Adnan, S. (2008). "Contestations Regarding Identity, Nationalism and Citizenship during the Struggles of the Indigenous Peoples of the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh." *International Review of Modern Sociology*, 34(1):27-45.
- Adnan, S (2011) "Resistance to accumulation by dispossession under neoliberal capitalism and globalization: Struggle for land by the poor peasantry in rural Bangladesh." Paper presented at the *International Conference on Global Land Grabbing* held on 6-8 April 2011 organized by the Land Deals Politics Initiative in collaboration with the *Journal of Peasant Studies* and hosted by the Future Agricultures Consortium at the Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex, England.
- Adnan, S. and Dastidar, R. (2011). *Alienation of the Lands of Indigenous Peoples in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. Copenhagen: International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs.
- Afroze, S. (2010). "Introduction." In Shaheen Afroze (Eds.) *Human Security Approach to Counter Extremism in South Asia: Relevance of Japanese Culture*. Dhaka: Academic Press and Publishers Library. pp. 1-12.
- Ahammad, Ranju and Stacy, Natasha (2016). "Forest and Agrarian Change in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Region of Bangladesh." In E. L. Deakin, M. Ksatriya and T. C. H. Sunderland (Eds.) *Agrarian Change in Tropical Landscape*. Bogo: Center for International Forests Research (CIFOR). pp. 190-233.
- Ali, A. (2010). *Reaching the Hard to Reach*. Dhaka: NGO Forum for Drinking Water Supply & Sanitation.
- Alkire, Sabina (2003). *A conceptual Framework for Human Security. Working Paper 2*. Oxford: Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity (CRISE).
- Annan, Kofi A. (2000a). *We the Peoples. The Role of United Nations in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*. New York: United Nations.

- Annan, Kofi A. (2000b). *Secretary-General Salutes International Workshop on Human Security in Mongolia*. Two-Day Session in Ulaanbaatar, May 8-10, 2000. Press Release SG/SM/7382. <http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2000/20000508.sgsm7382.doc.html> > 08/27/01.
- Arens, Jenneke (2013). "Militaryization of the CHT and Its Impact on the People." In Philip Gain (Eds.) *The Chittagong Hill Tracts. Man-Nature Nexus Torn*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 281-311.
- Arens, Jenneke and Chakma, K. N. (2010). "Indigenous Struggle in CHT." In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope: Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective. pp.-23-25.
- AWID [Association of Women's Rights in Development] (2004). *Women's Rights and Economic Change. Intersectionality: A Tool for Gender and Economic Justice*. Canada: AWID.
- Azad, A. K. (2010). "Human Security and Extremism in Bangladesh: Synergy and Conflict." In Shaheen Afroze (Eds.) *Human Security Approach to Counter Extremism in South Asia: Relevance of Japanese Culture*. Dhaka: Academic Press and Publishers Library. pp.-111-135.
- Bajpai, Kanti's (2002). "Beyond Comprehensive Security: Human Security". In *Comprehensive Security: Perspective from India's Regions. Seminar Proceedings*. New Delhi: Delhi Policy Group.
- Barakat, Abul; Halim, Sadeka; Hoque, Mozammel and Osman, Asmer (2009). *Life and Land of Adibashis. Land Dispossession and Alienation of Adibashis in the Plain Districts of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Pathak Samabesh.
- Barakat, Abul; Halim, Sadeka; Osman, Asmer; Hossain, I. Md. and Ahsan, Manjuma (2010). *Status and Dynamics of Land Rights, Land Use and Population in Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Human Development Research Centre, Bangladesh.
- Barakat, A. and Huda, S. (1988). "Politico-Economic Essence of Ethnic Conflicts in Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh." *Social Science Review*, 5(2): 103-127
- Barman, D. C. and Neo, M. S. (Eds.) (2013). *Human Rights Report 2012 on Indigenous Peoples in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Kapaeeng Foundation.
- Barman, D. C. and Neo, M. S. (Eds.) (2014). *Human Rights Report 2013 on Indigenous Peoples in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Kapaeeng Foundation.
- Barua, Bijay P. (2001). *Ethnicity and National Integration in Bangladesh: A Study of the Chittagong Hill Tracts*. New Delhi: Haranand Publications Ltd.
- Barua, Bijay P. (2010). "Development Intervention and Ethnic Communities in Bangladesh and Thailand: A Critique." *Journal of Alternative Perspectives in the Social Science*, 2(Special Issue No 1): pp. 372-400.

- Bekely, F. (1997). *The Gender Dimension in Development Projects: Concepts, Approaches and Framework for Gender Analysis*. DHP Publications Series, No. 3. Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa.
- Begum, F. S. (2014). *Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment: Suggested Strategies for the 7<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan*. [Retrieved on 15 April, 2016 from [http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/16\\_Gender-Equality-and-Womens-Empowerment.pdf](http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/16_Gender-Equality-and-Womens-Empowerment.pdf)].
- Bhattacharjee, R. (2015). "Inclusive Approach Needed to Resolve CHT Ethnic Conflict." The Opinion Page *BDNews24.com* 11 June 2015. Retrieved on 19 April 2016 from <http://opinion.bdnews24.com/2015/06/11/inclusive-approach-needed-to-resolve-cht-ethnic-conflict/>.
- Biswas, Saikat (2008). *State of Indigenous People's Rights in Bangladesh: An Analysis of Bureaucratic and Political Sensitivity*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, BRAC University, Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Bloor, M; Frakland, J.; Thomas, M. and Robson, K. (2001). *Focus Groups in Social Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Bleie, Tone (2005). *Tribal Peoples, Nationalism and the Human Rights Challenge. The Adivasis of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: The University Press Limited.
- Braun, V. and Clarke, V. (2006). "Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology." *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2):77-101. Taylor and Francis Online. Available from: <http://eprints.uwe.ac.uk/11735>
- Brauns, C. and Lofter, L. (1990). *Mru: Hill People on the Border of Bangladesh*. Berlin: Birkhauser Verlag, Basel.
- Bryman, A. (1988). *Quantity and Quality in Social Research*. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Brewer, R. M. (1993). "Theorizing Race, Class and Gender: The New Scholarship of Black Feminist Intellectuals and Black Women's Labor." In S. M. James and A. P. A. Bushia (Eds) *Theorizing Black Feminism: The Vision Pragmatism of Black Women*. London: Routledge. pp.13-30.
- Bulbul, A. (2006). *Parbotto Chottogramer Upojatio Samskriti* (Tribal Culture of Chittagong Hill Tracts) in Bangla. Dhaka: Mizan Publishers.
- BBS (1991). *Population Census 1991*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Planning, the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.
- BBS (2001). *Population Census 2001*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Planning, the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.
- BBS (2011). *Population Census 2011*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics, Ministry of Planning, the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh.

- Cerf, M and Magne, M. (2007). *How do Farmers Make Use of Developmental Interventions?* Retrieved on 25 October 2011 from [www.activities.org/v4n1/cerf-EN.pdf](http://www.activities.org/v4n1/cerf-EN.pdf).
- Chakma, Ashok Kumar (2010). "Who decides on Whose Identity?" In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope: Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh. Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective. pp. 216-217
- Chakma, Ashok Kumar, (2013). *Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Relating to Implementation of the CHT Accord 1997. An Assessment of the UNDP-CHTDF Project*. Rangamati: CIPD. Retrieved on 25 October 2015 from file:///C:/Users/Nasrin/Documents/CHT%20Development%20Maleya.pdf
- Chakma, Bhumitra (2012). "Bound To Be Failed? The Chittagong Hill Tracts Peace Accord, 1997." In Nasir Uddin (Eds.) *Politics of Peace: A Case of The Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: ICDR. pp. 121-142
- Chakma, K. and D'Costa, B. (2013). "The Chittagong Hill Tracts: Diminishing Violence or Violent Peace?" In Edward Aspinall, Robin Jeffrey, Anthony Regan (Eds.) *Diminishing Conflicts in Asia and the Pacific. Why Some Subside and Other's Don't*. New York: Routledge.
- Chakma, Chanchana (2010). "Women Invisible in CHT Accord." In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope: Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh. Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective. pp.181-182
- Chakma, N. and Matrot M. (2016). *How Ethnic Minorities Became Poor and Stay Poor in Bangladesh: A Qualitative Enquiry. Working Paper 34*. Dhaka: The Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh, UKaid, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation SDC and Shiree.
- Chakma, M. K. (2010). *The Status of Adivasi Hill Women in Light of the Chittagong Hill Tracts Accord*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Nari Progoti Sangha.
- Chakma, S. (2009). *Parbotto Chottogramer Upojati* (Tribal of Chittagong Hill Tracts), in Bangla. Rangamati: Tribal Cultural Institute.
- Chkraborty, E. (2004). "Marginality, Modes of Insecurity and Indigenous Women of Northern Bangladesh." In I. Ahmed (Eds.) *Women, Bangladesh and International Society. Methods Discourses and Politics*. Dhaka: Bangladesh Freedom Foundation (BFF) and University Publishers Limited. pp. 55-71
- Chakraborty, Eshani and Ali, Md. Ayub (2009). *The Hidden Matrix. Women's Position and Gender Relations in Adibashi*. Dhaka: Pathak Shamabesh.

- Chen, Lincoln (1995). "Human Security: Concept and Approaches." In Tatsuro Matsumae and Lincoln (Eds.) *Common Security in Asia: New Concepts of Human Security*. Tokyo: Tokyo University Press.
- Chenitz, W. C. and Swanson, J. M. (1986). *From Practice to Grounded Theory*. California: Addison Wesley.
- Chowdhury, K. (2008). "Politics of Identity and Resources in Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh: Ethnonationalism and/or Indigenous Identity." *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 36:57-58.
- Chowdhury, M. S. (2010). "An Appraisal of the Peace Accord and the Political Institutions in the Chittagong Hill Tracts." In Victoria Tauli-Corpuz, Raymundo Rovillos and Ruth Tinda-an (Eds.) *Hope and Despair. Indigenous Jumma Peoples Speak on the Chittagong Hill Tract Peace Accord*. Baguio City, Philippines: TEBTEBBA Foundation. pp. 1-114.
- Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission (2014). *Marginalization and Impunity. Violence against Women and Girls in Chittagong Hill Tracts*. Dhaka: Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission, IWGIA and Bangladesh Indigenous Women's Network.
- Christians, C. G. (2000). "Ethics and Politics in Qualitative Research. In Denzin, Norman K. and Lincoln, Yvonna S. (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- CHTDF-UNDP (2012) *Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts*. Dhaka: CHTDF-UNDP Bangladesh.
- CHTDF-UNDP (2014a). *Progress Report on Strengthening Basic Education in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Phase II*. Dhaka: CHTDF-UNDP Bangladesh.
- CHTDF-UNDP (2014b). *Promotion of Development and Confidence Building in the Chittagong Hill Tracts*. Dhaka: CHTDF-UNDP Bangladesh.
- CHTDF-UNDP (2015a). *What Have We Accomplished So Far?* Dhaka: CHTDF-UNDP Bangladesh.
- CHTDF-UNDP (2015b) *Progress Report on Conflict Prevention and Peace Building in Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: CHTDF-UNDP Bangladesh.
- Cohen, Sylvie I.; Sachdeva, Neena; Taylor, Sharon J. and Cortes, Patricia (2013). *Expert Group Meeting Report on Gender Mainstreaming Approaches in Development Programming: Being Strategic and Achieving Results in an Evolving Development Context*. New York: UN Women.
- Collins, P. H. (1990). *Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness and the Politics of Empowerment*. Boston: Unwin Hyman.
- Commission on Human Security (2003). *Human Security Now*. New York: Commission on Human Security.

- Connell, R. W. (2005). *Gender*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Corbin, J. and Strauss, A. (1990). "Grounded Theory Research: Procedure, Canons and Evaluative Criteria." *Qualitative Sociology*, 13(1): 3-21.
- Crabtree, B. F. and Miller, W. (1992). *Doing Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Crenshaw, K. W. (2005). "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics and Violence Against Women of Color." In M. A. Fineman and R. Mikitiuk (Eds.) *The Public Nature of Private Violence*. New York: Routledge. pp. 93-118.
- Creswell, John W. (2003). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (Second Edition). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Das, S. (2011). *Indigenous People's Access to Land in Northern-belt of Bangladesh: A Study of the Santal Community*. Unpublished M. Phil Thesis, University of Tromso, Norway.
- Denzin, Norman K. (1989). *The Research Act* (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.) Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Denzin, Norman K. and Lincon, Yvonna S. (2000). "Introduction: The Discipline and Practice of Qualitative Research." In Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincon (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Second Edition). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Dhaka Ahsania Mission (n.d.) *Regional Strategy Paper: Rangamati*. Retrieved on 10.12.2017 from <http://www.ahsaniamission.org.bd/strategy/Regional%20strategy%20documents%20of%20Rangamati%20Region.pdf>
- Dhali, Helal Hossain (2009). *Sustainable Development, State Policy and Gender: Examining the Effect of the Forest Policy on Gender Relations of Indigenous People in CHT in Bangladesh*. Unpublished Thesis in Development Studies, Institute of Social Studies, Netherland.
- Dhamai, B.M. (2014). An Overview of Indigenous People in Bangladesh. Survival under Threat. In M. S. Chowdhury (Eds.) *Survival under Threat: Human Rights Situation of Indigenous People in Bangladesh*. Asia Indigenous People Pact and Kapaeen Foundation. pp. 10-24
- Dodson, Alex (2011). "Marma." In Philip Gain (Eds.) *Survival on the Fringe. Adivasis of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 95-103.
- Drong, Sanjeeb (2006) "Indigenous Peoples: Facing Uncertain Future." In *Indigenous People have the Right to Territory Land and Natural Resources, Solidarity*, Dhaka: Bangladesh Indigenous Peoples Forum.

- Dunbar, C; Rodriguez, D. and Parker, L. (2002). "Race, Subjectivity and the Interview Process." In J. Gubrium and J. Holstein (Eds.) *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Dutta, J. P. (2000). *Impact of Development Programmes on Environment and Demographic Phenomena of the Ethnic Minorities of Chittagong Hill Tracts. Paper No. 6*. Dhaka: Centre for Policy Dialogue and United Nations Population Fund.
- Easher, T. H. (2013). Water – Scarce in the CHT. In Philip Gain (Eds.) *The Chittagong Hill Tracts Man-Nature Nexus Torn*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SHED). pp. 233-246.
- Erni, C. (2015). *Shifting Cultivation, Livelihood and Food Security, New and Old Challenges for Indigenous People in Asia*. Bangkok: The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs and Asia Indigenous Peoples Pact.
- Field, P. A. and Morse, J. M. (1985). *Nursing Research. The Application of Qualitative Approaches*. Beckenham Kent: Croom Helm.
- Fontana, A. and Frey, J. H. (2000). "The Interview: From Structured Question to Negotiated Text." In Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincon (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Second Edition) Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc. pp. 645-672.
- Gain, P. (2000). *The Chittagong Hill Tracts: Life and Nature at Risk*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD).
- Gain, P. (2011). "Land, Forests, and Adivashis of Bangladesh." In Philip Gain (Eds.) *Survival on the Fringe. Adivasis of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 393-443.
- Gain, P. (2013) *The Chittagong Hill Tracts: An Ecological Disaster*. In Philip Gain (Eds.) *The Chittagong Hill Tracts. Man-Nature Nexus Torn*, Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 15-63.
- Gain, P.; Moral, S. and Tigga, S. E. (2000). *Discrepancies in Census and Socio-economic Status of Ethnic Communities: A Survey of Ethnic Communities in Five Thanas (sub-districts) in the Northern, North-eastern and North-central Regions of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD).
- Gerharz, E. (2001). *Ambivalences of Development Cooperation in Post-Conflict Regions. Ethnicity in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*. Diploma Thesis. University of Bielefeld.
- Gillespie, D. (1999). "Ethical Issues in Research." In *Encyclopedia of Social Work*, 19<sup>th</sup> ed. Washington D. C.: NASW Press.



- Goldstein, J. A (2002). "Population and Security: How Demographic Change Can Lead to Violent Conflict." *Journal of International Affairs*, Fall 2002, 56(1): 3-22
- GoB [Government of Bangladesh] and FAO [Food and Agriculture Organization ] of the United Nations (2013). *Support to Preparation of Integrated Project for Environment friendly Agriculture in the Chittagong Hill Tracts. Technical Report*. Dhaka: GoB and FAO.
- Guba, E. G. (1981). "Criteria for Addressing the Trustworthiness of Naturalistic Inquiries." *Educational Communication and Technology Journal*, 29:75-91.
- Guhan, S. (2001). *Indian's Development Experience: Selected Writings of S. Gihan*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Guhathakurta, M. (2010). "Changing Context in the CHT." In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope. Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective. p 138.
- Halim, S. (2002). "Human Rights and the Indigenous Women. A Case Study from CHT." In S. Halim (Eds.) *State of Human Rights in Bangladesh: Women's Perspective*. Dhaka: Women for Women, A Research and Study Group. pp. 131-149.
- Halim, S. (2003). "Insecurities of Indigenous Women: A Case from the Chittagong Hill Tracts." *Solidarity*, 1:95-105.
- Halim, S. (2010). "Insecurity of Indigenous Women." In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope, Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective. pp 183-189.
- Hannan, Carolyn (2000). *From Concept to Action: Gender Mainstreaming in Operational Activities*. New York: UNDP
- Hassan, Md. Z. (2011). *Institutional Responsiveness to Indigenous Rights: The Case of Chittagong Hill Tracts Land Dispute Resolution Commission*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Centre for Peace Studies, University of Tromso.
- Hazarika, S. (1994). *Strangers of the Mist: Tales of War and Peace from India's Northeast*. New Delhi: Viking, Penguin Books Ltd.
- Hiscock, D. (2008). *Human Security in Bangladesh*. London: Saferworld.
- Huberman, M. and Miles, M. (1994). "Data Management and Analysis Methods." In Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Second Edition) Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc. pp. 428-444.
- Hussain, M.; Dutta, A.; Ranjan, C.; Barnalee, K.; R Monoj, H.; Saba M.; Nath, S. and Das, S. (2010). *Human Security in India. Health, Shelter, and Marginalization*. Dhaka: The University Press.

- Hutchinson, R. H. S. (1909) *Eastern Bengal and Assam District Gazetteers: Chittagong Hill Tracts*. Alahabad: Pioneer Press.
- ICISS [International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty] (2001). *The Responsibility to Protect. Report of the International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty*. Canada: International Development Research Centre.
- ICIP-CHT [International Council for the Indigenous Peoples of CHT] (2013). *A Submission on Jumma. Indigenous Rural Women of the Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT), Bangladesh*, regarding General Discussion on Rural Women, Under Article 14 of CEDAW, to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. [http://www.ohchr.org/documents/hrbodies/cedaw/ruralwomen/internationalcouncilfortheindigenouspeoplesofcht\\_icip-cht.pdf](http://www.ohchr.org/documents/hrbodies/cedaw/ruralwomen/internationalcouncilfortheindigenouspeoplesofcht_icip-cht.pdf). Retrieved on 20 November 2015.
- ILO [International Labor Organization] (2009). *Indigenous and Tribal People's Rights in Practice: A Guide to ILO Convention No. 169*. Geneva: International Labor Standards Department.
- Islam, Aynul (2013). "The Land Tenure Dynamics in the Post-conflict Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) Bangladesh." *Bangladesh Political Science Review*, 9(1):59-69
- Islam, Md. Rakibul (2010). *Maternal Morbidity and Mortality among Indigenous People in Bangladesh: A Study of the Mru Community*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Tromso, Norway.
- Islam, Md. R. and Chakma, A. (2013). "Major Obstacles to the Process on Implementing Peace: Experience from Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT) in Bangladesh." *Peace and Conflict Review*, 7(2):29-46.
- IWGIA [International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs] (2012). *Militarization in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh: The Slow Demise of the Region's Indigenous Peoples, IWGIA Report 14*. Copenhagen: IWGIA.
- Jahan, Farhat (2015). *Indigenous Identity Disputes in Democratic Bangladesh*. Southern Paper Series. Working Paper 26. Buenos Aires: CLASCO.
- Jamaluddin, Md; Hassan, Kamrul Md. and Miah, Monaem Md. (2010). *Identifying Livelihood Patterns of Ethnic Minorities and Their Coping Strategies in Different Vulnerabilities Situation in Chittagong Hill Tracts Region, Bangladesh*, Bangladesh Agricultural Research Institute.
- Jumma Net (2009). *Chittagong Hill Tracts White Paper. The Issues of Conflict, Human Rights Development and Land of the Indigenous People of the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh 2003-2006*. Jumma Net. Retrieved on 21 May 17 from [www.jummanet.org/webdata/cht/doc/090509CHTwhitepaperE2.pdf](http://www.jummanet.org/webdata/cht/doc/090509CHTwhitepaperE2.pdf).
- Kabir, Muhammad Humayun and Ahmed, Abu Taher Salauddin (2012). *Ethnicity and Human Security in Bangladesh and Pakistan*. Dhaka: The University Press.

- Kapaeeng Foundation *et al.* (2013). *Indigenous rural women situation in Bangladesh*. Submitted to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, 31 October 2013, Dhaka.
- Kapaeeng Foundation (2014). *UNPFII: Violence in the Chittagong Hill Tracts Continues with Impunity*. Press Release. New York. Retrieved 15 December 15 from [http://www.iwgia.org/news/search-news?news\\_id=996](http://www.iwgia.org/news/search-news?news_id=996)
- Kapaeeng Foundation (2016). Launching and Dissemination Programme of Annual Situation Report 2015 on Indigenous Woman in Bangladesh held in Dhaka. Kapaeeng Online Newsletter. Retrieved on 16 April 2016 from <http://kapaeeng.org/launching-and-dissemination-programme-of-annual-situation-report-2015-on-indigenous-woman-in-bangladesh-held-in-dhaka/#sthash.rjXBrenk.dpuf>.
- Keisuke, H. (2008). "Cak: Numerals." *The Dhaka University Journal of Linguistics*, 1(2):1-10.
- KfW (2006). *Gender Approach of Development Partners. Gender Mainstreaming for Gender Equity – The Experience of International Development Agencies*. Frankfurt: KfW.
- Khan, A. M. (1999). *The Maghs: A Buddhists Community in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: University Press Limited.
- Khan, Farida C. (2010). "Collateral Damage of Development." In Naeem Moohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope. Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Drishtipat Writers' Collective. 99-102
- Khisa, Sudibya Kanti (2011). "Jum Farming System and Jumias in the Chittagong Hill tracts." In Philip Gain (Eds.) *Survival on the Fringe. Aivasis of Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). 445-463
- Khumi, Lelung (2010). "Indigenous vs. Small Ethnic Group." In Naeem Moohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope. Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Drishtipat Writers' Collective. 225-226
- Kong, T. S. K.; Mahoney, D. and Plummer, K. (2002). "Queering the Interview." In J. Gubrium and J. Holstein (Eds.) *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc. pp. 239-258.
- Kundu, Debashish Kumar; Samadder, Mrinmoy; Khan, Ashrafuzzaman and Naomi, Sharin Shajahan (2011). *State of Justice in Chittagong Hill Tracts: Exploring the Formal and Informal Justice Institutions of Indigenous Communities*. Dhaka: BRAC.
- Kvale, S. (1996). *Interviews. An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.

- Long, N. and Ploeg, J.D.V.D. (1989). "Demythologizing Intervention and Actor Perspective." *Sociologia Ruralis*, Journal of the European Society for Rural Sociology, 29(3-4):226-249.
- Lincon, Y. and Guba, G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.
- Maclean, L. (2009). Intersectionality, Social Locations of Privilege and Conceptions of Women's Oppression. Prepared for CPSA meeting.
- Maggard, L.; Ahmad, S. and Sagma, M. (2007). *The Marma and Rakhaine Communities of Bangladesh: A Sociolinguistic Survey*. Dhaka: SIL Bangladesh.
- March, C.; Smyth, I. and Mukhopadhyay, M. (1999). *A Guide to Gender-Analysis Frameworks*. Oxfam: Maya Publishers.
- Mai, C. (2007). *A Brief Account of Human Rights Situation of the Indigenous Peoples in Bangladesh*. Chiang Mai: Asian Indigenous Peoples Pact.
- Manjoo, Rashida (2014). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women: Its Causes and Consequences*. New York: Human Rights Council, United Nations.
- Marshall, C. and Rossman, G. B. (1999). *Designing Qualitative Research* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.) London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Marvasti, A. B. (2004). *Qualitative Research in Sociology*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Mason, J. (1996). *Qualitative Researching*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Mei, W. (1984). *Genocide in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*, IWGIA Document No. 51. Copenhagen: IWGIA.
- Mohsin, Amena (1997). *The Politics of Nationalism: The Case of the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*. Dhaka: The University Press Limited.
- Mohsin, Amena (2002). "Gender, Nationalism and Security." In Navnita Chadha Behera (Eds.) *State, People and Security: The South Asian Context*. New Delhi: Har-Anand. pp. 202-219.
- Mohsin, Amena (2003). *The Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh: On the Difficult Road to Peace, International Peace Academy Occasional Paper Series*. London & Colorado: Lynne Rienner.
- Mohsin, A.; Ahmed, S. and Rahman Md. S. (2009). *Poverty and Development Perspectives from Women and Indigenous People*. Dhaka: Research Initiatives, Bangladesh.
- Morgan, D. L. (1997). *Focus Groups as Qualitative Research*, (2nd Ed.) Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.

- Mullings, L. (1997). *On Our Own Terms: Race, Class and Gender in the Lives of African American Women*. New York: Routledge.
- Nakano, G. E. (1999). "The Social Construction and Institutionalization of Gender and Race: An Integrative Frame Work." In M. M. Feree; J. Lorber and B. B. Hess (Eds.) *Revisoning Gender*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Naher, Ainoon and Tripura, Prashanta (2010). Violence against Indigenous Women. In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope, Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective.
- NFPCSP [National Food Policy Capacity Strengthening Program] (2010). *Research for Food Security Policies in Chittagong Hill Tract Areas: Production, Access and Nutrition Issues*. Proceedings for the Workshop, Dhaka, Bangladesh: NFPCSP.
- Nasreen, Zobaida and Togawa, Masahiko (2002). "Politics of Development: 'Pahari-Bengali' Discourse in the Chittagong Hill Tracts." *Journal of International Development and Cooperation*, 9 (1): 97-112.
- Neuman, W. L. and Kreuger L. W. (2003). *Social Work Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. New York: Pearson Education Inc.
- NGO Forum (2007). *Serving the Unserved: Consolidation of Watsan Success in CHT* (Volume 1). Dhaka: NGO Forum for Drinking Water Supply & Sanitation.
- NGO Forum (2008). *Study on Sanitation and Hygiene Situation in Chittagong Hill Tracts (CHT), Bangladesh*. Dhaka: NGO Forum for Drinking Water Supply & Sanitation.
- NGO Forum (2010). *Healthy Living in the Hills*. (J. Halder Ed.) Dhaka, Bangladesh: NGO Forum for Drinking Water Supply & Sanitation.
- Nue, U. S. (2007). "Marma in Indigenous Communities." In Mesbah Kamal, Zahidul Islam and Sugata Chakma (Eds.) Dhaka: Asiatic Society of Bangladesh.
- Ogata, Sadako (1998). *Inclusion or Exclusion: Social Development Challenges For Asia and Europe*. Statement of Mrs. Sadako Ogata United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees at the Asian Development Bank Seminar, 27 April 1998. <<http://www.unhcr.ch/refworld/unhcr/hcspeech/27ap1998.htm>> 08/22/01.
- O'manique, C. and Mclean, S. J. (2010). *Pathways among Human Security, Gender and HIV/AIDS in Sub-Saharan Africa*. In CIAS/RCEA 44:3.
- Osberg, L. (1998). *Economic Insecurity. Discussion Paper No. 88*. University of New South Wales: Social Policy Research Centre.
- PCJSS (n.d.) *Administrative Set up in CHT*. Retrieved on 21 May 2017 from <http://www.pcjss-cht.org/administrative-setup-in-cht/>.

- Park, R. (1998). *Another Point of View: A Manual on Gender Analysis Training for Grassroots Workers*. New York: UNIFEM.
- Plant, R and Chakma, K. N. (2011). *Regional: Targeted Capacity Building for Mainstreaming Indigenous People' Concerns in Development. Technical Assistance Consultants Report*, Asian Development Bank.
- Pundey, Pranab Kumar and Jamil, Ishtiaq (2009). "Conflict in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh: An Unimplemented Accord and Continued Violence." *Asian Survey*, 9 (6)1052-1070.
- Rahman, Md. S. (2009). "The Political Economy of (Under) Development: The Case of CHT in Bangladesh." In Amena Mohsin; Saima Ahmed and Md. Sajjadur Rahman (Eds.) *Poverty and Development Perspectives from Women and Indigenous People*. Dhaka: Research Initiative, Bangladesh. 64-88
- Rahman, Md. M. (2011). *Struggling against Exclusion. Adibashi in Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*. Dissertation in Sociology 95. Sweden: Dept. of Sociology, Lund University.
- Rasul, G. (2005). *State Politics and Land Use in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh*. London: International Institute for Environment and Development.
- Rasul, G (2009) "Ecosystem Services and Agricultural Land-use Practices: A Case Study of the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh." *Sustainability: Science Practice and Policy* 5(2): 15-27.
- Rasul, G. and Karki, M. (2007). "Political Ecology of Degradation of Forest Common in the Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh." *Environmental Conservation* 34(02):153-163
- Ritchie, J.; Lewis, J. and Elam, G. (2003). "Designing and Selecting Samples." In J. Ritchie and J. Lewis (Eds.) *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*. London: Sage Publications Ltd. pp. 77-108.
- Ritchie, J. and Lewis, J. (Eds.) (2003). *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*. London: Sage Publications Ltd. pp.263-286 pages.
- Roy, R. D. (1996). *Forests, Forestry, and Indigenous People in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*, Paper presented in a workshop on "The Rights of Tribal and Indigenous Peoples" Jointly organized by the Commonwealth Human Rights Initiatives and the Minority Rights Group, London, Indian International Centre, New Delhi.
- Roy, R. D. (2000). "Administration." In R. D. Roy *et al.* (Eds.) *Chittagong Hill Tracts. Life and Nature at Risk*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 43-57.

- Roy, R. D. (2002). *Land and Forest Rights in the Chittagong Hill Tracts. Bangladesh.* Kathmundu: International Centre for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD).
- Roy, R. D. (2004). "Challenges for Juridical Pluralism and Customary Laws of Indigenous Peoples: The Case of the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh." *Arizona Journal of International and Comparative Law*, 21(1):111-182.
- Roy, R. D.; Chakma, P. and Lira, S. (2010). *Compendium on National Laws & Indigenous Peoples in Bangladesh.* Dhaka: Shrabon Prokashoni.
- Roy, R. D. and Halim, S. (2013). Valuing Village Commons in Forestry: A Case From the Chittagong Hill Tracts. In Philip Gain (Eds.) *The Chittagong Hill Tracts. Man-Nature Nexus Torn.* Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 99-119.
- Roy, R. C. (2000). *Land Rights of the Indigenous People of Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh.* Denmark: International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs.
- Rubin, H. J. and Rubin, I. S. (1995). *Qualitative Interviewing.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Safa, Noorie (2014). *Development Intervention and Masculinities in Transition: A Study among Marma Men Living in Bandarban Sadar in Chittagong Hill Tracts.* Paper presented at 2<sup>nd</sup> Men Engage Global Symposium in Delhi. Men Engage Global Alliance.
- Sandelwoski, M. (1986). "The Problem of Rigor in Qualitative Research." *Advances in Nursing Science*, 8(3): 27-37.
- Schwandt, T. A. (1993). "Theory for the Moral Sciences: Crisis of Identity and Purpose." In Dj. Flinders and G. E. Mills (Eds.) *Theory and Concepts in Qualitative Research: Perspectives from the Field.* New York: Teachers College Press. pp. 5-23.
- Saha, P. S. (2008). A Glimpse of Adivasi Culture of Bangladesh. In Philip Gain (Eds.) *Culture of Adivashi in Bangladesh.* Dhaka: Society for Rehabilitation and Human Development. pp. 1-32.
- Shelley, M. R. (ed.) (1992). *The CHT of Bangladesh: The Untold Story.* Bangladesh: Centre for Development Research.
- Shenton, A. K. (2004). *Strategies for Strengthening for Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research Projects. Education for Information*, 22:66-75.
- Shields, S. A. (2008). *Gender: An Intersectionality Perspective.* Sex Roles, 59:301-311.
- Sieber, J. E. (1993). "The Ethics and Politics of Sensitive Research. In Research on Sensitive Topics." C. Renzetti and R, Lee (Eds.) *Researching Sensitive Topics.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc. pp. 14-26.

- Silverman, D. (2001). *Interpreting Qualitative Data. Methods For Analyzing Talk, Text, and Interaction* (Second Edition). London: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Silverman, D. (2005). *Doing Qualitative Research: A Practical Handbook* (Second Edition). London: Sage Publication Ltd.
- Snape, D. and Spencer, L. (2003). "The Foundations of Qualitative Research." In Ritchie, J. and Lewis, J. (Eds.) *Qualitative Research Practice: A Guide for Social Science Students and Researchers*. London: Sage Publications Ltd. pp. 1-23.
- Talukder, Kazal and Paul, Tapan Kumar (2013). *Report On Agricultural Development Strategy for Rangamati*, Rangamati: Agriculture and Food Security Project, Rangamati Hill District Council.
- Talukder, T. (2014). *Report on Sexual Health and Reproductive Rights 21, 22(1), 23 and 24 of United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous peoples – Chittagong Hill Tracts Context*. International Experts Group Meeting, Department of Economic and Social Affairs. New York: United Nations.
- The Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission (1991). *Life is not Ours. Land and Human Rights in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*. The Chittagong Hill Tract Commission.
- The Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission (2000). *Life is Not Ours. Land and Human Rights in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh*. The Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission.
- The Daily Star (2010). *Stop Land Commission's Activities in CHT*. December 7, 2010. Retrieved on 17.12.2016 from <http://www.thedailystar.net/news-detail-167578>.
- The Daily Star (2016). *Ethnic Minority Women of Plains, Hills should Fight Together for Rights*. Concluding Session of National Indigenous Women Conference 2016: Charter of their demands announced. March 21 2017. Retrieved on 21 May 2017 from <http://www.thedailystar.net/city/ethnic-minority-women-plains-hills-should-fight-together-rights-1197232> .
- Thompson, P. (2000). *The Voice of the Past: Oral History* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Thurmond, V. A. (2001). "The Point of Triangulation." *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 33(2) 253-258.
- Tiwari, S. (2003). *Chittagong Hill Tracts: A Preliminary Study on Gender and Natural Resource Management*. Canada: International Development Research Center (IDRC).
- Tripura, P. (2002). *Tripura Jati O Sangskriti (Tripura Nation and Culture)*, in Bangla. Publisher unknown.



- Tripura, S. B. (2011) "Tripura". In Phiip Gain (Eds.) *Survival on the Fringe Adivasis in Bangladesh*. Dhaka: Society for Environment and Human Development (SEHD). pp. 119-128
- Tripura, S. L. (2012). *Parbotto Chottogramer Prokriti o Samskriti* (Nature and Culture of Chittagong Hill Tracts), in Bangla. Rangamati: Khudro Nri-gosthir Samskritik Institute.
- Tripura, S. and Tripura, S. (2010). Tripura. In M. Chakma et al. *Bangladesher Adibashi: Ethnographic Gobeshona, Prothom Khondo* (The Indigenous Peoples of Bangladesh: Ethnographic Research, First Part) Dhaka: Utsho Prokashon and Bangladesh Adibashi Forum. pp. 301-350.
- Uddin, N. (2008). "Living on the Margin: The Positioning of the Khumi within the Sociopolitical and Ethnic History of the Chittagong Hill Tracts." *Asian Ethnicity*, 9(1): 33-53.
- Ullah, M. Shahid: Shamsuddoha, Md. And Shahjahan, M. (2014). "The Viabilities of Chittagong Hill Tracts as a Destination for Climate Displaced Community in Bangladesh." In Scott Leckie (Eds.) *Land Solution for Climate Displacement*. New York: Routledge. pp. 195-227.
- UNDP (1994). Human Development Report, New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- UNDESA (2008). *World Economic and Social Survey 2008. Overcoming Economic Insecurity*. New York: United Nations Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA).
- UNFPII (2004) Gender and Indigenous Peoples: Overview. Briefing Note No. 1. New York: United Nations Office of the Special Adviser on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women and Secreteriate of the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues.
- Unicef (2007) Study on Mainstreaming Gender and Researching Poor in Environmental Sanitation, Hygiene and Water Supply in Rural Areas, Unicef. Dhaka: Human Development Sanitation Section.
- Unicef (2008). *Rural Sanitation, Hygiene and Water Supply in CHT Area, Bangladesh*. [http://www.unicef.org/bangladesh/RURAL\\_Water\\_Sanitation\\_and\\_Hygiene.pdf](http://www.unicef.org/bangladesh/RURAL_Water_Sanitation_and_Hygiene.pdf) (Retrieved on 21.08.2016 from)
- United Nations (2004). *Gender and Indigenous Peoples. Briefing Note 1*. New York: United Nations Office of the Special Adviser on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women and the Secretariat of the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues.
- United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (2008) Resources Kit for the Indigenous Peoples' Issues. New York: United Nations.

- UNPO [Unrepresented Nation and Peoples Organization] (2016). *Chittagong Hill Tracts: New Report Highlights Increase in Human Rights Violation*. Retrieved on 01 03.2017 from [unpo.org/article/19040](http://unpo.org/article/19040).
- UN Women (2014). *Guidance Note Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming*, New York: UN Women.
- Vinding, D. and Kampbel, E. R. (2012). *Indigenous Women Workers with Case Studies from Bangladesh, Nepal and the Americas*. Geneva: Bureau for Gender Equality, International Labor Organization.
- Wasif, F. (2010). "Political Problem cannot be Viewed Through Military Lens." In Naeem Mohaiemen (Eds.) *Between Ashes and Hope, Chittagong Hill Tracts in the Blind Spot of Bangladesh Nationalism*. Dhaka: Dristipat Writers' Collective.
- WaterAid (2010). *End of Year Report 09/10 – Enhancing Environmental Health through Community Organizations, Bangladesh*. Dhaka: WaterAid Bangladesh.
- Weldon, S. L. (2006). "The Structure of Intersectionality: A Comparative Politics of Gender." *Politics and Gender*, 2(2):.235-248.
- Wilkinson, Mathew (2015). "Negotiating with the Other: Centre-Periphery Perceptions, Peacemaking Policies and Pervasive Conflict in the Chittagong Hill Tracts, Bangladesh." *International Review of Social Research* 5(3):179-190.
- World Development Report (2000/1). *World Development Report 2000/2001: Attacking Poverty*. Washington D. C.: World Bank Group.
- Yin, R. K. (1994). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods* (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.) Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case Study Research. Design and Methods* (Third Edition). Applied Social Research Methods Series Vol. 5. London: Sage Publication Ltd.
- Young Power Social Action (2013). *Study Report on the Viability of CHT as a Destination for Climate Displaced Communities of Bangladesh*. Dhaka, YPSA.
- Zahed, Md. I. U. (2013). Conflict between Government and the Indigenous Pople of Chittagong Hill Tracts in Bangladesh. *IQSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*. Vol. 16. Issue 5. P. 97-102.
- Definitions of Human Security. Retrieved on 10 May 2016 from <file:///C:/Users/Nasrin/Desktop/human%20securityDefinitions.pdf>.
- [http://www.bd.undp.org/content/bangladesh/en/home/operations/projects/crisis\\_prevention\\_and\\_recovery/chittagong-hill-tracts-development-facility.html](http://www.bd.undp.org/content/bangladesh/en/home/operations/projects/crisis_prevention_and_recovery/chittagong-hill-tracts-development-facility.html) Retrieved on 17 April 2016.

Kapaeeng Foundation (2016) Launching and Dissemination Programme of Annual Situation Report 2015 on Indigenous Woman in Bangladesh Held in Dhaka. Retrieved on 17 April 2016 from <http://kapaeeng.org/launching-and-dissemination-programme-of-annual-situation-report-2015-on-indigenous-woman-in-bangladesh-held-in-dhaka/#sthash.rjXBrenk.dpuf>.

Brief progress of “Peace-building, Human Security and Governance in Chittagong Hill Tracts of Bangladesh” Project Approved by the Government of Japan (2014). [https://info.undp.org/docs/pdc/Documents/BGD/Brief%20Progress%20Report%202014\\_%20Japan%20Peacebuilding%20Project.pdf](https://info.undp.org/docs/pdc/Documents/BGD/Brief%20Progress%20Report%202014_%20Japan%20Peacebuilding%20Project.pdf) Retrieved on 15 June 2016.

CHT Commission (2015). Website of Chittagong Hill Tracts Commission Retrieved on 02 December 2015 from <http://www.chtcommission.org/page.php?idn=4>.

CHTDF-UNDP (2011) Forests in the Chittagong Hill Tracts: Local Issues and Potential Approaches. Bangladesh REDD + Roadmap Process. Report on Stakeholder Consultation Workshop. Retrieved on 04 July 2016. <file:///C:/Users/Nasrin/Downloads/Workshop%20Report%20Rangamati.pdf>

# Appendices

## Appendix A

### Interview schedule for collecting data of a research project titled “Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security for Indigenous People in Chittagong Hill Tracts”

[Collected data will be used only for research work and confidentiality of data will be maintained. The questions will be asked in Bangla.]

#### A) Demographic and Socioeconomic Information

1. Name:
2. Address:                  Village:                          Post office:  
   Upazila:                                  District:
3. Age:        .....        year                                  Sex:    a) Male        b) Female
4. Educational Qualification:
5. Marital Status:                  a) Married        b) Unmarried        c) Widow        d) Others
6. Profession/Occupation :        a) Main profession  
   b) Second profession (If any)  
   c) Own monthly income: ..... Tk.
7. Religion:
8. Tribe:     a) The Marma     b) The Tripura
9. Family background:  
  
   Sex of household head:        a) Male     b) Female  
   Number of family members: a) Male     b) Female     c) Total:

#### B) Opinion Regarding Gender and Gender-based Duties and Responsibilities

10. How is household head determined in your community?
11. How do men and women enjoy freedom of mobility?
12. What types of attitudes towards boys and girls are existed in your community?
13. What are the reasons for such attitudes towards boys and girls?
14. What is the age of marriage for men and women in your community?
15. How is property rights determined for men and women in your community?

16. How wage is determined for men and women in employment sector?
17. (If there is any wage discrimination) what are the reasons for wage discrimination?
18. What kinds of role do you play everyday?  
Domestic work: .....  
Productive work: .....  
Recreational work: .....  
Public welfare work: .....
19. How do you take decision regarding different family matter?
20. Whose role is important in decision-making at household level?
21. What are the reasons for much importance of role of the above-mentioned person in decision-making?
22. Please tell if you take decision alone in any matter?

**C. Opinion Regarding Human Security and Development Programs undertaken by the Government Agencies and Non-government Organizations**

23. How do you explain the issue of human security as an indigenous person?
24. Please mention the names of the government agencies that are working for the development of your locality?
25. What types of development programs have been undertaken by the government agencies?
26. Please mention the names of the NGOs that are working for the development of your locality?
27. What types of development programs have been undertaken by NGOs?

**C. i) Opinion Regarding Educational Program**

28. What types of work have been done by the GAs for the development of education in your locality?
29. What types of work have been done by the NGOs for the development of education in your locality?
30. How did these educational programs influence the livelihoods pattern of the indigenous boys?
31. How did these educational programs influence the livelihoods pattern of the indigenous girls?

32. How did these educational programs influence the livelihoods pattern of the indigenous women?
33. How did these educational programs influence the livelihoods pattern of the indigenous men?
34. What kinds of obstacles the indigenous boys are facing in attaining education?
35. What kinds of obstacles the indigenous girls are facing in attaining education?
36. What kinds of programs do you think necessary for removing these obstacles?

**C. ii) Opinion Regarding Health Services**

37. What types of illness generally you experience in CHT?
38. What kind of treatment techniques would you apply in such illness?
39. What types of programs the government has taken to improve health condition in your locality?
40. What types of programs the NGOs have taken to improve health condition in your locality?
41. How have these health services influenced your livelihood?
42. Which treatment method would you think safer?
43. What are the reasons for choosing the above-mentioned treatment method?
44. What kinds of health hazards do you face at present?
45. Which other programs would you think to undertake to improve health services?

**C. iii) Opinion Regarding Food Security**

46. How many times do you have your meal everyday throughout the year?
47. What types of food do you have in your menu?
48. Do the people face food crisis in your locality?
49. (If they face food crisis) what are the reasons of food crisis?
50. How do you combat such food crisis?
51. What types of program the government agencies have taken to combat such food insecurity?
52. What types of program the NGOs have taken to combat such food insecurity?
53. How are you being benefitted through these programs in combating the food insecurity?
54. What types of other programs would you suggest in combating food insecurity?

**C. iv) Opinion Regarding Housing**

55. Describe the nature of your house.
56. What kinds of facilities do you have in your house?

**C. v) Opinion Regarding Land Security**

57. What types of land ownership do you have?  
Homestead : Own/government land/ have document/ no document  
Agricultural land : Own/government land/ have document/ no document
58. What kinds of complexities are existed in your locality in relation to landownership?
59. What are the reasons for complexities in relation to landownership in your locality?
60. How do the complexities in relation to landownership influence the livelihood of the indigenous people?
61. What types of efforts have you taken to resolve land related problems?
62. What types of programs the government agencies have been taken to recapture land (to settle the complexities of landownership)?
63. What types of programs the NGOs have been taken to recapture land (to settle the complexities of landownership)?
64. What types of other steps do you think necessary to take to recapture your land?

**C. vi) Opinion Regarding Violence**

65. What types of violence are prevailed in your area?
66. Why is the domestic violence occurred in your locality?
67. What are the reasons for ethnic violence?
68. How do you combat ethnic violence?
69. How do the people of your community combat such violence?
70. What types of initiatives the government agencies (GAs) have taken in preventing violence?
71. What types of initiatives the NGOs have taken in preventing violence?
72. How do you solve the conflict between yourselves (if any)?

**C. vii) Opinion Regarding Economic Security**

73. Please mention the conditions that you consider as economic insecurity?
74. What types of programs the GAs have taken in ensuring economic insecurity?

75. What types of programs the NGOs have taken in ensuring economic insecurity?
76. How are these programs ensuring the economic security?
77. How are the development projects undertaken in CHT impacting positively your family life?
78. How are the development projects undertaken in CHT impacting negatively your family life?
79. What are the positive impacts of development projects undertaken in CHT in your social life?
80. What are the negative impacts of development projects undertaken in CHT in your social life?
81. What types of steps have been taken from your community to combat such negative impacts?

**C. viii) Opinion Regarding Forest**

82. What do you think about the present condition of forest of your locality in comparison to previous one?
83. (If there is any forest depletion) how has the forest been exhausted in your locality?
84. What types of insecurity has been created due to forest depletion?
85. What types of steps have been taken to prevent such depletion process from your community?
86. What types of measure the GAs have taken to prevent such depletion process?
87. What types of measure the NGOs have taken to prevent such depletion process?

**C. ix) Opinion Regarding the Peace Accord**

88. What do you know about the Peace Accord of 1997?
89. What is your opinion regarding the Peace Accord of 1997 in ensuring security and development of the indigenous people of CHT?
90. How do you evaluate the change of your identity as ‘ethnic minority group’ instead of ‘indigenous people’?
91. What types of efforts have you taken against this decision?

Thank you so much for your valuable opinion.

Name and sign of the data collector



## Appendix B

### **Interview Schedule for Collecting Data from the Key Informants of a Research Project titled “Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security for Indigenous People in Chittagong Hill Tracts”**

**[Collected data will be used only for Research work and confidentiality of data will be maintained. The questions will be asked in Bangla.]**

#### **A. Personal Information**

1. Name :
2. Age : years Sex: a) Male b) Female
3. Educational Status :
4. Occupation/Profession: a) Primary Profession b) Secondary Profession
5. Address :

#### **B. Opinion Regarding Gender Discrimination and Gender-based Duties and Responsibilities**

6. What type of attitude male show towards female in indigenous community?
7. What types of discrimination between indigenous male and female are existed in enjoying various types of opportunities and rights?
8. What types of differences are found between indigenous male and female in performing their duties and responsibilities in domestic and public places?

#### **C. Opinion Regarding Development Programs adopted by the GAs and NGOs**

9. What types of programs the government agencies (GAs) have undertaken for the development of indigenous people?
10. How are indigenous girls benefitting through these programs?
11. How are indigenous women benefitting through these programs?
12. How are indigenous boys benefitting through these programs?
13. How are indigenous men benefitting through these programs?
14. What types of programs the non-government organization (NGOs) have undertaken for the development of indigenous people?

15. How are indigenous girls benefitting through these programs?
16. How are indigenous women benefitting through these programs?
17. How are indigenous boys benefitting through these programs?
18. How are indigenous men benefitting through these programs?
19. What kinds of impacts have been created on natural environment of the CHT by these development programs?
20. How are these programs influencing the livelihood of indigenous people?

**D. Opinion Regarding Human Security**

21. What do you understand by human security?
22. In which aspects are indigenous people living safely?
23. For what reasons the indigenous community is facing insecurities?
24. Why the indigenous people usually become refugee (internally displaced people)?
25. What kinds of problems they have to face as refugees?
26. What kinds of initiatives have been taken by your community to combat these problems?
27. Please mention if religious rules and regulations are related to the insecurities?
28. If there are any barriers to celebrate religious festival, please mention.
29. How do you combat such obstacles in performing religious activities?
30. Please mention if the indigenous people face any obstacles to celebrate cultural rite and rituals.
31. How do you combat such obstacles to celebrate cultural rite and rituals?
32. How do you explain the relationship between indigenous people and Bengali settlers?
33. What is your opinion about the impacts of the CHT Accord?
34. What is your opinion about the decision of changing the name of indigenous to small ethnic?
35. What efforts have you taken to get the identity as indigenous?
36. What are the other steps do you think that have to be taken for the welfare of the indigenous people?

Thank you so much for your valuable opinion

Name and sign of the data collector:

## Appendix C

### **FGD guidelines for collecting data of a Research Project titled “Gender Dimensions of Development Interventions and Human Security for Indigenous People in Chittagong Hill Tracts”**

**[The collected data will be used only for research work and the confidentiality of the data will be maintained. The questions will be asked in Bangla]**

Name of the Study Village/para:

Name of the FGD Facilitator:

#### **A) Opinion Regarding Gender and Gender-based Duties and Responsibilities**

1. How is household head determined in your community?
2. How do men and women enjoy freedom of mobility?
3. What is the attitude of male toward female in indigenous community?
4. What are the reasons for such attitudes towards boys and girls?
5. How is property rights determined for men and women in your community?
6. Is there any wage differential in indigenous community? If yes, what are reasons?
7. What are the everyday roles of male and female in your community?
8. Please explain the decision-making procedure at household and community level.

#### **B. Opinion Regarding Development Programs undertaken by the Government Agencies and Non-government Organizations and Human Security**

9. How do you explain the issue of human security as an indigenous person?
10. What types of development programs have been undertaken by the government agencies (GAs) for the development of the indigenous people?
11. What types of development programs have been undertaken by the non-government organizations (NGOs) for the development of the indigenous people?

#### **B. i) Opinion Regarding Educational Program**

12. What types of work have been done by the GAs for the development of education in your locality?
13. What types of work have been done by the NGOs for the development of education in your locality?

14. How did these educational programs influence the livelihoods pattern of the indigenous people?
15. What kinds of obstacles the indigenous children are facing in attaining education?
16. What kinds of programs do you think necessary for removing these obstacles?

**B. ii) Opinion Regarding Health Services**

17. What types of illness generally you experience in CHT?
18. What kind of treatment techniques would you apply in such illness?
19. What types of programs the government has taken to improve health condition in your locality?
20. What types of programs the NGOs have taken to improve health condition in your locality?
21. How have these health services influenced your livelihood?
22. Which treatment method would you think safer?
23. What are the reasons for choosing the above-mentioned treatment method?
24. What kinds of health hazards do you face at present?
25. Which other programs would you think to undertake to improve health services?

**B. iii) Opinion Regarding Food Security**

26. How many times do you have your meal everyday throughout the year?
27. What types of food do you have in your menu?
28. Do the people face food crisis in your locality?
29. (If they face food crisis) what are the reasons of food crisis?
30. How do you combat such food crisis?
31. What types of program the GAs have taken to combat such food insecurity?
32. What types of program the NGOs have taken to combat such food insecurity?
33. How are you being benefitted through these programs in combating the food insecurity?
34. What types of other programs would you suggest in combating food insecurity?

**B. iv) Opinion Regarding Housing**

35. Describe the nature of your house.
36. What kinds of facilities do you have in your house?

**B. v) Opinion Regarding Land Security**

37. What types of land ownership do you have?
38. What kinds of complexities are existed in your locality in relation to landownership?
39. Explain the reasons for complexities in relation to landownership in your locality?
40. How do the complexities in relation to landownership influence the livelihood of the indigenous people?
41. What types of efforts have you taken to resolve land related problems?
42. Explain the role of the GAs to recapture land (to settle the complexities of landownership)?
43. Explain the role of the GAs to recapture land (to settle the complexities of landownership)?
44. What types of other steps do you think necessary to take to recapture your land?

**B. vi) Opinion Regarding Violence**

45. What types of violence are prevailed in your area?
46. Explain the reasons for occurring violence?
47. Who are the perpetrators of such violence?
48. How do the people of your community combat such violence?
49. Explain the role of GAs and NGOs to combat such violence?

**B. vii) Opinion Regarding Economic Security**

50. Please mention the conditions that you consider as economic insecurity?
51. Explain the role of the GAs and NGOs in ensuring economic insecurity.
52. Evaluate the contribution of the GAs and NGOs in ensuring economic insecurity.
53. If there is any negative impact of the development activities on the lives of indigenous people, please explain.
54. What types of steps have been taken from your community to combat such negative impacts?

**B. viii) Opinion Regarding Forest**

55. What do you think about the present condition of forest of your locality in comparison to previous one?

56. (If there is any forest depletion) how has the forest been exhausted in your locality?
57. What types of insecurity has been created due to forest depletion?
58. What types of steps have been taken to prevent such depletion process from your community?
59. Explain the role of the GAs to prevent such depletion process.
60. Explain the role of the NGOs to prevent such depletion process.

**B. ix) Opinion Regarding the Peace Accord**

61. What do you know about the Peace Accord of 1997?
62. What is your opinion regarding the Peace Accord of 1997 in ensuring security and development of the indigenous people of CHT?
63. How do you evaluate the change of your identity as ‘ethnic minority group’ instead of ‘indigenous people’?
64. What types of efforts have you taken against this decision?

Thank you so much for your valuable opinion.